

**BODY, DISEASE AND LATE OTTOMAN LITERATURE: DEBATES ON
OTTOMAN MUSLIM FAMILY IN THE TANZIMAT PERIOD (1839-1908)**

A Ph.D. Dissertation

**by
TUBA DEMİRCİ**

**Department of
History
Bilkent University
Ankara
February 2008**

BODY, DISEASE AND LATE OTTOMAN LITERATURE: DEBATES ON OTTOMAN
MUSLIM FAMILY IN THE TANZIMAT PERIOD (1839-1908)

The Institute of Economics and Social Sciences
of
Bilkent University

by

TUBA DEMİRCİ

In Partial Fulfillment of the Requirements for the Degree of
DOCTOR OF PHILOSOPHY

in

THE DEPARTMENT OF
HISTORY
BİLKENT UNIVERSITY
ANKARA

February 2008

I certify that I have read this thesis and have found that it is fully adequate, in scope and in quality, as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History.

Assistant Prof. Dr. Oktay Özel
Supervisor

I certify that I have read this thesis and have found that it is fully adequate, in scope and in quality, as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History.

Assistant Prof. Dr. Selçuk Akşin Somel
Examining Committee Member

I certify that I have read this thesis and have found that it is fully adequate, in scope and in quality, as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History.

Assistant Prof. Dr. Aslı Çırakman
Examining Committee Member

I certify that I have read this thesis and have found that it is fully adequate, in scope and in quality, as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History.

Assistant Prof. Dr. Paul Latimer
Examining Committee Member

I certify that I have read this thesis and have found that it is fully adequate, in scope and in quality, as a thesis for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy in History.

Assistant Prof. Dr. Berrak Burçak
Examining Committee Member

Approval of the Institute of Economics and Social Sciences

Prof. Dr. Erdal Erel
Director

ABSTRACT

BODY, DISEASE AND LATE OTTOMAN LITERATURE: DEBATES ON
OTTOMAN MUSLIM FAMILY IN THE TANZIMAT PERIOD (1839-1908)

Demirci, Tuba

Ph.D., Department of History

Supervisor: Assistant Prof. Dr. Oktay Özel

Co- Supervisor: Assistant Prof.Dr. Selçuk Akşin Somel

February 2008

This study analyzes the development and transformation of Ottoman population policies and medical regulations together with their social impact in the *Tanzimat* Period. It also aims to document the transformation of Ottoman modern state apparatus in the scope of population policies, which characterized the era for their political, economic, moral, sanitary and military significance. Population and public health policies, diverse regulatory discourses related to these policy orientations, and finally literary works belonged to the Tanzimat period are evaluated to historicize the re-construction of power, and the emergence of Ottoman modern (Muslim) family and individual.

Keywords: Body, Disease, Family, Literature.

ÖZET

BEDEN, HASTALIK VE SON DÖNEM OSMANLI EDEBİYATI: TANZİMAT
DÖNEMİ OSMANLI MÜSLÜMAN AİLESİ ÜZERİNE TARTIŞMALAR (1839-
1908)

Demirci, Tuba

Doktora, Tarih Bölümü

Tez Yöneticisi: Assistant Prof. Dr. Oktay Özel

Ortak Tez Yöneticisi: Assistant Prof.Dr. Selçuk Akşin Somel

Şubat 2008

Bu çalışma Tanzimat Dönemi Osmanlı nüfus ve tıbbi politikalarının gelişim ve değişimini ve bu politikaların Osmanlı toplumu üzerindeki etkilerini ele almaktadır. Çalışma aynı zamanda Osmanlı modern devlet aygıtı ve bunun tarihsel evrimini Tanzimat Dönemi'ne ait nüfus politikaları çerçevesinde ve dönemin öne çıkan siyasi, ekonomik, ahlaki, sıhhi ve askeri meseleleriyle olan bağlantısı açısından belgelemeyi amaçlamaktadır. Tanzimat Dönemi nüfus ve halk sağlığı politikaları, bu politikalara ilişkin olarak geliştirilmiş farklı söylemler, ve son olarak döneme ait edebi eserler değerlendirilerek son dönem Osmanlı toplumundaki güç kavramının yeniden kurgulanışıyla, Osmanlı modern (Müslüman) bireyi ve modern Osmanlı (Müslüman) ailesinin ortaya çıkışı tarihsel olarak ele alınmıştır.

Anahtar kelimeler: Beden, Hastalık, Aile, Edebiyat.

ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

First of all I must express my sincere gratitude for two personalities for the completion of this study; Selçuk Akşin Somel and Oktay Özel, for their invaluable guidance, constant encouragement and empathy towards me as supervisors. Their guidance helped me to clarify and organise my thoughts. Instead of acting exclusively as supervisors they were intimate friends who reflected their appreciation and acknowledgements about difficulties of working, thinking and living as a PhD. student.

I owe special debt to Aslı Çırakman for taking part in my board meetings as a co-supervisor and during the various parts of drafting. Her invaluable comments and criticism enriched my study.

My special thanks are due to Paul Latimer and Berrak Burçak for participating my defence examination. Their constructive criticism and valuable comments improved my study.

I have to express my deep gratitude for American Research Institute in Turkey for awarding me a research grant to complete my archival research in Summer 2004.

Couple of individuals merits my thanks for their help and emotional support during the completion of this dissertation. Bahar Şahin, a close friend and flatmate beginning from the undergraduate years, who did not leave me alone for the moments of despair. I discussed many of the questions which guided me to construct

this dissertation with her. She was always present to help whenever I needed her. Sinan Ciddi, a colleague from Sabancı University Faculty of Arts and Social Sciences, helped me for variety of practical respects as well as supporting me with faith. I would like to thank Aysel Danacı Yıldız, a fellow PhD. student from Sabancı University, Faculty of Arts and Sciences, for her invaluable help to transcribe archival material in the initial stages.

I am indebted to the staff of Prime Ministry Ottoman Archives of İstanbul, and Beyazıt and Millet Libraries, İstanbul. Without their help and guidance, it would be very difficult to complete the research this study is based on.

My final acknowledgement is the most important: to my family. Without their endless encouragement it would be impossible to complete this dissertation. They always supported me with faith and tolerated many inconveniences I caused as a busy and tired daughter and sister.

This work is dedicated to my mother, Müzeyyen, who has always encouraged me to go beyond: she was not lucky as I am to study and learn, but her passion for knowledge has always been a motive for me.

My apologies if I have inadvertently omitted anyone to whom acknowledgement is due.

Naturally, all mistakes are mine.

January 2008

Calgary, Alberta

TABLE OF CONTENTS

ABSTRACT	III
ÖZET	IV
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS	V
TABLE OF CONTENTS	VII
LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS	IX
CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION	1
CHAPTER II: REFORM OF THE BODY	23
2.1. Reform of the Body: Demographic Policies of the Tanzimat	23
2.2. Population Policies and Public Health	26
2.3. Anti-Abortion Regulation in The Ottoman Empire (1820s-1900s)	31
2.3.1. Anti-Abortion Regulation Between 1820s-1870s	35
2.3.2. Anti Abortion Regulation and Discourse Between 1880s and 1900s	70
2.4 Repressive Reform and Reorganization for the Sake of Progeny: The Reform of Midwifery During Tanzimat	93
2.4.1. Reorganization and Reform of Midwifery	94
CHAPTER III: FIGHT AGAINST DISEASES	110
3.1. Public Health Measures for the Outfit of Population	110
3.2. Ottoman Folk Medicine: Traditional and Counterfeit Healers in the Age of Modern Medicine	111
3.3. Reorganization of Ottoman Medicine: The Reform of Pharmaceuticals and Medicine	119
3.4. Vaccination	122
3.5. Fight Against Venereal Contagion: Syphilis Epidemics in the Ottoman Empire (1850s-1910s)	135

3.5.1. Short History of Syphilis	135
3.5.2. Syphilis in the Ottoman Empire (1850s-1910s).....	148
3.5.3. Syphilis in Anatolia	173
3.5.4. Syphilis in the Ottoman Advice Genre.....	203
CHAPTER IV: OTTOMAN MUSLIM HOUSEHOLD AS A PESSIMISTIC	
LANDSCAPE IN EARLY TURKISH NOVELS.....	238
4.1.Ottoman Novels As Mediums to Search upon Nineteenth Century	
Ottoman Muslim Families	238
4.2.Early Novels in Turkish	241
4.2.1. Love, Marriage and Family in Early Turkish Novels (1872-1900) ..	250
4.2.2. The Members of the Tanzimat Family: Mothers, Children and	
Servants.....	303
4.2.3. Others of the Tanzimat Family; Prostitutes and Mistresses	351
CHAPTER V: CONCLUSION.....	377
BIBLIOGRAPHY	385

LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS

Abbreviations of Institutions and Documents

A. AMD.	BEO Amedi Kalemi
A. DVN.	BEO Divan-ı Hümayûn Kalemi
A. MKT.	BEO Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Kalemi
A. MKT. DV.	BEO Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Kalemi Deavi
A. MKT. MHM.	BEO Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Mühimme Kalemi
A. MKT. MVL.	BEO Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Mühimme Kalemi
A. MKT. NZD.	BEO Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Kalemi- Nezaret ve Devair
A. MKT. ŞD.	BEO Sadaret Evrakı Şura-yı Devlet
A. MKT. UM.	BEO Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Kalemi Umum Vilayat
BOA	Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi
BEO	Bâb-ı Âli Evrak Odası
C. DH.	Cevdet Dahiliye
C. SH.	Cevdet Sıhhiye
C.ZB.	Cevdet Zaptiye
DH. EUM. THR.	Dahiliye Nezareti Tahrirat Kalemi
DH.ID.	Dahiliye Nezareti İdare Evrakı
DH.MKT.	Dahiliye Nezareti Mektubi Kalemi
DH. MUL.	Dahiliye Nezareti Muhaberat-ı Umumiye Kalemi
DH.TMIK-S	Dahiliye Nezareti Islah Komisyonu
HI.	Hususi İrade
I. DH.	İrade Dahiliye
I. MV.	İrade Meclis-i Valâ

MV	Meclis-i Vükela Mazbataları
Y.A.RES.	Yıldız Sadaret Resmi Maruzat
Y.EE.	Yıldız Esas Evrakı
Y.MTV.	Yıldız Mütenevvi Maruzat Evrakı
Y.PRK. A.	Yıldız Sadaret Maruzatı
Y.PRK. AZJ.	Yıldız Evrakı Arzuhal ve Journaller
Y.PRK. BŞK.	Yıldız Mabeyn Başkitabeti
Y.PRK.MYD.	Yıldız Yaveran ve Maiyet-i Seniyye Erkân- Harbiye Dairesi
Y.PRK.SH.	Yıldız Sıhhiye Nezareti Maruzatı
Y.PRK. ŞH.	Yıldız Şehremaneti Maruzatı
Y.PRK.TKM.	Yıldız Evrakı Tahrirat-ı Ecnebiye ve Mabeyn Mütercimliği
Y. PRK. UM.	Yıldız Evrakı Umum Vilayetler Tahriratı
Y.PRK. ZB.	Yıldız Zaptiye Nezareti Maruzatı
ZB	Zaptiye Nezareti Evrakı

Abbreviations of Hicri and Rumi Months

M	Muharrem
S	Safer
Ra	Rebiyyü'l-evvel
R	Rebiyyü'l-ahir
Ca	Cemaziyyü'l-evvel
C	Cemaziyyü'l-ahir
B	Receb
Ş	Şaban
N	Ramazan
L	Şevval
Za	Zi'l-kade
Z	Zi'l-hicce
Ke	Kanun-i –evvel
K	Kanun-i sâni
Te	Teşrin-i-evvel
T	Teşrin-i sâni

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

The late eighteenth, and nineteenth centuries were the periods in which social change accelerated in relation to restructuring and transforming economy and society not only in Western Europe but also in the Eastern societies. The era between these centuries marked the emergence of modernization and modern industrial society, its genuine institutions and related working mechanisms that appeared as the only rational and universal alternative. Once Europe developed into “modern” and claimed its hegemony over other cultures, it established “both the parameters and paradigms of modernity”.¹ Moreover, modernity became identical with European technological and social development “modernization became the goal for the colonized and the subdued”². Essentially, espousing of the European technology and its social and political values appear to be perceived as a requirement both to attain economic development, and withstand the Western economic and political penetration.

¹ Zehra. F. Arat, “Introduction”, in idem. ed., *Deconstructing Images of “The Turkish Woman”*, (New York: St.Martin’s Press, 1998), 6.

² Ibid.

While European capitalism was expanding from the sixteenth century onwards, it created a “core” and “periphery”.³ Parallel to this, the concept of “economic growth” gained importance over the military expansion prompted by the classical economic thinking. The concept “economic growth” started to govern the political and economic mind elsewhere in addition to core economies of Europe since the area outside of this core was on a constantly changing peripheral zone. The internal economies, political and social systems of peripheral countries created responses to their indigenous and pre-existing social structures in relation to the core’s growing political and economic influence. Rather than resisting in their traditional views, the period of change in economy, culture and society- at least in the way these domains were approached- appeared in the “Eastern mind”.⁴ From this point onwards, a competitive and painstaking phase of “modernization” started for the vast area outside of Western Europe.

In the last century of Ottoman Empire, attempts to adopt such a model gained impetus, although the question of “reform” and “Westernization” was not new for the Ottomans.⁵ In fact, modernization had been part of the political agenda since the seventeenth century. Ottomans had an inflationary economy and commercial decline⁶, and military stagnation *vis-à-vis* the major European powers beginning

³ For a detailed discussion of this point see Immanuel Wallerstein, *The Modern World System: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World Economy in the Sixteenth Century*, (New York: Academic Press, 1974).

⁴ Halil İnalcık, “The Ottoman Economic Mind and Aspects of the Ottoman Economy” in M.A.Cook ed., *Studies in the Economic History of the Middle East*, (London, New York: Oxford University Press, 1970).

⁵ For a detailed account of previous reform attempts, see Niyazi Berkes, *The Development of Secularism in Turkey*, (New York: Hurst & Co., 1998); also see İlber Ortaylı, *İmparatorluğun En Uzun Yüzyılı*, (İstanbul: İletişim 2001), 13-17.

⁶ It is known from the historical evidence that the inflation in the Ottoman economy caused by the influx of the New World silver as well as alterations in commercial relations with Europe. The alterations in the commercial relationships were the result of European economic penetration since European imperialism was searching for a market that it could monopolise rather than exchange its

from the late sixteenth century.⁷ These developments created tensions for the Ottoman administration, and precautions underlining these problems were taken “to liberate the Ottoman pride from all indicators of backwardness, and to render the Ottoman sovereignty as strong as it used to be”.⁸ However, the most prominent reform projects remained limited to the military domain and social reform was in due.

The improvements in Ottoman military system gained an institutional and systematic character beginning from the late eighteenth century, the period Selim III (1789-1807) ruled.⁹ Following Selim III’s initiative, Ottoman military reform reached its peak during the time of Mahmud II (1808-1839).¹⁰ In time, Ottoman administration recognized that military reforms must be supported by modern

goods for Ottoman products, or supplying its own manufacture and industry by the raw and semi-manufactured Ottoman raw materials mainly concerned it. Identical to this shift, Europeans started to sell their manufactured commodities to the Ottomans in that period. The traditional export- oriented sectors such as silk spinning and weaving began to collapse. Additionally, Ottomans became increasingly involved in providing raw materials for the growing textile manufacturing centres in Europe. The Ottoman central administration tried to prevent export-oriented food production and take measures against it. But increasing demand from Europe and possibility of high-profits encouraged producers and merchants in Western Anatolia, Aegean Islands and Balkans to engage in export-oriented agricultural production. Please see R.Mantran, “The Transformation of Trade in the Ottoman Empire in the Eighteenth Century”, in T.Naff and R.Owen eds., *Studies in Eighteenth Century Islamic History*, (Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1977) for a detailed analysis of this respect.

⁷ Military expansion had been the primal strategy to create revenues, and *raison d'être* for the Ottoman state, however, it ceased by the revolution in European military technology beginning from the sixteenth century. Ottomans started to search for the reasons behind military decline beginning from the reign of Ahmed III (1703-1730), and when we came to the year 1774, Ottoman military failure became quite obvious as compared to Austria and Russia, major Ottoman rivals at that period. From this period onwards, it turned out to be inevitable to reform the Ottoman army.

⁸ Nur Betül Çelik, *Kemalist Hegemony from Its Constitution to Its Dissolution*, Unpublished PhD. Dissertation, University of Essex, 1996, 31.

⁹ During the reign of Selim III alliances with European powers were built to benefit from their mastery over military technology, as well as having peaceful diplomacy. Then, special missions were sent to major European capitals to establish first Ottoman embassies, which would help to fulfil the abovementioned aims in turn.

¹⁰ Mahmud II continued his uncle’s reforms by establishing a new army, called *Nizam-ı Cedid* in 1830, to bring the Ottoman armed forces up to contemporary standards of skill, technical equipment and training under the French guidance. He also followed the practice of sending special military missions and military students to France to learn European languages. For a detail analysis of Mahmud II’s military reforms, see Bernard Lewis, *The Emergence of Modern Turkey*, Third Edition, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1965), 60-61.

military education, and therefore, firstly engineering, natural sciences and medical schools were established as military institutions. In other words, the educational reform, which is the backbone of social and economic reforms, started as a military one in the Ottomandom. Depending upon this fact, it was not a coincidence that the first critical intellectuals and reformists were the ones educated either in these modern military schools, or the ones trained in the *Tercüme Odası* (Translation Office, 1821) by the officials, who had been formerly sent to Europe either in special missions or as students.

As for the political and social decline of the empire, it should be noted that undeniable transformations occurred in the Ottoman rural and urban economies and population during the eighteenth and nineteenth centuries; the traditional household-based agrarian economy was destroyed, rural to urban migrations had started¹¹, and decline in the Ottoman military power had already been its onset. In this period, the capitalist, market-oriented production turned out to be a reality, and the concept of a state, in which a universal national market with its market-oriented dependency elite, an urban bourgeoisie, related producer peasantry and industrial wage labor appeared as indispensable in the political agenda. “The insurmountable backwardness of the

¹¹ The transformations in the urban and rural economies in this period were owed firstly to the spread of export oriented agricultural and semi- finished manufacturing activities in Rumelian provinces and Western Anatolia. These activities not only accelerated the urbanisation in these regions, but also changed the traditional demeanour of economic and social affairs since the traditional social and economic structure, which was stipulated by the sovereign to prevent any of the economic sectors, i.e., agriculture, commerce, industry from becoming dominant, came to an end. In other words, capitalist market-oriented production turned out to be a reality. Secondly, in the second half of the nineteenth century urbanisation process was accelerated with respect to Land Law (*Arazi Kanunnamesi*) of 1858, which aimed to promote private enterprise of agriculture on the *miri* lands by transforming them into inheritable property, and forced population settlements in Southern Anatolia. Especially the former increased the fragmentation of arable lands among many heirs, so did migration from rural to urban centres. The migration to metropolitan centres like İstanbul, Beirut and Thessalonica had already been in its onset, and forced settlements where monoculture was the dominant form increased rural to urban movements, and emergence of agricultural as well as urban wage labour. For a detailed account of these issues please see İlber Ortaylı, “Family in Ottoman Society” in Türköz Erder ed. , *Family in Ottoman Society: Sociological and Legal Studies*, (Ankara: Turkish Social Science Association, 1985), 100-101 .

Empire”, which was the outcome of the idea of “stable order”¹², became obvious and insupportable. It was the time to think about the “Ottoman ethos” and beware of its incompetence *vis-à-vis* the contemporary realities.

The social and economic problems faced beginning from the late sixteenth century inspired the reform projects of the nineteenth century; firstly in military, then in tax extraction, central administration and bureaucratic apparatus itself subsequently. The empire was going into a new phase that it had to compete with Europe more than ever, and its strategies to adjust contemporary realities created their own drawbacks. These drawbacks were believed to be caused by these reforms’ limited scope and failure in trickling-down the improvements to society. It was realized that if the reforms in one area were not put under effect with the help of reforms in other domains, modernization would not achieve its aim. And day-to day, partial solutions to empire’s problems were far from being influential. Hence, Ottoman imperial administration and statesmen in the second phase of nineteenth and early twentieth centuries destined to be engaged with “thorough-going modernization”¹³. Basically, Ottoman statesmen, reformists and intellectuals recognized that European hegemony was not a sole external threat or influence anymore. Besides, the power of European states was much more than the economic and political hegemony; they were also socially and culturally powerful. “Being socially and culturally powerful” meant an integrated and solidarity based society which was organized with regard to the idea of “modern division of labor”. It was widely believed that with the modern division of labor, everybody and every institution in society functions for the well being of the whole in an organic fashion.

¹² Tuba Demirci, *The Construction of Motherhood and Shifts of the “Woman Question” at the End of Empire: The Turkish Case (1919-1939)*, Unpublished MA Dissertation, University of Essex, 2000, 9.

¹³ Ibid, 100.

Different agents in diverse levels of social division of labor in society must perform different tasks, and this is only possible through modern education and rational reconstruction of institutions, in which socialization of the individual takes place. It was believed that European societies were hegemonic since they accomplished such an achievement previously. Though invasion and direct rule had not taken place in the Ottoman Empire yet, its economy and polity had been semi-colonized through the European intervention and infiltration, and this would be an undeniable outcome as long as Ottomans improved themselves socially and culturally. Consequently, the reform issue acquired a “social locus” in an increasing fashion from 1830s onwards.

The transformation of reform issue into a “social question” furthered by the idea of “cultural schizophrenia”, which was believed to be brought in by the alienated, disintegrated and malfunctioning agencies, institutions and communities in Ottoman society in the eve of modernity. Ottoman administration had already started to reform its army, and state apparatus, but these “modernizations” were not enough to give a rational outlook to the re-structuration process. The hand of modernization should have touched to the society; there must be a cultural and social transformation, which was not only desirable in itself but also essential for economic development and social cohesion to challenge, resist and finally internalize “modernity”. As a result of these concerns, the period, which followed Sultan Abdülmecid’s (1839-1861) proclamation of a reform charter, called *Tanzimat*, in 1839, signifies the beginning of the process of “social reform” and “*purposive modernization*”¹⁴ in the history of Turkey.

The response of constituting thorough going and purposive modernization was chiefly based on the critique of basic institutions not only in the state apparatus,

¹⁴ Arat, 7.

but also in wider social surrounding. The Ottoman family -though this term can easily diminish all complexity and divergence of familial types in Ottoman society bounded to ethno-religious difference, time and space- gender relations and intra-family relationships embedded in it were put under question. In short, it was widely accepted that family was the basic “pivotal unit”¹⁵ in society, both receptive and agent of change. In other words, the economic and political distress felt by the advance of Western capitalist hegemony was translated into the ideological realm, and a modern discourse on family, which included the critique of gender relations, intra-family relations, purity and morality, was formed from the Tanzimat period (1839-1908) onwards.

Generally speaking, families have always been central to official concerns and policies; indeed, families have been direct agents of the established order through the continuity between public power and familial one. At the same time, family has been an indispensable apparatus, which functions as an anchorage for the private property and reproduction of the ruling ideology and hegemony. Societies have been considered to be constituted by families, and these families have particular functions such as biological and material reproduction, socialization and up bringing of younger generations and internalization of mores and values in individual, as well as being the site of production and labor use. Moreover, individuals have been the members of families through blood or contract, and states organize their whole affairs with the individuals according to this principle; i.e., being specified as the son or daughter of a certain woman or man and member of a wider kin group, having surnames. Family was also an institution, in which certain social tasks such as caring

¹⁵ Margaret L. Meriwether, *The Kin Who Count: Family and Society in Ottoman Aleppo 1770-1840*, (Austin, Texas: University of Texas Press, 1999), 8.

and rehabilitating were expected to be provided. Lastly, it has been the basic social unit by which public interacted with the private.

In the course of history, each of the above mentioned functions of family have become center of analysis while familial systems were examined and conceptualized. With regard to the academic traditions by which families were analyzed historically, particular familial forms were suggested to be dominant, or widespread in specific mode of productions. For instance extended families have been thought to be prevalent in pre-modern and tributary states and societies, so the nuclear families for the modern-industrial societies. Rather than being trapped in such kind of a conception, which would, in turn, influence the family history like an iron cage, it is sound to understand the very relationship between family and state, the transformation of values related to family and change of relationships embedded in it, and birth of disciplinary practices and discourses about it in specific time-periods in history. It is, of course, not an irrelevant task to quest for the pattern of familial types in the specific points of human history; however, a historian should be able to go beyond the evolutionary schemes, which presumes certain familial forms for specific periods. We know depending upon the historical evidence that neither of the familial forms exclusively prevailed any type of mode of production, and society. Basically, the evolution of society and presumed evolution of family are not always identical.¹⁶ The new directions in family history challenged the approach of periodization which argued that extended family gave way to nuclear one as a consequence of modernization and industrialization. On the contrary, different types

¹⁶ For a detailed account of this point please see L. Davidoff, M. Doolittle, J. Fink & K. Holden, *The Family Story: Blood, Contract, and Intimacy, 1830-1960*, (London, New York: Longman, 1999), 16-45; L. J. Nicholson, *Gender and History: The Limits of Social Theory in the Age of the Family*, (New York: Columbia University Press, 1986) , 105-133, and Lawrence Stone, "Family History in the 1980's, *Journal of Interdisciplinary History*, 12 (1981): 51-87.

of families coexisted in different states of history and society. It is also suggested that the location as well as mutual interplay of other factors such as class, religion, ethnicity, and culture via certain modes of production shaped the family forms in the course of history.

It has been argued up to this point that there was no direct relationship between types of family and types of society, yet there is a direct relationship between the transformation of family, and political and economic history. In this framework, family and state are in conjunction with each other, and the way they were arranged reflects interdependency. The home and family are not distinct realms from the economic and political realms, though it has been suggested; the home and family are related since production and distribution of resources, and subordination and order are not solely confined to economy and polity respectively. Families have been part of the economic realm by organizing production and distribution inside themselves, in wider kin groups, and through the medium of trade and exchange network in a given society. Family is also the social medium in which differential power relations organized. If any of these, economic and political realms, transforms, so does the families, or at least the ideology and value system surrounding family institution changes. As Lawrence Stone argues;

The thing which has become clear is that family history is inextricably involved in the great issue of the change from traditional to modern society. No other question is more important to historians [...] than the causes, nature, timing and consequences of this transition. [...] There is hardly a single one of these transformations in which the family has not played a key role as agent, subject, catalyst, or transmitter of changing values and experience.¹⁷

¹⁷Stone, 82.

While modernization of a society does not necessarily involve the upcoming of any prevalent type of family, yet it implies a shift in terms of both the function and attributes related to family. First of all, modern society is based on the idea of separate spheres, through which family became the sphere of private, and the distinction between domestic and non-domestic activities takes place. This posits a reversal to the widely accepted idea that family was both the sphere of private matters and economic production before the advent and supremacy of commoditized exchange relations and commodity market. The political ethos of European liberalism presumes such distinction between the public and private, in a way these two spheres were dichotomized. In this conception, it was supposed that family turned out to be solely the site of private matters while its economic functions were excluded from the economic domain on grounds that these economic function defied by the onset of modern market economy. According to this model, the family, or private realm should also be kept out of the reach of policy considerations and formulations.¹⁸ As capitalist economy advanced, household economy was essentially curtailed, yet not completely. In other words, families still stand as the centers of daily reproduction since all domestic tasks could not be commoditized immediately and “family wage” did not become a universal reality.

As market relations continued to be determinant and domestic economic affairs existed in a non-market character but complementary, family became more and more confined to the private realm and domestic affairs. Briefly, the exclusion of domestic economic activities from the realm of economy through the liberal economic perspective did not essentially dissolve the family’s functions. The public-private separation did not essentially mean the end and loss of significance of

¹⁸ See *ibid.* for a detailed discussion of this point.

household economic cycles; it would be quite impossible to live in the absence of support, and irreplaceable services provided in the private domain under the regulation of wage and salary work. Therefore, the exclusion of domestic economic activities, a broad category of tasks such as caring, cleaning, cooking for the reproduction of labor power to the next day, from the rational criteria of market economy did not actually eradicate the function and significance of domestic services and domestic economy. The mothers, homemakers, housewives and domestic labor have never disappeared, and these activities remained always significant. The only problem threatening for the household economy was its exclusion and subsuming to market relations, which completely weakened the competence and bargaining power of home and domestic labor-based petty industries. The latter process firstly marginalized, and then confined especially women's productive labor into domestic tasks. This marginalization went hand in hand with the public-private dichotomy that in time women's labor started to connote only caring, mothering, and directing homemaking, which were the three pillars of the private sphere.

It is previously mentioned that Western liberal thought suggested the separation of private and public sphere, and interconnected confining of family to the private out of the reach of public. With regard to this conception, family must not be regulated and handled by the policies of state on grounds that public must not interfere into private. In fact, it was also believed that the private domain had its own authority figure, which was chiefly a male. The patriarchy at home, both delegating the patriarchal sovereign and born out of differential power relations, thought to be responsive enough to govern the domestic sphere. This assumption basically underlined the fact that family had a mechanism and capacity to face problems and

disorders produced by industrial capitalist system. However, in time, it was realized that the state had to be involved in private matters.

There were two chief reasons for this shift in the conception of state's involvement in controlling families. Firstly, the separation of family from the public domain in fact had already given way to a hierarchical relationship between families and the public authority, which was embodied by state at the expense of the former. Secondly, the crucial relationship between family and social order became more critical with the process of nation building. The nation has been metaphorically figured as a family¹⁹, the "*imagined communities*" were the sum of identically functioning and corresponding families. The very process of nation building underlies the criteria of sameness, such as unity in language, culture, and ancestors as opposed to the other. The nation building is the process in which this sameness is reproduced, re-imagined and re-created. For the construction nation, families have indispensable tasks, such as socializing and internalizing the very idea of self, which should be based on the common sameness for the sake of national unity and solidarity. All these processes require well functioning, identical and accorded families along the same basic principles. These are the reflections that posit family as a domain, which must be regulated, disciplined and rationalized, although Western liberal thought did not assume such scheme when it broke out. In other words, family became a site that must be controlled and rehabilitated *vis-à-vis* the changing economic and social organization under the capitalist principles. A modern discourse on sexuality, morality, fertility, childcare, home economics, and gender relations was formed with respect to the transformations occurred in the society by means of

¹⁹ See A.Mc Clintock, A.Mufti, E. Shohat, eds, *Dangerous Liaisons: Gender, Nation and Postcolonial Perspectives*, (Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, c1997) for a detailed analysis of this respect.

industrial capitalism. Through this modern discourse, the individual, his/her place in family and society was redefined; certain new institutions emerged to overtake family's previous functions, and certain new responsibilities assigned to family and its members along the gender criterion. The idea which is as old as human society that the healthy society and stable order is the reflection of perfect familial structure was revitalized; if there is anomy and disorder in society at large, it is due to disorder and imbalance in the family, which was triggered by the capitalist transition and transformation. The uneven and evil shortcomings of the capitalist economy and industrial wage work, such as low fertility, high infant and child mortality rates as well as sanitary, nutritional and moral problems of high rates of labor mobilization, urged Europeans to take precautions addressing families. In other words, Western Europe advanced at the expense of certain losses, but in time they were obliged to utilize the wealth generated in the system for solving these problems under the vibrant criticism posited by the labor movement. In short, there occurred the "social question". The social question was tried to be answered through policy measures taken by the state either through labor opposition or the acknowledgement of dead-end threats, which would destroy the capitalist-industrial progress in the long run. Families and the private life were already in a hierarchical relationship with the political and public, but the public's intervention to the private on variety of matters became legitimate subsequently. The new dimension in this intervention was the emergence and remaking of certain institutions, such as schooling, the hospital, and penitentiary, and welfare institutions as well as charity initiatives.

While dealing with the subject matter in the Ottoman context from its own vantage point, we can see that all ideological groups in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries confronted with, and then challenged family, intra-family and

gender relationships inherent in it. In other words, Ottomans also underlined the idea that perfection in the family would bring perfection at large. Abovementioned issues became highly politicized, and in turn politicized the private life itself. However, commenting on domestic life, family and in-private politics was marked by gender, and shaped by a new paradigm of modernity, which was remarkably different from the one born in the West.

It has already been argued that the liberal tradition in the west approached the family from the perspective of separate spheres, as public and private. In this dichotomization, family was set aside in the private domain in a way economy and polity left out of its reach. Quite identical to this, it has been believed for long time that uneven and negative impacts of capitalist economy brought familial change coincidentally. According to this scheme, the transformation of family and birth of disciplinary practice on it in modern European culture was a natural reaction, rather a kind of adaptation to the working mechanisms of liberal economy. Nevertheless, the core mechanism of the single national market with its economic as well as cultural boundaries put the family under surveillance somewhat contrary to the classical assumptions of liberal thought. The West realized and conceptualized familial reform out of experience and in -process. In the East, and especially in the Ottoman Empire, however, the transformation of private domain under the guidance of a modern (national) state was intended, scheduled and contested.

Ottoman modernization project was designed to reform family on specific respects. The marriage, divorce, inheritance, child rearing and mothering, biological reproduction and sexuality in family plus variety of other matters were problematized for immediate reform. Nineteenth century Ottoman family reform project was part of a wider reform project; it was one of the crucial dimensions of a general re-

structuration program by which state infiltrated into the body of other social institutions. Each social agent, institution, and literally every corner of Ottoman society was objectified and re-conceptualized for being both the means and measure of modernization in this program, which was indeed a catching-up agenda.

The reason why such a reform project emerged in nineteenth century Ottoman polity is a remarkably important question. The nineteenth century was the culmination point for many respects in the Ottoman state; social contradictions and socio-political structures detrimental to “modern sense of progress” became apparent in this period. The restructuring economy, disruptive minority nationalisms with respect to Continental nationalism, territorial decline, long wars and their aftermath such as population losses and movements characterized the last and the longest century of Ottoman Empire.

Therefore, mapping out the familial reform, related discourses and policy formulations appeared in the Ottoman Empire in the nineteenth century and its aftermath is crucial for variety of respects. While analyzing Ottoman family reform, the reasons behind such an undertaking both for the elite, who were the ardent instigators of this project, and the state, as embodiment of regulatory and institutionalized power for such a reform, will enable us to go beyond the mere scrutiny of what had happened and why it had happened. The paradigmatic shifts in the structure of élite and state can be portrayed together with the change of the conception of family in this way. The familial reform, or the project of reforming and rehabilitating the “Ottoman-Muslim” families should be evaluated as practices stimulated by modernization and nationalism, which were the autonomous manifestations of the same phenomenon; hegemony. Additionally, the contemporary critiques and alternative views provided for familial reform must also be conferred in

order reveal the contested nature of the subject matter. At last, but not at least, through these analyses, we can both have hold of, and historicize the categories “Tanzimat family”, “modern Ottoman family”, “national family” and “modern Turkish family” precisely.

This study tries to reveal how family became the primal institution, which was pivotal to social change both as the agent of and subject to modernization. These signify an important shift in the position and function of family in the Ottoman society; it was propagated in this period that well-equipped and vigorous individuals could be raised in well functioning and child centered families, where intergenerational and gender relationships were “non-oppositional” and harmonized. In the second half of the nineteenth century, intellectuals and reformist cadres emerged and they firstly aspired to ascertain, then dissolve the “social ills” and “indicators of backwardness”, which were believed to be generated by the values surrounding and embedded in the traditional Ottoman familial system. Thus, this study suggests that these attempts were the indicators of the shift to the idea that the compatibility of a country depended on the compatibility of individuals brought up in well-ordered, well functioning and “modern” families. In addition, the regulation of Ottoman families along with a modern discourse was one of the crucial prerequisites of the Ottoman modernization.

The debates formed with respect to family reform and contemporary arrangement and functioning of the Ottoman families were purpose oriented. The empire was in the phase of reconstructing itself *vis-à-vis* the West and this process inevitably included the formation of a “new Ottoman identity” which would be compatible to the European. Family, in turn, became central to the constitution of this identity since the new Ottoman nation was metaphorically projected as a

properly and harmonically functioning family. It was recognized that families had indispensable tasks such as socialization of the individual, and internalization of the very idea of self, which should be based on the common sameness for the sake of social unity and solidarity. The new Ottoman society, therefore, must be the sum of correspondingly and harmonically well- operating families since the new man and woman, the main actors for the recovery of the Empire, could only be brought up in these families. For that reason, transformation of family and private sphere under the guidance of a modern state and *münevvvers* (enlightened, intellectuals) was intended, scheduled and contested.

The change in the Ottoman family along “modern criteria” were evoked and urged by Ottoman intellectuals and statesmen. Ottoman reform debates on family were also colored by different ideological paradigms. Besides, the condition of Ottoman families, and related calls for reform were the areas, about which social criticism and intellectual challenge was formed in the Ottoman society for the first time. Therefore, the proposed change in the customs related to marriage, divorce, inheritance, child rearing and mothering, sexuality, purity and morality were the first systematic and explicit challenges against the traditional demeanor of social affairs, and the *ancien regime*. These intellectuals, mainly technocrats and columnists, criticized and complained about the conflicts in traditional family structures, and suggested that these were disadvantageous for “modern sense of social progress”. In the medium of these criticisms on “old ways” and reform formulations, which had been previously tabooed, these intellectuals posited themselves as the “enlightened”, and marked themselves from the traditional Ottoman intellectual. This study also puts forward that these intellectuals’ protest against “old patriarchy” was a new phenomenon for Ottoman ideological ground since they created new genres, which

would also be splendid in time such as novels, advice literature and polemical articles. Being the initiators of familial reform was crucial for two respects; firstly the urging for a social reform also included an implicit criticism of the Ottoman state and polity itself. Secondly, the very process of reform enterprise made the modern Ottoman intellectual, who was a “social engineer” in a way. These two points are key factors to understand the identity formation of modern Ottoman intellectual.

An in-depth analysis of the development of a modern discourse on family and related reforms in Ottoman Empire during the Tanzimat Period is crucial since it brings together the analysis of different discourses formed about family with the parallel examination of state’s appeal to constitute a reform project. The inquiries of this study enhances the historical studies on Ottoman families, both qualitative and quantitative ones, since it is particularly committed to historicize the formation of modern discourse on family and intellectual identity in the Ottoman context. The historical studies on family generally concentrate on the impact and consequences of the transformations in economy and legal structure as well as searching for the inner dynamics of families in specific historical periods. In these studies, the state’s and reformist cadres’ appeals for reform remain partly analyzed. The emergence of family as an institution to be criticized, transformed and regulated is, yet, crucial for two respects; one is the enlargement of state concern and control over private dynamics, another is the development of intellectual criticism. In turn, these two processes point out the constitution of power, and its differential diffusion into the society.

My study and research is significant firstly for providing the social history of reform in Ottoman society in the medium of family. Various historical sources, archival documents, advice genre and polemical articles, and contemporary novels,

were concurrently used and analyzed to portray both the scope and contested nature of family reform in the Ottoman Empire. The simultaneous use of various resources enabled me to depict different dimensions of the reform; how social interacted with the individual, and how state and intellectuals became responsive to the contemporary problems inherent in families, and in turn issues problematized as familial ones in the context of national recovery. Secondly, *Tanzimat*, the age of reorganization, was reviewed and re-conceptualized through its diverse regulatory discourses such as purity, morality, sexual reproduction, sanitation, manners, modernization, which are key notions to comprehend not only late Ottoman Empire but also modern Turkish society today. I also believe that this study contributed to historicize the late nineteenth century Ottoman society and state as transforming entities rather than an example of stagnant and ahistoric Eastern empire so that Ottoman reform process will be acknowledged in the general history of modern reform world-wide.

Nineteenth century was the period that population dynamics, i.e., population decline and increase, population hygiene and public health, became critical concepts about which both industrialized and modernizing political entities increasingly concerned. Late nineteenth century Ottoman Empire, as a centralizing and modernizing polity, was not an exception; it had a similar stance about population. Ottoman imperial administration also handled problematical issues regarding its population by new population policies and their implementation. Therefore, the second chapter of this study is devoted to the institutional arrangements and policy implementations concerning population progeny during Tanzimat Period. For manifesting Ottoman administrative concerns towards population progeny in the Tanzimat period, anti-abortion regulations, pronatalist policies and child welfare

schemes of the period were deliberated in this section. The deliberation of Ottoman anti-abortion regulations, pronatalist policies and child welfare measures is deemed crucial for two basic respects. Firstly, these are nearly unexploited subjects both for Ottoman social history and the history of bureaucratization in the Ottoman Empire. Secondly, institutional arrangements and policy formulations regarding abortion, pronatalism and child welfare are critical issues to conceptualize the redefined relationship between Ottoman Muslim families and the state in the late nineteenth century. In the medium of Ottoman population policies and their implementation, Ottoman Muslim family transformed into a social unit whose objectification and discipline was believed promote population progeny. In the mean time, population policies also evolved. In order to historicize nineteenth century Ottoman population policies from their initial stages and their evolution through time, various historical sources were utilized. The nineteenth century Ottoman regulations and advice genre were the basic historical sources for this section and they were comparatively analyzed for determining the margins and evolution of the aforesaid population policies.

The third chapter elaborates the development of public health measures in the Ottoman Empire and building of modern-interventionist control over Ottoman families by means of these measures. Between 1850s and 1910s, Ottoman imperial administration prepared significant regulations regarding public health. In the medium of these regulations, the lives of subject people were standardized with respect to the modern criteria of personal and public hygiene. These policies were directly related to the policies of progeny, which aimed to increase Ottoman population quantitatively. In other words, as accommodating and parallel policies, regulations on public health aimed to increase the quality of life and outfit of

Ottoman peoples. Successive public health policies regarding smallpox and syphilis epidemics, which troubled Ottoman administration from 1850s to 1900s, were introduced to handle social disorders these two illnesses posited. These policies were not merely regulating the epidemics, such as providing treatment for the ill, building hospitals or training inoculators. A modern discourse and administrative structure were also formed in the medium of these policies that would be key measures for later medical reforms in late Ottoman Empire and Modern Turkish Republic. While Ottoman state was introducing preventive measures for syphilis and smallpox, a parallel debate on public health, personal hygiene and effectiveness of regulations was also formed. Independent intellectuals, and bureaucrats and professionals employed in different segments of public health tried to enhance the public health regulations through their debates. For the points regulations were limited in terms of their content and applicability, these debates instructed people. Parallel to behavioral schemes and practical information over preventive methods for epidemical illnesses, they also determined and criticize inherent “ills” of Ottoman Muslim households. In time, these works also guided the administration to be more responsive and effective for the scope and methods of health issues.

The fourth chapter comprises the history of the emergence of novel as a new genre that Ottoman Muslim family was depicted, criticized and proposed with necessary changes parallel to the arguments formed in preceding sections. This chapter is based on the novels which chose family, familial disorders and family members as their central themes. As the earliest genre used by Ottoman intellectuals, Ottoman Muslim family was criticized and proposed necessary solutions in the medium of these novels. The problems reflected in these novels overlap the predominant part of disorders which were addressed by official regulations and

advice genre. Therefore, the depiction of disorders Ottoman Muslim families by late nineteenth century novels becomes meaningful to conceptualize what had been projected and accomplished regarding families. The didactic disposition of early novels in Turkish is analyzed in this part to determine the pathways to the ongoing reforms, and reformist personalities who directed the reform issues in the empire.

The fifth and last chapter provides concluding remarks and an overall analysis of the reform and policy formulations elaborated in preceding sections.

CHAPTER II

REFORM OF THE BODY

2.1. Reform of the Body: Demographic Policies of the *Tanzimat*

This section is devoted to the institutional arrangements and new policy formulations about population progeny, which aimed to re-organize and reform family institution slightly before and during the Tanzimat Period. Through critical appraisal of Ottoman population policies, firstly the manner in which Tanzimat administration's effort to rehabilitate Ottoman Muslim family will try to be posited. Secondly, by means of institutional arrangements and policy formulations of Tanzimat and its aftermath, the Ottoman Muslim family will be analyzed and taken as a social unit, which was (re)objectified, (re)disciplined and (re)constituted²⁰ in the nineteenth century process of modernization. The main scope of analysis will be the Ottoman State's policies which reflected the re-organization and review of perspective and paradigms related to population and procreation that directly diffused and targeted familial ground.

²⁰ By adding prefix "re" to the processes enlisted above, I try to reveal the fact that families have always been subject to the process of objectification, discipline and constitution since the emergence of human society and state. For Ottoman history, families have always been under monitoring; the empire's very organizational principles like taxation, administration and settlement cannot be analyzed exclusively with respect to its policies towards population and family institution. Therefore, the processes pointed above will be evaluated as time-specific reflections of power-knowledge – discipline in the nineteenth century Ottoman context.

While re-organizing and transforming its own entity, Ottoman state simultaneously reviewed and increased its potential to interfere into many different domains in Ottoman social life during the nineteenth century. Certain areas that used to be autonomous and partially under the monitoring of Ottoman State increasingly became areas in which bureaucratic state reworked and redefined its role and activity. In other words, following the commencement of Tanzimat period, amilial domain deemed to be the ground on which bureaucratic state could legitimately intervene on the one hand, and from which the state based its own legitimacy on the other.²¹ The welfare, health, outfit and contentment of Ottoman peoples were seen prerequisites to be translated into the agenda to improve all the productive forces of the country for the sake, continuation, and advance of the Ottoman State. The related policy formulations and institutional structuring attempts can be taken as the indicator of an intentional and scheduled project for a sort of “early welfare” and “modern- interventionist” state to appear.

While Ottoman State was undertaking a structural and parallel ideological transformation to be compatible and up-to-dated for the modern era, there was another simultaneous process through which a new perspective over subject people was forming. This was a transition from masses/ inhabitants/subjects, quite often denoted by the famous Ottoman word *ahali*, into *population* with its all technical, social and political connotation. In short, Ottoman administration during the Tanzimat Period took certain institutional steps and performed ideological and paradigmatic shifts, which were in accordance, then in discordance or finally in hybrid forms with the “modern criteria” that put the families at large and Ottoman Muslim family in specific to the scope of the reform issue. Basically, Tanzimat

²¹ Nadir Özbek, *Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Sosyal Devlet; Siyaset, İktidar ve Meşruiyet 1876-1914*, (İstanbul: İletişim, 2002) 47.

administration produced an institutional agenda and discourse by which Ottoman social institutions were firstly addressed to be reformed, then reformed. No matter there was a perfect match between what was planned and desired, and what was accomplished in real terms, it is rather constituting reform policies, reformist regulations and reformatory discourses by which Ottoman familial ground with its all constitutive, economic, social elements together with its surrounding ideology became objectified. It is also important to state that this process of objectification was a multi-layered and multi-dimensional one; some policies aimed to transform and “rehabilitate” family and individual directly, making direct references to different members, course of life and constitution, dissolution and structure of the family, and provided the lines through which one can grasp the objectification. The other ones were rather indirect reforms that Ottoman state did not directly address family but still tried to transform it as part of a broader reformatory agenda.

Although it is often difficult to differentiate the former and latter policies analytically from each other, the second group, indirect reforms in general “reform curricula” need to be reviewed together with the first group. Such an attempt will enhance the attempt to write the social history family and “modern” individual when direct references to the family institution are present but not explicit. An Ottomanist might experience a difficulty to find direct and explicit historical sources to conceptualize the contemporary paradigmatic shifts in the problematization of family in through the documentation of state’s activity. However, the very essence of the Tanzimat Period provides opportunities. Tanzimat era was the age of regulation, both in terms of producing regulatory narratives on hundreds of respects, but at the same time bringing in the advent of “centralizing” and “universalizing” regulations that give the modern regulation its distinct character. At this resort, one can grasp the

manner and scope, means and ends of the verbally non-uttered but evident familial reform by excavating in to the grand narrative of reformist-regulatory-disciplining discourses at large. In other words, administrative, economic, political, and institutional reforms produced individual and area-specific medical, moral, and educational regulations and discourses. Within these individual and area specific regulations, the depiction of Ottoman family and discourse instrumentalized for this depiction will help to reveal the mental map of family reform in a way facilitating “genealogy” of both family and the reform question in the late-Ottoman polity.

2.2. Population Policies and Public Health

The issue of public health is one of the major areas in which Ottoman State’s regulation principle gained weight during the Tanzimat era, though the advent of institutional modernization in public health date back to the early nineteenth century with the gradual transformation of the autonomous medical institutions²². The earliest attempts to put the administration of the institutions of health under state monitoring came about during the reign of Selim III, who tried to establish a state hospital in 1804, and succeeded to achieve it in 1806. The establishment of a state hospital can be evaluated as the one major sign of increasing state concern over

²²Traditionally, Ottomans left the issue of public health to the hospitals (*dârüşşifâ*) and madhouses (*bîmârhâne*) which were attached and financed by pious foundations and religious colleges (*medrese*). This means that hospitals were autonomous of state authority; for example central administration did not consider intervening or managing the issues of public health as its duty in the preceding and formative periods of Ottoman imperial progress. For details of this point see Arslan Terzioğlu, “Bîmâristan” in *TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi*, (İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi Genel Müdürlüğü, 1988-), 2: 163-178 ; Selcuk Aksin Somel, “Osmanlı Son Döneminde Iskat-i Cenin Meselesi”, *Kebikeç*, 13 (2002): 65-88; A. Süheyl Ünver, ‘Osmanlı Tababeti ve Tanzimat Hakkında Yeni Notlar’, *Tanzimat I*, (İstanbul: MEB Yayınları, 1999), 933-966; Arsen Yarman, *Osmanlı Sağlık Hizmetinde Ermeniler ve Surp Pırgıç Ermeni Hastanesi Tarihi*, (İstanbul: Surp Pırgıç Ermeni Hastanesi Vakfı, 2001), 206-210.

public health. His concern must have to do with military and administrative conditions of the second half of the eighteenth century that Ottoman military failures *vis-à-vis* Austrian and Russian assaults had triggered Ottoman ruling elite to form administrative and social reforms with a special focus on demography. These first demographic policies aimed to promote population increase. However, the political turmoil of *Kabakçı Mustafa* Revolt in 1807 prevented this first state hospital, which was principally founded to train physicians for the Ottoman army, to advance into a genuine medical faculty or a chief medical institution to administer the health issues in the empire.²³ The institutional reform attempts in the area of public health accelerated during the reign of Mahmud II (1808-1839) with the establishment of two hospitals named *Tibbhâne-i Âmire* and *Cerrâhhâne* (Imperial School of Medicine and Surgery) on 14 March 1827. Both of these institutions turned to be primal medical establishments in which modern medicine with respect to European curriculum was taught and applied beginning from the 1830s onwards.²⁴ The first public health issue about which Ottoman administration concerned and produced a regulation was contagious diseases, such as plague, cholera, typhoid fever and typhus, and an early but influential quarantine administration was subsequently introduced in 1836. After that, the central institution for quarantine measures took its

²³The early signs of change can be observed in the course of the military and administrative reforms put forth by Selim III (r.1789-1807) under the label “New Order” (*nizâm-i cedîd*). Around 1804-1805 a state hospital along European standards (*tibbhâne, spitalya*) was founded, and it seemed to have functioned until 1822. In two years time, a medical school was established at the military shipyards of Taşkızak to raise physicians for the navy. All of these new institution, however, were located in İstanbul. *Kabakçı Mustafa* Revolt of 1807, which led to the deposition of Selim III and the suspension of *nizâm-ı cedîd* reforms, prevented the advent and accomplishment of this project. See *ibid* for details.

²⁴ These institutions’ modern outlook was reinforced by the appointment of French and Hungarian physicians from 1831 onwards. For example, in 1838, the Austrian physician K.A.Bernard was appointed as the rector of the Medical School, where medical instruction became enhanced with experimental approach. See Ünver, pp.937-940, Yarman, 210-212 for details.

final shape with the establishment of *Meclis-i Tâhâffüz-ı Ūlâ*²⁵ (The High Council of Quarantine) in 1838, an institution later transformed into *Meclis-i Ūmûr-ı Sîhhiye* (The Council of Health Issues). These institutions were quite successful to prevent epidemical outbreaks of plague in Ottoman provinces in Anatolia and Rumelia after 1840s.²⁶ Slightly before and during the Tanzimat period, Ottoman central administration developed and declared quarantines to prevent its core areas as well as its remote dominions from contagious diseases.²⁷

Between 1836 and 1876, this reformist zeal managed to create an official discourse on public health by establishing more institutions of public health according to modern criteria. It also aimed to transform previously established public health institutions into a well-functioning, effective and more preventive structure along with the “socialization” of health services. To meet this end, Ottoman central administration issued 43 distinct official regulations that instructed the principles of quarantine, practice of medicine, surgery, dentistry, pharmacy, vaccination against epidemics, caring for the mentally ill, and midwifery.²⁸ Later, beginning from 1880s onwards, regulations about prostitution and venereal disease were launched.²⁹

²⁵ The first Council of Quarantine.

²⁶ See Daniel Panzac, *Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Veba (1700-1850)*, (İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 1997), 220-233; Ünver, 947-948; Nuran Yıldırım, “Tanzimat’dan Cumhuriyet’e Koruyucu Sağlık Uygulamaları” in *Tanzimat’dan Cumhuriyet’e Türkiye Ansiklopedisi*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1985), 5: 1322-1323.

²⁷ For application of quarantines, see Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi (Prime Ministerial Ottoman Archives, hereafter BOA) *C.SH. 347-* (Ra 1254) for quarantine method; BOA *C.SH 941* (S 1254) Hüküm; BOA *C.SH. 668* (29 S 1255); BOA *C.SH. 783* (8 M 1258)-Tâkrir; BOA *C.SH. 1255* (21 Z 1254) for quarantine method, BOA *I.DH. 7205* (1263) for the construction of a quarantine building in the Imperial Maritime Arsenal.

²⁸ For the complete list of these regulations, see Ünver, 954-956.

²⁹ See Osman Nuri Ergin, *Mecelle-i Ūmûr-ı Belediye*, İstanbul: İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediyesi Kültür İşleri Daire Başkanlığı, 1995), vol.6 :3296-3302, 3303-3306.

In addition to these regulations, compiling and arrangement of the population, birth and death registers became a task about which Ottomans concerned remarkably from 1820s onwards.³⁰ Basically, Ottoman administration handled its population dynamics beginning from the 1830s onwards with a new approach. This new approach was the indication of further revisions and modernizing attempts in the area of public health. Firstly, in 1829, the system of population registers was introduced, and up until 1839, the appointment of officials and administrators, who were in charge of logging and reporting local birth and death figures, was accomplished.³¹ The recording of population dynamics such as amount of deaths and births together with reasons behind local death figures with respect to ethno-religious criterion started from 1836 onwards both in the capital and provinces.³² The attempt to record population with regard to the abovementioned criteria becomes crucial if one considers the centralizing policies on tax structure in that era.³³ However, registering population can also be interpreted as an attempt to have a full knowledge over the population dynamics in a multi-ethnic and multi-religious society. Regarding the fact that foreign political and cultural influence gained weight especially over non-Muslim subject populations beginning from the 1850s onwards, keeping all people under record by investigating the rate of increase and decrease, outfit, occupational, and financial figures of population through ethno-religious

³⁰ Slightly before the proclamation of Tanzimat, Ottoman central administration issued a decree which ordered the establishment of an office and its director to inspect and organize the compilation of population register in the centre and provinces, for details of this point see BOA *C.DH.* 5424 (29 B 1253)-Decree.

³¹ Kemal H. Karpat, *Osmanlı Nüfusu (1839-1914) Demografik ve Sosyal Özellikleri*, (İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 2003), 68.

³² See BOA *C.DH.* 5424 (29 B 1253)-Decree.

³³ See Erik J. Zürcher, *Turkey: A Modern History*, (London, New York: I.B. Tauris, 2005), 15-18, 46-49, 59-61; Shaw, Ezel Kural & Shaw, Stanford J. *History of the Ottoman Empire and Modern Turkey: Volume II Reform, Revolution and Republic-the Rise of Modern Turkey, 1808-1975*, (New York : Cambridge University Press, 2002) 40-41, 83-91.

classification becomes more meaningful. The birth and death registers even became monthly, finally daily recorded in the capital city, and similar registers were designed to determine the amount of married, unmarried and children. It is, however, striking to have very scarce information about women subjects among such a massive record-keeping.³⁴

Under the directive of Ministry of Interior, Ottoman administration also produced an institutional system of *journals* (reports), which clearly denounced the reasons behind deaths not only in the centre but also in the provinces.³⁵ It became crucial for the central authority to know and be informed about i.e., the rate of homicide, deaths caused by the epidemics, improper services of medical professionals such as midwives and physicians, and irregularities regarding sanitary conditions. Depending upon these developments, it can be argued that these reports and investigation means shaped population and public health policies of the empire parallel to other economic, legal and social transformations, such as tax reforms. In other words, Ottoman State became concerned to investigate and comprehend the decease of its subjects, and this tendency produced various regulations regarding such as death and burial events, certification for funerals, location and administration of cemeteries.”³⁶ However, the most crucial arrangements about population progeny were about anti-abortion regulations, pronatalist policies together with child welfare measures³⁷ that the Ottoman State directly targeted families through their medium.

³⁴ For details, see BOA *C.DH.* 6543 (3 Za 1254).

³⁵ See BOA *Y.EE* 147/59 (21 N 1297) for this respect.

³⁶ An official memoranda which outlawed the burials without official permission and receiving a “burial” certificate from quarantine administration, for details see BOA *A.MKT.MHM.* 12/33 (5.15 1265).

³⁷ The reader must be aware of the use of the term here since when we say child welfare in the Ottoman context, it should be remembered that welfare arrangements towards children were not the same with the “welfare state” we know through the western European experience. It should also be

As will be discussed in the following parts of this chapter, these regulatory attempts actually gave Ottoman administrative apparatus a modern-interventionist feature, though amalgamated with a moral-religious discourse.

2.3. Anti-Abortion Regulation in The Ottoman Empire (1820s-1900s)

Anti-abortion regulation was a very crucial issue among other demographic policies in the mid-nineteenth century Ottoman Empire. However, there are very few studies which analyzed abortion with respect to the motives of Ottoman imperial administration for exerting control over families and Ottoman-Muslim women.³⁸ The prime reason for this perspective to remain unexploited is the general tendencies in Ottoman historiography. Historical studies focusing on sexuality and gender-related subjects are recent directions in historiography and family history in general³⁹ and

regarded that infants and children of poor families and families in need with many children had always been supported through *vakıfs* (pious foundations) and *imaret* (public kitchens for the poor and destitute) tradition in the Ottoman Empire.

³⁸ See Tuba Demirci, & Selçuk Akşin Somel, “Women’s Bodies, Demography and Public Health: Abortion Policy and Perspectives in the Ottoman Empire of the Nineteenth Century,” *Journal of the History of Sexuality*, (forthcoming); also see Somel, “Osmanlı’da,.

³⁹ The classical works on family history focused on the changing nature of family and its transformation with respect to other spheres of social life, and it has splendid the interest on family from variety of disciplines. Accordingly, a new sub-field, named as family history, was engendered, in the historical discipline. Family history hosts variety of approaches to the subject matter; for example the early literature on family history focused on periodization, about which what kinds of familial types were prevalent in different historical periods, for example C.B.Silver ed, *Frederic Le Play on Family, Work and Social Change*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982; P.Laslett, *The World We Have Lost*, (London, New York: Rutledge, 1965) are studies of this kind. In the period between 1940s and 1970s, however, a rapid growth took place in the direction of the re-periodization of family, and this approach challenged the view, which addressed to find predominant familial forms in the course of history. With this criticism, demographic studies and analysis based on household size became central in family history, and for these respects see P.Laslett ed. , *Household and Family in Past Time*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1972); E.A.Hammel, P.Laslett, “Comparing Household Structure Over Time and Between Cultures: A Suggested Scheme for Representation and Classification with a Provision for Handling by Computer”, *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 16 (1974): 73-103, P.Kundstadler, ‘Demography, Ecology, Social Structure and Settlement Patterns’ in G. A.Harrison, A.J.Boyce eds., *The Structure of Human Populations*, (Oxford: Clarendon

Ottoman social and familial historiography in particular⁴⁰. Primary sources such as *fetva mecmuaları* (fatwa collections-collections of Islamic legal opinions), *şer‘iyye*

Press, 1972) ; P.Kundstadler, “Characteristics of the Western Family Considered Over Time” in P.Kundstadler (ed), *Family and Illicit Love in Earlier Generations*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977) ; J.Hajnal, “Two Kinds of Pre-Industrial Household Formation System”, *Population and Development Review*, 8 (1982), 449-494. Another crucial trend is the one emphasizing the historical construction of family as a kinship, conjugal and child-centered unit, and best examples are P.Ariés, *Centuries of Childhood: A Social History of Family Life*, (New York: Vintage Books, 1962) ; J.L. Flandrin, *Families in Former Times*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press 1979); M.Bloch, “The Long-Term and the Short –Term: The Economic and Political Significance of the Morality of Kinship” in J.Goody ed., *The Character of Kinship*, (London: Cambridge University Press 1973) ; M.Fortes, *Kinship and Social Order*, (London: Aldine 1969) ; J.Goody, *The Development of Family and Marriage in Europe*, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983), J.Hajnal, “European Marriage Patterns in Perspective” in D.V.Glass, D.E.C. Eversley eds. , *Population in History*, (London:Edward Arnold, 1965) . After 1970s, many studies have been conducted to analyse the relationship between the state and family, and the main focus of these studies is the influence of economic change on familial system in the course of history, see for example L.Tilly, J.Scott, *Women, Work and Family*, (New York: Holt, Rinehart and Wilson, 1978) ; A. Clark, *Working Life of Women in the Seventeenth Century*, New York: Routledge, 1968) ; J.W.Scott, L.A.Tilly, “Women’s Work and Family in Nineteenth Century Europe”, *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 17 (1975); M.Barrett, M.McIntosh, *The Anti-Social Family*, (London: NLB, 1982) ; N.Zemon Davis, “Ghosts, Kin and Progeny: Some Features of Family Life in Early Modern France”, *Daedalus* 106 (1977). The state’s appeal to reform and propose change in the familial structure seems to be a recent phenomenon that family historians have quested. The first examples of this approach came from studies on sixteenth and seventeenth century Western Europe, especially from England, i.e. L.Stone, *Family, Sex and Marriage in England, 1500-1800*, (New York: Harper & Row, 1979) ; J.Donzelot, *The Policing of Families*, (Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1977). With the advent of Women’s Studies and Women’s History, the last two approaches were contributed a lot, but the latter, which is also the genre that this study will focus primarily, benefited from the appeal of Women’s Studies and Women’s History, see B.Thorne, “Feminist Rethinking of the Family: An Overview” in B.Thorne, M.Yalom eds., *Rethinking the Family*, (Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1982) ; E.Zaretsky, *Capitalism, the Family and Personal Life*, (London: Pluto Press, 1976) ; C.Degler, *At Odds: Women and Family in America From the Revolution to the Present*, (New York: Oxford University Press, 1980) ; L.Davidoff, M.Doolittle, J.Fink &K.Holden, *The Family Story: Blood, Contact and Intimacy, 1830-1960*, (London, New York: Longman, 1999).

⁴⁰ Generally speaking, studies on Ottoman family are characterized by area and case studies, there is hardly an overall evaluation on the structure of Ottoman families through history owing to the broad regional differences and multi-ethnic particularities of Ottoman population. In other words, analysis on demographic and household structures were prevalent. See Ö.L.Barkan, “Tarihi Demografi Araştırmaları ve Osmanlı Tarihi”, *Türkiyat Mecmuası*, 10 (1979):1-26, Ö.L.Barkan, “Türk Toprak Hukuku Tarihinde Tanzimat ve 1274 (1858) Tarihli Arazi Kanunnamesi”, in idem., *Türkiye’de Toprak Meselesi*, (İstanbul: Gözlem Yayınları 1980) ; L.Erder, S.Faroqhi, “Population Rise and Fall in Anatolia, 1550-1620”, *Middle East Studies* 15 (1979): 322-345; S.Faroqhi, “Rural Society in Anatolia and the Balkans During the Sixteenth Century, I.”, *Turcica*,: *Revue d’études Turques* 9 (1977):162-195; S.Faroqhi, “Rural Society in Anatolia and the Balkans During the Sixteenth Century, II.”, *Turcica*,: *Revue d’études Turques* 11 (1979) : 103-153, K.Karpat, *Ottoman Population, 1830-1914: Demographic and Social Characteristics*, (Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1985) ; K.Karpat, “The Land Regime, Social Structure, and Modernisation in the Ottoman Empire,W.Polk” in R.Chambers eds., *Beginnings of Modernization in the Middle East*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1968) ; R.Jennings, “Urban Population in Anatolia in the Sixteenth Century: a Study of Kayseri, Karaman, Amasya, Trabzon and Erzurum”, *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 7 (1976) : 21-57, S.Öztürk, “Tereke Defterlerine Göre XVII. Asırda İstanbul’da Aile Nüfusu, Servet Yapısı ve Dağılımı”, *İstanbul Araştırmaları*, 3 (1997): 109-112 for this respect. However, after 1970s, the qualitative analysis on family and relations embedded in it became crucial for the history of Ottoman families. The change of family law and related alterations in marriage

sicills (religious court records) and literary accounts, press and advice genre, which are promising materials for social history of abortion and pronatalist policies, have not been utilized by Ottomanists in so far.

patterns, property, status of heirs and child custody are the central themes that state's involvement in control and change of Ottoman familial structures examined through time; see i.e., Ö.L.Barkan, "Şer'i miras Hukuku ve Evlatlık Vakıflar", in Ö.L.Barkan, *Türkiye'de Toprak Meselesi* ; P.Benedict, "Hukuk Reformu Açısından Başlık Parası ve Mehr", in A.Güriz, P.Benedict eds. , *Türk Hukuku ve Toplumuna Üzerine İncelemeler*, (Ankara: Türkiye Kalkınma Vakfı, 1974) ; H.Cin, *İslam ve Osmanlı Hukukunda Evlenme*, (Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Yayınları, 1974) , Ş.Turan, "Tanzimat Devrinde Evlenme", *İş ve Düşünce Dergisi*, 182 (1956) ; Z.F.Fındıkoğlu, "Aile ve Kadın Telakkisinde Tebeddül", in idem., *Tanzimatta İctimai Hayat*, (İstanbul: Maarif Matbaası, 1940) ; H.Gerber, "Social and Economic Position of Women in an Ottoman City, Bursa, 1600-1700", *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 12 (1980): 231-244, R.Jennings, "Women in Early Seventeenth Century Ottoman Judicial Records: the Sharia Court of Anatolian Kayseri", *Journal of Economic and Social History of the Orient*, 18 (1975) : 53-114, J.McCarty, "Age, Family and Migration in Nineteenth Century Black Sea Provinces of the Ottoman Empire", *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 10 (1979): 309-323; İ.Ortaylı, "Anadolu'da XVI. Yüzyılda Evlilik İlişkileri Üzerine Bazı Gözlemler", *Osmanlı Araştırmaları*, 1(1980); İ.Ortaylı, *Osmanlı Toplumunda Aile*, (İstanbul: Pan Yayıncılık, 2001) ; İ.Ortaylı, "Ottoman Family Law and the State in the Nineteenth Century", *A.Ü. OTAM Dergisi*, (1990): 321-332, A.Duben, "The significance of Family and Kinship in Urban Turkey", in Ç.Kağıtçıbaşı ed. , *Sex Roles, Family, and Community in Turkey*, (Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Turkish Studies, c1982): 73-99; A.Duben, "Turkish Families and Households in Historical Perspective", *Journal of Family History*, 10 (1985): 75-97; A.Duben, C.Behar, *İstanbul Haneleri; Evlilik, Aile ve Doğurganlık 1880-1940*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları,1996) ; A.Duben, *Kent, Aile, Tarih*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002) ; İ.Doğan, "Tanzimat Sonrası Sosyo-Kültürel Değişmeler ve Türk Ailesi", *Sosyo-Kültürel Değişme Sürecinde Türk Ailesi*, (Ankara: T.C. Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu 1992) 1: 176-198. Finally, it can be said that the impact of women's history and women's studies in general is the same for the Ottoman family history, especially Middle Eastern scholarship in these areas added considerable insights to the Ottoman family history; see E. A. Sonbol ed., *Women, The Family and Divorce Laws in Islamic History*, (New York: Syracuse University Press, 1996) ; M.C. Zilfi ed., *Women in the Ottoman Empire; Middle Eastern Women in the Early Modern Era*, (Leiden, New York: Brill, 1997) ; B.Baron et al., *Women in the Middle Eastern History; Shifting Boundaries in Sex and Gender*, (New Heaven, Connecticut: Yale University Press: 1991) L.Beck, N.Keddie ed., , *Women in the Muslim World*, (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1978) ; S.Faroqhi, *Stories of Ottoman Men and Women; Establishing Status, Establishing Control*, (İstanbul: Eren 2002) ; J.E.Tucker, "Decline of Family Economy in Mid-Nineteenth Century Egypt", *Arab Studies Quarterly* 1 (1999): 245-271, J.E.Tucker, "Marriage and Family in Nablus, 1720-1856: Towards a History of Arab Marriage", *Journal of Family History* 13 /2 (1988): 165-179; L.Peirce, *The Imperial Harem: Women and Sovereignty in the Ottoman Empire*, (Oxford: Oxford University Press 1993) ; Meriwether, *The Kin*,. Nevertheless, especially for the Tanzimat period, the field needs to be enhanced with the analysis of certain discursive practices that emerged and shaped family matters as well as the ideology surrounding this institution. In other words, in addition to quantitative and qualitative historical case studies, Ottoman family history must be combined with studies, which focus on the nature and shifts of the relationships between the state and families through the discourses formed in specific time periods. Recent theories actually have allowed us to see the connection between the eruption of particular discourses and formation of political power, and social criticism, for example M.Foucault, *Discipline and Punish*, (New York: Pantheon Books, 1977) ; M.Foucault, *Power/Knowledge*, (New York: Pantheon Books, 1980) ; M.Foucault, "Governmentality", in G.Burchell, *The Foucault Effect: Studies in Governmentality*, (Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1991) ; M.Foucault, *The History of Sexuality*, vol. 1, (New York: Vintage Books, 1980) ; A.Melucci, "The Social Movements and the Democratization of Everyday Life", in J.Keane ed., *Civil Society and the State: New European Perspectives*, (London: Verso, 1988) are theoretical contributions of this kind.

Beginning from 1827, Ottoman administration systematically dealt with the issue of *iskat-ı cenîn* (throwing out the fetus; abortion; deliberate miscarriage, or miscarriage).⁴¹ From 1850s onwards, Ottoman administration managed to build a web of social control by means of regulations that different institutional and social domains were controlled for preventing abortion activity. In other words, Ottoman state's anti-abortion stand became an integral part of the contemporary social engineering projects and the reformist elite of the era. Therefore, the subject of abortion requires to be visited within the framework of the process by which the state and reformist elite produced demographic and public health policies.

Though we do not have any rates, or statistical representation of abortion activity in the concerned era, certain contemporary commentaries and imperial decrees bestow information about its extent. These sources may not seem reliable enough when compared to statistical data; however they still provide invaluable information. Firstly, these sources reveal the “ease and frequency” of abortion in the Ottoman lands.⁴² Secondly, the terminology used in official documents for describing the reasons, course and agents, who either performed or assisted abortions, were crucial for understanding abortion activity in the nineteenth century Ottoman context. It should be noted that the social history of abortion and child spacing as well as statistical representation of abortion activity and corrective treatment towards abortionist is possible through meticulous study of şer‘iyye sicills.

⁴¹ Şemseddin Sami explains the term *iskat-ı cenîn* in his *Kamus-ı Türkî*. Vol.1 (Dersaadet: 1317/1899-1990) as “the crime of aborting or allowing to abort a child in the womb” (*rahimden kasden çocuk düşürmek veya düşürtmek cinâyeti*), In Sir J.W.Redhouse's *Turkish and English Lexicon. New Edition* (Constantinople: 1890) *iskat-ı cenîn* is described as “abortion; miscarriage”. Contemporary documents, however, use *iskat-ı cenîn* to denote unintentional miscarriage as well as deliberate miscarriage and abortion.

⁴² See Fanny Davis, *The Ottoman Lady; A Social History from 1718 to 1918*, (Westport, Connecticut: Greenwood Press, c1986) :40.

⁴³ However, the central claim of this section is to analyze the discursive practices and treatment towards abortion instead of its actual representation.

During the second half of nineteenth century, various claims about abortion were contested and revealed through regulations and other sorts of administrative arrangements. Ottoman intellectuals also provided treatises over the issue. Not only documents, regulations and commentaries distinctly related to abortion, but also regulations in other domains, such as medical profession and area of traditional healing-folk medicine also help us to historicize abortion issue. Moreover, the overall analysis of different discourses and domains, which were the activity axis of discourses, can help us to determine the content, nature and transformation of the relationship between public health and families. Finally, while being informed about the evolution of medical domain and subjection of agents of medical profession, families and individuals respectively, it is likely to excavate and do the archeology of modern disciplinary Ottoman state.

2.3.1. Anti-Abortion Regulation Between 1820s-1870s

To begin with, the first preventive, but partial disciplinary measures against abortion dated back to the reigns of Abdülhamid I (r.1774-1789) and Selim III (1789-1807).⁴⁴ In January 1786, an imperial order was issued to punish a non-Muslim pharmacist who was reported to sell prohibited plants.⁴⁵ Though the content and type of these

⁴³ Somel, *Osmanlı Son Döneminde*, 4.

⁴⁴ See *ibid.*

⁴⁵ BOA C.SH. 380 (5 Ra 1200).

plants were not revealed in the text, it can be assumed that there were probably abortifacient substances among them. In May 1789, Selim III ordered a decree which prohibited the sale of remedies, cures and substances known to be causing miscarriage, and the main group deemed to be supplying these materials was physicians and pharmacists.⁴⁶ With this imperial decree abortion was outlawed both in the capital city and provinces.⁴⁷ Then, in 1827, another order was issued that first repressive arrangements related to abortionists were put into force. This new decree addressed all midwives active in business irrespective of ethnic criterion. The decree began with the claim that midwives had been assisting women to deliberately terminate their pregnancies for financial gains⁴⁸. After stressing the hazards of abortion categorically, but not in detail⁴⁹ - Ottoman decrees would be detailed on hazards of abortion in time- it referred to Jewish midwives, whom were known to be famous and skillful on abortion. As decree stated, “midwives of *milel-i erba’a*⁵⁰ and especially the ones called *Kanlı Ebe*⁵¹ from Jewish community must be properly warned and ordered to not to assist abortions.”⁵² In the text of decree, Jewish midwives were referred as as *Kanlı Ebe*, a pejorative nickname for traditional and

⁴⁶ BOA C. SH. 1026 (N 1204)- İlâm as cited by Somel, 5.

⁴⁷ Ibid.

⁴⁸ “Some Muslim, Christian and Jewish women in Istanbul, who habituated the task of midwifery, were realized that they have inspiringly given remedies to pregnant women to miscarry their unborn children, and in turn caused their[these women’s] perish out of their [midwives’] sole materialistic self interest” as excerpted from an Order from *Divân-ı Hümayûn* (The Imperial Chancery of State) to the Chief Physician of the Imperial Court, BOA C. SH. 437 (12 Şaban 1242)- Buyruldu .

⁴⁹“In order to prohibit this unlawful and illegitimate practice completely and protect the public from its hazards” excerpted from ibid.

⁵⁰ *Milel-i erbaa* means the Muslim, Jewish, Armenian and Greek subjects of the Ottoman Empire.

⁵¹ *Kanlı Ebe* means “blood-stained midwife” and this phrase was used to denote midwives who were known and attributed to be performing abortion, or helping women to have abortion.

⁵² Ibid.

“abortionist” midwives that would remain in use for decades. The decree concluded with the information that two Jewish midwives, known to be eminent for assisting abortions, were exiled to Thessalonica.

The pejorative pinpointing towards the midwives of a specific ethnic group in the text is crucial for couple of respects. First of all, the scape-goating of Jewish midwives was a repetitive dimension in other documents which were issued to prohibit the sale of abortifacient substances. Secondly, this approach also became an integral part of the meta-narrative on anti-abortion especially after 1830s.⁵³ While trying to eliminate the practice of abortion, Ottoman administration addressed Jewish midwives as the “primary evil group” who had a mastery over this task. It will be an straightforward, but simultaneously evident conclusion depending upon this depiction that Jewish midwives were conducting abortion in the capital more than any one. However, any direct presumption from this early document, which evaluated abortion as an “evil practice” in an era where population started to denote “strength” and abortion as a form of illegitimate and unacceptable control over fertility, should not necessarily lead us call Jewish midwives as the corrupted enemies of the public. It is also considerable for the era that Jewish midwives were both the most talented, knowledgeable and regarded ones in the practice of midwifery, and they turned to be perceived as “evil” while Ottoman medical profession was transforming into a modern and male-dominated one. In other words,

⁵³“Jewish midwives from certain localities of İstanbul and Boğaziçi must absolutely be hindered from performing abortion” excerpted from the report prepared by *Meclis-i Umur-i Nafia* (Council of Public Works) in 1838 and cited in *Muharrerât-ı Nâdire*, 18 vols. (İstanbul: İzzet Efendi Matbaası, 1289/1872-1873) 18 :773-754, which exemplifies both “meta-narrative” and “ethnic pinpointing” dimensions. The Edict, as well as the related official documents have been reprinted in the document collection, titled *Muharrerât-ı Nâdire* [“rare documents”]. This semi-official publication, consisting of eighteen volumes and containing selections mainly nineteenth century documentation, appeared in 1871 and 1872. See also Ahmed Lûtfi, *Târih-i Lûtfi* , 15 vols. (Dersaadet: Mahmut Bey Matbaası, 1302/1884-1885) 5: 135-136 ; Mustafa Öztürk, “Osmanlı Döneminde İskat-i Ceninin Yeri ve Hükümü,” *Fırat Üniversitesi Dergisi (Sosyal Bilimler)*, 1 (1987): 200; Ünver, 950, 954.

new and un-usurped sources about Ottoman Jewish subjects, the history of Jewish medicine and women's position within it will make these points clear. It can also be argued that the entrance into, and training and mastery for the trade of midwifery was circumscribed by ethnic criterion. In other words, midwifery could be a traditional, common and one of the few career opportunities available for women in the Ottoman Jewish community in nineteenth century. Finally, probable structural difficulties about supporting a family might have been more acute for Jewish community in the nineteenth century that they used abortion as a strategy to cope with the economic hardships.⁵⁴ Then, this could have turned Jewish midwives into experienced midwives in general, and abortionists midwives in particular. These points need to be supported by in-depth economic and socio-historical analysis of the Ottoman capital and the course of life within it with respect to the life courses of different ethno-national communities.

The decree of 1827 also provided the first tangible provisions of punishment for the ones assisting and performing abortion. The latter, midwives inducing abortion, were denounced to be subject to investigation by means of the community leaders of their own ethnic group, and the former, aiding midwives were to be exiled. Here, we see that the Ottoman administration aimed the cooperation of community leaders. This was a usual Ottoman practice which helped to install and announce new regulations, investigate and control local and subject populations via their religious leaders, who predominantly resided in the same residential quarters with the subject people;

It is to be announced and reported to the ones liable to execute this decree, and to the Greek and Armenian patriarchs and Jewish Rabbis that the ones [midwives] who do not behave in accord with these prohibitions will be

⁵⁴ See Özbek who talks about the material conditions of lower order Jewish subjects in the capital.

exiled in Thessalonica. If these Muslim and other *milel-i salis*⁵⁵ midwives do not conform this rule, they will be punished and corrected with respect to *şer'-i şerif*⁵⁶ [...].⁵⁷

The decree of 1827 is also crucial in terms of providing the earliest depiction of the primary target groups who were to be put under surveillance and corrected with respect to their connection with abortion activity. By underlining the contribution they made for abortion, Ottoman administration made it clear that instead of punishing abortionist mothers or parents, the aides and the ones who provided technical information about abortion had to be subject to constant monitoring and punishment. And this attitude formed the basic narrative and approach to treat abortion up until the end of nineteenth century.

Anti-abortion appeal as an official policy became systematic with in 1830s. As revealed above, Ottoman administration had already formed the initial narrative and penal means to prevent abortion. In 1838, shortly before the promulgation of Tanzimat, another decree which would sweepingly outlaw abortion everywhere in the empire, was formed through successive deliberations firstly in *Meclis-i Âmir-ı Nafîâ* (Council of Public Works), then in *Dâr-i Şûra-yi Bâb-i Âlî* (Council of the Sublime Porte) and finally in *Meclis-i Vâlâ-yı Ahkâm-i Âdliyye* (Sublime Council for Judicial Ordinances). In the aftermath of negotiations among these three offices between 8 and 18 November 1838, the final form of report was prepared that

⁵⁵ *Milel-i Salis* is another phrase used to denote non-Muslim subject population in the Ottoman polity.

⁵⁶ The Canonical Law of Islam.

⁵⁷ Excerpted from BOA C. SH. 437 (12 Ş 1242) Buyruldu. This decree reveals the first evident punitive provisions for the ones assisting and performing abortion; the “aides” in abortion activity were denounced to be investigated by the community leaders of their own ethnic group, and if found guilty, they were to be exiled. In this occasion, the cooperation of community leaders was aimed quite in accordance with the customary Ottoman practice, which helps to install and announce new regulations, investigate and control the daily lives of subject populations via the religious leaders in their locality. BOA C. SH 437 (12 Şaban 1242).

Ottoman anti-abortion narrative gained more systematic character.⁵⁸ There must have been important reasons to initiate the constitution of a more systematic narrative over abortion by which crucial repercussions for families were introduced consequently. The ruling elite's concern to form a policy outlawing abortion must have been stimulated by denunciations and information gathered through local administration. A probable increase in un-statistical but rough data formed about abortion through provincial reports and journals, or the death records of expectant women must have triggered such discussions. It is previously told that Ottoman central administration attempted to run a birth and death records system at provincial level in the early decades of the nineteenth century, and these regulations were sophisticated through successive memorandums. In short, at least the local authorities must have informed the central administration thanks to the death records system that abortion had become a common practice for subject populations. To accommodate this claim, the nineteenth century travel literature on Ottoman society can be helpful. Travelers' accounts belonged to the area depict that abortion was a common phenomenon for Ottoman women who thought they had "enough children to care".⁵⁹ It was also reported that women did not want to give birth to children whose lives were not guaranteed, and they were probably guided by the relative abundance of books and information regarding birth control in the era.⁶⁰ In addition to this, the principle of recruiting Ottoman males as the prime armed force in the aftermath of the

⁵⁸ Somel, "Osmanlı Son Döneminde", 6.

⁵⁹ See Davis, 40; and as an exemplary for provincial situation about the use of abortion measure also see Mervat F. Hatem, "19.Yüzyıl Mısır'ında Ebelik Mesleği ve Kadın Bedeninin Denetlenmesi" in Madeline C. Zilfi, ed., *Modernleşmenin Eşiğinde Osmanlı Kadınları*, (İstanbul:Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları, 2000).

⁶⁰ See Donald Quataert, "Age of Reforms," In *An Economic and Social History of the Ottoman Empire, 1300-1914*, H.İnalcık & D.Quataert ed., (Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994), 790-793.

abolishment of Janissary Army caused provincial population to look for ways by which they could evade this compulsory service.⁶¹ As a final possibility, which will be referred with respect to motives behind abortion in consequent part of this chapter, the concern towards discouraging abortion might have been related to the decline in the material and financial capacity of families. However, the acute financial difficulties were in due to mark the last quarter of the nineteenth century rather than 1830s.

All in all, in the medium of successive reports and discussions which prepared in the decree of 1838, families and parents started to be monitored and put under scrutiny for a matter which was not a public concern before at this extent.⁶² In other words, by the decree of 1838, the “very private” of the family in general and very intimate side of being woman was called to be regulated.

If we return to the Edict of 1838⁶³, we see that Ottoman administration’s primary concern towards abortion was the hazardous consequences that it inflicted on the society, and its negative influence over *istikmâl-i emr-i refâh* (perfection of welfare and prosperity) and *râhât* (comfort) of the subject populations.⁶⁴ The report

⁶¹ A peasant in 1860s complained as follows: “to what purpose bring-up sons, as soon as they come to an age to be able to help us, they are liable to be taken away by conscription” as quoted in cited in Charles Issawi ed., *The Economic History of Turkey, 1800-1914*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980), 23.

⁶² Since the late fifteenth century, Ottoman state professed a Sunni Islamic identity. Like many other Muslim Turkic states, Ottoman Islamic establishment, chose the Hanafi School as its legal basis. With respect to the Hanafi legal tradition, the husband’s consent was considered sufficient for the permissibility of abortion. That is, according to the Hanafi Islamic law abortion was an issue, which clearly belonged to the private realm, and the Hanafi opinion supports abortion provided it is performed within hundred twenty days of conception. It was believed that during this first hundred-twenty day fetus is not a complete human soul. Accordingly, early abortion, before the hundred twenty day, is regarded as *makrûh*, i.e. disliked but not totally forbidden, when it lacks valid reasons or justifications. The valid reasons for abortion is the mother’s inability to breast-feed her baby, and the family’s inability to afford a wet nurse. For details of this point, see Somel, *Osmanlı Son Döneminde*.

⁶³ I’m grateful to Selçuk Akşin Somel for informing me about the presence of this report and providing the Xerox copy.

⁶⁴ *Muharrerat*, 751.

argues that there was a direct relationship between the strength and might of a state (*mamûriyet ve âbâde-i memâlik*) and the number of people (*ahali ve ibâdın kesret ve vefreti*) in that polity.⁶⁵ For this reason, state was conceptualized as an organization whose primary task was “to take precautions which would in turn promote the population increase and eliminate the factors and conditions which inhibit the progeny of population.”⁶⁶ The text continues to remark on population increase by making reference to religion and rational science as follows;

[...]The maintenance of the reproduction of humankind and the management of economic life are clearly divine requirements laid both by rational evidences and religious proofs. Since the abortion of fetus, which is formed by the will of God, is but a murder and one of the biggest sins, and the assiduous committers of this [abominable act] will certainly be subject to the divine punishment in the next world d by God.⁶⁷

Depending upon the quote above, it can be argued that Ottoman administration tried to convince the public about the evils of abortion by transforming the population and procreation issue into a public one. Secondly, the simultaneous incorporation of religious tenets as well as modern rationalist view on population in their discourse in order to make their appeal more convincing. The reference to religion and the use of phrases such as “abominable sin”, “assiduous committers [of abortion] to be punished in the life after death” aimed to discipline the individual as well as forming and diverting communal conscience and public opinion. In a way, these phrases functioned as “implicit repressive means” for the anti-abortion discourse.

⁶⁵ “The increase in strength and might of a state is depended on the abundance of its people” as excerpted in *ibid*.

⁶⁶ *Ibid.*, 750.

⁶⁷ *Ibid.*, 750-751.

The economic life, and the power and might of a state were deemed interrelated with the number of individuals in that polity. Interestingly, the Ottoman State desired to have a populous dominions as much as possible; the numbers meant strength, although the translation of numbers into “strength”, “power” and “might” in economic and political terms was not a new phenomenon.⁶⁸

It was also reported in the decree that “those women, who hastily abort their fetuses by making use of deadly drugs, would be surely ruined, deserving this calamity”⁶⁹, since the religious duty (*farz-ı ayn*) for humans to protect their progeny from any kind of harm (*zürriyetlerini telef-ü hederden vikaye*) was severely violated while inducing abortion. With regard to the quote, it can be argued that the significance of individual health was emphasized, however, ambivalently. For the committers of abortion, the discourse was an ambiguous one since Ottoman administration was on the one hand “sorry” or “worried” for the losses and damages in the body, but it was not remorseful for them on the other hand. The utterance of concerns towards the losses in the aftermath of abortions can be read as a growing concern over individual health. However, the phrase “deserving the calamity of being ruined” in the text is also the clear indication of the critical approach towards individual mother and her body that motherhood was deemed as an instinctively and divinely pre-determined female activity. Women who neither performed their divinely determined mission, nor cared about their bodies, which were “entrusted” to them both by God and the state for the progeny of population had to “pay back” or

⁶⁸ As it can be acknowledged by every Ottomanist, the settlement, population transfers and attempts to gain population were central issues for a tributary state like Ottomans. These tendencies could be found even in the earliest phases of the Ottoman state when it was a principality. Especially after the conquest of İstanbul, population transfers and desire to have as many people as possible both in the urban areas and countryside were critical issues. In short, a tributary state like Ottomans cannot be imagined without a desire to have settled and numerous subject population.

⁶⁹ *Muharrerat*, 750-751.

“be troubled” at the end. In addition to this, it can be claimed that Ottoman administration had a clearly gendered approach to handle abortion even prior to the analysis of the causes behind abortion, i.e., whether the female perpetrators committed abortion due to “illegitimate” “out of wed-lock” “after rape” pregnancies, or abortions were induced due to economic difficulties or not. As claimed in the text, abortion was practically a killing of a soul (*ifnâ-yı nefis*), and it was committed due to not acknowledging the blessing of a child, which was a fruit of one’s own soul (*semere-i fî’âd*). Women were also depicted as “ignorant [mother] individuals” who did not have any idea about the personal consequences of what they were doing. Another ambivalent point in this report was regarding the motives behind abortion. It was claimed that people performed abortion either because of their (bodily) self-indulgence (*tenperverlik*), or incapability to support, (*idaresinden ‘aciz*), many children.⁷⁰ While blaming the individual who committed abortion by not being careful about the body trusted to her, the individual care, which was addressed to spare one’s self from the pains of rearing and supporting many children, was criticized, and labeled as “over-care”, even a perverted one (*âsâr-ı dalâl*). Therefore, individual concern and strategy to cope with difficulties was subsumed under the narration of a “standardized individual” by state. In other words, abortion was not accepted as a legitimate strategy developed by individuals for, i.e., surviving under hard economic conditions, getting rid of undesirable pregnancies consequent to rape, or having no pregnancy while being sexually active. According to this view, the standard individual reaction towards children had to be a positive one, and to that of sexuality had to be a procreative one. With respect to these one can argue that the

⁷⁰ “Some people resort to [this shameful deed of abortion] for hedonism and personal comfort, and some others [abort their babies] as a necessity that they are financially unable to support [children]” as excerpted from *ibid.*, 751.

divine authority-though it is not the concern here- and the state represented as powers which entrusted the bodies of individuals to individuals' themselves in order to perform specific duties in specific margins. For instance, in this framework, the female individual had to take care of herself by not having abortion to procreate for the well-being of nation, and at the same time not to be ruined. In sum, abortion was conceptualized as an activity against both the divine authority, and the legal, and the violation against these authorities deemed to prepare one's end or disaster, i.e., by death, crippling and being punished before the law. Ambivalent enough, women were both victims and co-operators of an evil activity. They were represented to be in need of correction together with midwives, providers of the sale of abortive substances, and finally with their husbands, who categorically represented indifferent in the course of abortion as the report claimed;

There will be set of decrees addressing to the individual midwives, physicians and pharmacists from four communities of Ottomandom to not to suggest and give cures suspects for abortion and this respect will be realized with the help of community leaders like chief rabbi and the patriarch who will administer the said persons with oaths. Muslim midwives of each neighborhood will entreat with oaths in the presence of the *Kadı* of Istanbul with the help of the imams of their own neighborhood.⁷¹

Since there are also several women, who know and supply the said cures [abortive cures] in addition to physicians, pharmacists and midwives, [...].⁷² and since it is obvious that neighbors and other people in the surrounding area would surely know in case of an injury that whether this [injury] occurred due to a deliberate miscarriage or not, it should be revealed in, and added to the upcoming imperial edict that anybody who witnesses an abortion but does not inform the dignitaries, any woman who is known to prepare, or try to use abortifacients will be subject to coercive measures [before the law] together with her husband.⁷³

⁷¹ Ibid.,752.

⁷² Ibid.,753.

⁷³ Ibid., 754.

Actually the immediate anti-abortion measures were two fold as they were proposed and stipulated in the preliminary negotiations which prepared the decree of 1838. The first was to monitor the activities of physicians, pharmacists and midwives that the Chief Physician was assigned to warn all physicians and pharmacists of the capital city and the provinces to not to provide abortifacients to the people. In addition to this, individual midwives, physicians and pharmacists were obliged to give oaths before their respective *kadis*, patriarchs and rabbis that they would not provide any information about abortifacients. The second group of anti-abortion measures comprised the mechanism of social control. Since any deliberate miscarriage would be well known among the quarter population, people who would know but not inform the police together with abortionist women and their husbands were to be severely corrected as suggested by the document. Given the fact that pregnancy, child birth and miscarriages were important daily issues for Ottoman quarter populations as it will be shown in the successive parts of this chapter, and the information regarding abortifacients was assumed to be widespread among ordinary women, Ottoman administration chose to appeal to the individuals, who would not overlook any suspicious miscarriage in their locality as responsible neighbors/subjects. In short, the administration encouraged them to report any suspicious miscarriage around neighborhood.

While it was deliberated, the edict of 1838 took the procreation and fertility issues into the public sphere to be discussed; these issues turned to be “public issues” and argued upon “for the benefit of public”. It is referred above that one of the reasons behind abortion was the incapability of some families to support new children, and the other reason was selfishness.⁷⁴ While dealing with policy

⁷⁴ “The majority of women who committed abortion have many children, but some of them are quite vicious and perverse in their cause that they do not believe they are even capable of bringing-up a

orientation in the successive parts of the report, Ottoman administration addressed these two abortion cases differentially. The families in economic difficulty but with many children were regarded as the potential, primary and legitimate group to receive economic support and compensations. Others, in contrast, were seen as the unruly, selfish ones who did not deserve anything, but punishment.⁷⁵ The compensations and promise of financial help for families with many children, and punishment for the rest can be read as paternalistic attitude which brought initial examples of both pronatalist policies and repressive measures diffused into private domain in modernization history of Ottoman administration. The attitude of administration was a paternalistic one since it tried to save and support the ones who were prone to resort abortion out of material hardships as a compassionate father, would have the same attitude in a similar occasion. However, the other group of families, the “hedonist women” and the ones assisting these women’s abortions were threatened, repressed and disciplined as in the case of a “tough” father by means of the stipulations regarding severe penalties (*mücâzât-ı şedîde*). The repetition of the phrases which denoted the responsibility of the ruler towards his subject populations is the clear reflection of the paternalistic attitude which was believed to be delegated to the ruler from the divine authority.⁷⁶

First of all, the Decree of 1838 is significant since it was genuinely concerned about the peoples’ widespread resort to abortion and abortion’s negative impact over population growth as well as its consequent and adverse effects on the state.

single child. It is gladly announced that families with more than five children will be granted financial help and redistribution with respect to their [material] incapacity, which will be determined on investigation by the imams of the related neighborhood” as excerpted from *ibid.*, 752.

⁷⁵ “intimidating them by threats and menace” as excerpted from *ibid.*, 753.

⁷⁶ “May God bestow an inexhaustible life and health to the Sultan who devotes himself to realize the divine commandments together with divine prohibitions while he keeps working to improve the welfare and comfort of all of [his] subjects” as excerpted from *ibid.* 751.

Secondly, it applied a religious discourse in order to discredit abortion in the eyes of the subject people in addition to its modern - secular and interventionist approach to abortion. It is interesting that Ottoman state used religious references in its anti-abortion narrative though the Koran, the primary source of Islamic law, does not provide a direct clue on this subject apart from its limited allusions about mother-child symbiosis and the mother's duty over the fetus.⁷⁷

The Islamic views regarding abortion need some elaboration at this point. Apart from the limited allusion on mother-child symbiosis, there is only one verse, which can have some distant relation to abortion in Koran. This is the verse that prohibits people to commit infanticide, a common practice among the pre-Islamic Arabs.⁷⁸ The verse stresses that since God feeds human beings, people should not kill their children because of poverty.⁷⁹ Regarding the fact that Hanafi legal school was the predominant official doctrine for the Ottoman state, and there was no legal ban over abortion accordingly, the idea which approached abortion through the prism of the "violation of the will of God" was to promote the feeling that abortion was divinely illegitimate and it is an act against religion. In other words, while there was no solid doctrinal basis for abortion with respect to Hanafi jurisprudence, Ottoman administration chose to apply a generalized anti-abortion discourse, which incorporated religious sanctions on abortion, in order to provide legitimacy for its early demographic and pronatalist policies. By by-passing the Hanafi juristic opinion which partly tolerates abortion in hundred twenty days and under breast-feeding problems, Ottoman administration employed the idea that the fetus was

⁷⁷ The Sûra of Hac, 22nd Verse which provides the necessary period of fetal development; the Sura of Mû'minun 13th Verse where the womb/ uterine is depicted as a "secure enclosure".

⁷⁸ The Sura of Îsrâ, 31th Verse.

⁷⁹ The Sura of Îsrâ, 31th Verse: "وَلَا تَقْتُلُوا أَوْلَادَكُمْ خَشْيَةَ إِمْلَاقٍ نَآءِمًا وَهُوَ قَوْلُ رَبِّهِمْ أَنِ لَكُمْ عَذَابٌ عَظِيمٌ".

actually a living being immediately after it was conceived. Parallel to this, references to divine and after life punishments were utilized for manipulating the opinion of the masses for the sake of its demographic policies. According to Somel, who made the first sound study about abortion in the Ottoman Empire in the reform period, the increasing strengthening of Sunni Islamic orthodoxy in İstanbul in general, the ruling elite's rising inclination towards Sunni Naqshband order and relatively strong Sufi atmosphere⁸⁰ in particular in the Ottoman Empire in the course of eighteenth to nineteenth century might have contributed to this orientation regarding abortion. Since abortion was approached negatively by Orthodox Sunni and Sufi doctrines, Ottoman administration might have applied religious detriments of abortion by stepping out of Hanafi approach.⁸¹ Finally, the paternalistic nature of ruling was incorporated to this new interventionist reflex by referring to the Ottoman sultan once more as a person who had mercy, fairness and compassion to prevent the abominable activity of abortion in the name of God in the Ottoman dominions which itself is a donation of God to the sultan.

The decree of 1838 can be regarded as one of the most important systematic attempts to constitute an interventionist-disciplinary meta- narrative on families which specifically dealt with the reproduction and progeny of population. This interventionist approach designated an information-control and repression axis to be effective. The decree, for instance, circulated across Ottoman dominions

⁸⁰ Al-Ghazali, the great Sufi scholar, whose religious and doctrinal influence was predominantly imprinted in Ottoman scholarly life, did not support the idea of abortion and perceived it as a crime, manslaughter. See B.F. Musallam, *Sex and Society in Islam. Birth Control Before The Nineteenth Century* (Cambridgeshire, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1983):18; Abdel Rahim Omran, *Family Planning in the Legacy of Islam* (London, New York: Routledge, c1994): 9, 137 as cited by Somel.

⁸¹See Somel, "Osmanlı Son Döneminde", Also see Butrus Abu-Manneh: *Studies on Islam and the Ottoman Empire in the 19th Century (1826-1876)*, (İstanbul: Isis, c2001) for the expansion of Naqshband religious influence among the ruling elites of Istanbul as cited by Somel.

immediately after 18 November 1838. Having received this decree, provincial administrations⁸², and the local courts instantly recorded the stipulations of it to their registers, and announced its content to the subject people with the help of religious leaders. These announcements enlisted the inconveniences and drawbacks of abortion in a summarizing fashion. All deliberated stipulations were announced to the people except one of them. One of the most crucial provisions of the draft decree, the issue of financial help for the crowded families in need,⁸³ was omitted from the scope of these *ilâms* (records of engrossing);

It is obvious that a country and region to be civilized and prosperous is depended on its number of people who are the gift of God. While the descendants of Adam have always been trying to save their progeny from ruin, some people have been aborting their unborn infants with disastrous cures and remedies against the will of sultan. It has been heard and recorded that some [women] have adopted the abominable sin *ıskat-ı cenîn*, and they have been ruining both their babies and themselves. Therefore, an imperial decree was announced [...] which outlaws both the usage and exchange of these dangerous cures and practice of *ıskat-ı cenin*. [...] many people were summoned to the local court [of Babadağ, Romania] and the decree of sultan was announced and explained to be regarded.⁸⁴

Some of the people of Istanbul and other Ottoman lands have adopted *ıskat-ı cenîn* which is an abominable and disgusting behavior causing the diminishing of the descendants of Adam against the will of Creator[God]. The warding of this disgusting and abominable practice completely, preventing people to be obstinate on this respect, and perfection and health of

⁸²“[...] (2) since it has been announced to the necessary ones, and also in my divinely protected imperial dominions (3) hereafter in order to prevent such abominable deeds to be committed, written commandments included (4) in my high orders to other parts of Anatolia and three sub-divisions of Rumelia and other necessary regions (5) were forwarded and sent, you are marshalls and divisional generals, and *müşar* and governors and tax collectors and district governors and judges (6) and substitute judges and other aforementioned officials of mine, on the arrival of my illustrious edict (7) you should certainly announce the matter to enjoin thereupon in your dominions that (8) nobody will be able to venture abortion [*ıskat-ı cenin*] as it is realized in my capital city (9) with the help of rigid orders and punishments and if there are any[body] dare to (10) act contrary, they should be punished and corrected with the means mentioned [above] and aforesaid regulation of mine (11) and its [my regulation’s] necessities should be prevented from violations and you should take care and set the terms unanimously (12) as my order requires [...] as excerpted from BOA C.SH. 566 (13 Z 1254)-İlâm.

⁸³ Families which had more than five children.

⁸⁴ Ibid.

the residents of Ottoman land are needed. Therefore, from now and thereon, the ones who are dare to adopt ıskat-ı cenîn will be liable to firm regulations, which are put under effect in the capital [Istanbul]. And it is necessary to be extremely careful and to take a great care in terms of applying these regulations constantly.⁸⁵

The promise of retribution for poor and crowded families as sympathized abortionist *vis-à-vis* self-indulgent / hedonist abortionists was included in the scope of neither 1838 decree nor the memorandums sent to the provinces as it was projected. Financial difficulties of the period might have caused this omission. However, there were crucial and possibly compensating practices for this omission that can also give clues about why Ottoman administration gave up from the financial help measure as a disincentive for abortion. One of these practices was the regulation of *tev'em maaşı* (monthly benefit or stipend for twins)⁸⁶ that aimed to support families of twins and triplets by providing a relief for them since expenditures of these children were deemed much more expensive than having a single child. Although *tev'em maası* was not a recent measure in Ottoman administrative apparatus, it became quite frequent between the years 1840s and 1850s.⁸⁷ The second measure was salary entitlements for firstly the families in economic hardships, then for single and widowed mothers. The latter group was given monthly stipend for caring and rearing

⁸⁵BOA C. DH. 3225 (13 N 1254)- ilam, also see BOA C. DH. 12099 (1254 N) -Eyalet Buyuruldusu; BOA C. DH. 1790 (5 Z 1254); BOA C. DH. 6794-16 Z 1254; BOA C.DH. 6543- 3 Za 1254; BOA C.SH. 306-25 L 1254.

⁸⁶ *Tev'em* means twins, and *tev'em maası* means a monthly benefit paid for the families to care these children, especially when they had many children under material hardships.

⁸⁷ There are many cases which can be found on this respect; BOA A.MKT.NZD 45/91 (1268.1.15) ; BOA I. DH. 15291 (1268) ; BOA I.DH. 15507 (1268) ; BOA I.DH. 15702 (1268); BOA I.MV. 11556 (1270); BOA I.DH. 18605 (1270); BOA A.MKT.NZD. 143/100 (1271 B 24); BOA A.MKT.NZD. 160/91 (1271 Z 21); BOA A.MKT.NZD 179/3 (1272 B 5) ; BOA A.MKT.NZD. 179/67 (1272 B 16); BOA A.MKT.NZD. 233/2 (1273 Z 29) ; BOA A.AMD. 85/52 (1274) ; BOA A.AMD. 86/74 (1274) ; BOA A.AMD. 89/53 (1274) ; BOA A.MKT.NZD. 235/31 (1274 M 1274) ; BOA A.MKT.NZD. 241/78 (1274 Ra 26) ; BOA A.MKT.NZD. 288/83 (1274 Za 23) ; BOA I.DH. 27122 (1274) ; BOA A.MKT.DV. 164/48 (1277 M 5) ; BOA A.MKT.NZD. 336/31 (1277 C 9) ; BOA A.MKT.NZD. 387/3748 (1278 C 20) ; BOA A.MKT.NZD. 387/48 (1278 C 21) ; BOA A.MKT.NZD. 417/88 (1278 Za 12) ; BOA A.MKT.MHM. 294/63 (1280 L 11) ; BOA Y.PRK.UM. 47/126 (1317 Ca 18).

orphans. This task, the responsibility of caring abandoned infants was quite often utilized by young women with dependent children that they made their living by breast-feeding orphans, and they were granted a monthly income by the state.⁸⁸ Actually, wet nursing was also a common practice in the Ottoman Empire; traditionally urban upper and upper middle class households resorted to this practice quite frequently⁸⁹, and Islamic law even provided stipulations which regulated the foster kinship / kinship which was believed to arise from wet-nursing.⁹⁰ Ottoman administration's similar resort into wet nursing for deserted children in the absence of orphanages also provided income generation strategy for women in economic hardships to not to terminate their pregnancies. Basically, by giving birth and breastfeeding orphaned infants consequent to delivery, these women became able to support their children and families.

As revealed from the archival documents, anyone in financial difficulty could apply to either of these measures; for instance the recipient could be a state employee⁹¹, an immigrant found refuge in the Ottoman state⁹² or a widowed mother⁹³, even a father who simply applied to central administration due to financial difficulty to support his twins⁹⁴. It was enough for the applicant to mention his/her

⁸⁸ See BOA *I.DH.* 7339 (1263) ; BOA *I.MV.* 2632 (1264) ; BOA *I.MV.* 11386 (1270) ; BOA *I.MV.* 10700 (1269 22 N) ; BOA *I.MV.* 14228 (1271) ; BOA *I.DH.* 23294 (1272) ; BOA *I.DH.* 24316 (1273) ; BOA *I.DH.* 2461A (1273.28) ; BOA *I.DH.* 24808 (1273).

⁸⁹ For details of this account, please see Abdülaziz Bey, *Osmanlı Adet, Merasim ve Tabirleri*, 2 vols. , (İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 2002), 2 :25-28.

⁹⁰ See Ahmet Akgündüz, *Mukayeseli İslam ve Osmanlı Hukuku Külliyyâtı* (Diyarbakır: Dicle Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Yayınları, 1986), 154, 232-233.

⁹¹ For the request of a *zaptiyye neferi* (policeman) for such a benefit, see BOA Irade Dahiliye 15291-1268.

⁹² BOA *I.DH.* 15507 (1268).

⁹³ BOA *I.DH.* 18605 (1270) and *I.MV.* 11556 (1270).

⁹⁴ BOA *I.DH.* 15702 1268.

family size and the number of dependent children. Generally speaking, Ottoman administration did not reject such requests, and in the capital city, these salaries were paid either from *İstanbul Emtia Gümrüğü* (İstanbul Commodity Custom) or *Dâhiliyye Nezâret-i Celilesi Hazinesi* (The Treasury of the Ministry of Interior). The corresponding offices in provincial areas made the similar payments to provincial claimants. The granting of these salaries was represented as “his majesty-sultan’s benevolence” and “imperial alms”, in a way underlining the paternalist dimension in these welfare measures. It can also be argued with respect to the content of these documents that rearing, and breast-feeding of the abandoned infants and children became a kind of “nursing” and “wet-nursing” under state employment. Although there are hundreds of cases, the following ones exemplify this respect quite neatly;

The woman named Halime submitted a petition to *Meclis-i Vâlâ* that she found a deserted baby around *Karagümrük* and she wanted to be entitled a monthly salary, [...] since she is really poor and fitted for benevolence of his majesty [...] the said infant is entitled a monthly stipend of thirty gurus which will be paid [...] until its puberty, and when it reaches its puberty to be cut, [...] ⁹⁵

In order to bring up and care, the woman named Fatma mercifully took the child which was previously left to *zaptiyye* (the police). Since she is very poor, she requested a suitable monthly salary to manage to look after the baby. [...] and it is decided that the said woman is entitled to a monthly stipend which will be given to her to breastfeed the baby and to be cut when the infant stops suckling, [...]. ⁹⁶

The aforesaid support schemes might have been considered sufficient to hinder abortion activity instead of introducing a brand new financial retribution by the sultan and central administration. In addition to this, as argued previously, the vocabulary of thrill; i.e., after-life punishments, surveillance utilized through

⁹⁵ BOA *IMV*. 2632 (1264).

⁹⁶ BOA, *IDH*. 7339 (1263).

neighbors and the penal measures for the ones violating law and disregarding values towards life, were seen adequate and remarkable stipulations and repressive means that the introduction of a new financial disincentive for abortion became unnecessary.

Nevertheless, it can be said that the decree of 1838 marked the beginning of a consistent official discourse and meta- narrative for the anti-abortion regulation which lasted well until the beginning of twentieth century and the end of Hamidian era. However, no penal measure for abortionists and their aides was incorporated into the criminal codes up until the year 1858. For instance neither the first Criminal Code of the Tanzimat, the Criminal Code of 1840, nor the Criminal Code of 1851, which was the comprehensively revised version of the previous, included a single stipulation concerning abortion.⁹⁷ The first legal sanctions against abortion came with the Criminal Code of 1858⁹⁸; article 192 of this criminal code denotes the first penal measures for abortion. Article 192 stipulated the correction of a person who inflicts miscarriage on an expectant woman through a blow or a similar violent act, and fining of the culprit that he/she had to pay *diyet* (indemnity) to the injured party. In other words, the first penal measure about abortion did not include the ones induced abortion. In addition to the *diyet* payment, and circumscribed by the

⁹⁷See Mustafa Öztürk, 199 ; Tahir Taner, “Tanzimat Devrinde Ceza Hukuku”. *Tanzimat I*, 2nd edition, (İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı, 1999), 226-230. As for the none-treatment of abortion in those penal codes Somel argued that the period between 1839-1856, when the codes of 1840 and 1851 were prepared, and the period following 1856, were considerably different in terms of political as well as cultural conditions. For example the administrative reform steps prior to 1856, when Mustafa Reşid Pasha and Sadık Rifat Pasha were active, were not necessarily “westernizing”, but in contrast, Islamic that worldview and sentiments were still colored by Islamic values. However, Crimean War of 1853-1856 signifies a crucial change in terms of Ottoman politics and ruling elite’s inclination to westernizing reforms. During the Crimean War relations between the Ottoman Empire and Europe increased, so were the cultural and diplomatic influence of European states. The influence of France was worth to mention that following the Reform Edict of February 1856, new laws were promulgated which were inspired mainly by French counterparts and sometimes were in opposition to the Sharia.

⁹⁸ The Criminal Code of 1858 was actually an adaptation of the French Criminal Code of 1810, and included series of non-Islamic sanctions in a way constituting an example to the new official attitude towards westernization. However, the articles regarding the correction of abortionists were in full harmony with the Sharia. See Somel, “Osmanlı Son Döneminde” for details.

condition that whether the violence was an intentional one or not, punishment also included servile labor. Article 193 of the Civil Code of 1858, however, provided the correction of the aides to abortionist mothers; medical professionals such as pharmacists, physicians and surgeons would be sentenced to forced labor if they provided abortifacients or any tool which was used for abortion. In a similar way, any person who helped or guided a pregnant woman for abortion would be imprisoned for six months to two-years. This code remained valid though it was amended firstly in 1911 and later in 1926.⁹⁹

It is striking that the Criminal Code of 1858 did not provide any penal measure to the mothers who resorted to abortion in contrast to the stipulations of the decree of 1838, which keenly dictated severe for this group. Depending upon this, it can also be argued that despite the increasing westernizing attitude of elites who introduced legal reforms, the issues pertaining to private law, i.e., family, women, inheritance, and children were still perceived to be under the command of Islamic Law. Quite probably for this reason, the correction of abortionist mothers was not incorporated into the medium of legal reforms for not violating Islamic Law. Moreover, this attitude was in accordance with the traditional Hanafi jurisprudence by which abortion was tolerated if the husband's consent was the case. In turn, for the sake of acknowledging Islamic Law's sanction over individuals and family, only the secondary agents and aides for abortion; i.e., physicians, surgeons, and pharmacists, were deemed accountable for correction. The inclusion of medical professionals and aides in corrective stipulations underlined the idea that these professionals were abusing their authority and knowledge. Instead of establishing repressive means and full control over women's bodies, and family decisions, the

⁹⁹ See Ahmet Akgündüz, *Osmanlı Kanunnâmeleri ve Hukukî Tahlilleri*, (İstanbul: Fey Vakfı, 1990), vol.1 ; and Akgündüz, *Mukayeseli*, 864.

ruling elite of post 1856 period chose to correct and regulate the activities of secondary agents, who were seen responsible to disseminate information and means of abortion. This can also be read as a failure on the part of decision making bureaucracy; they were ardent to construct a fully procreative and pronatalist demographic policy on the one hand. However, they were half-hearted to violate Islamic sanctions over family and private life that they finally had to find a mid-way, that was the development of a comprehensive policy to construct a firm control over medical professionals, i.e. physicians, surgeons, pharmacist and midwives who were deemed accountable for population health and the quality of procreation in general. Parallel to this, repressive measures such as threatening, exile and punishment under the provision of *şer'i şerif* together with child support schemes must have been considered dissuasive enough that secondary agents were punished. All in all, the main motive behind outlawing abortion was a pronatalist one which aimed to increase the population of the empire irrespective of ethno-religious criteria. That means that one hardly finds a claim which pertained to the desire of maximizing the progeny of one specific ethno-religious group until 1880s. Nevertheless, in time, the anti-abortion argument would gain an ethno-religious outlook.

Aligned with the official anti- abortion regulation, abortion became a prevalent issue of public health for press and advice genre around 1870s. Slightly before and during 1870s, firstly, the articles in newspapers and scientific journals started to be published to propagate abortion's evil impact over the individual, society and population as well as contesting its incompatibility with regard to religion and civil law. Following quotes exemplify the hazards that abortion inflicted over individual, society and population as represented in the Ottoman press;

[...] as it is well –known by everybody that the promotion of a country’s might and glory is contingent with the increase of its inhabitants, every individual [in that country] is responsible to contribute this [aim], [...] Alas! In addition to the various factors which prevent our inhabitants’ multiplication, there is one more detrimental factor called abortion, which is practiced un-constrainedly. Since abortion’s hazards are not limited only to a specific section of society like plague, cholera and wars, and abortion comprehends whole community, this activity can decrease a country’s population to its half little by little. Therefore, we believe that it is one of the most crucial matters to forbid this detrimental activity and protect a nation from its calamities. [...] The hazards occurred due to abortion are two fold; harms to individual and harms occurred to community. Individual harms occur in the body of abortionists. [...] The adoption of severe methods [...] influences the mother before the fetus. It is also evident that even if the mother does not die, she will suffer a lot and be bed-ridden. [...] The social hazards of abortion, which are often inflicted on a country, regards the diminishing of the numbers of people in a given society and curtailment of a nation’s progress and happiness.¹⁰⁰

[...] Since the whole achievements of human beings are the products of their adjoining ideas and mutual endeavors, when population decreases it is sure that human achievements also diminish. [...] If we are to perform our biggest duty, we should devotedly work for increasing our population. Because we are suffering more through troubles due to fewness of our population than the civilized countries, who are frightened by the outcomes of probable increase of their population. We have a regulation called “Regulation of Public Education” by which the state obliges our people to study through its taking charge of the provisions for education. It is required by this regulation that schools are to be built in every half-an hour distance. Whatever the case, [...] noble intentions or financial sacrifices, since one can hardly find a four-household-village even in a two –hour- distance in the greater parts of our country, how it is possible to benefit from the Regulation of Public Education? [...] While the majority of provinces in our country are depopulated, who will produce to feed the railway stations? [...] In the time of Sultan Süleyman [the Law-giver], not only in the Ottoman dominions, but also in these core provinces there was a population more than 100 million, now there is not even 40 million. Our dominion is five times bigger than France, [but] our population is but lesser than France. With this diminishing population, in which way we will be able to confront the friend and foe? How will we succeed to restore our ancestors’ age of felicity and prosperity with respect to the requirements of our age? [...] and why did we become so few? [...] I wonder, whether our population is diminishing. Are we aware if we are diminishing? Or did we start increasing? [...] According to the assumptions laid by researchers, population increases one time in 25 to 26 years.[...] If we conform to this natural law of population increase, we will be able to bring our nation to the level of highly populous civilized countries to which we admire their level of prosperity. Then, what is the reason which prevents our fatherland to achieve this aim? According to experts, the factors

¹⁰⁰ Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey, “İskat-ı Cenin”, *Mecmua-i Fünun*, 41 (December 1866) :189-192.

which inhibit population increase worldwide are classified into two; one is the factors which cause population decrease, and the other one is the factors which prevents population increase.[...] [after having examining factors which cause population decrease, it can be said that] abortion is the most heart-breaking disasters in Ottomandom [causing population decrease]. It is even so widespread that once upon a time there were skilled and authorized executioners called “bloody midwives” to perform it.¹⁰¹

Basiretçi Ali Efendi¹⁰²(1838-1910) reported as follows ; “Abortion is one of the greatest crimes canonically and legally. [...] since the degree of wickedness of abortion is known by everybody, the absolute prohibition of this [abortion] is one of the most incumbent duties of all.”¹⁰³ Namık Kemal¹⁰⁴ (1840-1888) tested the incompatibility of abortion with regard to law and religion similarly, however, used thrilling expressions so that masses would be informed more effectively;

One of the most unbelievable things in the world is our women’s resort to abortion. The same mothers, who shed bloody tears for the babies they lost immediately after their birth for years and years, purposefully ruin the lives of the babies whom they have not seen and which are secured in their own bodies as the product of their lives. These [women] are ruthless; they neither fear God nor feel ashamed before the Prophet. They never think that they are

¹⁰¹ Namık Kemal, “Nüfus”, *İbret*, 9, 19 Rebiyyü’l ahir 1289/ 13 June 1288/ 14 June 1872, 1-3.

¹⁰² He was originally a minor clerk in the Ottoman financial bureaucracy. His journalism career began in *Takvim-i Vekayi* (Official Gazette) and in time he became the director of this newspaper. However, he took the epithet “Basiretçi” after he started to publishing Basiret, a daily newspaper a daily newspaper widely read among conservative Muslims of İstanbul, which was published beginning from 23 January 1870 till 1878, then for couple of months after 1878. This newspaper was one of the most influential newspapers in Ottoman Turkish and hosted many different Young Ottoman authors, and published critical articles about internal political affairs, which infuriated the central bureaucracy from time to time. He also published a satirical journal titled *Kahkaha* in 1875 for eight months. See Nuri Sağlam, *Basiretçi Ali Efendi: İstanbul Mektupları*, (İstanbul: Kitabevi, 2001).

¹⁰³ As excerpted from Basiretçi Ali Efendi, “Şehir Mektubu no:52”, *Basiret*, 1070, 10 Ramazan 1290/ 17 Teşrin-i Evvel 1289/ 1 November 1873, 1-2

¹⁰⁴ Namık Kemal was one of the most important political critics in the second half of the nineteenth century. As a nineteen century bureaucrat, columnist, poet, novelist and political critic, he contributed to the political criticism which made the parliamentary reform and constitutional parliamentarianism possible in the last phase of the Ottoman State. He was exiled due to his political ideas, and he had to escape to London. For a deep biographical information see Roderic H. Davison, *Essays in Ottoman and Turkish History, 1774-1923; The Impact of the West*, (Austin: Texas University Press, 1990) ; Şerif Mardin, *The Genesis of Young Ottoman Thought: A Study in the Modernization of Turkish Political Ideas*, (Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2000).

putting their own lives into danger in the course of killing children in such a cruel way which would not even suit to scorpions and snakes. [...] [in general] such kind of an abominable deed against humanity is immediately returned a divine punishment, that would not let them to have comfortable lives due to painful illnesses, or cause them to die out in torment. The mothers who cannot bear to watch animals being sacrificed should know that deliberate miscarriage is the most abominable crime in the world.¹⁰⁵

It was generally believed that Ottoman people resorted to abortion due to their ignorance about the hazards of, liabilities and sanctions in the post-abortion period. Therefore, the intellectuals, who used advice genre and press mediums to form a public opinion about abortion, instructed the masses about religious and legal sanctions awaiting abortionists. Following quote from Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey¹⁰⁶ (1840-1878) exemplifies this point very well;

If the results of abortion cases and investigations [thereupon] are revealed through newspapers, there will be a degree of admonition and vigilance in the minds of people, and since one of the responsibilities of the Ministry in charge [the Ministry of Police] is to investigate this practice carefully, and determining the reasons behind it is an incontestable matter, the result and course of these cases, and their investigation should be announced to enlighten the public.¹⁰⁷

A similar ignorance was also the case for abortion-related injuries; for example Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey warned his readers that “none of the measures for

¹⁰⁵ As excerpted from Namık Kemal, “İskat-ı Cenin”, *Hadika*, 15, 28 Teşrin-i Sâni 1288/ 27 Ramazan 1289/ 28 November 1872 , 1-2

¹⁰⁶ A military physician specialized on pathology and internal medicine. He took part in the establishment of Imperial Faculty of Medicine in 1867, and became its first director, and instructed medical students on internal medicine, pathology, physics and chemistry. He also participated to the foundation of Turkish Red Crescent Organization in 1868. See Mehmed Süreyya, *Sicill-i Osmani*, 6 vols, (Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı, İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 1996) 345; also see Arslan Terzioğlu ed., *Beiträge zur Geschichte der türkische-islamischen Medizin*, (İstanbul: Isis, 1996).

¹⁰⁷ As excepted from Basiretçi Ali Efendi, “Şehir Mektubu no:52”, 1-2.

abortion is absolutely effective”.¹⁰⁸ He furthered his claims as follows that “putting one’s own self to danger for this [abortion], whose impacts are uncertain, is the sign of absolute foolishness and ignorance that it does not even require explanation.”¹⁰⁹ In addition to their unawareness about the perils of abortion, people’s religious and patriotic inclination was also questioned. People, who induced deliberate miscarriages, were neither proper believers nor appropriate subjects as represented in the press :

[...] The murder [abortion] of an innocent is enough to stain the honor of a great nation, even that of whole humanity till the day of Last Judgment. We are Muslim, we are human, and we should abstain from this abominable corruption which would even shockingly discourage an executioner! We should think whether it is desirable to be more loath-some than devil in the way our descendants and successors will remember us? ¹¹⁰

All of the authors, who dealt with the abortion issue, were males, therefore it is not surprising to find a truly male, and to a certain degree a misogynist, dimension in their conception of abortion. In the majority of cases, women were represented as “evil perpetrators” who failed to behave in accordance with the womanly duties, which were strictly maternal with respect to the religious-moral, legal and medical stances these authors took. For instance, Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey argued that “only women who are deprived of shame and good manners commit abortion” ¹¹¹, which was inexcusable under any condition. Namık Kemal was more enthusiastic and talented both for questioning women’s maternal inclination and employing a

¹⁰⁸ As excerpted from Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey , “İskat-ı Cenin”, 190-191.

¹⁰⁹ As excerpted from *ibid.*

¹¹⁰ As excerpted from Namık Kemal, “Nüfus”, 3.

¹¹¹ As excerpted from Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey, 190.

thrilling vocabulary to portray abortionist women. He believed that by inducing abortions women digressed from a must, that is motherhood, which was a proper feminine task;

Why a mother, who deliberately attacks the innocent in her own womb for her comfort, does not eat the babies she delivered like cats do [when they cannot take care of their offspring] ? As if it is not enough for them [our women] to spend excessively on clothing and ruin the wealth of community, hurt the nation's decency in excursion places [...] in Holy Days [...], poison the children of hope with pasties and opium to sleep comfortably at night, and in sum if it is not enough for them to be not useful but harmful, they send the unborn innocents, which heed their compassion and pity, to the grave in order to not carry them inside their womb for couple of months.¹¹²

How is it possible for a human being to attack so cruelly the life of an innocent gained through a two-minute [sexual] pleasure that has not even seen the world and has not been breast-fed by its mother? I wonder, how come a mother can kill her beloved child, which has not been corporealized and ensouled, though the same mother would sacrifice herself in order to prevent [her] children in her lap for a very simple matter directed towards them.¹¹³

As it is also revealed from the quote above, Namık Kemal inquired upon the socially and culturally idolized motherly affection for already born children that he criticized the way fetus was treated in the course of abortion. He basically claimed that whether unborn or already born, women were obliged to have a motherly affection towards children for moral, religious and personal reasons. This was not so striking given the fact that “Ottoman motherhood” was also under scrutiny of both advice genre and official regulations.

It is previously argued in the context of 1838 decree that abortionist were distinguished as the ones who had financial difficulties to raise children and the ones who were over indulged in their personal comfort. Advice genre and press medium

¹¹² As excerpted from Namık Kemal, “İskat-ı Cenin”, 1-2.

¹¹³ As excerpted from Namık Kemal, “Nüfus”, 2-3.

also differentiated abortionist, however, their classification of abortionists surpassed the official one in terms its elaborations. In other words, they incorporated the analysis of additional but significant factors which characterized the course of Ottoman familial life together with financial and personal reasons of abortion. In turn, anti-abortion regulation and propaganda became enhanced;

I personally admit that not all of the abortions are performed due to non-existence of motherly affection or the ill belief that having lesser children are better. It is often the case that mother in law and sister in law in a household are at the top position in terms of managing the household matters, and the brother or son gets married one day. Beginning from that day, a disastrous rivalry breaks out [at home]. After the birth of the first child [...], any affectionate treatment between husband and wife is evaluated as another new pregnancy. When a new pregnancy appears, the bride becomes subjected to unbelievable insults and scorning [...], and this legitimate pregnancy creates problems for the mother even more than an illegitimate one. Since advice-giving women are never absent in any neighborhood, it is enough to decide a deliberate miscarriage in couple of gatherings in balconies, or around the kitchen. Due to the wicked zeal of treacherous old women [mothers in law or sisters in law], this innocent baby is periled. And its helpless young mother also passes away afterwards.

In our country, abortion is performed due to some contemptible men who are indulged both in their wives' aggression and their lust. These men take concubines in secrecy and after they impregnate these concubines, they leave them and the children to the villainy of their wives.¹¹⁴

As it is revealed from the long quote from Namık Kemal, familial distress as an integral feature of extended families and the presence of in-laws and concubinage were pushing factors for certain women to perform abortion *vis-à-vis* demonized abortionists¹¹⁵. The tension among in-laws and brides at home were reported as ordinary everyday troubles of Ottoman domestic life by certain contemporaries as

¹¹⁴ As excerpted from Namık Kemal, "İskat-ı Cenin", 2-3.

¹¹⁵ See previous page, and footnote # 114.

well.¹¹⁶ It is well known that the practice of concubinage (*cariyelik*)¹¹⁷ and domestic slavery were common customs in Ottoman society, especially for higher income households.¹¹⁸ Namık Kemal combined his well-known distaste both for concubinage, as one of the major evils in Ottoman households, and familial disaccord with the critique of abortion.¹¹⁹ He depicted the situation of young brides and concubines as victims in his argumentation that they had to perform deliberate miscarriages for evading ill-treatment and securing a peaceful life.

While conceptualizing motives behind abortion as factors generated by the displeasing features of Ottoman domestic life, Basiretçi Ali Efendi chose to put Ottoman Muslim males' attitude towards family and marriage under criticism;

It is evident that taking a woman as a wife and divorcing her is canonically legitimate, but divorce requires to be based on a legitimate excuse, which is also canonically defined. However, some men do not know those legitimate reasons for divorce, and they divorce their wives causelessly, [...]. It is both sinful and quite shameful for one to leave his wife either due to sudden burst

¹¹⁶ See Balıkhane Nazırı Ali Rıza, *Eski Zamanlarda İstanbul Hayatı*, (İstanbul: Kitabevi Yayınları, 2001), 30-31 for the break of such rivalries and familial distress. Also see Melikzâde Fuad, *Vezâif-i Beytiyyeden Hanımlara Aile Dersleri*, (İstanbul: Şirket-i Mürettebiye Basımevi, 1325/ 1909-1910), 105-108. Ottoman novels after 1890s also treated this issue quite often. See fourth chapter for details.

¹¹⁷ Cariyelik is used to denote the status of female slaves utilized for domestic slavery in Ottoman society. According to Islamic Law, Muslim males could legitimately demand sexual services from female slaves in addition to their domestic services, and they could get married if the owner demanded. Generally speaking, some female slaves were given free status after giving birth to the heirs of their masters. However, pregnancy and child-birth guaranteed neither emancipation nor marriage since the determination of paternal ancestry and paternity was left to the master's consent. For this respect, see Akgündüz, *Mukayeseli*, 151-158, 221-238; Şefika Kurnaz, *II. Meşrutiyet Döneminde Türk Kadını*, (İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı, 1996), 118-119; Yusuf Hakan Erdem, *Slavery in the Ottoman Empire and Its Demise, 1808-1909*, (New York: St. Martin's Press, 1996) ; Madeline C.Zilfi, "Osmanlı'da Kölelik ve Erken Modern Zamanda Kadın Köleler", *Osmanlı Ansiklopedisi*, 7 vols., (Ankara: Yeni Türkiye Yayınları, 1999), 5: 474-479.

¹¹⁸ See İlber Ortaylı, *Osmanlı Toplumunda Aile*, (İstanbul: Pan Yayıncılık, 2001), 129-131; Ehud R. Toledano, "Attitude to Slavery During the Tanzimat", *150. Yılında Tanzimat*, ed. Hakkı Dursun, (Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1998) ,303-324; Y.Hakan Erdem, *Slavery*.

¹¹⁹ For Namık Kemal's critique over familial troubles and the situation of Ottoman households, see his article "Aile", *İbret*, 56, 18 Ramazan 1289/ 7 Teşrin-i Sâni 1288/7 November 1872, 1-2.

of anger out of fractiousness or seeking for new pleasures after living together for a while.¹²⁰

Though population increase is one of the primary factors which guarantees the future and [might] of a nation, and it is paid attention accordingly, we neglect this issue, [...]. [...] there is no benefit scheme for the destitute. Due to this, many poor women abstain from giving birth. Some of them search the ways through which they do not give birth at all, and a great deal of them look for the ways they deliberately miscarry their infants immediately after they realize their pregnancy. Because of these factors, our population is diminishing day by day instead of multiplication. This matter is to be of interest for all of us. Therefore, our people should recourse to their purse of gratitude and vigor to constitute a support scheme.¹²¹ [...]

The financial hardships and the practice of “causeless and illicit divorces” were represented as the factors triggered women’s poverty that they had no other way but choosing abortion. Indeed, the records of Islamic courts provide numerous cases for divorce which took place by the males’ unilateral procurement of separation formula in a way supporting Basiretçi Ali Efendi’s argument.¹²² Though Islamic Law set the terms and conditions of divorce clearly¹²³, the issue of divorce was still an ambiguous matter since it could take place without applying to the court.¹²⁴

¹²⁰ As excerpted from Basiretçi Ali Efendi, “Şehir Mektubu 6” , *Basiret*, 791, 28 Ramazan 1289/29 November 1872, 1-2.

¹²¹ As excerpted from *ibid.*

¹²² For this respect see Muhiddin Tuş, Adnan Gürbüz, Ömer Demirel, “Osmanlı Ailesi ile İlgili Şer’iyye Sicillerinden Seçilen Örnek Belgeler” in *Sosyo Kültürel Değişme Sürecinde Türk Ailesi*, 3vols, (Ankara: T.C.Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu Yayınları, 1992), 3: 849-875. See also Leslie Peirce, ““She is Trouble and I will Divorce Her”: Orality, Honor and Representation in the Ottoman Court of Aintab”, in *Women in the Medieval Islamic World: Power, Patronage, and Piety*, ed. G.R.G Hambly, (New York: St. Martin’s Press 1999), 279.

¹²³ Islamic Law set the terms and conditions of *talak* (divorce) clearly, see Ahmet Akgündüz, *Mukayeseli*, pp.195-219 for this respect that divorce is defined as a right of the husband and it is enough for a married man to be a divorcee after pronouncing the separation formula either out of anger, sobriety or vice versa without consulting the legal advisories. However, alimony and maintenance allowances, and the repayment of women’s dowry are the issues required application to courts and legal verdict. More precisely, the dissolution of marriage itself was left to the husband’s unilateral pronouncement of the following separation formula: “*boş ol*” (I divorce you), and there was no limitation for a Muslim husband in terms of finding valid causes for divorce; males’ claim to divorce was always valid and legitimate. Thus, divorce could be used for anything, and anything would be valid before the Sharia. See Leslie Peirce for details.

¹²⁴ With respect to Islamic stipulations, Muslim males did not need to initiate and realize divorce before the court; it was enough for them to pronounce the divorce formula whereas wives had to look

Therefore, by underlining Muslim men's canonically sanctioned stronger position to initiate divorce, Basiretçi Ali argued that women were vulnerable to be left behind with material difficulties in the aftermath of divorce. In the absence of support schemes for widowed, deserted and divorced pregnant women, abortion became the only viable solution.

Definitely necessitated by his professional alignment and position to write for a popular scientific journal, Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey felt the need to contribute anti-abortion discourse by providing a comparison over "necessary(medical)" and "evil" abortions, which were remained untouched by the anti-abortion regulation;

In fact, under certain circumstances, abortion is legitimate and necessary. That is to say, the womb can have problems as opposed to its natural course, and pregnancy can put the mother's life into danger during delivery. Therefore, the fetus is aborted with the help of an expert. Apart from this legitimate cause, abortion is not permitted for any reason and excuse, [...] however, only women, who are deprived of shame and good manners, commit this activity.¹²⁵

Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey's approach to the issue of abortion demonized women, who resorted to this medium without legitimate reasons, such as health problems. However, he did not provide a detailed instruction about what kinds of health problems were legitimate to perform abortion. Moreover, he did not make any references to other unwanted pregnancies such as post –rape pregnancies repeating

for more explicit reasons for divorcing their husbands (i.e., absenteeism, violence, sexual impotence, poverty, or material negligence and reluctance), and appeal to the court for legal sanctions underlining these causes for their own and children's benefit. Divorce was permitted by Islam, and easy to be initiated and realized by the husband, on the other hand women needed to apply to the court. All in all, whether it was initiated and realized by the husband, or initiated by women in the form of appeal to the court, divorce needed to be registered at court in order to avoid violating the Islamic sanction over illegitimate forms of cohabitations and adultery, which would probably cause suspicions and confusions among co-believers about the divorced couples, and thus a complicate social matters through mutual responsibilities. See *ibid*.

¹²⁵ As excerpted from Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey, 189-190.

the approach of anti-abortionist league in 1870s. Depending upon this, it can be suggested that enhancement of anti-abortion regulation through press and advice genre was limited in terms of their omission of rape and out-of wed-lock pregnancies. However, he was the first figure who incorporated the issue of medical abortion which was non-existent in the anti-abortion decrees up until this era. Pregnancies in the aftermath of “illegitimate” intercourses, and more precise medical information over “necessary” abortion were in due to be integrated into to the anti-abortion discourse between late 1890s and early 1900s. Besides, the conceptualization of medical and necessary abortion was closely related to the evolution of medical professions and sovereignty of truth over all *savoirs privilégiés*¹²⁶ in Ottoman context. All in all, Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey was the first one to acknowledge medical abortion due to his concern over un-professionally done but legitimate (health-related) abortions regarding women incapable of delivery. He reported that “fetus should be aborted with the help of an expert.”¹²⁷ These issues will be analyzed in the following parts of this chapter after conceptualizing the events that anti-abortion regulation shaped after 1870s.

Another important classification about abortionist mothers was based on class and status differences in 1870s. As already mentioned, Namık Kemal complained about impairing potential of extravagancy and material comfort, which were enjoyed in wealthy households, towards womanly responsibilities. He also uttered the

¹²⁶ See Michael Foucault, *The Birth of the Clinic : An Archeology of Medical Perception*, Trans. From French by A.M. Sheridan, First American Edition, (New York: Pantheon Books, 1973) for this concept. By *savoirs privilégiés*, Foucault discusses the establishment of the sovereignty of truth over all privileged forms of knowledge, i.e. midwifery, through structural reforms in medicine, and he exemplifies this situation through the professionalization of all medical activities, and subjection of midwives to the doctors, medical corporations to medical schools, and licensing of the persons who would be the health professionals during the Revolution. For a detailed discussion of this point, also see Phyllis Stock-Morton, “Control and Limitation of Midwives in Modern France: The Example of Marseille”, *Journal of Women’s History*, 8/1(1996): 63-64.

¹²⁷ As excerpted from Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey, 189.

insecure position of young brides and concubines in Ottoman households.¹²⁸ Basiretçi Ali Efendi also provided the conception over women's poverty due to asymmetric nature divorce process. In another article, Basiretçi Ali argued that ignorant and lower class women reached and made use of abortifacients while they were looking for other child-care measures, which were deemed ill and traditional.¹²⁹ These ill child-care practices included the use of opium and variety of herbal extracts for consoling uneasy children. Such measures were represented as epitomizing lower class women in Basiretçi Ali Efendi's argumentation that only women in this echelon took care of their own children, while women of higher income groups left these task to nannies, wet nurses and concubines. Therefore, if there was a problem called abortion, it was due to the poverty and lack of opportunity to have outside assistance for child care that women of humble classes resorted to abortion. In sum, he believed that child care was not something easy, and women of lower social classes disposed the help and assistance of nannies, wet nurses and concubines. Yet, above all, it can be suggested that the idea of Ottoman women's class and status –related resort to deliberate miscarriages was further clarified by Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey. In contrast to Basiretçi Ali Efendi, abortion was widespread among the wealthy. He reports as follows;

This evil practice [abortion] is quite common among us, since *wealthy people inclined to extravagancy and dissipation*, they want to spare themselves from the duty of giving birth and rearing children, and thereupon prevent themselves from getting pregnant by variety of ways that they improved among themselves. [Nevertheless] when pregnancy occurs accidentally, they ruthlessly abort it [...].

¹²⁸ See previous quotes from Namık Kemal and Basiretçi Ali Efendi in this chapter.

¹²⁹ Basiretçi Ali Efendi, "Şehir Mektubu 20", *Basiret*, 416, 26 Rebiyülahir 1288/15 July 1871, 2.

Generally, *women from wealthy households* guarantee their marriages after giving birth to one or more children, they abort their children with the fear that their bodily disposition and their lives would be distorted and distressed with many children. With respect to these [upper class women], *women of middle stratum* abstain from this blame-worthy behavior.¹³⁰

Analogous to Namık Kemal's stance, Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey constituted his argumentation by referring to the deviation from proper gender roles, that is, birth-giving and mothering. He predominantly scolded women of upper class households that his claims became really moralistic, yet vaguely judgmental in the absence of case studies regarding real abortion data with respect to class and social-economic background. Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey made another claim by arguing that abortion was more prevalent among Muslims *vis-à-vis* the non-Muslims. Through quite a rough scientific approach, he combined losses in the course of abortion with that of natural birth rate among Muslims, and he warned the public about abortion's overlooked decisiveness for the decline of Muslim population in a way forerunning Hamidian ethno-religious stance against abortion in 1890s;

With respect to its climate and geographical position, here in İstanbul women are able to give birth between their 15th to 45th ages. If we suppose that the number of women between the ages of 15 to 45 is one hundred fifty thousand out of whole female population of six hundred thousand and if each of these reproductive women commit abortion once in their life time, in thirty years time, which is the average life expectancy, one hundred fifty thousand children would be ruined. Again, if we suppose that monthly amount of deaths among Muslim inhabitants of İstanbul is 400, and its 30-year period sum is 140 thousand, it is obvious that even the aforesaid 30 –year- sum is lesser than the children ruined through abortion. Since non-Muslims and other ethnic groups rarely commit abortion, their populations are increasing as compared to Muslims. As the responsibility of military service, which causes many losses and hardships, solely belongs to Muslims, the increase of Muslim population should be paid attention for the well being and conservation of society. The most serious of the factors which inhibits this [population increase] is abortion, and it must be prohibited [...].¹³¹

¹³⁰ As excerpted from Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey, 190. Emphases are added.

¹³¹ As excerpted from *ibid.*, 192

Anti-abortion discourse and related propaganda in 1870s was not limited to advice literature and press. The theatre genre, a medium extensively used by Ottoman intellectuals to instruct masses, was also utilized for abortion issue. Abortion, as a theme, was depicted as one of the social ills depriving both Ottoman society and the Ottoman Muslim family in a play published by Hasan Bedreddin Pasha¹³² (d.1912) around 1873-1874.¹³³ This play is in fact about a romance resolved into a marriage. This couple manages to get married in the expense of a third person, the cousin of the bride. Şevki, the cousin, becomes alienated and resentful due to this romantic marriage since he fails to become an affluent man by being rejected by his uncle's daughter, Afife. Therefore, Şevki plots a vengeance by manipulating the doctor to whom Afife consults for her pregnancy. On the ill-recommendations of this doctor that she is unable to give birth, Afife aborts her baby. However, the abortion is a fatal one and she dies in vain, leaving her beloved husband and family property behind. Then, her husband also dies in grief of his wife and the unborn baby.

This play is crucial since it underlines the role of midwives and non-Muslim physicians for guiding women to abortion. Though the female protagonist, Afife, does not want to have an abortion and she is depicted as a mere victim under the abuse of "deceitful" medical functionaries, abortion is condemned as a product of her and her husband's own ignorance. Afife's trust to her "ignorant" but innocent wet-nurse to decide on the necessity of abortion also emphasizes the acclaimed

¹³² Hasan Bedreddin also known as Hasan Bedri Paşa. An instructor at the Imperial Academy of War who was specialized on explosive military equipment and cosmography. He was the person who made the first translations of European operas into Ottoman Turkish, with his colleague Manastırlı Rıfat Bey. See Bursalı Mehmet Tahir, *Osmanlı Müellifleri*, 3 vols. (Ankara: Bizim Büro Basımevi, 2000), 2: 2.

¹³³ Hasan Bedreddin Paşa, *Iskat-ı Cenin. Facia*, (İstanbul: 13 No.lu Matbaa, 1874-1875).

unpleasant role of female-information flow in Ottoman society both for women's and their whole families' welfare. There is no evidence whether this play had ever been staged or not, however, the play itself is crucial for three respects. Firstly, theatre genre's potential for propaganda and instruction was acknowledged, if one considers the literacy level of masses in the Ottoman Empire. Hasan Bedreddin Paşa might have chosen to write a play instead of a column in a newspaper for this reason. Secondly, though actual abortion data has not been obtained through the archival research for the time being, it is crucial that a member of the ruling elite wrote such a play. He must have been alarmed women's frequent resort to abortion in that specific era. There is also a possibility that Ottoman administration requested from him to write such a play in an era abortion issue became popular and crucial. Thirdly, Hasan Bedreddin himself must have preferred to write a play since he had been dealing with performing arts and abortion was a tragic phenomenon and fervent debate to be utilized.

2.3.2. Anti Abortion Regulation and Discourse Between 1880s and 1900s

The second consistent effort outlawing abortion but promoting population progeny came during the reign of Abdülhamid II (1876-1908). However, an ethno-religious perspective predominantly imprinted itself to this second significant attempt. In other words, between late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries, issue of abortion and pronatalism revisited through an ethno-religious perspective that Ottoman administration reflected its concerns about diverse and conflicting population figures of different ethno-religious groups. For example, disproportionate and declining

Muslim population vis-à-vis the non-Muslims groups across the empire became an important reference for anti-abortion and pronatalist policies.¹³⁴ Basically, Hamidian administration handled the issue of abortion from an ethno-religious angle that anti-abortion regulation clearly identified a specific group whose progeny and decline concerned and desired to the exclusion of others.

Up until the year 1889, Hamidian administration did not introduce a new measure to prevent abortion. As demographic studies report, abortion was still widespread among the inhabitants of the capital city despite the previous regulations.¹³⁵ Probably motivated by the *journals* reporting the prevalence of abovementioned abortion activity and other means of the police state he founded, Abdülhamid II demanded from his administrators to introduce new measures to curb abortion activity in 1889.¹³⁶ Among these measures, utilization of anti-abortion viewpoints from Islamic Law was the first resort. In the year 1890, Abdülhamid II ordered to the Council of Ministers to initiate the preparation of a collection, which would provide *hadiths* (prophetic traditions) together with references to Islamic Law, popular reason and science about the impropriety of abortion.¹³⁷ The same order also

¹³⁴ The Ottoman-Russo War of 1877-1878, consequent Congress of Berlin (June-July 1878) and dwindling of Ottoman territories in the Balkans marked a change in the perception of Ottoman administration about subject populations; these developments caused a concern over empire's territorial and political integrity that consequent demographic shift in favor of Muslim population translated into a new direction that Ottoman Muslim population became the only trustworthy and essential demographic constitute. With the advent of time, and thanks to the autocratic rule of Abdülhamid II, the term Ottoman, which used to denote all subjects irrespective of ethno-religious difference in the post 1839 period, was replaced by a special focus on Muslim subjects that official concerns regarding supposed decline of Muslim population, and related critical questions over ethno-military issues arose. As a result, the disciplinary function of the Ottoman state increased while seriously underlining the decadence and decrease of Muslim population, which became a reference population for the empire which was politically and territorially in crisis.

¹³⁵ See Alan Duben & Cem Behar, *Istanbul Households. Marriage, Family and Fertility 1880-1940* (Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press 1991), 181-184 for this respect..

¹³⁶ See *ibid.* 183-184.

¹³⁷ The Proceedings of The Cabinet [*Zabıt Varakası*] dated 5 Ca 1308/ 17 December 1890 indicates; “a statement which includes certain verses and Mohammedan anecdotes about the impropriety of abortion together with canonical and scientific references was prepared by the order of his Majesty

dictated the assessment of this collection by the office of the Chief Mûfti in terms of its compatibility with Islam.¹³⁸ Consequently, cabinet discussed this suggestion on a meeting dated 17 December 1890, and they came to a decision that such a publication would indeed be helpful to persuade the public about the personal and social detriments of abortion. While identifying the hazards of abortion on Ottoman society and Islamic community, this document also declared anti-abortion standpoint as an official discourse.¹³⁹ The amalgamation of religious and rational-scientific opinions over the perils of abortion for propagating anti-abortion regulation was not new. The same incorporation was already present in the decree of 1838. However, what made this order significant was the response of Abdülhamid II, who clearly aimed to mobilize all available ideological resources for the propagation of anti-abortion regulation. The task of publication, on the other hand, was not accomplished.¹⁴⁰ During the final years of Hamidian rule, an ample report, dated 29 March 1903 /20 *Zilhicce* 1320, was prepared to examine the motives behind and necessary precautions against abortion. This current report was in accordance with the previous narrative on abortion for referring its evil influences over population, economic activity at large and the welfare of the subject people. Moreover, in order

Caliph [;] and the Grand vizier's memorandum on this respect and correspondence about the examination of this document's content by *Şeyh'ül İslam* was discussed in the Cabinet" as excerpted from BOA *MV*. 60/35 (1308 Ca 5).

¹³⁸ Ibid.

¹³⁹ "On its occurrence, abortion causes population decrease. Apart from this, material and spiritual dangers, and treachery accompanying it are self-evident in terms of Islamic community. Therefore, its abomination from canonical and rational points should be explained to the public, [and] rendering and guiding the demonstration of the detriments of abortion in a clear and comprehensible way through the publication of such a useful work [...] is one of the requirements of our time" as excerpted in *ibid*.

¹⁴⁰ The basic bibliographical collections, i.e. Özege collection, and among library collections which hold late-Ottoman works do not include any information whether such an official publication was made.

to reinforce the inexcusable position abortion, it also referred other canon laws, and prophetic deeds;

The issue of progeny and increase of the inhabitants of a nation [country] can be found in many different schemes of canonical law, and there are also glorious verses and prophetic deeds by which marriage is encouraged and population increase is incited.¹⁴¹

The above quote is the indication of Ottoman state's concern towards perpetuating abortion's inexcusable position with regard to religion in the absence of a full Islamic-juristic consensus over the issue. By incorporating the presence of prophetic deeds into its discourse, anti-abortion policies were tried to be more legitimately defended in this report. The abortion issue and pronatalism, however, revisited through an ethno-religious perspective. In the previous period, the anxiety towards population decline was irrespective of ethno-religious criterion; it was a concern crosscutting all Ottoman population. This anxiety shifted into an ethno-religious one in the medium of this report that anxiety of population decline primarily focused on the decline of Muslim population. Muslim population was represented as the reference but at the same time "object" population for the state that concerns regarding the decrease of provincial Muslim population included negative depictions. For example "the ignorant and unwary folk" was the way provincial Muslims were categorized. The use of phrases such as "as reported", "by investigation", "conspicuous and astonishing methods and remedies about which the administration was informed" demonstrated the patronizing and disciplinary discourse late nineteenth century Ottoman administrative apparatus adopted to correct its object population

¹⁴¹ As excerpted from BOA *Y.PRK.AZJ 46/19* (29 Z 1320/ 29 March 1903).

After having one or two children, rural population adopt this malicious method to not to give birth and to save themselves from *the painful burden*¹⁴² and distress [...] on account that they are not able to feed and maintain [their children] by being poor and incapable. At this resort, by investigation, it is not possible to say that this practice is transitive and rare, on the contrary it was reported from a village that five or six pregnant women died out while they were trying to perform deliberate miscarriages. Although it is obvious that the ones commit abortion are liable to correction through the penalties designated and provided in the legal code, *ignorant* and *unwary folk* are incapable to appreciate the degree and content of these punishments. Therefore, they commit this abominable activity in secrecy and the methods they know are really *conspicuous and astonishing*. [...] It should be acknowledged that the people who have already adopted and the ones who have just commenced to commit this shameful deed must be informed about the stipulated punishments so that they will abandon these deeds [...] for the sake of prosperity in the dominions of state.¹⁴³

In addition to these, population progeny and marriage issues were defined as divine requirements by pointing out Islam's acknowledgment over them.¹⁴⁴ Together with the issues of progeny and marriage, the ethno-religious stance by which Muslim progeny deemed crucial was explained as follows;

[...] since military service is solely performed by Muslim subjects with respect to the political organization of Ottoman State, the population increase and incitement for marriage are very crucial issues for Muslim subjects. While this [aforementioned claim] is very important, the claimed progeny and increase of Muslim population in the provinces has been subject to hardships, and crucial and detrimental events have been taking place [...] in a way drawing our majesty's attention.[...] This condition, which causes diminution and deterioration of population, is [called] *iskat-i cenin*.¹⁴⁵

¹⁴² Emphasis is mine.

¹⁴³ Ibid.

¹⁴⁴ "there are also glorious verses and prophetic deeds by which marriage is encouraged and population increase is incited in the religion of *Muhammediye* that we had taken as our way" [...] as excerpted from *ibid*.

¹⁴⁵ As excerpted from *ibid*.

With regard to the quote above, it is apparent that administration of Abdülhamid II treated the issue of abortion from an ethno-religious angle due to its military concerns. As the report suggests, the group of subjects from which recruitment to the army was predominantly made had to be as large as possible. In short, the progeny of Muslim subjects was crucial given that they were the main group from which conscription to army was made. However, this was antithetical to the principles laid down by the reform edicts of Tanzimat, the *Magna Carta* of Ottoman society, and *Islahat*.¹⁴⁶ Such as shift from Ottoman peoples to one group among All Ottoman population can be taken as firstly the indication of a hysteria that emerged parallel to the Ottoman political and military decline. Secondly, it can also be read as the side-effect of Hamidian political affiliation which destined itself to address Muslim masses, who remained as the only loyal stratum in the age of nationalism and nation-states. Thirdly, Ottoman State was becoming a more disciplinary and repressive state that was more interested in the outfit of its “bio-powers”. The bio-powers of the empire were not free from ethno-religious criterion. In other words, the human elements in the empire were selectively approached; the decrease and stagnation of Muslim section, whose military and economic responsibilities were evident, terrorized the administration more than any other one’s.¹⁴⁷

To put it in a different way, towards the end of the nineteenth century, the Ottoman ethos and its perception shifted that the term Ottoman started to denote Muslims more than any other one. Ottoman administration started to address Muslim

¹⁴⁶ With the reform Edict of Tanzimat, regardless of ethnic and national membership, every subject in the empire became suitable for military service. The equality of all Ottoman subjects before the laws was the stipulation perpetuated with the Reform Edict of 1856.

¹⁴⁷ ‘As a result of this detrimental and evil practice, it has been realized that Muslim rural population, which used to constitute the majority of [overall] population twenty years ago, decreased 20 percent both with respect to population and household terms’ as excerpted from BOA *Y.PRK.AZJ 46/19* (29 Z 1320/ 19 -29 March 1903).

subjects of the empire as the main demographic and loyal pillar *vis-à-vis* other subject populations, and alarmed by its demise, pseudo or not.¹⁴⁸ In the light of these remarks, we can argue that the Hamidian era reshaped the discourse on abortion, which was perceived as a social evil, by making references to military and ethnic questions. In the absence of statistical representation which reveals actual abortion rates, it is hard to state whether deliberate miscarriages were habitually performed in late nineteenth century or not. Nevertheless, the representation of abortion as a social evil by means of a repressive and disciplinary discourse is significant.

In some sense, the vocabulary of this document is crucial for positing the features, might and activity axis of a modern state to come about, at least discursively. Ottoman State was transforming, and it was actually under construction that the ambivalences of transformation reflected were also reflected to the “modern regulations. The simultaneous use of religious, paternalistic, and disciplinary vocabulary characterized all regulations produced in that period. This ambivalent discourse was also applicable for anti-abortion regulation;

Except for the ones who are not liable for conscription, such as the people of capital city, and reserving this benefit solely to the people providing *de facto* service to the army, families with more than six children will be granted a reasonable amount of salary. By this measure, parents who sacrificed their children out of no reason, or parents, whose destructive deeds harm and diminish the population of [this] country more than terrible battles and fatal illnesses, will be obstructed from abortion mightily. This decree is issued by our benevolent [...] sultan to provide the precautions that will both assure the multiplicity and prosperity of the noble people of Ottomandom, and save them from the disasters entailed by this abominable and disgusting calamity, which deserves punishment by fire in the next world.¹⁴⁹

¹⁴⁸ The population increase rates with respect to differential ethnic structure of the era can enhance this point.

¹⁴⁹ BOA Y.PRK. AZJ. 46/19- (29 Z 1320)

The financial assistance promise might have been accomplished through schemes like *iane*, *tev'em* benefits or simply in salary forms for the needy, since evidence regarding compensations defined by above quote proved impossible to be gathered for the time being. The doubts regarding the influence of tight police surveillance and vocabulary of thrill also rise with respect to historical evidence in the opening decades of twentieth century. The religious, legal and repressive sanctions on abortion must not have been efficient enough that a German physician managed to open an illegal abortion clinic in *Beyoğlu* around 1900. Having informed about her activities, Hamidian administration tried to expel this female physician, however, the German diplomatic protection she enjoyed enabled her to carry out her activities for five years more. The capitulatory-concessional rights and de facto diplomatic immunity that foreign residents enjoyed in Ottoman Empire stood as obstacles against proper investigation and correction for the ones who engaged in different occupational and professional activities. The administration managed to close down this clinic and extradite *Madam Mari Zibold* in 1905 after abiding and bargain like diplomatic negotiations.¹⁵⁰

It is mentioned previously that advice genre and press medium enhanced the anti-abortion regulation beginning from 1870s onwards. The columnists who chose abortion as a topic basically condemned women through a moral-religious orientation, yet providing an explanation for other reasons for resorting into abortion such as economic reasons, and women's status in general. In 1880s, anti-abortion debate became more diversified by the inclusion of both technical dimensions

¹⁵⁰ See Yavuz Selim Karakışla, "Arşivden Bir Belge. Kürtaj Mütahassısı Alman Doktor Madam Mari Zibold." *Toplumsal Tarih* 82 (October 2000) : 39-44. See also BOA *HI.* 52 (1322 B 14); BOA *HI.* 11 (1322 Ş 4) ; BOA *HI.* 68 (1322 Ş 25) ; BOA *HI.* 47 (1322 N 11) ; BOA *HI.* 53 (1322 N 19) ; BOA *HI.* 32 (1322 L 7) ; BOA *HI.* 37 (1322 L 12); BOA *HI.* 48 (1322 1 17) for the process how this clinic was closed down and related negotiations.

regarding abortion and condemnation of the aides besides abortionists mothers. Quite probably stimulated by the rise of anxiety towards the decline of Muslim population, the language of disciplinary-corrective stance against abortionists became harsher. It even turned into a pure condemnation. Secondly, men were also included into the critique of abortion as irresponsible and apathetic fathers towards what had been taking place in their households. They were characterized the “ill-fated fatherhood” by their attitude towards abortion:

A murderous deed takes place regrettably frequent both in our society and in other countries that it is called abortion [...] [Abortion] is such a barbarous and disgraceful act by which the mother takes the responsibility of being the murderer of her own child as the most eternal misdemeanor. The mischievous ones, who assist or guide this [abortion], also share the liability of murder by partaking in this vileness. When pregnancy recurs, that so called mother, the pregnant unscrupulous, and a couple of disgraceful (*rezile*) [women] altogether arrived at the decision to abort it, [then] it is performed. But in which way? Truly unskillfully and ignorantly. If that so called mother, the idiot, who pitilessly killed her own child, but fortunately did not die, it was indeed a great blessing in contrast to her murder and ingratitude. Then, what about the father? Father never understands such matters, otherwise he would not have let this thing, which is cruel and fatal, to happen. Some fathers believe that women know better than [men]; how detrimental and unimaginable ignorance [they have] ! God forbid! Since they [fathers] did not hinder such a big offence and lethal attempt he would also accomplice in this cruelty. It is only the fathers that would obstruct abortion. Whether due to ignorance or connivance, fathers who allow this [abortion] to happen will be accused more severely than those murderous mothers both before God and humanity.¹⁵¹

As revealed by the quote, fathers were also instructed about the possibility of legal and divine punishment along with abortionists and their confidants, although the Penal Code in practice did not correct parents who chose abortion option for unwanted pregnancies.

¹⁵¹ As excerpted from Ahmed Said, *Hıfz-u Sıhhat-i İzdîvâc ve Tenâsil*, (İstanbul: 1308/ 1892-1893), 13-14.

Ahmed Said¹⁵² provided the critique over abortion as one of the problematic constituents of marital life in Ottoman Muslim households. Moreover, for the first time in the scope of anti-abortion debate, yet featuring the most important moral critique of the milieu¹⁵³, he deliberated “illegitimate intercourses” as the prime factor for women of lower echelons to choose abortion;

Quite often, women feel obliged to abort the babies [fetuses] which are the products of illegitimate deeds [out of wed lock intercourses]. And they perform it. By resorting into such a misdemeanor against the babies they do away with the illegitimacy they are involved. Unfortunately [...] the poor ones are forced to do it since they would be subject to defamation and financial burden if they give birth to these children; however there is no reason for the others, who legitimately conceived, to abort their beloved children.¹⁵⁴

Ahmed Said incorporated father’s responsibility towards unborn children, and he appraised the contemporaneous situation of fatherhood that they were unconcerned about what was going on in women’s world. He criticized the gender regime, which separated the women’s and men’s spheres of life. He also encouraged men to take initiative, and interfere into women’s mysterious and wicked world so that they would obstruct abortion activity. Actually this attitude was in accordance with the new approach that Ottoman men and women were called upon to learn each others’ body, values, psychological and social conditions in the late nineteenth to early

¹⁵² It proved impossible to locate any information on Ahmed Said and his career except the book I cited in the previous footnote.

¹⁵³ Beginning from 1870s onwards and getting fervent in 1890s, moral critiques vis-à-vis super-westernized consumption patterns, women’s dare to appear in public in unusual ways, i.e. dressed up in foreign garments and in vanity, and violation of the limits set by Islamic and cultural values between sexes caused the columnists and intellectuals of the milieu to direct fervent moral critique over contemporaneous moral state of the Ottoman Muslims. These points will be discussed in the next chapter that is constructed to argue upon Ottoman familial life and marriage in the context of nineteenth century social reform.

¹⁵⁴ As excerpted from Ahmed Said, 13-14.

twentieth centuries by the information provided in advice literature.¹⁵⁵ While praising motherhood as a civil and moral duty for women, and circumscribing legitimacy of abortion with respect to the evolution of medical profession, Melikzâde Fuad¹⁵⁶ urged for the correction of abortionist, who digressed from the most important womanly duty, by increasing the tune of condemnation;

It is evident that some monstrous and bestial mothers ruin their infants, who are secured in their womb, through deliberate miscarriage, that is, abortion. Since abortion means the ruin of a gift granted by God, destruction of an innocent is a great crime and sin which necessitates serious legal punishments with respect to law. A mother who purposefully miscarry the infant, which is secured in her womb, is a murderer. She is to be subsequently punished before God. A mother who does not give birth without any legitimate excuse with respect to their health, and mothers who get bored with children are loath-some. In fact, giving birth to, and bringing-up a child is really a difficult

¹⁵⁵ There was actually an explosion of advice and conduct books written for such a purpose that Ottoman intellectuals believed to fill the gap which was thought to be brought by the distanced lives of husbands and wives. Couple of these works are worth to cite; see for example See “Tuhfe-i Mütehhileyn; Altıncı Bab: Keyfiyet-i Dem-i Hayz”, *Hadika*, 25, 8 Cem‘aziyyü’l -evvel 1287/ 24 Temmuz 1286, 192 25; “Tuhfe-i Mütehhileyn; Beşinci Bab: Rical ile Nisanın ‘Aza-yi Tenasiliyesi”, *Hadika*, 14, 1 Cem‘aziyyü’l-evvel 1287 / 17 Temmuz 1286, 182-183; and an untitled article on virginity and sexuality in *Hadika*, 15 Rebiyyü’l-ahir 1287 / 3 Temmuz 1286, 168. Ahmed Midhat, “Âlem-i Medeniyette Kadınların Mevkii”, *Tecüman-ı Hâkikat*, 11-12, 29 June 1878; Şemseddin Sâmî, *Kadınlar* (İstanbul: 1296/ 1880-1881); Mehmed Said, *Vezaif Al’İnas*, (İstanbul: Matbaa-yı amire 1878-1879); Ahmed Midhat, *Gençlik ve Tevhül*, (İstanbul: Kurkanbar Matbaası, 1305/ 1889-1890) ; Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-u Sıhât-i Şebâb*, (İstanbul: 1307/ 1891-1892) ; idem. *Mirat’ül Beyt ; Hanımlara Yadigâr*, (İstanbul: 1308/ 1892-1893) ; *Hıfz-u Sıhât-i Mütehhileyn*, (İstanbul: Şirket-i Mürettebiye Matbaası 1317/ 1901-1902); *Hayât ve Memât ve Aşk-ı İzdivâc*, (İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1315/ 1899-1890) ; *Hocanın Hanım Kızlara Dürûs- ı Ahlâkı*, (İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1315/ 1899-1890) ; *Vesile-i İntibâh*, (İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan, 1318/ 1902-1903) ; Besim Ömer, *Sıhâtümâ-yı Aile yahud Baba, Ana, Çocuk*, (İstanbul: Mahmud Bey Matbaası, 1304/ 1888-1889) ; idem. *Ukum ve İnânet*, (İstanbul: 1306 / 1890-1891) ; Melikzâde Fuad, *Aile Vezaifi ve Terbiye*, (İzmir: Ahenk Matbaası 1319, 1893-1894) ; idem. *Vezaif-i Beytiyyeden Hanımlara Mahsus Aile Dersleri*, (İstanbul: Şirket-i Mürettebiye Basımevi, 1325/ 1909-1910) ; Şekib Akif Nazım, *İslam Hanımlarına Mahsus Fenni ve Ahlaki Mektuplar*, (İstanbul: artin Asodoryan Şirket-i Mürettebiye Matbaası, 1316/ 1900-1901) ; Necmeddin Sami, *Sevda Çiçekleri Yahud İzdivacın Ehemmiyeti*, (İstanbul: Kasbar Matbaası 1312/ 1897-1897); İbnü’l Hakkı Mehmed Tahir, *İzdivac ve Şerait-i Esasiyesi*, (İstanbul: Nefaset Matbaası, 1329/1913-1914) ; Ebu’l Muammer Fuad, *Vezaif-i Aile*, (İstanbul: Kateon Bedrosyan Matbaası, 1328/ 1912-1913) Hâtibzâde Nusred Fuad, *İzdivac ve Şerait-ı Sıhhiyesi*, (İstanbul: 1329/ 1913-1914); Kenan Tevfik. *Kadınlık ve Analık*, (İstanbul: Şems Matbaası, 1913-1914).

¹⁵⁶ Information regarding Melikzade Fuad and his career has not been obtained except his cited works, *Aile Vezaifi*, published in 1893-4 and *Vezaif-i Beytiyyeden Hanımlara Mahsus Aile Dersleri* which was published twice firstly in June 1902 in İzmir, then 1909 in İstanbul. These works were suggested for the curriculum of the secondary schools for girls. Quite probably he was a teacher who instructed his students about Islamic morals and family in secondary schools around İzmir after he graduated from one the higher education schools in İstanbul.

task. Yet, adding up a person to the world of humanity is also a great honor and skill. The innocent smile of a child has an impact that would help a mother to forget about all of her worries and hardships. Children are the treasure of a family; they are their parents' means of comfort and consolation.¹⁵⁷

Melikzâde defined mothering as a duty which bestows happiness and honor. In fact it was not, and especially the aftermath of delivery and taking care of infants were neither easy nor smooth experiences for the majority of mothers as represented in the memoirs of Balıkhane Nazırı Ali Rıza Bey¹⁵⁸ (1842-1928). Ali Rıza Bey offered clues which were unbiased and non--misogynist about why women wanted to terminate their pregnancies as compared to others. First of all, he reported that Ottoman women perceived delivery as a “big disaster” since “quite often, a midwife without capability and proper training became surprised when she realized that the delivery would be an abnormal one.”¹⁵⁹ According to Ali Rıza Bey, when difficult deliveries were the case, “she [midwife] was prone to make mistakes; it was probable that perilous events would take place.”¹⁶⁰ As an alternative to the demonization and condemnation that Ottoman women, who used abortion as a medium, were portrayed as “loath some murderers” up to that time, he chose to depict the post partum period as not happy as it was claimed in Ottoman Muslim households;

¹⁵⁷ As excerpted from Melikzade Fuad, *Vezâif*, 114-115.

¹⁵⁸ Also known as Balıkhane Nazırı (The Director of Imperial Fish Market). A state employee beginning from 1859 at different levels of Ottoman bureaucracy until 1883 when he became the director of the Imperial Fish and Salt Market. He serialized articles about prominent Ottoman statesmen of mid-nineteenth to early twentieth century in newspapers titled *Peyam* and *Peyam-ı Sabah* between 1919-1921. He published his memoirs, which are used for this study, firstly as installments in *Peyam-ı Sabah* between February and March 1921. See Ali Şükrü Çoruk, *Eski Zamanlarda İstanbul Hayatı*, Second Edition, (İstanbul: Kitabevi, 2001).

¹⁵⁹ As excerpted from Balıkhane Nazırı Ali Rıza, *Eski Zamanlarda*, 2-3.

¹⁶⁰ As excerpted from *ibid.*

The familial discord among commoners usually breaks out subsequent to the birth of children. Since wifely care is to be divided into two, the wife becomes imperfect due to exerting herself to the care of the child. She cannot find time to arrange herself properly. On his arrival in the evenings, the husband finds her disheveled. The weakness caused by breastfeeding also occurs besides the discomforts she had had during child-birth and post-partum confinement. Poor woman becomes worn-out and her previous charm disappears.¹⁶¹

The intellectuals of late 1890s and 1900s made their position clear about the distinction between medical-necessary (legitimate) abortion and the illegitimate one. They surely did not deny the question of necessary abortion. However, they deliberated under which circumstances an abortion would be an acceptable solution for the loss of “the root” *vis-à-vis* the loss of its “branch”.¹⁶² For Nusred Fu’ad¹⁶³, a physician from Military School of Medicine, medical abortion was an excusable medium for the following cases:

If the pregnancy is detrimental for the mother’s health, it is legitimate with respect to law and medical practice to abort the baby. As long as it is not performed by unskilled and un-authorized hands, and for illegitimate reasons, for example in case of pelvic problems, [...] or heart problems, it is not dangerous to practice abortion. [In such cases], there are means to eliminate the risks and complications of abortion.¹⁶⁴

¹⁶¹As excerpted from *ibid.* 6, 9-10.

¹⁶² Islamic juristic consensus abortion set a limit that after a period of *four months* from the date of conception abortion amounts to taking a life. However, this limit may also be *set aside* if, according to objective medical opinion, there is a definite risk of death to the mother. In other words, the mother’s life takes precedence over the child’s life on the juristic principle: ‘the root is more valuable than the branch. See Musallam, 10-11, 57-59; Omran, 8, 9; Mustafa Öztürk, *Osmanlı Döneminde İskat-i Ceninin Yeri*, 199. Also see the articles in *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*, 10 vols, (İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi Genel Müdürlüğü, 1988-) written by Orhan Çeker, “Çocuk Düşürme,” vol. 8, by Muhsin Koçak, “Gurre,” vol 14, and by Mustafa Uzunpostalcı, “Cenin,” vol 7.

¹⁶³ Information regarding Nusred Fu’ad’s birth and death dates could not be located. We learnt that he was active as a military physician, and instructor at the Military School of Medicine in İstanbul since he signed his book titled *İzdivac ve Şerait-i Sihhiyesi* as a military physician. This book was published twelve times in three year interval between 1912 to 1915. Dr. Besim Ömer who wrote prologues for these books must have been a close professor or colleague of him.

¹⁶⁴ Nusred Fu’ad, *İzdivac*, 86.

Here, medical opinion regarding the case of pelvic disorders and heart problems were suggested as legitimate reasons to recourse to abortion, but the medical opinion, which would support abortion, had to be an objective one. Such an objective opinion could only be obtained through the medical examination of a real expert, an obstetrician, as suggested by Nusred Fu'ad. This reference to scientific approval reminds Foucault's conception of the establishment of the sovereignty of truth over all *savoir privileges*. In other words, Nusred Fu'ad's conception echoed the emergence of male obstetricians as opposed to female midwives subsequent to the professionalization of medical activities. In short, the science of woman, obstetrics, transformed into a domain of activity for male physicians, excluding female homeopaths and midwives.¹⁶⁵ The general incapability characterizing technical skills of midwives was also incorporated into the anti-abortion debate as objective reasons other than moral ones to explain women's recourse to abortion by Ali Rıza Bey. Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey had already reported in late 1860s that "the adoption of severe methods [for abortion] influences the mother before the fetus."¹⁶⁶ It is interesting that in the course of nineteenth to twentieth century, midwives were correspondingly warned by male obstetricians. Dr. Besim Ömer Paşa¹⁶⁷ (1862-1940), the founding father of gynecology in Ottoman Empire, cautioned midwives firmly

¹⁶⁵ See Michael Foucault, *The Birth of*, for the *savoir privilégiés*' replacement with the sovereignty of truth, and see also Ornella Mossucci, *The Science of Woman: Gynecology and Gender in England, 1800-1929*, (Cambridge; New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990), which is a seminal work over the transformation of medical knowledge, personnel, and emergence of obstetrics as a professionalized discipline as opposed to midwifery in England in the nineteenth to early twentieth century.

¹⁶⁶ As excerpted from Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey, 190-191.

¹⁶⁷ Later, Besim Ömer Akalın. He was one of the pioneer Ottoman obstetricians educated in Europe. The first delivery clinic in İstanbul in 1892 was founded by his initiative. He translated some of the contemporaneous works about obstetrics from French, and he also wrote major works on modern obstetrics, modern nursing, first aid, and child care in Ottoman Turkish.

for not assisting and advising women, such as for “breaking delayed menstruation”(aybaşını söktürmek) or anything pertaining to abortion.¹⁶⁸ The anti-abortion discourse in this period reached such an extent that information on necessary and illegitimate abortion, the aftermath of unskillfully performed abortions, and probable ways to prevent conceiving were also discussed;

The delay of placenta in [deliberate miscarriages] and delivery of it in particles is dangerous; [...] these difficulties bring women into death or permanent injuries. The placenta left inside becomes a seat for microbes, and smells like rotten meat. It produces deadly diseases in the blood of woman. Therefore, women, who abort their babies in various filthy ways, die out or damned in 42 to 48 hours. For a reasonable and decent woman abortion means to go into grave or lying down in the bed of torment and death. [...] Abortion is a very deadly practice; it is often the case that woman [deliberately miscarries her baby] is ruined. [...] The majority of serious and incurable uterine diseases are the leftovers of abortions.¹⁶⁹

Salahaddin Asım¹⁷⁰ commented that “abortion and refraining from birth-giving harms [our] women, actually [our] nation and race at once”. For him, “the nation is deprived from its organ[s] and women lose their health and lives by either adopting abortion or refraining from child-bearing”.¹⁷¹ While arguing about fertility and reproductive issues, Dr. Kenan Tevfik¹⁷², another physician specialized on

¹⁶⁸ Besim Ömer Paşa, *Ebelik: Doğurmak ve Doğurtmak*, (İstanbul: Matbaa-i Ahmed İhsan 1322/1906-1907), prologue.

¹⁶⁹ As excerpted from *ibid.*, 386.

¹⁷⁰ Though he has been often referred due to his adherence to national-secularist stance, the information regarding his birth and death dates, and career could not be found, however, we have a scanty information that he published a book titled *Osmanlı'da Kadınlığın Durumu*, (İstanbul: Arel,1989), originally named as *Türk Kadınlığının Tereddisi Yahud Karışmak*, in İstanbul, circa1910.

¹⁷¹ As excerpted from *ibid.*, 59.

¹⁷² Birth and death dates could not be located. He was a physician specialized on obstetrics and gynecology in Imperial Medical School in 1900s. He co-authored another book titled *Hastabakıcılık Kitabı* with Dr.Münir Tevfik in 1909. He became the chief physician in the Gynecology Clinic of the Imperial School of Medicine in 1910s.

gynecology, reported the possibility that abortion had been utilized for child spacing and contraception. However, he warned his readers that abortion was never an inexcusable and proper way for child spacing. For the first time in Ottoman advice genre, proper methods of contraception were conceptualized, yet, for refuting abortion;

Among the masses, many inappropriate medicines and means are used, and since it is often evident that [these means and medicines] cause serious illnesses in the womb and around it, and sometimes give way to death, our ladies should absolutely not have recourse to these harmful means. The best way to not to conceive is to find a way that ovule does not conjoin to the seeds in semen. [...like] special rubber holsters for men and women.¹⁷³

Kenan Tevfik did not conceptualize contraception as a negative issue; he even chose a neutral position to inform his readers as a physician. However, other medical professionals, such as Hüseyin Remzi (1839-1896)¹⁷⁴ did not provide such a neutral stance while discussing abortion. Definitely stimulated by the pronatalist discourse over demographic policies, peoples' resort to contraception was evaluated negatively in such works that birth control measures of the period were not deliberated, but primitive ways such as post-intercourse baths were suggested. Even if there were

¹⁷³ As excerpted from Kenan Tevfik, 44.

¹⁷⁴ He was born in İstanbul. He studied medicine at the Imperial Medical School with a bursary, and worked at various levels in Ottoman medical administration as a military physician at Third Division in Manastır and Ottoman Navy. He also taught medicine and zoology in Imperial Medical School, Darüşşafaka Sultanisi, Imperial Academy of War. He also contributed to the establishment of following institutions; Imperial School of Veterinary Medicine, Telkikhane-yi Şahane (Imperial Bureau of Vaccination), Society of Ottoman Medicine. He was also a member of La Société Asiatique, Committee of Civil Medicine and Public Health, and Association of Civil Medicine. He was a prolific writer on various subjects such as zoology, natural history books for secondary schools, microbiology, deontology, gynecology, Islam, Ottoman family life, morals, child discipline and public health. He had been in European cities such as Paris and Darmstad for conducting research and in-service training that he worked in the laboratory of Louis Pasteur in 1886 to implement vaccines for rabies and improve his knowledge on bacteriology. For full bibliography of Hüseyin Remzi, see Ekrem Kadri Unat, "Muallim Miralay Dr.Hüseyin Remzi Bey ve Türkçe Tıp Dilimiz," In *IV. Tıp Tarihi Kongresi* , 239-252.

specific chapters dedicated for contraception and child spacing, these issues were not comprehensively discussed. Following quote is from Hüseyin Remzi's cited work and sub-section titled as "How to Prevent Conceiving";

To a certain degree conceiving or not conceiving is depend on women. They can have bath, and wash their reproductive organs after the intercourse. [...] Abortion is dangerous. Performing of such a cruelty do not befit to humaneness. In this way, a child attaining maturity in its mother's womb is slaughtered. Actually, this is a murder. The abortionist woman, either during abortion or it's afterwards also ruins herself in a way deserving this end. What is it, if not murder?¹⁷⁵

One could hardly find information regarding contraceptives in the press and advice genre, however, they inform us about the ways in which self-inflicted abortions were performed. In contrast to the official documents, i.e., decrees and memoranda, which complained about high rates and astonishing methods for deliberate miscarriages, but remained silent over what specifically they were, advice genre enlisted them. For example, Dr.Besim Ömer Paşa, mentions lead, sulphate, tobacco, ergot of rye, ruta graveolens/rutacae (*sedef otu*), and spirits as poisons to induce miscarriage. He clearly warned midwives to not to give any of these substances and any kind of medicine to the expectant woman apart from the ones they were authorized to be used during delivery.¹⁷⁶ In a similar way, Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey gave accounts about eating deadly poisons like black juniper (*juniperus sabina*) and rye grass (*lolium temulentum*), and other ways by which these poisonous herbs were taken. Referred herbs claimed to enter into the blood circulation through digestion; quite often women ate these roots or herbs to poison the fetus.¹⁷⁷ As a physician (and

¹⁷⁵ As excerpted from Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-u Sıhhat-i*, 222.

¹⁷⁶ Besim Ömer Paşa, *Ebelik*, 2-3 and 382.

¹⁷⁷ Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey, 192.

probably aware of the fact that his audience was sensible enough to not to implement these ways), he explicitly explained other methods for miscarriage. Such as heavy strokes on abdomen, cupping blood from arms with the help of lancets, and inserting surgical tools into womb.¹⁷⁸ Basiretçi Ali Efendi reported wicks (*fitils*) prepared and distributed by midwives, and other poisonous drugs sold by herbalists.¹⁷⁹ Salahaddin Asım also counted henna, alum, ammonia, asphodel roots used for textile industry, citric acid or lemonade powder, terracotta, and earth as abortifacients.¹⁸⁰ He claimed that these substances were processed with other chemicals to be taken orally, or inserted into the womb. All the abovementioned authors warned women that these chemicals, herbs, or any of the cited methods did indeed induce abortion and injure the fetus, while serious injuries or death were definite for the pregnant woman in due. The majority of the aforesaid substances , i.e ergot of rhye , was prohibited to be utilized by midwives by the article number 8 of the Regulation Concerning the Execution of Medical Profession within Municipalities of the Imperial Lands” (*Memâlik-i Mahrûse-i Şâhânede Tabâbet-i Belediyye İcrâsına Dâir Nizamnâme*), dated 12 October 1861 /7 Rebiyülâhir 1278.¹⁸¹

The most speculative and fervent critiques over abortion came around 1910s that abortion. These critiques deliberated its impact over society and population dynamics from an ardent nationalist stance. Salahaddin Asım’s work evaluated abortion as one of the greatest ills in Ottoman society. He chose an unequivocal organicist and nationalist stance by condemning abortion as the cradle for both

¹⁷⁸ Ibid.

¹⁷⁹ Basiretçi Ali Efendi, “Şehir Mektubu 20”, *Basiret* , 416, 2; and “Şehir Mektubu 52[50]” , *Basiret* , 1070, 1.

¹⁸⁰ Salahaddin Asım, 59.

¹⁸¹ Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 6: 3054.

individual, and social and national decay. He certainly prioritized the issue of abortion, and therefore devoted a whole chapter to its discussion. Salahaddin Asım considered abortion as a practice which reduced women into mere female sexual objects (*karılařmak*).¹⁸² Unlike the previous commentators, he made a far-reaching analysis over abortion in the Ottoman society. According to Salahaddin Asım, first, seclusion of Ottoman women imposed by Islam, and separate and gendered private spheres as its by-product created a female-specific world, which constituted a complete deviation from proper gender roles. Seclusion, and veiling as seclusion's public manifestation brought women into a state of psychology and behavioral conduct leading them to feel insecure, useless. They were also claimed to become "inconsiderate", "ill-mannered", and "shameless". In such a psychological state, women argued to learn to hate men and their womanly duties. Consequently, this hatred claimed to promote a female world where alternative romances and companionships were formed, i.e., female homosexuality. The lesbian courtship, in other words, as the basic outcome of this specific gender order based on the out-casting and exclusion of women from social and communal duties, such as education and decision making, further encouraged women to act disorderly, perverted and un-motherly. Therefore, they adopted the measure of abortion, and refraining from child-rearing.¹⁸³ The division of Ottoman social world into that of males and females, according to Selahaddin Asım, resulted in unresolved desires where men and women espoused perverted sexual and courting behavior. As a substitute for their unresolved desires of courting, they flirted with the same-sex agents who could legitimately step

¹⁸² Salahaddin Asım, 56

¹⁸³ Ibid.

into their respective environment.¹⁸⁴ Lesbianism, as the by-product of the by-products of seclusion, stimulated Ottoman Muslim women to abstain from anything related to males. Even if they had sexual intercourse with men, they managed to refrain from pregnancy. He articulated his view, which is really worth to be cited due to aforesaid claims, as follows;

The most obvious sign and outcome of lesbianism is the evasion from wifehood, motherhood and children. The greatest foe of a lesbian woman is the child. Sometimes, this animosity reaches such a degree that if pregnant, a lesbian, or a woman who would like to become lesbian, tries to abort her baby, or totally gives up from disciplining and caring her children. Today, abortion and abstaining from child rearing turned into a social illness in our society. And the basic reason for that is the seclusion, which divorces woman from social functions and participation to the management of familial and social processes, and inequality in terms of matrimony, divorce, inheritance and social rights that curb the embracement of women with family and children through sensuality, squandering, self indulgence and lust. In short, abortion and abstinence from children is the outcome of a circumstance that we force and imprison women into act like mere female animal. The child custody, which belongs to father [in our society], is another crucial factor on this issue.¹⁸⁵

Similarly speculative, yet hard to be confirmed, Ali Seydi Bey's¹⁸⁶ (1867-1933) comments which took imperial family and household in to consideration, provided an interesting view about why abortion was still a painstaking public issue in 1900s.¹⁸⁷ He reported by referring to the memoirs of İzzet Ziya (1880-1934)¹⁸⁸, a

¹⁸⁴ Ibid., 57-58.

¹⁸⁵ Ibid., 56-57.

¹⁸⁶ He worked as a clerk in the Council of State, then in the Sultan's Privy Purse in 1890s. Afterwards he became an inspector responsible for imperial lands and ferries in Bagdad and Basra, then he worked as a teacher Turkish literature, history, aritmetics, geometry, geography, ethics in different junior high schools and high schools such as Üsküdar İdâdisi, Mercan İdâdisi, Bağdat İdâdisi, Bagdad Armenian School and Galatasaray High School. He became one of the members of the Council of History (*Tarih Encümeni*), and also worked as a columnist in newspapers, and most important of them was İkdam that he wrote in 1920s. He was elected to parliament in 1933.

¹⁸⁷ Ali Seydi Bey, *Teşrifat ve Teşkilâtımız*, (İstanbul: Tercüman Yayınları, 1970).

painter close to the palace, that Sultan Reşad (Mehmet V /1909-1918) tolerated and encouraged birth control and deliberate miscarriages in the palace. According to Ali Seydi Bey Sultan Reşad did not want a crowded harem since it would inflict a heavy burden over the state's treasury. Individually, Sultan Reşad also did not prefer a crowded family for himself. In addition to the sultan's preferences, Ali Seydi Bey also argued that abortion was a frequently utilized method to do away with illegitimate pregnancies in the imperial harem, which has been the prime and stereotypical symbol of seclusion for all Ottoman women. This comment reminds Salahaddin Asım's term "*karılařmak*". Moreover, since Ali Seydi Bey wrote this book in republican period when defamation of harem and seclusion in general represented one of the ways to disrupt the relation between new and the old regimes, his claims become more susceptible for reliability. Instead of arguing whether secluded and perverted life in Ottoman imperial harem really encouraged masses to perform abortion, this is useful to understand the deficiency and limitedness of official discourse and regulatory means against abortion up until 1920s.¹⁸⁹

¹⁸⁸ Apart from his birth and death rates, and his painting carrier no information has been obtained about İzzet Ziya. Ali Seydi Bey referred to his unpublished memoirs while he was conceptualizing imperial harem.

¹⁸⁹ There is no study available on the issue of abortion and pronatalism for the Young Turk period (1908-1918), however, the nationalist and ethnicist policies during the time span between 1913 and 1918 in particular suggest us to assume that the procreationist and pronatalist approaches of the previous era probably did continue. For the Young Turk period, see M.Naim Turfan, *Rise of the Young Turks: Politics, the Military and Ottoman Collaps*, (London: I.B.Tauris, 1999); Feroz Ahmad, *The Young Turks: The Committee of Union and Progress in Turkish Politics, 1908-1914*, (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1969). However, we clearly know that the early republican state, founded in 1923, prohibited both contraceptive devices and abortion, again due to demographic reasons (1930). See Akile Gürsoy "Abortion in Turkey: A Matter of State, Family or Individual Decision," *Social Science and Medicine* 42 (4) (1996):532-533 for this regard. Overall speaking, the ban over abortion in Turkey, in Western European countries as well as in USA would become relaxed only from the 1960s onwards. Due to macroeconomic considerations, rapid population growth as a hindrance to economic wealth led to take liberalizing steps from 1965 onwards. Finally, the Law Concerning Population Planning, dated 27 May 1983, provided permission for abortion. However, it is interesting and rather ironic to note that this law stipulates abortion to be permissible only with the written consent of the husband. See *ibid.*, 535-536 for this respect. This can be read as a virtual return to the Sharia of the Hanafi legal school, i.e. to the period prior to 1838. The "liberal arrangement" under pre-modern conditions turned into a tool for patriarchy after 1983. This law, therefore, has become a target for

Hüseyin Remzi argued that abortion was in fact a contemporary and cross-cultural phenomenon. “The abominable deed of abortion is also evident in civilized countries, [however] severe laws were introduced for [preventing] abortion in those countries.”¹⁹⁰ Yet, even under such laws, which were “effective to a certain degree”, “women still venture it under circumstances that were far from the reach of these legal measures.”¹⁹¹ Hüseyin Remzi claimed that this situation was “regrettable” and he probably wanted other means, which were more influential than those laws for curbing abortion.

Ottoman advice genre provided opportunities to search upon abortion and its content in the absence of firm laws, and the obstacles regarding impenetrable private world of Ottoman women. The medical explanations by which women were warned and instructed about the course and aftermath of abortion in contemporary press and advice literature elaborated the perception about and the margins of abortion activity. Mostly physicians and surgeons, the authors devoted themselves to explain the difference between deliberate and accidental abortions, and at the same time providing a behavioral scheme for expectant mothers to not to lose their children. Tactfully and detailed, these works also provided information for intimates and people in the surrounding social environment of expectant mothers. For example medical professionals, intermediary medical practitioners, family members and neighbors were instructed to discern circumstances under which a miscarriage could be identified as intentional or accidental, together with the basics of necessary

present-day liberal and feminist groups in Turkey who argue for the importance of individual women in deciding on the reproductive function of their bodies.

¹⁹⁰ Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-u Sihhat-i Müteahhileyn*, 222-223.

¹⁹¹ Ibid.

precautions when an abortion or unintended miscarriage occurred in the medium of advice genre.¹⁹²

The state's appeal to various social agents around expectant women correlated with the basic medical information about abortion provided in the advice genre. The depictions regarding the aftermath of abortion, symptoms of miscarriage and proper conduct for pregnant women were crucial means which could enhance investigations about abortions. While the state launched a system that put responsibility on the neighborhood, religious leaders and midwives to report abortion cases, the advice and press medium destined to instruct these agents about the nature of miscarriages and deliberate abortions. These medical and popular treatises on abortion addressed everybody. Some of them were written for specific occupational groups, such as Besim Ömer's *Ebelik*. Considering the low literacy rate among Ottoman Muslim women, it can be also argued that the target audience of this commentary literature was obviously literate people. However, advice genre and press aimed to instruct illiterate women about abortion by means of medical professionals and their male kin. Apart from some very few literate individuals, Ottoman women in general might have learned the hazards of abortion either through their husbands, or midwives who were the basic source of information for gynecological and child-related matters. Finally, the portrayal of abortionist women through an accusing and scolding terminology in these works can be considered as a corresponding and perpetuating stance for the disciplinary scheme drawn by state.

¹⁹² See Kırımlıazade Aziz İdris Bey ; Besim Ömer Paşa, *Sıhhatnūma-yı Etfal Yahud Valdelere Nasihat; Sıhhat-i Etfal Sa'adet-i İstikbaldir*, (İstanbul: Şirket-i Mürettibiye Basımevi 1303/1887-1888), 25-31; idem., *Ebelik*, prologue, 3, 112-118, 381-387; Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-u Sıhhat-i Müttehhlileyin*, 222-225; Nusrud Fu'ad, 42-53 83-85.

2.4 Repressive Reform and Reorganization for the Sake of Progeny: The Reform of Midwifery During Tanzimat

It is mentioned in the preceding section that midwives and other medical professionals were put under scrutiny while Ottoman administration was forming its anti-abortion regulation beginning from the 1830s onwards. In this part, firstly the regulations and policies formed in the course of the second half of nineteenth century towards midwifery will be discussed with regard to promote population progeny. The conception of these notions will be done through a critical appraisal so that both the regulations and the modernization of Ottoman state apparatus can be properly conveyed.

Ottoman anti-abortion discourse and regulation called public conscience into work by referring abortion's social, individual and religious impropriety. Up until the early twentieth century, only the medical professionals, such as midwives, pharmacists and physicians were liable for correction as stipulated in the Penal Codes. In other words, instead of punishing abortionist mothers, and parents, Ottomans chose to control and punish medical professionals as long as they were Ottoman subjects. As argued in the preceding sections, mothers, and parents who resorted to abortion were not punished. Despite the intimidating addressing in decrees, abortionist mothers and father who complied with them did not become liable to correction for abiding to the margins of personal law, which was clearly laid by Islamic jurisprudence. Midwives, doctors and pharmacist, at this resort, remained as the only group that could be effectively controlled with regard to their professional activities for anti-abortion regulation. For the rest of this part, the control and

enhancement of midwifery as a medical profession for anti-abortion and procreation discourses will be conceptualized.

2.4.1. Reorganization and Reform of Midwifery

It is nearly impossible to underestimate the role of midwives in Ottoman social life. Narrations from the past revealed that the midwife of a town quarter, the *ebe hanım*, was indeed an intimate for families and confidants of women of the location. This close relationship was built through the pregnancy process; the local midwife became a part of the birth process beginning from initial stages of pregnancy. She actively partook in the preparation of the swaddling clothes (*kundak*), and joined the accompanying prayers, then provided the birth of the infant. However, the midwife's assistance and function did not end with the birth. First of all, she was the one who would be periodically visiting the new mother and infant for examining their health in the post partum period. Considering the high frequency of childbed fever (*humma-i nifasi*) among Ottoman women, their regular visits were inevitable. Midwives also had to take care of the infants until the time their umbilical cord shed. Moreover, midwives were the only therapeutic specialists to vaccinate infants until the period that Ottoman administration handled this issue by training professional inoculators and health personnel. Midwives had to participate, and sometimes lead certain rituals following the birth, too. For example, henna night (*kına gecesi*), which was organized in order to celebrate the new mother after childbed, and Cradle Procession (*beşik çıkma*), which was done for the same reason in wealthy households, were events midwives actively took part. It was a custom for the new

mother to take her baby, along female relatives, neighbors and the midwife, and go to a public bath (*lohusa hamamı*) on the fortieth day following birth. There, the midwife performed certain religious rituals (*kırklamak*) both for mother and her infant so that they would have healthy lives.

All in all, as suggested by the contemporary accounts on Ottoman society, traditional midwives were indispensable agents for domestic life and female social sphere.¹⁹³ Depending upon their knowledge in medicine and plants, however, they also assisted women to terminate undesired pregnancies.¹⁹⁴ Therefore, it not surprising to find out certain midwives, who had took part in abortions, were nicknamed as “*kanlı ebe*” (bloodstained midwife).¹⁹⁵

Firstly, the administration of Mahmud II attributed a key role to midwives assisting abortions. Consequent to this, draft documents for 1838 decree proposed to oblige midwives to give an oath to their respective community leaders for not performing abortions. Few years following the edict of 1838, administration took a crucial step towards the professional training of midwives. With respect to the available information, first midwifery courses were offered as part of surgery classes

¹⁹³ ‘Whatever *Ebe Hanım* told is acceptable and esteemed; she is seated on the seat of honor, everybody respects her, she is either connected to the family or recommended by relatives, her commands are influential. Her words are effective. Sometimes she is believed to defy everybody in the world; even a physician does not know anything with respect to her knowledge. Ebe Hanım says this, so it is certainly correct’ as excerpted from [Anonymous] “Ebe Hanım”, *Hanım Kızlara Mahsus*, 83-285, / 8 Receb 1318/ 1 November 1900, 1

¹⁹⁴ ‘If a woman is thought to be pregnant, Ebe hanım is consulted immediately, and she examines the woman carefully. Through this habitual and superficial examination, she says “yes, there is vexation you are expectant” and if it is desired, she helps to miscarry the poor creature whose existence is doubted. She recommends medicines.[...] She starts praising herself. She talks about her successes like “in such and such place something happened like this, and I saved [her] with a cure... The poor woman might be pregnant for couple of months. But she is dare to implement the abortion, which is a deed of abomination, even in this condition. The baby is [deliberately] miscarried, and this is concealed from everybody, the woman becomes ill, and ruined, and she goes into grave. However, Ebe Hanım does not feel sorry at all, since she performed her duty’ as excerpted from *ibid*.

¹⁹⁵ Balıkhane Nazırı Ali Rıza,2; Namık Kemal, “Nüfus”; Abdurrahman Kurt, *Bursa Sicillerine Göre Osmanlı Ailesi* (Bursa: Kültür Bakanlığı Yayınları 1998) , 93; Nil Sarı, “Osmanlı Sağlık Hayatında Kadının Yeri,” *Yeni Tıp Tarihi Araştırmaları.The New History of Medicine Studies* , 3 vols. , (İstanbul: TTK Yayınları, 1996-1997) 2: 2-3; Yarman, 194.

as early as 1827, a period that the Imperial Medical School was currently established. Nevertheless, a consistent institutional policy for training midwives was introduced around 1842. This included the organization of specific seminar-courses for midwives at the Medical School. The commencement of midwifery courses was publicly announced by the Chief Physician Abdülhak Molla (d.1854).¹⁹⁶ This undertaking suggests that at least the midwives in the capital, belonging to Christian, Jewish and Muslim communities, were expected to register the course;

Midwives from three [Christian, Jewish and Muslim] communities in İstanbul have to come and attend the classes, and in the presence of two midwives and non-existence of any other male except a skilful teacher on midwifery from the School of Teachers, the assembled midwives will be instructed first theoretically in Turkish, then the aforesaid male teacher will go out and abovementioned two [foreign] midwives will practice necessary deeds about midwifery [...]. In the way described above, these midwives [midwives of three communities] must go to the aforesaid [Medical] school two days a week to be instructed and trained, and if there are any who do not attend, they will be prohibited from harming people and henceforth performing midwifery.¹⁹⁷

The basic indicator of one's practice of midwifery was the ownership of a delivery chair. The ownership of a delivery chair also became an indication for clandestine midwifery and therefore pretext for the compulsory attendance to midwifery classes newly started;

If women with delivery chairs but absolutely no training do not come and attend the classes, they will have to abandon the practice of midwifery, and if they do not, they will be liable to punishment.¹⁹⁸

¹⁹⁶ Abdülhak Molla served as the Chief Physician three times (1834-1837; 1839-1845; 1848-1849). See Ali Haydar Bayat, *Osmanlı Devleti'nde Hekimbaşılık Kurumu ve Hekimbaşılar*, (Ankara: AYK, Atatürk Kültür Merkezi Başkanlığı 1999), 158-165.

¹⁹⁷ As excerpted from BOA I. MV. 830 (19 § 1258).

¹⁹⁸ As excerpted from ibid.

Accordingly, women who owned delivery chairs but refused to attend aforesaid classes would be prohibited from practicing midwifery, and liable to punishment. In order to enforce this measure effectively, Ottoman administration cautioned kadıs, patriarchs and rabbis to supervise the activities of the midwives;

All midwives of İstanbul who have delivery chairs, ought to come and have their names enlisted into the book of registry, and hereafter the ones who refuse to attend the said courses regularly and the ones who do not register at all but keep practicing midwifery will not be warned, [but] prohibited from practice and punished, [and] in order to announce [this] condition to the public [...] [and] neighborhoods, the decision is transferred to the bountiful Kadı of İstanbul, and by means of the Kadi of İstanbul [this matter] is addressed to kadıs, imams, patriarchs and the Chief Rabbi.¹⁹⁹

These measures displayed a strong tendency to put midwives under administrative surveillance.²⁰⁰ The first courses for midwives at the Medical School were offered twice a week. Male instructors lectured female students only theoretically, and considering the fact that it would be “inappropriate”, and “injurious” for the course attendance, female professionals were hired for practical parts of the courses. One of the hired female professionals was from Paris, and the other one from Vienna. Both of these midwife- instructors possessed midwifery certificates.²⁰¹

¹⁹⁹ As excerpted from a Memorandum submitted by Abdülhak Molla and approved by the Sublime Council on 23 November 1842/19 Ş 1258, in BOA *I. MV. 830* (19 Ş 1258).

²⁰⁰ Davis, 39, 40; Osman Nuri Ergin. *Türk Maarif Tarihi*. 2 vols. İkinci Baskı (İstanbul: Eser Kültür, 1977), vol. 1-2, 540-542; Sarı, 25; Yarman, 219.

²⁰¹ “As having been trained in European Academies and being talented in midwifery, two midwives provided with [midwifery] certificates had been summoned from Europe [...] and they started to medicate and examine women who have gynecological illnesses at the Imperial School of Medicine” as excerpted from BOA *I.MV. 830/* (19 Ş 1258). Also see Nil Sarı, “Osmanlı Sağlık Hayatında Kadının Yerine Kısa Bir Bakış,” in *Sağlık Alanında Türk Kadını*, ed. Nuran Yıldırım, (İstanbul: Novartis, 1998), 460; Nuran Yıldırım and Suzan Bozkurt, “Başlangıcından Günümüze İstanbul Tıp Fakültesi’nin Kadın Öğretim Üyeleri,” in *Sağlık Alanında*, ed. Yıldırım, 173-174.

Ottoman administration keenly believed that by launching this training program and introducing modern means of education, “evil” activities of midwives could be put under control. The reasons which motivated Ottoman administration to commence a training program for midwives were also particularly important. For example, it was widely accepted that midwives constituted the primary group whose evil activities had to be put under control with the modern means of education. The press and advice genre also underlined evil features of traditional midwives. According to Ottoman intellectuals, midwives refused to comply with the means of modern midwifery and medicine so that they could preserve their dominant status for caring women and children;

The greatest shrewdness of *Ebe Hanım* [Mrs. Midwife] is to prevent the family [...] from consulting the physician for issues which have to do with women and children. If it is decided for consulting a physician, Ebe Hanım hinders it with all her might. She claims that a female should not expose herself to a male. [...] She inspects the patients, consoles and comforts them by claiming that there is nothing serious. Then she examines the poor, helpless and innocent woman, who is subject to a terrible infirmity, with her filthy and foul finger. The ignorant ebe does not even wash her hands, and she argues “there is still time”, then leaves. [...] and she does not hesitate to examine another helpless and wretched woman with the same filthy finger. [...] We also have Ebe Hanıms, who are careful about prudent and wise assistance, cleanliness and purity through having worked under the specialists and having witnessed the medication and examination of physicians, who are benevolent and desirous for instructing them. We should regard the existence of such Ebe Hanıms. However, there are Ebe Hanıms that I have just described that they cause many grievous incidents every year.²⁰²

Ottoman midwives’ technical skills with respect to delivery process and their occupational incompatibility were also questioned:

The ignorance and incapability of Ottoman midwives in the aforesaid trade [midwifery] is obvious and their training is not proper, they habitually take

²⁰² As excerpted from “Ebe Hanım”, 2.

the infant and cut its umbilical cord improperly, and they also perform variety of serious things through which the mothers are subject to various troubles, [...] midwives try to take the infants, which are sometimes positioned in their mothers' womb in abnormal ways, [...] many improprieties occur in the course of these wrong deeds, [...] sometimes infants die in their mothers' womb due to midwives who try to take them out by force, [...] since the prevention of families and children from perdition and suffering is important and necessary, both Muslim and non-Muslim midwives performing midwifery have to register their names and attend the courses which are designed for the aforesaid science two days a week for three to four months.²⁰³

Another important dimension about professional qualities of midwives was the way they entered into the trade of midwifery. Contemporaries inform that in the absence of formal midwifery education, women became midwives with the help of either their mothers or close women relatives, who initially practiced midwifery.²⁰⁴ However, the best critique for the lack of modern midwifery training and the ease of entry into this trade was provided by Dr. Besim Ömer, who wrote a specific conduct book for midwives;

²⁰³ As excerpted from BOA *I. MV. 830* (19 Ş 1258).

²⁰⁴ “In the past, there were hardly any trained midwives, and they were old women who perform midwifery either their mothers used to be midwives and midwifery was a family occupation, or their means of survival was somehow midwifery. After spending time with some midwives and acquiring basic information thereon, they thought they were authorized to practice it. There had always been tragic events due to their ignorance. Accordingly, women perceived birth giving as a big disaster. Due to this important and insecure nature of birth-giving, [...] families in a neighborhood discuss with and consult each other for weeks and weeks, and through such intricacies a midwife could be found” as excerpted from Balıkhane Nazırı Ali Rıza Bey,1; and “[...] at the present time, there are many [midwives] who pretend to be midwives in our city [İstanbul]. [...], midwifery is not something to be pretended, but of something requires expertise so that during delivery she [the midwife] can facilitate the birth and do away with the risk. Though they did not receive the necessary scientific training, these [midwives] are allowed to practice midwifery as they wish, [...] the abnormal delivery of infants is such a danger that it is a requirement to find a capable midwife, or initiate an [caesarean] operation. In such occasions, presence of the ones who do not have any capability and the ones who were not [formally] trained in midwifery are the same, [useless] [...]” as excerpted from Basiretçi Ali, “Şehir Mektubu No: 157 [252]”, *Basiret*, 2318, 13 Rebiyülevvel 1295 / 26 Şubat 1294, 2-3; “It is hundreds and thousands of time better to save and assist a helpless woman wisely and in proper manner while she is in labor rather than waiting her to give birth through great hardships and suffering for hours and days. Since it is absolutely not permitted and proper to leave such helpless woman on her own in such instances, supporting and attending her is one of the most important duties of humaneness and benevolence. And this is only possible and appreciable if Ebe Hanıms are instructed and trained under the guidance of specialists in perfect clinics for birth and maternity hospitals” as excerpted from so “Ebe Hanım”, 3.

Midwifery is not a simple, unimportant profession or an easy task: in order to become a midwife, one must have [...] long preparations and deep learning. Not everybody, not every woman can become a midwife. Young ladies, women who would like to become midwife should think well, they should test and evaluate their knowledge and capabilities to decide whether they are suitable for learning and practicing this art. It should be seriously taken into consideration that “midwifery” is not solely limited to assisting and taking care of women in delivery, and dealing with the newly born infant; because these tasks can be undertaken by anybody, even by an ordinary maid. A midwife should add to her knowledge, and improve her virtues in order to work properly and gain the trust of families she serves, not to commit any harm, [...]. [...] Proper midwifery means the protection of whole womanhood. In human societies, from a woman, a home, a hearth, even a city can be induced. The total well being of women and their unproblematic child-delivery is something a society and nation yearns for. A midwife, who guides women from cradle to grave, should not harm them who are the prospective mothers and grandmothers of future [...], and a midwife should not bring her customers to death instead of health. Since female body is a fragile one as compared to a male one, the slightest problem can easily be established in there. Midwives who deal with the womanhood should have an extra understanding, attention and knowledge so that many young, vigorous and reproductive women do not die in vain by leaving their homes without mistresses, husbands without wives and their children without mothers. However, it has been a custom for women to inherit the task of midwifery from their mothers as if it is an estate, and one can hardly see the glimpse of knowledge, hygiene, talent and skill in any of these midwives. This situation is not only a disgrace, but also a sin. I would like to cry when I encounter with dotard old women who push and throw young, healthy and vigorous women into the grave by their filthy hands that infect these pure women’s wombs with the seeds of deadly diseases. It is a big and incurable trouble that some women perform midwifery without having any knowledge [...] about women, women’s body, and moreover they are violating the profession of midwifery by recommending remedies here and there.²⁰⁵

Whatever their social and economic status and to those of households they served, the stories behind Ottoman women’s entry into the art of midwifery were all alike.²⁰⁶

²⁰⁵ As excerpted from Besim Ömer, *Ebelik*, 2-4,4-5.

²⁰⁶ [...] “Midwives who practice this auspicious and blessed task are classified into three; midwives of the Imperial Palace, midwives of the genteel households and midwives of the commoners. [...] The midwifery in the Imperial Palace was a very old service, which used to pass from mother to daughter. If these midwives did not have any daughters, so to say any successors, they used to train a close woman from their kin by bringing them to the palace and helping them to be acquainted with the highest chamber in order to not to miss the honour of serving the palace. [...] midwives serving genteel households [...] also brought their daughters or women relatives, who inclined to this trade, to the houses they served, and they made them acquainted” as excerpted from Abdülaziz Bey, 346-347.

Midwifery was indeed one of the very few but profitable carrier paths for Ottoman women²⁰⁷, and entry into this profession could not be controlled efficiently other trades, which were either under the rigid control of guilds, or official regulations. The attempt to regulate midwifery profession was two fold. One was to control their activities through close monitoring; since midwives were the only outside agent frequenting the impenetrable world of Ottoman women. Second dimension aimed to provide a formal and better training opportunity so that they could not put the progeny of population in to jeopardy in an age population quantity mattered more than ever. The complaints regarding midwives, which were deliberated by contemporaries, were tried to be improved with the curriculum designed by the Chief Physician in 1842.²⁰⁸ Accordingly, 36 midwives received diplomas from the Medical School until 1845. 26 of these midwives were Christian, and the remaining 10 were Muslim. Majority of these graduates were employed at civil and military hospitals.

²⁰⁷ “Midwifery was one of the most profitable trades for our women. Some women adopted midwifery as their occupation through gaining experience and skills under the supervision of senior midwives” as excerpted from Balikhane Nazırı, 29; for the economic status of midwives, Abdülaziz Bey uses a three-party scheme which identifies the financial gains of midwives with respect to the households they served and the quality and style of the medical tools they used. According to him, midwives who served the palace and genteel households were affluent, because they were paid and given presents generously after delivery. Palace midwives had regular salaries, and they received alms and grants from the palace in Holy Days together with regular food support. These midwives of palace and genteel households had their own mansions and servants. As for the utensils and tools they used for childbirth, Abdülaziz Bey talked about for example elegantly decorated “delivery chairs” “utensil bags”, and “midwife scepters” and a “document accompanying these” which were given them by the palace to be identified as midwives if it was necessary, for details see Abdülaziz Bey, 346-347.

²⁰⁸ At the present time, there are pregnant female mannequins and three-dimensional illustrations brought from Europe which show the fetus from ten days to its ninth month and tenth day, and [again] there are more than sixty illustrations about positioning of fetus in the womb and circumstances a pregnant woman may undergo during delivery, [all these will be used] to properly explain and instruct the troubles and diseases that a women might experience during parturition, and remedies and medicines that pregnant women may need will also be described, [...] all midwives will acquire the level of proficiency in midwifery by means of [these] and aforementioned two talented midwives, [...] if some famous midwives of Istanbul do not attend these classes [...] they would not learn the necessary scientific procedures, [...] and if they perform any hazardous deed and harm anybody out of their pseudo-training [...] instead of correcting and perfecting their defects, their violations of medical regulations, and injuries they cause will be reprovred with the necessary fines, and they will be prohibited from performing midwifery hereafter as excerpted from BOA *İ.M.V.* 830 (19 Ş 1258).

Depending upon these, it becomes clear that the first Ottoman women civil servants belonged to the profession of midwifery.²⁰⁹

On the other hand, one can argue that the total number of 36 graduates within three years of official training seems far from sufficient. The very few number of Muslim participants and the virtual non-participation of Jewish midwives cause further doubts about the efficiency of this policy. This is actually the indication of the fact that traditional midwives managed to avoid this professional training. The lack of Jewish participation is particularly striking, since contemporary sources occasionally accused Jewish midwives for assisting abortions.²¹⁰ It is also difficult to determine to what extent this propaganda affected the population, whether they preferred professionally trained midwives or not. In addition to this, Ottoman administration kept producing announcements about the problem of un-trained midwives. For example, a new memorandum was issued in 1851 to underline the provisions of 1842 report. This memorandum was addressed to the Chief Magistrate (*iẖtisâb nâzırı*) that additional announcements had to be sent to local functionaries so that the absentee and overlooked midwives of the capital city who had not received necessary training could registered to the courses.²¹¹

²⁰⁹ Sarı, 25; Yarman, 219.

²¹⁰ See the documents of 1827 and 1838, mentioned above. Also, see Davis, 43; Namık Kemal's untitled article in *Tasvir-i Efkâr* 28 Zilhicce 1280; Rena Molho, "Tanzimat Öncesi ve Sonrasında İstanbul Yahudileri." Pinelopi Stathis ed. , *19.Yüzyıl İstanbul'unda Gayrimüslimler*, Translated by Foti and Stefo Benlisoy (İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları, 1999), 80; Ünver, 944; as for the monopoly of Jews in medicine and midwifery, and especially Jewish midwives primal role in folk medicine, Abdülaziz Bey talked about their traditional but unintentional mastery over these task. He states that modest and contended approach of Jewish medical professionals and midwives made them preferable before their customers in Abdülaziz Bey, 348-349.

²¹¹ "It was previously announced to the liable ones that Muslim and non-Muslim midwives of İstanbul, Eyüb and Üsküdar, who have not been trained and provided license for midwifery yet, and the ones who did not attend regularly to the courses at the Imperial Medical School and obtain the necessary information and license [diploma] would not be allowed to practice midwifery. Though most of these came and received the necessary instruction and license consequently, some of them did not, and these are still performing midwifery despite their incompatibility, and causing infirmities [...], since this cannot be tolerated, [...] and a new announcement on this matter by means of the

While Ottoman administration was disciplining and regulating the activities of midwives in the capital city, provincial requests were made for applying a similar training for the midwives in provincial areas. For instance, the Governor of *Biga* province sent a report to the capital that since midwives in his province were deprived of training, casualties during deliveries were not exception. He demanded the appointment of a formally trained midwife to his province from the Imperial Medical School.²¹² In its reply to the governor, the Law Court complained that the number of trained midwives in the centre was not sufficient enough to meet this provincial request. Then, it was decided that a talented midwife from Biga province would be sent to the capital to be trained. Then, after she returned from the capital, this midwife would instruct the other ones in the province. There is no evidence whether this midwife received projected training, since boarding problems about this midwife were not settled, this proposal might have been postponed.²¹³ There were also cases which revealed the complaints of people about the shortcomings of midwives. In other words, provincial people also became insightful about the

Chief Physician will take time, the unlicensed midwives' attendance to training is a requirement that has to be announced [...]by the offices in charge and religious functionaries in the neighborhoods"[...] as excerpted from BOA *A.MKT. NZD 26/48* (1267.4.1)

²¹² "In a recently received memorandum from the Council of Biga, it is claimed that since midwives on the coast of Biga could not obtain the necessary training, and some degree of injuries and losses of lives were occurring accordingly, they asked the appointment of a midwife, who graduated from the Imperial Medical School, to instruct the local midwives for five to six months on the grounds that her expenses would be covered by the local inhabitants. Apart from this, the matter was forwarded to the Law Court, and the Chief Physician of Imperial Medical School was reported about the matter afterwards. Though the science of gynecology and midwifery has been taught [in the capital city], there was not anyone found to be appointed to the aforesaid province, and actually there are two of that kind [trained midwives] but these are needed here, [...] Though it was reported to the Chief Physician and approved afterwards that it was a requirement that a talented midwife from the said province would be sent to be trained and instructed midwifery in the Imperial Medical School in order to instruct the ones in that locality on her return, [...]" as excerpted from BOA *A.MKT. UM 127/96* (1269 Ca 26).

²¹³ "it should be noted that if this midwife does not have any acquaintance with anybody to support her here [in Istanbul], she would be subject to misery and poverty, therefore, this midwife must be from among the ones who can be easily hosted [a midwife who has relatives, or acquaintance]", [...] as excerpted from *ibid.*

inadequacy of midwives, i.e., their improper deeds and conduct, parallel to the state's zeal to put midwives under "scientific scrutiny". All in all, reports regarding the failures of midwives became the part of *journals* that regulation over midwifery found adherents in the centre and provinces. For instance, a mother gave birth to triplets towards the end of 1859 in the town of *Kemer-i Edremid* (*Burhaniye*, Western Anatolia). However, she lost her babies due to the midwife who attended her delivery. The mother claimed that her children deceased since the midwife failed to cut their umbilical cord. As a result, the mother presented a petition to the local Islamic court for the correction of the said midwife. She demanded a payment of blood-money (*diyet*) with respect to the provisions of Sharia. Since the misdeed of the midwife was considered a serious one, provincial authorities informed the Sublime Porte about this incident:

A woman named Emine from Kemerredremid [...] gave birth to triplets [and] since midwife named *Tulumbacı Kızı* did not cut these triplets' umbilical cord and caused their death, the said Emine requested with a petition that the said midwife should be tried at the court and should pay a blood-money with respect to the provisions of Canonical Law for the deceased children, and the matter was transferred to the Law Court so that if the said midwife had any shortcomings in the loss of these innocents, and it is appreciated that the incident was a serious one, opening of an investigation is a requirement.²¹⁴

Depending upon the quote above, it is arguable that the public became aware of the means through which they could sue, or complain about the shortcomings of midwives legitimately around 1850s. What we know definitely is that formally-trained midwifery began to expand effectively only after 1871. Generally speaking, the reorganization of the Ottoman provincial system in 1864-1867 and the introduction of municipality system to towns in 1870 provided a new legal and

²¹⁴ As excerpted from BOA *A.MKT.UM* 396/66 (1276 B.23).

administrative frame for the extension of public health services in the provinces.²¹⁵ The midwifery was also included in the scope of these improvements. After 1864, couple of hospitals for the poor (*gurebâ hastahânesi*) was established in provincial capitals, and some of these hospitals employed formally-trained midwives.²¹⁶ According to a report, dated 1871, the government intended to set up midwifery courses at each town quarter, located within *Ahırkapı* and *Otluk Ambarı* districts of İstanbul. Consequently, in 1885, the project of setting up a delivery hospital was launched, however, it could not be accomplished.²¹⁷

The earliest legal statute related to the profession of midwifery was prepared on 12 October 1861/7 Rebiyülahir 1278 within the framework of the “Regulation Concerning the Practice of Medical Profession in the Municipalities of the Ottoman Lands” (*Memâlik-i Mahrûse-i Şâhânedi Tabâbet-i Belediyye İcrâsına Dâir Nizamnâme*). According to article number 3 in this regulation, only those Ottoman and foreign midwives whose diplomas were approved by the Medical School were permitted to practice their profession. A noteworthy article number 8 explicitly prohibited midwives to use forceps and any other surgical instrument during the

²¹⁵ Stanford J.Shaw, “The Origins of Representative Government in the Ottoman Empire: An Introduction to the Provincial Councils, 1839-1876”, in idem, *Studies in Ottoman and Turkish History. A Life with the Ottomans* (İstanbul: The Isis Press, 2000), 225- 226.

²¹⁶ The Hospital of *Ruşuk* (Ruse in present-day Bulgaria) and the hospital of *Tulça* (Tulcea in present-day Romania), for example, employed midwives as early as 1869. In 1886 the poor-hospital of Damascus included a special gynecology clinic for women. At the beginning of the twentieth century we encounter midwives being appointed to smaller district towns in Ottoman Macedonia such as *Gevgili* (Gevgelija). See İsmail Eren, “Yugoslavya’daki Türk Sağlık Kuruluşları”, in *I.Türk Tıp Tarihi Kongresi. Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler. İstanbul, 17-19 Şubat 1988*, (Ankara: Atatürk Kültür, Dil ve Tarih Yüksek Kurumu Yayınları, 1992), 31; Idem, “Bulgaristan ve Romanya’daki Türk Sağlık Kuruluşları”, see also Ekmeleddin İhsanoğlu, “Suriye’de Son Dönem Osmanlı Sağlık Müesseseleri İle İlgili Bazı Notlar”, in *Ibid*, 42; Shaw, 78, 85.

²¹⁷ Davis, 39, 40; Ergin, *Maarif*, 540-542.

process of delivery. This article probably aimed to forestall any possibility of abortion.²¹⁸

Though entitlement to diploma and certification was believed to be an efficient measure for the surveillance over midwives, it created new troubles for Ottoman administration in the provinces. The information drawn from provincial cases reveals that certification might have not put an end to the traditional course of initiation to the midwifery. Around 1906, Ottoman central administration demanded from magistrates and local administrations to follow, and return the diplomas of deceased midwives to the centre.²¹⁹ This measure can be taken as the indication of new types of violations, and midwives' own evaluation of the situation that it could be still possible for them to train their heirs in the absence of empire-wide training for midwifery. Moreover, centralizing and control-oriented means were well developed in the centre but they were not diffused to the provinces with the same extent. The central administration also had difficulties to appoint formally trained midwives to the remote provinces until the beginning of twentieth century.²²⁰ These correspondences, therefore, are meaningful both understanding Ottoman administration's daily solutions to its problems, such as difficulties about diffusing

²¹⁸ Osman Nuri Ergin. *Mecelle-i*, 6: 3053-3054.

²¹⁹ In two memorandums from İstanbul Police Department to the General Directorate of Ottoman Public Schools it was reported as follows; '[...]on investigation it is found out that the un-returned midwifery certificate of Müzeyyen, who died while staying in Erzincan, was kept by her family, and this [certificate] will later be presented as enclosed to the liable office' as excerpted from BOA ZB 346/23 (1322 A.2) ; "enclosed is the diploma of deceased Hadice Hanım, who was one of the graduates of the Imperial Medical School of Midwifery and inhabitants of Han Köyü, [...]" and this diploma was taken from the said woman's daughter and forwarded by means of İstanbul Police Department to the General Directorate of Ottoman Public Schools, [...]" as excerpted from BOA ZB 346/110 (1322.K.24).

²²⁰ See BOA ZB 40/60 (1323.T.2) which is an example for the appointment of midwives to the provincial towns and investigations requested from the administration of their former locations of service whether they had moved to these new locations and started to work.

new policies to the periphery, and resistance of midwives to the implementation regarding their profession.

At the beginning of the twentieth century, surveillance and monitoring of midwives was still a painstaking issue; midwifery without license²²¹, midwives' assistance in abortions²²² and technical shortcomings of midwives²²³ were still persistent problems that Ottoman administration had to deal with. At this point, it should be asked whether the policy of subjecting midwives to surveillance, and training alternative and licensed midwives were really successful policy implementations. Considering other historical experiences, one can presume that people generally had a warm and informal relationship with the traditional midwives

²²¹ In a document addressed from İstanbul Police Department to the General Directorate of Military Schools, it was reported as follows; “[...] with respect to their practicing of midwifery without diplomas, [four] women named [...] are prohibited from practice and they are liable to expiation thereon” as excerpted from BOA ZB 347/ 123 (1323.A.6).

²²² In a special decree dated Ra 15 1322, an abortion case was reported as follows; ‘It was heard that a woman called Moscovian or German has been habitually performing abortion here and there, and if this case is true, it is a necessity that she must be prohibited from performing midwifery and forced to leave [our] country for the sake and health of the public, [...]’ as excerpted from BOA HI. 101 (1322 Ra 15).

²²³ In a special decree dated 29 Ca 1318, it was reported that women were losing their lives in delivery because of the technical and professional incapability of local midwives and other medical personnel; “Since a woman from Koçhisar district of Konya province tragically died while giving birth due to the incapability of the physician and midwife [attending her], [the matter] was addressed to the liable ones in İkdam Newspaper [...] Though so many physicians and doctors have been raised in military and Civil medical schools in Ottomandom, his Majesty grieves the occurrence of such cases due to some districts’ deprivation from medical specialists. Therefore, the measures which provide midwives, who were previously trained in medical schools for the provinces is an undertaking that should be set to work immediately with respect to the necessity laid by his Majesty-Caliph” as excerpted from BOA HI. 72 (1318 Ca 29); and in another special decree dated 15 Ra 1322, treatment towards the professional incapability of provincial midwives discussed as follows; “The necessity to prevent the casualties occurred in Haleb due to the professional shortcomings of local midwives with respect to their lack of proper training were reported in the memorandum of the aforesaid province’s Medical Board, and since the matter was found serious, the Cabinet immediately decided to correct it” [...] as excerpted from BOA HI. 101 (Ra 15 1322); another special imperial decree issued after a newspaper commentary suggested the following : “Due to non-presence of midwives in Biga province, seven mothers and their infants were ruined out of difficulty in delivery and [these cases] were reported through a letter in the newspaper called İkdam. In order to prevent such incidences, the issue of undertaking necessary precautions was reported to the Sublime Porte [Bab-ı Ali] by his Majesty Caliph’s imperial decree. It is also ordered by his Majesty that an intensive means of punishment must be introduced to prohibit abortion. It is again ordered with this decree that delivery hospitals must be established in provinces and investigation for abortionists must be undertaken” as excerpted from BOA HI.. 5 (1324.R.2).

rather than with those formally educated and appointed ones. Since the latter group quite often thought to be the agents of central authority. At least the nineteenth century experience in Britain and Netherlands revealed that despite the administrative efforts of British and Dutch administration, which aimed to prevent abortion by training state-supported midwives, people did not accepted these midwives. On the contrary, traditional midwives continued their activities, albeit illegal, until the beginning of the twentieth century.²²⁴ In anyhow, officially-appointed and trained midwives, mostly having little in common with the local people and acting as agents of central authority, could not have become influential *vis-a-vis* the traditional midwives, who were indispensable agents of Ottoman female world.

As suggested by Foucault, the development of scientific knowledge on human body aimed to build a power-knowledge complex through which the “political technology of the body” was devised. This process intended to accomplish a domination and discipline over the body. For the case of reorganizing midwifery, the suggested domination was reinforced by the activities of official midwives; as agents of central authority, midwives provided the opportunity that state could accomplish an indirect surveillance over its population.²²⁵ Having received their training at formal institutions, official midwives had the basic knowledge to protect prospective mothers from complications of child delivery and save the newborn from hazards. Moreover, they became the means by which a specific regime over body, which required vigor and reproduction, was accomplished. Traditional midwives, in contrast, were devoid of basic information such as hygiene, and scientific knowledge

²²⁴ Margaret L. Arnot and Cornelia Osborne. *Gender and Crime in Modern Europe* (Padstow, Cornwall: UCLA Press, 1999), 18.

²²⁵ See Foucault, *Discipline*, 26-28, 170-171.

about pregnancy and birth, thus posing significant risks. It was the superiority of the official midwives in terms of scientific training and knowledge, which, despite the resistance of masses, gradually led to the marginalization of the traditional ones.

CHAPTER III

FIGHT AGAINST DISEASES

3.1. Public Health Measures for the Outfit of Population

This chapter deliberates transformation of the nineteenth century Ottoman public health policies which aimed to protect, and improve the outfit of Ottoman peoples. Beginning from the opening decades of nineteenth century, Ottoman administration introduced set of public health measures to provide better health services and prevention of epidemics for its population. These measures were pertaining to different areas of health administration, such as medical professionals, and regulations for the prevention of epidemics. By these improvements in health services and medical professions, Ottoman subjects were also disciplined. For example regulations, which aimed to prevent the expansion of epidemics, i.e., through vaccination, and propagating for the proper treatment for illnesses and complications such as difficult deliveries, post partum fever, and venereal diseases, included clear disciplinary dimensions. Beginning from the 1870s onwards, Ottoman advice genre also provided guidelines for families to protect themselves from diseases. These works also aimed to enhance and amend official health care policies so that they could be better organized and accomplished.

3.2. Ottoman Folk Medicine: Traditional and Counterfeit Healers in the Age of Modern Medicine

Prior to the elaboration of Ottoman administrative attempts to introduce preventive public health policies empire-wide, the role of folk medicine and superstitious health care measures in Ottoman society must be discussed. Traditional healers had an undeniable place in the lives of Ottoman people. In the absence and insufficiency of centralized public health institutions, Ottoman people resorted to the treatment and medication provided by traditional healers. Whether useful or futile, these healers were specialized on different tasks in a striking manner. Thanks to the contemporary accounts, such as memoirs and travel literature, we learn that there was an elaborated division of labor in the domain of folk medicine. For example there were *kırbacı kadınlar* (water skinner women specialized on to heal the sick who had diarrhea and swollen abdomens), *kurşun dökücü kadınlar* (lead melter women to treat illnesses by evil eye), *korku damarına basıcı kadınlar* (women compressing dread; healers of fear related illnesses), *alazcı women* (blazer women treating eczema), *kelci kadınlar* (female healers for baldness), *dalakçılar* (women heal spleen problems or swollen abdomens), *dil altı kesenler* (women heal hepatitis by cutting tongues), *hunnakçılar* (women heal lymph, quinsy and inflammatory throats), *sıtma bağlayıcılar* (healers for malaria), and *hekime hanımlar* (women healers for syphilis).²²⁶ Additionally, there were *kan alıcılar* (blood takers), *parpıcılar* (healers

²²⁶ For additional information, see Abdülaziz Bey, 354-358; Balıkhane Nazırı, 7-9,57-65; Şennur Sezer & Adnan Özyalçın, *Bir Zamanlar İstanbul Hayatı; Eski İstanbul Yaşayışı ve Folkloru*, (İstanbul: İnkılap Kitapevi 2005), 243-245; Feryal Saygılıgil, “Osmanlı’da Sağlık Alanında Tedavi Gören ve Tedavi Eden Olarak Kadınlar” in Aynur İlyasoğlu & Necla Akgökçe eds, *Yerli Bir Feminizme Doğru*, (İstanbul: Sel Yayıncılık, 2001), 130.

for rabies and hydrophobia), *okuyucular* (readers healing by verses and spell), *falcılar* (fortune tellers), *remmals* (geomancers), *ocak hekimleri* (healers trained by practice in certain dens and households), *kehals* (traditional oculists) *attars* and *kökçüs* (herbalists), traditional midwives, and barbers, who treated false teeth and surgical problems as well as performing circumcisions. The *kehals*, *kökçüs*, *attars* and midwives were under the control of guilds both financial and professional respects up until the Tanzimat period.²²⁷

In addition to vast specialization in terms of illnesses they healed, another important issue is related to the gender dimension. Majority of traditional healers in Otoman society was women. It is quite often suggested that Ottoman women did not deal with income raising tasks outside of their homes and they were not part of the public sphere. However, as claimed by contemporaries, these healing tasks were performed by women for income generation that elaborate historical reasearches on the position of these healers in Ottoman guild system, and use of unexploited sources on health care and folk medicine would further clarify this notion.

Beginning from the consecutive years of Tanzimat, Otoman intellectuals contemporaries complained about superstitious and improper healing methods provided by the aforesaid groups. Far from being helpful, traditional healers were deemed to cause crippling, deterioration of health and death habitually. In addition to the injurious and imperfect services they provided, they were blamed to be deceitful, and generating unmerited earnings.²²⁸ Their primitive ways of treatment,

²²⁷ For this point see Tahsin Özcan, *Fetvalar Işığında Osmanlı Esnafı*, (İstanbul: Kitabevi, 2003), 176.

²²⁸ For these respects, see Basiretçi Ali Efendi, “Şehir Mektubu no: 20” that he talked about fake doctors and injurious medicines prepared by these ill-informed counterfeit healers. Basiretçi Ali himself lost his four year old daughter, previously diagnosed as scarlet fever, due to additional treatment of a fake Jewish doctor, who was recommended by women neighbors. See also Basiretçi Ali, “Şehir Mektubu no. 138”, *Basiret*, 1585, 20 Cemaziyülahir 1292/ 14 April 1875.

i.e., use of “weird” substances, such as tortoise blood, leech and various incenses and herbs concerned both central administration and intellectuals of the period.

Counterfeit physicians were another group whose activities caused trouble for the administration and the intellectuals. These *sahte hekims* (counterfeit physicians), who had neither official licence for practice nor formal medical training, were claimed to be numerous around the capital city.²²⁹ For instance, Evangelinos Misailidis deliberated the issue of false physicians by making a rough estimation about their numbers, and basic features in his half fictive half autobiographic work in 1870s as follows;

There are only two truly holy and important occupations in the world, however, both of them are abused. The first one is clergy, and the second is medicine. [...] If we deem that İstanbul has a population of one and a half million, we can say that one thousand and five hundred physicians would be more than enough, but, if we count up barbers, herbalists, tailors and *perukars* [wig makers] into the category practicing medicine, the number of [those so called] “physicians” might exceed three and four thousands. And if it is a requirement to add the ones practicing medicine with the help of manuscripts and forged books [...] the number of physicians would be boundless.²³⁰

In Misailidis conceptualization, counterfeit physicians were indeed people who had other tasks to perform such as performing hair dressing and running herbal stores. However due to their propinquity to people and with the help of manuscripts and forged books, they managed to practice medicine.

It is suggested above that traditional healers were numerous and susceptible for the low quality of service they provided for Otoman people. Again regrettably

²²⁹ See Abdülaziz Bey, 350-354, see also Basiretçi Ali Efendi, “Şehir Mektubu no: 23”, *Basiret*, 434, 17 Cemaziyülevvel 1288/ 23 July 1871, 45-46.

²³⁰ Evangelinos Misailidis, *Temaşa-i Dünya ve Cefakâr-u Cefakeş*, Prep. By Robert Anhagger & Vedat Günyol, (İstanbul: Cem Yayınevi, 1986), 532-533.

reported by contemporaries, and supported by studies on Ottoman everyday life²³¹, Ottoman people, and especially women had an undeniable tendency to resort into such healers and superstitious specialist. It was often claimed that due to their aforesaid inclination, women were the basic customers, therefore second source of ill and superstitious health care among Ottoman peoples. Whether motivated by their up-bringing in seclusion, or feeling obliged to not to consult real physicians due to the limitations put forward by seclusion or misinformation about these limits, women might have had such a remarkable inclination towards traditional healers and health measures.²³²

All in all, we know depending on the historical evidence that Ottoman administration had to deal with such healers, and fight against people's preference towards superstitious treatment up until the early decades of the twentieth century. Despite the centralizing efforts of Ottoman administration in 1880s, which will be shortly discussed in a while, empirewide supervision of medical activities was a difficult task to accomplish. For instance, a correspondence from the Sublime Council for Judicial Ordinances to the office of the Chief Mufti dated 3 November 1859 reported that "peoples from Mağrib and Baghdad as well as Kurds have been residing usually in stores here and there, and performing geomancy and charm writing (*muskacı*)."²³³ It was also mentioned that those people were "particularly serving women by providing them spells and charms." "Since such deeds are

²³¹ See Ibid., Ali Ragıp Akyavaş, *Asitâne II: Evvel Zaman İçinde İstanbul*, (İstanbul, 2000), 109-113, 156-157; see also Raphaella Lewis, *Everyday Life in Ottoman Turkey*, (US, 1988), 41-54; Balıkhane Nazırı, 57-65.

²³² Although Islam did not prohibit the medical examination of women by male physicians, it was reported by contemporaries that Ottoman Muslim males did not want their women folk to be inspected by male physicians. For this respect see Salahaddin Asım, "Kızlarımıza Tesettür Esaslarına Nazaran Verilen Terbiye" in idem., 64; "Kadın-Tababet", 2.

²³³ As excerpted from BOA-*A.MKT.NZD* 295/62 (1276 Rebiülahir 19).

unacceptable in terms of Sharia and rational reason, and they spoil peoples' opinion", that their activities must be totally banished.²³⁴ Strikingly, Ottoman administration needed a religious proof from the Chief Mufti that these activities were not in accordance with the Islamic jurisprudence and traditions.²³⁵ Basically, Ottoman administration needed to have a firm pretext to eradicate such activities completely and legitimately. After obtaining such a sanction from the Chief Mufti, on 17 November 1859, another correspondence addressed to the Chief Director of Police firmly ordered the prevention of the aforesaid persons from superstitious activities. Moreover, it was also instructed that these provincial geomancers and charm writers had to be "expelled from the capital city" immediately. Another crucial stipulation in this order was the recommendation made to these provincial people prior to their evacuation. The Police was additionally ordered to recommend these charm writers and geomancers to "deal with legitimate arts and crafts or agriculture in their homelands instead of such oblivious stuff".²³⁶

As revealed above, the presence of traditional-counterfeit and superstitious healers was a problem caused by immigration. In fact, beginning from 1860s onwards, administration issued concurrent memorandums to control both rural and foreign émigrés. *Serseri Nizâmnameleri* (Regulations for the Vagabond) was introduced together with strict regulation of travel permissions.²³⁷ Yet, public

²³⁴ As excerpted from *ibid.*

²³⁵ *Ibid.*

²³⁶ As excerpted from BOA *A.MKT.NZD 296/89* (1276 Cemaziyü'l-evvel 4) .See also BOA *Y.PRK.SGB 2/31* (5 Rebiyyü'l- ahir 1301/3 February 1884) for the case of Lohusa Hoca, who was reported to have been dealing with magic and sorcery in Uzunçarşı district of İstanbul.

²³⁷ See documents BOA *A.MKT.MVL 140/3* (22 Receb 1278/ 23 January 1862) ; BOA *A.MKT.NZD 295/ 87* (23 Rebiyyü'l- ahir 1276/ 8 October 1859) that how Ottoman administration started a strict regulation of provincial people' entry into the city of İstanbul and the entitlement of travel permissions in the provincial areas so that there would not be any illegitimacy in terms of single workers, beggars, impoverished and the prostitutes, in 1860s onwards.

security measures and police control must have been inadequate that further cases arose. On 4 October 1901, a telegram, complaining about a person named Hacı Mehmed, addressed to the sultan's principal scribal office. According to this telegram the said person "have been deceiving people", and "traveling across the provinces to give spells and charms, to perform geomancy and fortune telling, and to read verses for the ill."²³⁸ As an interesting example for the evil impact these persons inflicted on people, the telegram reported the case of a man who divorced his wife in vain following the advice given by the said Hacı Mehmed.²³⁹ In sum, fortune tellers and people who practice medicine and healing without authorization and training were problematical for couple respects. Firstly, the service they provided was unacceptably useless and harmful. Secondly, they were claimed to be disturbing public order and familial order; they were unsolicited visitors for cities and contributing the distrupction of agriculture and trade in their country of origin by dealing with such superstitious activities. The claims about the harm posited by counterfeit physicians, traditional healers and practitioners of superstitious crafts would become more elaborated in the context of smallpox and syphilis epidemics. The central administration and medical authorities would increase the tone of criticism and appeal of corrective measures when the resistance of subject people and traditional healers became evidently damaging for the modern medical regulations, which launched the conditions of fight against epidemical illnesses.

Regarding the activities of counterfeit physicians, a note written from the Directory of the Military School of Medicine to the Ministry of Police on 8 May 1905. This note denounced that "in a wig store numbered 130 opposite to Ağa

²³⁸ As excerpted from BOA *Y.PRK.UM 56/102* (1319 Receb 4).

²³⁹ Ibid.

Camii around Beyoğlu, a man aged 30 and called İstelyo [Stelyo] from Kilyos, found to be performing blood letting and tooth removal during a routine inspection.”²⁴⁰ It is also reported that the said person was performing these task without license, therefore “he should be prohibited performing these tasks as required by the related laws, and released on a high amount of bail.”²⁴¹ However, “if he is found again carrying out such activities, he would be liable to serious punishment.”²⁴² This document also reveals that the inspectors from Military School of Medicine and the Sixth Division of Municipality of Istanbul made routine inspections. However, Ottoman administration had to handle similar cases of counterfeit and unlicensed healers up until the early twentieth century that those healers sometimes cooperated with real medical practitioners and made use of their legitimacy to set up pharmacies and surgeries.²⁴³

While complaining about fake physicians and superstitious healers, advice genre, and school books for girls started to include chapters titled as “protection of health” (*hıfzıssıhha*) and “domestic health care” (*ev hıfzıssıhhası*), home medicine (*tababet-i beytiyye*) and home pharmacy (*ev eczahanesi*) that they put a serious responsibility over women as daughters, wives, mother and grandmothers from 1880s onwards.²⁴⁴ Not only personal health and body care, but also proper diet, home

²⁴⁰ As excerpted from BOA ZB 40/39 (1323 April 21).

²⁴¹ Ibid.

²⁴² Ibid.

²⁴³ See BOA ZB 40/55 (1323 Haziran 19/ 2 July 1905) that a pharmacist helped a traditional healer to run a pharmacy in Üsküdar by his own license that the latter’s forgery was found out by a maltreated tifoid’s complaint.

²⁴⁴ See Besim Ömer, *Sihhatnüma-yı Etfal*, 46-47; idem., *Sihhatnüma-yı Aile*; Şerefüddin Arif Bey, *Ev Hekimi* (İstanbul: 1305/ 1899-1890); Ahmed Müfid, *Beka-yı Sihhat*, (İstanbul: 1312/1896-1897); Hüseyin Remzi, *Yadigar-ı Remzi: Aile Hıfzıssıhhası*, (İstanbul: Mahmud Bey Matbaası, 1320/ 1904-1905); A. Rıza, *Kızlara Mahsus İdare-yi Beytiyye I-II*, (İstanbul: Karabet Matbaası, 1314/ 1898-1899), 6-37, 27-64, Chapters 5 and 6: 3-35; A. Rıza, *Kızlara Mahsus Hıfz-u Sihhat*, (İstanbul: Karabet Matbaası, 1321/ 1905-1906).

hygiene such as instructions regarding cleaning of rooms, disinfection of kitchens and toilets, bathrooms, doing the laundry, setting furniture and organizing drawers, ventilating homes, were given.²⁴⁵ There were also books written solely for health care (*hıfz-u sıhhat*) that basic scientific information about organs, body functions such as digestion, inhalation, fertility, sterility²⁴⁶ were enlisted along with the drawings from English, German and French books of same kind. These books were followed by the ones written for mothers, through which Ottoman women introduced about pregnancy and post partum period, infant care and childhood diseases, vaccination as well as child discipline.²⁴⁷ Generally speaking, issues like sexuality, reproductive health with respect to venereal diseases, fertility and sterility were later incorporated to the health care books with specific titles such as “health of the married couples”.²⁴⁸ These books were written primarily by health professionals; they were physicians, surgeons or veterinarians.²⁴⁹

²⁴⁵ A.Rıza, *Kızlara Mahsus İdare-yi*, 6-15, 21-30.

²⁴⁶ See Şekib Akif Nazım, *İslam Hanımlarına Mahsus*.

²⁴⁷ See Besim Ömer, *Sıhhatnüma-yı Etfal*; idem., *Zayıf ve Vakitsiz Doğan Çocuklara Edilecek Takayyüdat*, (İstanbul: 1306/ 1890-1891; Dr. Salih, *Sari Çocuk Hastalıkları yahud Sirayet-i Marazdan Akdem Etfalin Emr-i Muhafazası*, (İstanbul: Ceride-i Askeriyye Basımevi, 1304/ 1888-1889) ; Dr. Munlas Suturi, *Validelere Rehber yahud Hıfz-u Sıhhat-i Etfal*, (İstanbul: Kasbar Matbaası, 1310/ 1894-1895) ; Hüseyin Remzi, *Validelere Yadigar*, (İstanbul: Artin asodoryan Matbaası, 1318/1902-1903) ; Mustafa Hüseyin, *Genç Valdelere ve Yeni Doğmuş Çocuklara Hizmet ve Takayyüdat*, (İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1309/ 1893-1894) ; idem., *Çocukların Hıfz-u Sıhhati*, (İstanbul: Kasbar Matbaası 1309/ 1893-1894) ; Hekimbaşı Muhyiddin, *Valideyne İhtar yahud Kuş Palazı*, (İstanbul: Alem Basımevi, 1316/1900-1901) ; Kenan Tevfik, *Kadınlık*, for syphilis and child care see Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, (İstanbul: Karabet Matbaası, 1317/ 1901-1902), 65-68.

²⁴⁸ Ahmed Said, *Hıfz-u Sıhhat-i İzdivac ve Tenasil*, (İstanbul: 1308/ 1892-1893) ; Kenan Tevfik, *Kadınlık*, 29-35;39-45; Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-ü Sıhhat-i Müteehhileyn*, 215-237; idem., *Sağdıç; Rehber-i İzdivaç*, (İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1889-1890) ; Besim Ömer, *Ukum*, ; İbn’ül Hakki Mehmed Tahir, *İzdivacın Şerait-i Sihhiyesi*, (İstanbul: Nefaset Matbaası, 1329/ 1913-1914).

²⁴⁹ For example Besim Ömer was one of the pioneer physicians who specialized on gynecology. Nusred Fu’ad and Hüseyin Remzi were again similar examples for this respect.

3.3. Reorganization of Ottoman Medicine: The Reform of Pharmaceutics and Medicine

Ottoman administration's initial attempts to regulate pharmaceutics could be traced back to the reigns of Abdülhamid I and Selim III, and they were carried out for two basic issues: abortion and poisonings. These early steps towards medicine and pharmaceutics remained sporadic in character. A more systematic attempt came about subsequent to the announcement of the edict of 1838, during the initial years of the reign of Abdülmecid (1839-1861). In 1840, the Medical Council (*meclis-i tıbbiye*) was established for supervising the sale of pharmaceutical products.²⁵⁰ Due to legal and financial requirements, pharmacists of İstanbul and their apprentices were obliged to register at the Office of the Chief Physician, and they were subjected to the regular supervisions of the Office of the Chief Magistrate (1844).²⁵¹ In 1854, when the Office of the Chief Magistrate was dissolved and its functions transferred to the municipality of İstanbul, the municipal administration took over the duty of supervising pharmacists.²⁵²

Between 1845 and 1850, number of medical incidents took place in İstanbul that Ottoman administration ventured to regulate pharmacies. These events included the decease of children and women due to inadequately prepared medicines. As stimulated by these tragic losses, administration prepared the first regulation for pharmacies in the Ottoman Empire. This regulation, titled “Regulation Concerning

²⁵⁰ See Nuran Yıldırım, “Nizamnâme-i Eczacıyan der Memalik-i Osmaniye. Osmanlı Devleti’nde Eczacılar Nizamnâmesi-1852,” in *IV.Türk Eczacılık Tarihi Toplantısı Bildirileri (4-5 Haziran 1998, İstanbul)*, ed. Emre Dölen, (İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi Eczacılık Fakültesi Yayını, 2000), 43 for details..

²⁵¹ BOA C.S. 454 (13 B 1260 – 4)- Takrir.

²⁵² İlber Ortaylı, *Tanzimattan Cumhuriyete Yerel Yönetim Geleneği*, (İstanbul, 1985), 116-124.

Pharmacists in the Ottoman Lands” (*Nizamnâme-i Eczâciyân der Memâlik-i Osmâniye*), and dated 18 June 1852 / 29 Şaban 1268 intended to introduce standard measures for emergency (*növbet*) pharmacies and the drugs they provided. As indicated by the prelude of this regulation, Imperial Medical School (*Mekteb-i Tıbbiye-i Şâhâne*) would take the full charge of supervising pharmacies and pharmacists. According to articles 1-5, only those pharmacists who received an official certificate from the School of Medicine subsequent to a qualification exam were eligible to set up pharmacies. Article 7 of the aforesaid regulation underlined that nobody except the officially certificated pharmacist could prepare drugs. Similarly, with the article 11, pharmacists were prohibited to prepare drugs unless they received a prescription from a physician. With the article 13, poisonous and explosive chemicals were to be stored and kept in a safe location.²⁵³

The regulation of 1852 was replaced by the “Regulation Concerning the Practice of the Craft of Pharmaceutics within Municipalities” (*Beledî İspençiyarlık Sanatının İcrâsına Dâir Nizamnâme*), dated 3 February 1861 /22 Receb 1277. The new regulation, as article 1 stipulated, transferred the control of drug trade to the “Superintendent of Medical Issues” (*Umûr-ı Tıbbiye Nezâreti*), which was a directory attached to the Medical School.²⁵⁴ Similarly, *attars* and *kökçüs* (*herbalists*) were prevented to engage in following tasks: setting up and running pharmacies, preparing prescriptions, selling drugs at cheaper prices and providing their own-accord medicines. In addition to the all stipulations above, the sale of imported drugs, whose ingredients were indefinite, was also prohibited by the article 3 of the Regulation Concerning Pharmaceutical Merchants (*Eczâ Tüccarı Hakkında*

²⁵³ Yıldırım, “Nizamnâme-i Eczacıyan”, 43-45, 65-67.

²⁵⁴ See Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 3056-3057.

Nizamnâme) and article 3 of Regulation Concerning Herbalists (*Attar ve Kökçüler Nizamnâmesi*), both of which put in effect in May 1885²⁵⁵. However, a more comprehensive regulation regarding pharmaceuticals was endorsed on 16 April 1888 /4 Şaban 1305, and entitled as “Regulation Concerning Physicians and Pharmacists of the Country” (*Memleket Etıbbası ve Eczâcıları Hakkında Nizamnâme*) which enlisted the name of 68 drugs names which were prohibited within Ottoman borders.²⁵⁶

A parallel process established the official control over physicians. The “Regulation Concerning the Execution of Medical Profession within Municipalities of the Imperial Lands” (*Memâlik-i Mahrûse-i Şâhânedede Tabâbet-i Belediyeye İcrâsına Dâir Nizamnâme*), dated 12 October 1861 /7 Rebiyülâhir 1278, indicated the legal conditions under which Ottoman and foreign physicians could practice medicine. Accordingly, only those physicians, who received their diploma from Imperial Medical School, or foreign physicians whose diplomas were approved by the same institution, were permitted to practice medicine by the article number 3.²⁵⁷ Another article stipulated that physicians were not allowed to provide on their own accord drugs to their patients if those drugs were not practiced and distributed by the local pharmacies previously, with the article number 6.²⁵⁸

²⁵⁵ See *ibid.*, 3069-3070.

²⁵⁶ *Ibid.*, 3065-3054.

²⁵⁷ See BOA *HI. 30* (1313 Zilhicce 15/ 28 May 1896) for a sample license request made by the Greek Orthodox Patriarchate for a Greek female physician (midwife) who was graduated from Medical Faculty in Paris.

²⁵⁸ Ergin, *Mecelle-i* , 6: 3053-3054.

3.4. Vaccination

The issue of child welfare and children's protection from epidemics of smallpox, diphtheria, and scarlet fever was one of the most prominent issues regarding public health that both state and advice literature tried to discipline families about proper vaccination and health care. Prior to the enhancement of empire wide health services in 1870s, *ilkah* (vaccination) was the duty of local midwives, or *aşıcı kadınlar*, who were specialized in inoculating. These homeopaths were performing vaccination by traditional ways such as taking extracts from the boils and sores of ill children, or the infected, especially in the provinces. However, Ottoman administration interfered into this process by opening permanent centers which would have permanent inoculators, and physicians to examine the children who were infected with aforesaid childhood illnesses. For example, a decree dated 14 June 1846, from the Sublime Council for Judicial Ordinances announced that “in order to inoculate all Muslim and non-Muslim children of the empire, who had neither been infected with, nor vaccinated for smallpox”, permanent and continually on-duty centers would be opened in Üsküdar and Eyüb, and necessary physicians would be appointed, [...]”

²⁵⁹ It was also revealed in the decree that those physicians appointed in to the aforesaid regions “would be responsible for finding out and inspecting unvaccinated children from the local headmen and religious functionaries.”²⁶⁰ However, the most crucial part of the decree is about the way it addressed families of children that they were warned both for secular and religious repercussions of avoiding vaccination measure;

²⁵⁹ As excerpted from BOA *İ.M.V.* 1570 (2 Receb 1262).

²⁶⁰ As excerpted from *ibid.*

[...] Since the Holy Sharia does not have any objection to the issue of vaccination, [...] and the Office of the Chief Mufti has given a positive opinion previously, [...] and the inhabitants of İstanbul had already acknowledged the value of their children [in previous epidemics], vaccination of children must be gratuitously applied. [...]

It is striking that Ottoman administration had to resort to the measure of *fatwa* (opinions of Islamic jurists) in order to encourage families to accomplish the inoculation of their children. Moreover, these orders had to address their conscience by reminding past epidemics and related high child mortality. As a reason for the administration to propagate the medical benefit and religious appropriateness of inoculation, it might be suggested that Ottoman families resisted either for the substance of new vaccines, i.e., the one collected from calves, and the vaccine's side effects and quality that in the aftermath of vaccination children had symptoms. Another point had to do with the payment for vaccination; families might have not understood that vaccination was performed for free.²⁶¹ Whatever the reasons of such resistance from the masses towards inoculation of their children, the administration had to issue another decree on 10 December 1850 due to another epidemic cycle among the children of the capital city.²⁶² In this decree, it was reported that in a short time span²⁶³ seventy nine children died, though the administration provided opportunity of vaccination by opening permanent centers which had doctors and medical personnel standing for emergencies. The decree also argued that prior measures of vaccination saved the lives of children who were brought by [their

²⁶¹ Another decree dated 10 December 1850 from the Sublime Council for Judicial Ordinances reported that at the vaccination centers previously established around Eyüp and Üsküdar districts poor people were also provided the opportunity of vaccinating and medication for free. See BOA *LMV*. 6492 (17 Safer 1267).

²⁶² “just in a month time, during January 1850” as excerpted from *ibid*.

²⁶³ “Between the beginning and end of January” as excerpted from *ibid*.

parents to these centers].”²⁶⁴ For Ottoman administration, “such a high amount of losses”²⁶⁵ in “such a short time”, caused by the “exclusive lenience of the majority of people towards inoculating their kids.” ²⁶⁶ The intensity of calling families’ conscience increased in the medium of this decree; “the lenience of parents”, who did not vaccinate their children while numerous medical personnel and vaccination centers were provided, was deemed “contradictory to the protective compassion of proper parenthood.”²⁶⁷ Moreover, it was also argued in this decree that while the benefit of inoculation against smallpox was proven, “incompliance against it is indeed contrary to the humanness and divine orders”. “Therefore”, as the decree concludes, “from now on, everybody has to bring their children to the said centers and vaccinate them”. And if found not complying with this measure, parents would be liable and responsible for the repercussions. The order ended with the provision that community leaders and religious functionaries of each neighborhood would warn families about these matters.²⁶⁸ Quite similar to the way anti-abortion regulations were carried out, the administration chose to warn parents with the help of local functionaries, however more clearly that parents’ resistance to have their children vaccinated was evaluated as an act against humanity and proper parenthood. Here, acting against humanity was rejecting vaccination regulation, therefore contributing to the expansion of the illness. As for the proper parenting, the official discourse referred to the parently compassion towards children; children were deemed to be the part of one’s own heart and divinely entrusted beings. The decree

²⁶⁴ As excerpted from *ibid.*

²⁶⁵ As excerpted from *ibid.*

²⁶⁶ As excerpted from *ibid.*

²⁶⁷ As excerpted from *ibid.*

²⁶⁸ As excerpted from *ibid.*

also ordered the advertisement of vaccination regulation in the official newspaper, *Takvim-i Vekâyi* so that administrative units and ordinary people would comprehend the issue properly. Accordingly, a correspondence dated 21 December 1850 from the Sublime Council for Judicial Ordinances to the Grand Vizierate ordered the informing of medical personnel in vaccination centers about recent decisions concerning vaccination by means of the Imperial Medical School. Basically, medical personnel were informed about recent developments so that they could be more influential to accomplish higher participation while operating vaccination measure.²⁶⁹ Depending upon this, it can be suggested that the second eager official measure towards the population progeny and proper up-bringing of young generations was projected in the medium of vaccination measure consequent to anti-abortion regulation.

Subsequent to the measure of promoting “the duty of vaccinating”, there emerged the problem of “proper vaccination” and “licensed inoculators” between late 1840s and 1850s. Regarding archival evidence, cycles of smallpox epidemics among children in the capital and provincial areas were reported.²⁷⁰ At first, central administration ordered on 28 November 1846 that young students, who would be drawn by lots, from provincial areas had to be sent to the capital city to be trained for vaccination.²⁷¹ It was reported in another imperial decree dated 1 March 1847 that itinerary groups of physicians, who specialized on vaccination and epidemics, had to be sent to Anatolia both for inoculation and taking specimen from the vaccines

²⁶⁹ As excerpted from BOA *A.MKT.MVL* 40/99 (28 Safer 1267).

²⁷⁰ See BOA *I.DH* 1581 (April 1852) for vaccination of children around Edirne for smallpox epidemic and BOA *A.MKT.UM* 241/87 (28 Şevval 1272/ 2 July 1856) for smallpox epidemic in Prince Islands.

²⁷¹ See BOA *LMV* 1732 (9 Zilhicce 1262 / 28 November 1846).

which had been used in those areas.²⁷² Accordingly, un-licensed and improper inoculators in the provincial areas were tried to be put under scrutiny. The report revealed that “unrelated and un-licensed characters” “having neither medical competence nor information regarding the science of inoculation” were reported to be providing “cures and vaccination” for children with “adverse substances”.²⁷³ With respect to this correspondence, the Sublime Council of Judicial Ordinances ordered the Ministry of Interior that people who were not licensed by the Imperial Medical School would not be allowed to practice either medicine or vaccination as it was previously decided. “Since this issue is pertaining to the public health, the decision must also be announced to the people” as concluded by the report.²⁷⁴ On 6 September 1858, a memorandum addressed from the Ministry of Interior initiated the necessary measures for the projected public announcement.²⁷⁵ On 18 September 1858, it was reported from provinces that the “order of preventing un-licensed persons from performing the delicate measure of vaccination” was announced to the provincial people.²⁷⁶ Finally on 2 December 1858, a response for the memorandums sent in September for proper inoculators received. This report stated that provincial administrators were taking great care about allowing only the licensed personnel for the vaccination of children.²⁷⁷ As mentioned previously, vaccination was accomplished by traditional midwives and *aşıcı kadın*s, however after 1860s vaccination transformed to be the duty of officially appointed paramedics and

²⁷² See BOA *LDH* 7087 (13 Ra 1263).

²⁷³ As excerpted from BOA *A.MKT.UM* 325/75 (1275 S 5/ 2 September 1858).

²⁷⁴ As excerpted from *ibid.*

²⁷⁵ As cited in BOA *A.MKT.UM* 326/18 (1275 Safer 9).

²⁷⁶ As excerpted from *A.MKT.UM* 326/ 18 (1275 Safer 9/ 18 September 1858).

²⁷⁷ As cited in BOA *A.MKT.UM* 336/10 (25 Rebiyyü'l-ahir 1275/ 2 December 1858).

midwives. Parallel to this, advice genre also started to instruct people about vaccination beginning from 1870s onwards that below is one of the earlier examples of such instruction;

O son! The disease of smallpox was a passage way for children that many of them used to die and some of them become ugly as their cute faces were spoiled. [...] Smallpox is a contagious disease that children get in touch with infected kids who break out with smallpox, and this disease appears in some seasons severely.

O the light of my eyes! Your generous mother had you vaccinated while you were very young, and she examined your vaccination boils with an extreme care everyday. With full of kindness, you should behave properly and have your children vaccinated when you grow up and have kids. While so much benefit of smallpox vaccination is acknowledged, there are many who do not know about vaccination in Anatolia and countries in Asia. However, in civilized countries skillful physicians are encouraged by governments to vaccinate children; everybody bring their children for vaccination when they are young. The physician who invented vaccine [substance] was named Jerry Benar [Edward Jenner] that he was residing in Glouchaster, where husbandry of cows was prime activity, and he found this vaccine by examining the fatteners who did not have smallpox but had boils in the hands. [...] ²⁷⁸

The above quote is interesting for couple of respects. First of all, the writer chose to address a son, who would be the supreme overseer of proper orientation and discipline of children in the future as frequently suggested by the advice genre. Secondly, the author directly addressed that son's conscience for ensuring the treatment he had received for his own children Thirdly, he wanted to instruct the prospective parents about the science of vaccination by providing a technical explanation on recent and reliable vaccine extracts. In other words, science was posited as a positive alternative and profanized by the medium of vaccination. Other instructions for proper vaccination included similar stances as well as questions regarding appropriate time for vaccination, proper inoculators. For example,

²⁷⁸ As excerpted from Edhem İbrahim Paşa, *Terbiye-i Etfal Risalesi*, (İstanbul: Matbaa-yi Amire, 1286/ 1870-1871, 90-93.

Hüseyin Remzi advised female students, as prospective wives and mothers, in his work titled *Moral Lessons for Girls from the Teacher (Hocanın Hanım Kızlara Dürus-ı Ahlakı*, 1898) as follows; “the children are the profit of the holy command of marriage, and they must be vaccinated in the first three months immediately after the birth so that they could be saved from smallpox.”²⁷⁹ The proper and systematic vaccination also meant the cooperation of local administrations with the central administration that both state and intellectuals charged local functionaries for registering births. Hüseyin Remzi encouraged his readers, female students, to inform local administrators and religious functionaries about the birth of their kids so that they could organize identity cards, and have their children registered into population registry book, which would in turn ascertain the vaccination of their infants.²⁸⁰ Indeed, Ottoman administration would start utilizing the regulation of *nüfus tezkiresi* (population registry and identity card) for newly born infants that local administrators and religious functionaries delegated to collect the amount of children who were currently born and in need of vaccination beginning from late 1880s.²⁸¹ On 16 April 1888 /4 Şaban 1305 a regulation titled “Regulation Concerning Physicians

²⁷⁹ Hüseyin Remzi, *Hocanın Hanım Kızlara*, 160.

²⁸⁰ Ibid.

²⁸¹ For the amendments and introduction of systematic means towards the Regulation of Population Registry and Identity Cards, see reports of the Council of Ministers BOA *MV* 19/55 (1304 Şaban 3/ 27 April 1887) and BOA *MV* 20/98 (1304 Ramazan N 2/ 25 May 1887) that death and birth case became obliged for families. In January 1891, the ones who do not notify the local functionaries about the changes in their household composition such as death, birth and marriage were subjected to fines, see BOA *MV* 61/30 (1308 Cemaziyyü'l-evvel 23/ 4 January 1891). Between late 1890s and early 1900s, the central administration had to issue another measure since it was often reported that certain families were prone to not to register and take identity cards for their newly born infants due their indigence and poverty; for example a policeman residing in Üsküdar was found out that he did not inform the functionaries about the birth of his daughter in the specified time period for such matters, and he was liable to pay the fine amounted 1 Osmanlı Lirası. However, on inspection, he proved that he was hardly making a living, therefore the Council Ministers decided that he had to pay the fine otherwise it would be a violation of the population registry regulation, yet, his fine would be subsidized by the imperial alm. See BOA *MV* 110/21 (1322 B 15 / 25 September 1904) to the finally in 9 October 1909, a special report from the Council of Ministers introduced a reduction in the fee of identity cards that poor families were tried to be encouraged to register and take ID's for their children, for this respect see BOA *DH.MUI.* 20-1/39 (1327 N 4/ 9 October 1909).

and Pharmacists of the Country” (*Memleket Etıbbası ve Eczacıları Hakkında Nizamnâme*) was put in effect. With the article 17 of this regulation, physicians across the empire were subjected to routine inspection about whether they have been complying with the recent measures regarding public health administration. For example, they would be inspected for proper enforcement of orders, preparing reports and necessary information about epidemics and health issues in the provinces.²⁸² In 1892, The Institution of Smallpox Vaccination (*Telkih-i Cedri Ameliyyathanesi*) was established. This was followed by the foundation of the School of Vaccination.²⁸³ Between 1892 and 1897, 600, 000 children were vaccinated as a result of these developments. However, at the beginning of the year 1902, a smallpox epidemic broke out in the imperial army division in Prizrin that the Hamidian administration had to issue an additional decree by which it could evaluate the efficiency of its personnel to fight back the epidemic. Dated 13 January 1902, this imperial decree strikingly underlined both the reasons behind such an epidemic and advantage of vaccination prior to the epidemics;

Despite the benefit of the quarantine measure on which a regulation was consequently made and the increase in the number of physicians to serve all over Ottomandom, the said illness has been breaking out here and there like that of Prizrin, and this is caused by the lenience and indolence as well as incomppliance of local officials to the said regulation. Therefore, from now on, the aforesaid officials in Rumelia and Anatolia, and in short all over the Ottoman dominions have to fulfill the measure of vaccination, which is to be financially assured by provincial administrations. But they [inoculators and physicians] should be also careful about the fact that sometimes vaccination tempts the disease for the ones who have aptitude for smallpox, and this dimension should also be announced to them. And as it has been reported by the press that smallpox has been killing many people in England, while it ceased to be epidemical in Vienna with regard to the regulation of compulsory vaccination, it is convenient to introduce similar measures for

²⁸² Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 3067.

²⁸³ Yıldırım, *Tanzimat’dan*, 1321-1335.

smallpox vaccination in the Ottoman lands and take necessary steps as well as amending the extant vaccination regulation, if necessary.²⁸⁴

Depending upon the decree, it can be claimed that there were troubles regarding both the quality of vaccine and the conduct of the liable health personnel in early 1900s despite the previous measures taken for such epidemics. The former problems can be regarded natural that the achievement of medical science could not provide better vaccine substances at that time. In addition to this, vaccination for smallpox had to be repeated in every five years. However, the nuisance which was argued to be caused by the unreliable health personnel was a kind of dilemma that the successful enforcement of regulations had always been problematic for big territorial empires like Ottomans. The uniformity of health services and simultaneous application of preventive measures could not be possible in contrast to the central administration's counter claim. To put it differently, although Ottoman administration initiated the enforcement of vaccination regulation by convincing families at first, they decided to hold health personnel responsible for the uneven ramifications as in the case of anti-abortion regulation. In short, the administration questioned first the shortcomings of its own agents instead of intervening more to the families. In early 1900s the epidemic issue was still a painstaking one, and ongoing modernization required first the accomplishment of an effective bureaucracy and enforcement scheme. It is also possible to argue about a kind of division of labor that the Ottoman state took the responsibility of perfecting its means to interfere while advice genre and press medium fulfilled the perfection of the sense of responsibility in parents. Such a claim can be corroborated with the following development. On 7 December 1909, the Ministry of Interior prepared a memorandum to be circulated among local

²⁸⁴ As excerpted from BOA *HI. 119* (1319 Şevval 3/ 13 January 1902).

functionaries, religious and administrative, that they were in charge of clarifying and reporting the amount of births in their respective localities for enforcing vaccination regulation more systematically.²⁸⁵ In other words, the Ottoman bureaucratic modernization was actually a transformation into an information-knowledge-practice based model as the development of public health issues exemplified.

If we return to the proper vaccination regarding when to vaccinate children, another medical specialist, Mustafa Hüseyin reported that vaccination must be made in infancy, in the first two months.²⁸⁶ The proper vaccination issue, yet, explained quite neatly by Besim Ömer. He recommended both licensed midwives and mothers that the inoculation of the newly born against smallpox had to be done twice. The first one must be performed at the end of the first month, and the second one must be done in the sixth month.²⁸⁷ He also informed families and midwives about the process of proper vaccination, specifically the appropriate vaccination for smallpox as follows;

The only mean to avoid smallpox is the smallpox vaccine. In the past, this vaccine was used to be obtained from the boils on the breast of cows. It could also be taken from an infected child that the substance of his/ her pus was a kind of vaccine. However, obtaining vaccine from another child is both difficult and [dangerous] that in the former case the pus usually is not enough, and in the latter case hidden diseases, i.e. syphilis and tuberculosis, of the first[donor] child could infect the other one.

Nowadays, the vaccine obtained from calves are used everywhere. In addition, there is vaccine department opened to produce vaccine extract in the premises of the Imperial Medical School. They keep vaccine substances in sterile small tubes in that building.

²⁸⁵ See BOA *DH.EUM.THR 15/31* (24 Zilkade 1327/ 7 December 1909).

²⁸⁶ See Mustafa Hüseyin, *Genç Valdelere*, 64; see also Besim Ömer, *Sihhatnüma-yı*; Melikzâde Fuad, *Vezaif-i Beytiyyeden*, 108-117.

²⁸⁷ See Besim Ömer, *Ebelik*, sections titled as “For the child” in prologue, and “Vaccination of Children”, 449-451.

[either of the aforesaid] measures must be utilized when vaccination is the concern. The most suitable place for vaccination is the area near to child's shoulder. It is dangerous to inoculate kids on the legs since urine and feces can easily infect the sores of vaccination boils. Vaccination must be done with a special lancet, and the most important point regarding vaccination is to be careful about hygiene and extreme purity. Those lancets must be washed and boiled. Vaccine substance must be transferred from the sterile tubes to a previously washed and sterilized glass container. Then, the point of inoculation must be properly rubbed and cleaned with a piece of sterile cotton damped with lysol. For this, the kid must be undressed in the upper part of the body.

[...]the child must be vaccinated in the first two months following delivery, and at about winter time. However, the vaccination needs to be repeated; it is not successful all the time. On these occasions children should not be immediately re-vaccinated; it should be left to later periods, such as couple of months must pass.

All in all, vaccination must be done in the first year of birth, and parents are obliged to do this with respect to the official regulation. Vaccination does not harm the children, and after vaccination children should be treated the same way before; nothing related to its routine life i.e., bathing, cleaning, the manner of dressing and feeding. Nothing should be changed in the aftermath of inoculation.

However this point must be acknowledged very well; smallpox usually harms and kills newborns. And the most important measure to prevent this is vaccinating infants and not delaying inoculation.²⁸⁸

As it was revealed from the above quote, vaccine substance taken from human donors was not approved, and families were warned for proper vaccination accordingly. In order to direct families for scientific vaccination, The Institute of Smallpox Vaccination managed to prepare 7, 607,784 units of smallpox vaccine extract between 1892 and 1913.²⁸⁹ Not only advice books written for child care and health measures, but also books and pamphlets compiled for the prevention from syphilis also included plain admonitions to families that vaccine substance from infected kids, and inoculation from the sores and boils from other children could not be utilized. They also warned parent to be extremely careful about the infection potential of traditional healers and their utensils for syphilis. For example the

²⁸⁸ As excerpted from *ibid.*, 449-451.

²⁸⁹ See Yıldırım, *Tanzimat*'dan, 1335.

“lancets” of these healers were problematic.²⁹⁰ Celaledin Muhtar, another physician from the Imperial School of Medicine specialized on venereal diseases and syphilis, acknowledged that the old way of obtaining vaccine from human donors actually exacerbated the amount of syphilitics. He also reported that the vaccines from calves were not harmful by any means, and “as long as it is performed complying with the scientific medical measures”, vaccination did not posit any danger but “preserves one’s life from a grave illness like smallpox.”²⁹¹ In addition to the risk of syphilis contagion from the human donors, the most frequent danger regarding inoculation posited by the vaccinators themselves. As Celaledin Muhtar reported, “some of these did not use clean injectors and lancets; they leniently wet the lancet with their saliva or blew upon the vaccines to make it cooler, but ended up infecting the substance consequently.”²⁹² He also warned parents about the infectious potential of lancets and injectors which were repetitively used during vaccinations at schools and military quarters.²⁹³

As secondary measures for child and infant health, Ottoman administration also supported the publication of books²⁹⁴, and initiated the establishment of specific

²⁹⁰ As excerpted from Nuri Bin Ömer, *Frengi Risalesi; Istilahat-ı Fenniyyeden ‘Âri Frengi Hastalığı Hakkında Herkesin Anlayabileceği Derecede Malûmat-ı Müfideyi Camii’dir*, (Dersaadet: 1323/1907-1908) 4,5,11. See Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivac*, (İstanbul: Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete Matbaası, 1317/ 1901-1902), 2-5 that he included the spread of syphilis firstly by midwives and *aşıcıs* who were accidentally infected with syphilis, and in the course of vaccinating persons. See also Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, *Frengi İlleti Hakkında Herkese Elzem Olan Muamelât*, (İstanbul: 1317/ 1901-1902), 22 that he condemns the smallpox vaccines from human donors on account of spreading out syphilis.

²⁹¹ Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 64-65.

²⁹² As excerpted from *ibid.*, 65.

²⁹³ *Ibid.* See also 66-68.

²⁹⁴ See BOA A.MKT.MHM 138/17 (11 Muharrem 1275 / 21 August 1858) for the permission for a book titled *Nuhbet’ül Etfal*, which was written by the senior physician of Tarabya Hospital, BOA Y.MTV 37/72 (6 Cemâziyyü’l –ahir 1306 / 7 February 1889) for the publication of a book titled *Emraz-ı Etfal*, which was a translation from English by Hüseyin İhsan Efendi, a physician from Gureba Hastanesi; BOA Y.PRK.TKM/SH 21/63 (30 Zilhicce 1304/17 August 1890) for the permission given for the translation of Herman Molkenbauer’s *Terbiye-i Etfal-i Daimi-yi Beynelmilel*; see also

clinics for childhood diseases at public hospitals²⁹⁵ between late 1850s and 1890s. In addition to these, central administration tried to prevent public health with more general measures; such as inspecting cheap rooms and inns for the single laborers in the capital city around shopping districts in terms of hygiene²⁹⁶, constituting health commissions²⁹⁷ and preparing reports about the recent condition of public health, and necessary measures to be taken consequent to these reports.²⁹⁸ The medical inscontrol of public space and coffee houses, waste management²⁹⁹ and compiling proper and detailed statistics about seasonal cycle of epidemic diseases, the number of infected and dead consequent to epidemics both in the capital and provincial areas were other measures to promote public health.³⁰⁰ If an epidemic occurred in a locality and school, the administration provided the necessary disinfection.³⁰¹

BOA *HI.* 34 (1320 Cemaziyyü'l -ahir 15 / 19 September 1902) for the publication of a book titled *Sihhatnümâ-yı İzdivac* and its translation to Urdu language, which was written by Ekber Beğ.

²⁹⁵ See BOA *Y.PRK.* *SH/TKM* 9/ 70 (29 Zilhicce 1315/ 21 May 1898) for the opening of epidemical illnesses at Hamidiye Etfal Hastanesi.

²⁹⁶ See BOA *Y.PRK.* *ŞH* 2/29 (1302 Zi'l- kade 20 / 30 September 1885) for a routine report dated 26 September 1885 which was prepared after a municipal inspection on such inns and cheap residences.

²⁹⁷ See BOA *HI.* 1313 (1302 Rebiyyü'l ahir 27)

²⁹⁸ See BOA *MV* 56/ 23 (1307.Zilhicce 24/ 11 August 1890) that Ottoman administration introduced the routine health control among the poor, and inspection over consumption items, and checks for infectious diseases by the physicians appointed to the Sixth Divison of Municipallity of İstanbul. See also BOA *Y.PRK.**SH* 3/62 (1310 Muharrem 28 / 22 August 1892) for a report prepared by Chemist Dr. Zâni for informing the imperial bureaucracy about public health that additional regulations and means for the enhancement of quarantine administration, renewal and control of sewage systems, inspection of hotels and inns, control of food and beverages and drinking water, inspection means and officers, the regulation of passport and travel, opening of chemistry labs for testing and improving means for city hygiene, etc.

²⁹⁹ See BOA *HI.* 96 (1311 Muharrem 28 / 11 August 1893) for a special imperial decree which introduce the control of small coffee houses for not throwing the waste water of water pipes since these wastes causing contagion and infection.

³⁰⁰ See BOA *HI.* 61 (1324 Muharrem 17 / 13 March 1906) an imperial decree ordering the perfection and amendment of such statistical registries for each and every season so that better precautions and measures could be taken beforehand.

³⁰¹ See BOA *Y.PRK.* *ŞH* 2/8 (1301 Zi'l-kade 6/ 25 September 1884) for a report prepared to handle scarlatina and diphteria epidemic among school children in Eyüp and the measures taken by the municipality.

Ottoman administration finally became more responsive towards providing more means of protective health care and emergency cases.³⁰²

3.5. Fight Against Venereal Contagion: Syphilis Epidemics in the Ottoman Empire (1850s-1910s)

3.5.1. Short History of Syphilis

The period between mid- nineteenth to early twentieth century was the time of increasing concern about sexually transmitted diseases and their society-wide flow as epidemics. Syphilis, which is quite often regarded as an “illness of the modern era”³⁰³, perceived as an evil infirmity that could deteriorate future generations, obliterate fetuses and doom stricken families of different classes to unhealthy, jeopardized and tainted progeny. In addition to these, it was also an immoral malady which could destroy the fighting ability of men in arms and impair the honor of societies in which it broke out. In relation to rapid flow of syphilis among masses, different sets of reflexes and precautions emerged; such as growing concern towards the well-being and purity of families, systematic medical examination of prostitutes and control over prostitution, hospitals designed and built for locking and treating

³⁰² See BOA *HI. 115* (1316 Rebiyyü'l evvel 30/ 18 August 1898) a special imperial decree addressed to the Municipality of İstanbul that pharmacies of İstanbul must be open out of working hours on rotative basis so that emergency cases would be treated properly.

³⁰³ David I. Kertzer, “Syphilis, Foundlings, and Wetnurses in Nineteenth Century Italy”, *Journal of Social History*, 32/ 3 (Spring 1999): 591.

syphilitics in a compulsory way, and a whole set of strictly moral claims about the infected.³⁰⁴

The first recorded syphilis epidemic dated back to the late fifteenth to early sixteenth century, and it consequently swept Europe and the Old World between 1494 and 1510.³⁰⁵ The first epidemic broke out among French army besieging Naples in 1495; France and Italy were the first geographies influenced from syphilis in epidemical forms.³⁰⁶ Firstly in the year 1495 in Northern Italy, then in the aftermath of the demobilization of French army in the same year, the first allusions about the disease's link to sexual intercourse, its virulence and severe disfigurement, i.e., scars and sores that it inflicted upon the victims became obvious.³⁰⁷ In 1496, French city of Lyons started to implement a policy of expelling syphilitics from the city premises. In the following year syphilis became a country wide epidemic for France, then it also spreaded into Europe and overseas in less than a decade. First cases of syphilis were recorded in Scotland as early as 1497, in India around 1498, and finally in Canton in China in 1505.³⁰⁸

From the beginning, there were contrasting allusions about “the original” and “first” transmitters of the disease; the emergence of syphilis in Europe quite often

³⁰⁴ Allan M. Brandt, “Sexually Transmitted Diseases”, W.F. Bynum & Roy Porter eds. , *Companion Encyclopedia of the History of Medicine*, vol.2, London, Routledge, 1993, 566.

³⁰⁵ See *ibid.*, also see Claude Quétel, *History of Syphilis*, Trans.by Judith Braddock & Brian Pike, (Cambridge:Polity Press, 1990), 1-11; Marie E. McAllister, “Stories of the Origin of Syphilis in the Eighteenth Century England; Science, Myth and Prejudice”, *Eighteenth Century Life* 24 (Winter 2000): 24; Jon Arrizabalaga, John Henderson and Roger French, *The Great Pox: The French Disease in Renaissance Europe*, (New Haven; Yale University Press, c1997) ,1-19, 20-37. See also Emel Bülbül Başkan, Şükran Tunalı, “The History of Syphilis”, *Türkiye Klinik Tıp Etiği Hukuku Tarihi* 10 (2002): 139; Jared Diamond, *Guns, Germs and Steel*, (New York: W.W.Norton, 1997), 195-210.

³⁰⁶ See J.D. Oriel, *The Scars of Venus: A History of Venereology*, (London: Springer- Verlag, 1994) ; John E. Lobdell, Douglas Owsley, “The Origin of Syphilis”, *The Journal of Sex Research* 10/1 (February 1974): 78; Başkan, 140; Kertzer, 591.

³⁰⁷ *Ibid.*, Quétel, 10-11.

³⁰⁸ See Başkan, 140; Quétel, 50-52.

attributed either to the French troops infected by Spanish mercenaries under the service of the King Charles VIII of France for the siege of the city of Naples, or to Italians, who gave contagion to the French during this siege.³⁰⁹ It was also suggested that firstly the Spanish mercenaries were contracted with syphilis during their sexual encounters with the women previously infected by the Columbus' crews returning from the New World. It was believed that syphilis was contracted to the other mercenaries from the Spanish; since German, Swiss, Burgundian, Hungarian, Slavic and English mercenaries who simultaneously served the French army with the Spanish.³¹⁰ Syphilis became nearly a stigma, a means for otherization and outcasting immediately after it broke out in epidemical forms. Syphilitics were deemed as outcasts and condemned by the church since it was keenly believed that the illness was a clear sign of fornication; illicit sex. In other words, the illness became a sin in itself; the infected were avoided socially and locked in specific localities and hospitals circa 1550s.³¹¹ The literature on syphilis therefore coloured by these claims; Renaissance and early modern venereology literature speculated through employing the concepts of illicit sex, sexual promiscuity, encounters with the alien and rival people for the origin of syphilis.

The process of naming the “new pox” and theories of its origin were full of contrasting reproachful claims towards “the other” beginning from the early sixteenth century. For example, the Columbian-New World Theory of Exchange argued that syphilis was a non-existent and un-recorded New World disease in

³⁰⁹ See *ibid.*; Oriel ; and Lobdell, 78.

³¹⁰ See Laura Engelstein, “Morality and the Wooden Spoon: Russian Doctors View Syphilis, Social Class and Sexual Behaviour, 1890-1905”, *Representations* 14 (Spring 1986) , 171; see also Başkan, 140.

³¹¹ For lay and church reactions and first lock hospitals see Arrizabaloga, 20-37, 38-55, 171-233 respectively.

Europe and other parts of the Old World prior to the return of the first crew of Columbus expedition.³¹² The sailors of Columbus, who had sexual encounters with the “sexually promiscuous” Native American women, brought the disease firstly to Europe, then infected their wives, other “common women” around Iberia and Italian cities.³¹³ The sixteenth to seventeenth century venereology literature, which in turn evolved into modern Columbian Exchange Theory, keenly argued that the contagion of syphilis was originated from women. Syphilis was deemed to be originated from the extremely toxic menstrual blood of the women of New World. Due to long exposure to hot climates, poisonous diets composed of venoms and spiders, and habitual consumption of tobacco were suggested as reasons for contaminated menstrual blood. Moreover, these women did not have monogamous sexual intercourses as custom but casual ones that semen of the numerous men blended in their wombs making their bodily fluids more poisonous.³¹⁴ In contrast to this “westwardly spread” theory, a more recent Pre-columbian theory of syphilis alternately maintained that syphilis existed long before Reconnaissance, and beginning from the paleolithic times, it appeared, i.e., firstly in Africa, Near East, and Europe. In other words, syphilis existed, however, it was quite often confused with leprosy, then, brought into the New World by Spanish expeditions that the spread was indeed eastwardly.³¹⁵ In support of this claim, Hoang –Ty, a Chinese intellectual of the late third century B.C has been referred that he had reported

³¹² Lobdell & Owsley, 76.

³¹³ This idea was claimed by a French court physician of eighteenth century, Jean Astruc, in his work titled *A Treatise of the Venereal Diseases*. Astruc was referred by Kevin P. Siena in “Pollution, Promiscuity and the Pox: English Venereology and the Early Modern Medical Discourse on Social and Sexual Danger”, *Journal of the History of Sexuality*, 8/ 4 (April 1998), 569.

³¹⁴ Astruc as cited in *ibid*.

³¹⁵ See Lobdell & Owsley, 76, 79; Frank B. Livingstone, “On the Origin of Syphilis: An Alternative Hypothesis”, *Current Anthropology*, 32/ 5 (December 1991) , 588.

chancere like sores, resembling the symptoms of syphilis. Attributed to blood infections, he was claimed to treat these skin problems with mercury.³¹⁶ There is a third theory, which synthesized the first and second one; with respect to this theory, *spirochete*, a specific bacteria, called *Treponema palladium* was the mutated form of two different kinds of bacteria, which had simultaneously existed in both hemispheres of the world. The increased social contact in late fifteenth century contributed the evolution of these two bacterias into venereal syphilis, which became epidemical beginning from the early sixteenth century onwards.³¹⁷ There were also allusions, other than bacterial mutation or illicit sexual intercourses provided by contemporaries for the first outbreak of syphilis. Some of the Renaissance and pre-Scientific Revolution physicians and critics believed that syphilis was a result of “fatal celestial re-alignments”, “corruption of the air”, “pestilence” or “lethal conjunction of stars”, and “divine cause”.³¹⁸ In sum, the origin of syphilis has remained a subject of extensive dispute over centuries up until today.

As suggested by the theories of origin, syphilis is claimed to be contracted from an outside source and outsiders, and this perpetuated its moralized conception. Beginning from the sixteenth century onwards, the contraction of syphilis was deemed purely sexual and it was equated with vice, i.e., illicit sex. The moral claims became deeper when considering the way it was named. The terms utilized for naming syphilis in the societies it became epidemical suggest how it was considered as an outside threat posited by alien elements, quite often by frontier rivals through a

³¹⁶ Lobdell & Owsley, 77

³¹⁷ See Sheldon Watts, *Epidemics and History: Disease, Power and Imperialism*, (New Haven: Connecticut: Yale University Press, 1998), 100-104; Brandt, 562-565.

³¹⁸ See Siena, 556; Arrizabalaga, 1-19.

set of misogynist, racist, anti-semitic ideas and national prejudice.³¹⁹ For example, English called it “French pox”, and the French as “Neopolitan or Italian disease”. On the other hand, Italians and Dutch named it as “Spanish disease”, while Portuguese as the “Castilian” one. Russian believed that it spreaded from Polish people, therefore it was called “Polish disease (*mal Polonais*)”, and Polish belived that it originated from Russia, and titled it as “Russian disease”. Japanese labeled it as “Portugese” and “Chinese” disease. Ottomans, similary, identified it with the French, and termed it as “*Frengi*”, however, the term French broadly meant “European”.³²⁰

As early as late fifteenth century, venereologist and physicians started to talk about congenital/hereditary and non-sexual forms of syphilis contraction, which could be imposed on one through a different onset than the adult promiscuity.³²¹ The infection was believed to be caused either by fathers, agents responsible for promiscuity after “common women” of illicit sexual notoriety, or wet-nurses that were utilized for infant care and breast-feeding.³²² Contraction through heredity and breastfeeding were claimed to be “innocent” and “unmerited” forms of infection as compared to the venereal one. However, the infected were deemed to be unmerited and innocent; not the infecting ones, and distaste and criticism among the

³¹⁹ McAllister, p.23-25.

³²⁰ See Arrizabaloga, 1-19; Başkan, 140; Quétel, 16.

³²¹ See Paul Diday, *A Treatise on Syphilis in New Born Children and Infants at the Breast*, Trans. By G.Whitey, (New York: 1859) , 5-8 that Renaissance and early modern physicians such as Gaspard Torella, Mathiolus, George Vella, Paracelsus, Montanus, Antonious Gallus, Theodosius were referred to talk of hereditray and non-sexually transmitted syphilis in infants and virgins.

³²² See Kertzer, 591; Başkan, 141; John Thorne Crissey & Lawrence Charles Parish, *The Dermatology and Syphilology of the Nineteenth Century*, (New York: Praeger 1981).

Renaissance and early modern thinkers towards wet-nursing with regard to this point is not surprising.³²³

Wet-nursing had been a common practice in Europe; it had been already a well organized task and a sort of trade in the Renaissance period.³²⁴ Up until the late eighteenth century, urban upper and middle class families habitually resorted to wet-nurses for feeding their infants. There was a couple of factors for such a widespread practice; such as breast-feeding's physical burden over women, husbands' objection to their wives' nursing and religious sanctions over sexual intercourse with the suckling mother.³²⁵ Working class women, on the other hand, started to utilize wet-nurses' help in the following century with regard to the commercial and industrial development by which they were drifted into urban areas for wage-work. The army of female manufacture and factory labourers, therefore, were forced to hire wet-nurses, who lactated these working class infants in their rural households.³²⁶ The Enlightenment period was the time that praising over mother's milk as opposed to the wet-nurse's triumphed; the conduct literature and medical writings of the period

³²³ See Carolyn A. Nadeanu, "Blood Mother / Milk Mother: Breastfeeding, the Family and the State in Antonio De Guevara's *Relox De Principes* (Dial of Princes)", *Hispanic Review* 69/2 (Spring 2001): 160-161 for the ideas and idealizations of Antonio de Guevara (1481-1545), Bishop of Granada, later Galicia, and a close official and chronicler of Charles I (Charles V of the Holy Roman Empire) about breast-feeding mother and its significance for the well being of the children. For English and Anglo-Saxon case, and transformations after Reformation parallel to the development of prutinasim, see Ruth H. Bloch, "American Feminine Ideals in Transition: The Rise of the Moral Mother, 1785-1815", *Feminist Studies* 4/ 2 (June 1978) :104-108 for these accounts.

³²³ Marylyn Salmon, "The Cultural Significance of Breastfeeding and Infant Care in Early Modern England and America", *Journal of Social History*, 28/2 (Winter 1994). 260.

³²⁴ See Valerie Fildes, *Wet-Nursing: A History from Antiquity to the Present*, (Oxford: Basic Blackwell, 1988), 49-79 for foundling hospitals and state-supported wet-nursing system in Europe until the eighteenth century.

³²⁵ Salmon, 260; Fildes, 1988, 10-102, 106.

³²⁶ James R. Lehnig, "Family Life and Wet-Nursing in a French Village", *Journal of Interdisciplinary History*, 12/ 4 (Spring 1982) , pp.645-646. Also see Deborah Simonton, *A History of European Women's Work, 1700 to Present*, (London: Routledge, 1998) and Ruth H. Bloch, 104 for these accounts.

urged mothers to breastfeed their infants instead of hiring wet-nurses. Wet-nurses were portrayed as harmful personalities creating risks for the infants' physical and spiritual well being.³²⁷ Enlightenment's idealization of breastfeeding mother, however, was not something totally new. The post-reformation medical writings and advice literature in European societies encouraged women to nurse their own children since it was a "religious duty", "the best solution" for the children's health and for the "building of maternal love".³²⁸ In other words, wet-nurses had been ill-reputed by being "careless", "prone to make mistakes" and simultaneous threat of an epidemical disease, i.e., syphilis, dangerous. In short, wet-nurses and their nurselings became crucial for the syphilis literature; first for their potential to put their families at risk; a healthy child could be infected by a syphilitic wet-nurse, or vice versa that syphilis could easily spread inside the families and among different classes. Secondly, another category of syphilitics appeared that syphilis did not necessarily expand through sexual intercourse. It could also be an unmerited infection; however, still perilous that it could spread sneakingly and unexpectedly. Thirdly, such possibility of contraction perpetuated the shifts which were already on their onset about the conception of motherhood, domesticity and child rearing that mothering became a real duty and work for women to serve state, society and family. Finally, the problems about the feeding of children who could not be breast-fed by

³²⁷ Wet nursing was a task performed by rural and lower-class women in return for income. Some of them resorted to nurse upper class children in order to support their own children either in the absence or desertion of their husbands, or simply due to poverty. The class issue was quite crucial here that peasant and lower class women were regarded as ignorant, ill informed about real and effective child care. See Salmon, p.260 ; for poverty-stricken wet-nurses see Kentzer, 590-591; Lehning, 646- 656.

³²⁸ See Susanna Hedenborg, "To Breastfeed Another Woman's Child: Wet-Nursing in Stockholm, 1777-1937, *Continuity and Change* 16/3 (2001): 401 and Valerie Fildes, *Breasts, Bottles and Babies: A History of Infant Feeding*, (Edinburg: Edinburg University Press, 1986), 98-133 for these accounts. See also Siena, 555-562 that he talks about how early modern writers such as Ambrose Pare (1510-1590), a French surgeon, William Clowes (1582-1648), an Elizabethan healer and surgeon , and John Marten (1692-1737) for how wet nurses were held responsible of the spread of syphilis in the early modern period.

their own mothers nevertheless required nursing. Due to the undeniable presence of the infants of unhealthy women, orphans and deserted kids, there occurred the compulsory medical examination of wet-nurses.³²⁹

Whether unmerited or deserved, syphilis caused great anxiety among physicians that they started to warn families about syphilis –generating breastfeeding processes, and this issue became an integral part of infant feeding literature and conduct books for families beginning from the late sixteenth century onwards. In the same period, it also became firm that infection could be a two way one; a syphilitic child could also infect his/her wet-nurse.³³⁰ Up until the twentieth century, congenital syphilis was believed to be caused by the father, through his semen, at the very moment of conception. This theory of transmission, which argued infection through father's semen and suckling was also incorporated another dimension that women could infect their children during pregnancy and delivery. Yet, all of these theories were discredited in the twentieth century parallel to the developments in bacteriology and new achievements in the syphilis diagnosis.³³¹

In the nineteenth century, venereologists had achieved more systematic knowledge on syphilis; they finally differentiated it from gonorrhoea³³², another venereal disease, and they also had progress in identifying the courses of the illness.

³²⁹ See Hedenborg , 401-402 about how foundling hospitals and medical control of wetnurses in Sweden in the eighteenth to nineteenth century and in Paris in the nineteenth century was performed, and see Kertzen for the Italian case. for the application of Wassermann blood test to determine whether prospective wet-nurses, pregnant women and babies in need of breast-feeding in foundlings were syphilitics or not, see Fildes, 1988, 240.

³³⁰ Cataneous's remark in 1505 and Musa Brassavole's point dated 1553 cited by Kertzer, p.591. See also Diday, pp.1-10 for the remarks of Gaspard Vella in 1498, Cataneous in 1505 and Brassavole's 1553 for syphilis and wetnursing. See pages 40-49 for Diday's own case studies about the infection by wetnursing and suckling.

³³¹ Kertzer, 591; Quétel, 131, 165.

³³² In 1837, a famous French venereologist Philip Ricord (1799-1889) discovered the difference and specificity of these two diseases. See Başkan, 141; Brandt, 567 for details.

By the mid-nineteenth century, syphilis was differentiated as primary, secondary and tertiary ones, and the first connections of syphilis and miscarriages in pregnant women, or stillbirth and physically damaged, crippled infants were drawn.³³³ With regard to this differentiation, during its primary and secondary phases, syphilis was communicable through sexual intercourse, by getting in touch with the chancres and open sores around the body. However, in tertiary stage, it was believed to be not infectious to others but detrimental to the infected: the spirochetes could settle in different parts of the body, i.e., nerves, bones, skin, arteries, and hearth through blood circulation. The patient could loss his/her vision, and deafness, deterioration in bones, lesions in blood circulation system, neurosyphilis, loss of hair and nose as well as pathologies such as swollen lymph nodes, rashes, upsurge of tubercules, general paralysis could occur as claimed by Rudolph Virchow (1821-1902).³³⁴ The late nineteenth century venereology claimed that infection could also be possible through more “innocent ways”; by inanimate objects, i.e., cutlery, glasses, home utensils, which has been proven to be extremely rare by the modern dermatology and venereology. Conversely, this argument became a legitimate excuse for higher class syphilitics, especially for women of upper classes in the late nineteenth century.³³⁵ By the 1900s, it was found out that syphilis could also be transmitted through

³³³ Başkan, 141, see also Jill Harshin, “Syphilis, Wives, and Physicians: Medical Ethics and the Family in Late Nineteenth Century France”, *French Historical Studies* 16/1 (Spring 1989) , 75, and see 78 for the impact of syphilis on pregnant women and infants.

³³⁴ Harshin, 75-76; Brandt, 567.

³³⁵ As Harshin reported, syphilis has been perceived as an illness mainly contracted through sexuality and especially illegitimate forms of sexuality, upper and upper middle class women had difficulties to conceal and confess their infection-even if they were infected by their husbands, it was not easy for them to acknowledge the unfaitfulness and sexual adventures of their husbands, or their own sexual activity at home. Therefore, they utilized this recent theory of contraction by inaimate objects , and blamed their domestic servants who brought pox to them through cutlery, home utensils, etc. See Harshin, 90 for details.

placenta.³³⁶ In 1905, German researchers Fritz Schaudinn (1871-1906) and Eric Hoffman (1868-1959) identified the micro-organism causing syphilis; and this treponemal organism was called *Treponema pallidum*.³³⁷ A year after, August Paul Von Wasserman (1866-1925), a German bacteriologist, developed a blood test to detect syphilis.³³⁸

Mercury had been the oldest known cure for syphilis, and it remained the primary medicine to treat syphilis together with iodide potassium until 1909, however being an extremely lethal drug. Mercury was taken orally as pills, or as injections, and dispensed in ointment form to be put on to the skin and sores as well as vaporized.³³⁹ It had been used for the first time in 1496 by Giorgio Sommariva of Verona, and reached its notoriety by Jacopo Berangario da Carpi of Italy.³⁴⁰ However, the influence of mercury for the treatment of syphilitics was limited. It helped to reduce recurrent attacks, and improve the symptoms, but did not utterly heal the illness. Moreover, it caused undesirable side effects, i.e., increase in salivation, gastroenteritis, rashes, liver and kidney disorders and discoloration and loss of teeth, gangrenes in the cheeks and gums.³⁴¹ these side effects, in turn, made the illness more visible, therefore inflicting more stigmatization to the patient.³⁴² Due to shortcomings of the mercury treatment, Paul Ehrlich (1854-1915), a Nobel prized German immunologist, improved *salvarsan* method (arsphenamine, also known as

³³⁶ Başkan, 141; Brandt, 567.

³³⁷ Brandt, 572-573.

³³⁸ Harshin, 76.

³³⁹ Brandt, 565; Başkan, 141; Quézel, 4, 28-29, 30-32, 53, 59-63, 83-86, 106, 116-117, 119-120, 128.

³⁴⁰ Başkan, 141.

³⁴¹ Ibid. ;Harshin, 76-77.

³⁴² Brandt, 565-566.

606th arsenical)) in 1909, and salvarsan remained the effective remedy for syphilis with its modified forms until the discovery of penicillin in 1943. By penicillin, syphilis was more effectively and easily cured.³⁴³

The nineteenth century was the period of serious syphilis epidemics. According to Watts, syphilis epidemics in the nineteenth century were predominantly caused by the moral atmosphere of the same century. He argued that nineteenth century religious and moral sanctions, which became popular in the medium of moral writings and popular culture, clearly demonized masturbation. This, in turn, increased brothel visits that syphilis became one of the most painstaking problems of European societies.³⁴⁴ Under such a new upsurge, it was not surprising that important achievements on new effective treatments were accomplished between late nineteenth to early twentieth century.³⁴⁵ Consequently, antibiotics were used for the serious upsurge of the disease in epidemical forms in Europe and North America in the interwar and post-Second World War period.³⁴⁶

Although it is clearly caused by a microorganism, syphilis had been subject to specific social attitudes and beliefs; the definition of the victim, the course of infection and medical treatment have never been value-free processes. In addition to this, unlike many of other contagious diseases, as a venereal illness it concerned not only public health authorities and medical professionals, but multiple agencies such as social reformers, military authorities, families and other public institutions. The nineteenth century brought in new insights about illness and social order that a

³⁴³ Ibid., 572-573; Başkan, 142; Quétel, , 142-143.

³⁴⁴ Watts, 104.

³⁴⁵ See Quétel, 131-143 for late nineteenth to early twentieth century developments.

³⁴⁶ Ibid., 176-210.

medical issue transformed into a social and private malady. As a public and personal matter, syphilis became a medium by which state intervened into private lives. The public health policies constituted for preventing syphilis also produced new claims over marriage, sexuality and chastity.³⁴⁷ Beginning from the mid-nineteenth century onwards, venereal disease in general and syphilis in particular transformed into metaphors for corrupt sexuality, pollution and uncleanness, sterility and unproductiveness. In short, syphilis was equated with sexual-moral and social disorder. In turn, these claims targeted the infected ones and the ones who had potential to expand the infection. They were deemed agencies who willfully contravened the moral code through a sexual irresponsibility and unsanitary life course scheme. Moreover, the infected and sickly experienced a double jeopardy; in addition to the physiological consequences of the disease, they also experienced psycho-social stigmatization.³⁴⁸ It can also be suggested with regard to the public health policies and popular culture of the era that venereal contagion was creatively instrumentalized to form repressive means of control by the individual states over their populations. Clearly driven by the concerns regarding progeny, decline and outfit of their subject peoples, the control-repression-discipline dimension of the modern states was perpetuated in this process.³⁴⁹

³⁴⁷ See Allan M. Brandt, *No Magic Bullet: A Social History of Venereal Disease in the United States Since 1880*, (New York: Oxford University Press,1985) ,3-5.

³⁴⁸ Ibid.

³⁴⁹ See Quétel, 143-159, 211-247 for how preventive and propagandistic dimensions of anti-syphilis policies were built mainly in France, and Europe during the nineteenth and early twentieth century. He basically talks about organization of international conferences for the prevention of syphilis world wide in 1899 and 1902, committees, i.e., Société de Prophylaxie Sanitaire et Morale (1902), setting up of medical journals solely devoted to the study of syphilis, i.e., *La syphilis* (1903), emergence of novels and plays revolving around syphilis, i.e., Maupassant's *Le lit 29*, Barbey d'Aurevilly's *La vengeance d'une femme*, Balzac's *Béatrix* (1839) and *La cousine Bette* (1846), *Les Averiés* by Eugène Brieux in 1901, and *Vénus* (1901) and *Les demi-fous* (1905) by Michael Corday, flourishing of pamphlets and medical genre for married couples in France, and control and compulsory medical control of prostitutes in Europe. See also Engelstein, pp.189-199 for how regulation and institutional control over syphilis was built in Imperial Russia. For the British case of mid-nineteenth century see

3.5.2. Syphilis in the Ottoman Empire (1850s-1910s)

The references for the first syphilis cases and its spread in Ottoman society are also obscure and value-laden. It has been assumed that syphilis was brought into Ottoman territories in the sixteenth century by syphilitic Jewish women who took refuge in Ottomandom due their expulsion from Counter-reformation Spain.³⁵⁰ It was also argued that these women were prostitutes, i.e., morally corrupt outsiders and others that contaminated the people of a society where prostitution was forbidden, and contact with Europe, the cradle of syphilis, was very limited.³⁵¹ Medical literature regarding history of syphilis in the Ottoman Empire prior to the nineteenth century needs to be reviewed and revised carefully for couple of respects. First, for the moralistic claims, which perceived the spread of disease purely as an outside impact. Secondly, due to recent theoretical claims on the global spread of disease that the bacteria causing syphilis had been co-existent in both hemispheres of the world beginning from the antiquity, and syphilis was mistaken as leprosy in the old world.³⁵²

Susan Kingsley Kent, *Sex and Suffrage in Britain, 1860-1914*, (Princeton, London: Princeton University Press, 1987), 60-79, 80-114; Judith R. Walkowitz, *Prostitution and Victorian Society: Women, Class and the State*, (New York: Cambridge University Press, 1980), 48-68, 69-89 for syphilis in Victorian England and how Contagious Diseases of 1860 were introduced to control its spread by the medium of regulated prostitution, for their application in the British colonies see Philippa Levine, *Prostitution, Race and Politics: Policing Venereal Disease in the British Empire*, (New York: Routledge, 2003) , 91-121, 178-198.

³⁵⁰ See Başkan, 142; İnci Hot, “Ülkemizde Frengi Hastalığı İle Mücadele” , *Türkiye Klinik Tıp Etiği Hukuku Tarihi* 12 (2006) , 36.

³⁵¹ See Başkan, 142. Also see S. Basa, “Sifiliz’in Tarihçesi” , *Haseki Tıp Bülteni*, 15/2 (1977) , 93-95.

³⁵² Recent archeological research conducted in Anatolia reports syphilis epidemics in ancient times. Başkan talks about Alaim-i Cerrahin, a late fifteenth century treatise on an epidemic illness closely resembling syphilis. This treatise is among the collections of Millet Kütüphanesi, and it was written to

In the early phases of the nineteenth century syphilis was regarded as a contagion which spread into the Ottoman dominions from outside. For example it is widely accepted that Ottoman-Russo Wars of 1806-1812 and 1828-1829 caused the first formidable outbreaks of syphilis in the regions where military aggression was the case.³⁵³ By the 1850s, syphilis became an important public health concern; it became epidemical, and Muslim refugees drifted from Russian Empire during and after Crimean War of 1853-1856³⁵⁴ were held responsible for syphilis epidemics in the Ottoman capital and countryside.³⁵⁵ Similarly, Ottoman-Russian War of 1877-1878³⁵⁶ was also suggested be a reason for epidemical syphilis in the Ottoman society.³⁵⁷ Reminding the European attributes to syphilis, the upsurge of the illness as an epidemic among Ottoman peoples was believed to be the result of illegitimate

instruct the Ottoman physicians of late fifteenth century about the stages and treatment of this illness. Similarly, an early fifteenth century physician from Ankara, Şaban Niyadi, wrote a didactic poem regarding treatment of syphilis titled “Mualece-i Zahmet-i Frenk”. Hayatizâde Mustafa Feyzi (1641-1693), a court physician of Mehmet IV, talked about syphilis in his book titled “Hayatizâde’nin Beşibiryerdesi”. Abbas Vesim (d.1760), in his book titled “Düstur-u Vesim fî Tıb’ül Cedid ve’l Kadim (1748), called syphilis as “French Misery”. These works should be reviewed in order to portray the early historical and social attributes about syphilis in the Ottoman world.

³⁵³ See Hot, 36; Nuran Yıldırım, “Tanzimat’tan Cumhuriyet’e Koruyucu Sağlık Uygulamaları”, *Tanzimattan Cumhuriyete Türkiye Ansiklopedisi*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1985), 5:1328-30.

³⁵⁴ For Crimean War of 1853-1856, see Trevor Royle, *Crimea: The Great Crimean War, 1854-1856*, (London:Abacus, 2000) ; Robert B. Edgerton, *Death or Glory: The Legacy of the Crimean War*, (Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press, 1999) ; Eric J. Zürcher, *Turkey: A Modern History*, (London, New York: I.B. Tauris, 2005), 53-54, 63-64, for Muslim refugees after Crimean conflict, see 80-81; Abdullah Sağlam, *Kırım ve Kafkas Göçleri, 1856-1876*, (Ankara: TTK, 1997).

³⁵⁵ See Nuran Yıldırım, “Salgınlar”, *Dünden Bugüne İstanbul Ansiklopedisi*, 8 vols. , (Ankara, İstanbul; Kültür Bakanlığı; Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 1993-1995) , 3: 425; İbrahim Halil Kalkan, *Medicine and Politics in the Late Ottoman Empire (1876-1909)*, Unpublished Masters Thesis, Boğaziçi University, İstanbul, 2004, 62; Başkan, 142.

³⁵⁶ See Zürcher, 74-75; Bernard Lewis, *The Emergence of Modern Turkey*, Third Edition, (New York: Oxford University Press, 2002),165-169; also see Ezel Kural Shaw & Stanford Shaw, *History of the Ottoman Empire and Modern Turkey: Volume II Reform, Revolution and Republic-the Rise of Modern Turkey, 1808-1975*, (New York: Cambridge University Press, 2002) for Ottoman-Russo War of 1877-1878.

³⁵⁷ Hot, 36.

forms of sexuality; for example, prostitution and homosexuality³⁵⁸ were counted as the *raison d'être* of the illness that the former became the main site to be disciplined in the medium of anti-syphilis regulation and discourse.³⁵⁹ During the Hamidian era, however, these allusions became diversified. Since syphilitics were not deemed eligible for military service and thus not conscripted, Ottoman males who had military liability were accounted for deliberately infecting themselves. In the age of long and continual wars and compulsory and elongated military service, syphilis, for some contemporaries, appeared as a popular response for one to spare himself from the pains of military duty.³⁶⁰

The Crimean War and its aftermath were deemed significant both for Ottoman state's responsiveness towards epidemical syphilis and medical precautions to prevent its spread. In the frame work of medical and historical studies on the mid-nineteenth century public health reforms, cosmopolitanization of the city of Istanbul and related increase of prostitution in the major port cities were attributed for the upsurge of syphilis. With respect to this framework, Istanbul, the capital city, and other important port cities, such as Kastamonu and İzmir, their hinterland in Western and Northern Anatolia were the basic sites of syphilis outbreaks. The most important actors who were believed to contribute to the spread of disease among masses, were foreign prostitutes, concubines and domestic servants, seasonal and international Muslim migrant workers, who sought their fortunes either in cosmopolitan areas in

³⁵⁸ See Bedi N. Şehsuvaroğlu's "Memleketimizde Frengi Tarihçesi", an article published in *Yeni Asya* on 2 March 1971, 2 as cited by Kalkan, 62.

³⁵⁹ Ibid.

³⁶⁰ See Kalkan, 63 that he cited Mazhar Osman's point regarding deliberate infection of syphilis in *Sıhhat Almanakı*, İstanbul, Kader Matbaası, 1933, 40.

the Ottoman territories and or in the Russian Empire.³⁶¹ These allusions again argued for exterior sources of syphilis infection: it was either foreign prostitutes who could not be controlled due to the stipulations of *Islahat Fermani* of 1856 (Imperial Rescript of Reform February 18, 1856) which endowed “great” trade privileges and diplomatic immunity to non-Muslim foreigners and non-Muslim subjects in the empire in the post-Crimean War era. According to this conception, during the Crimean War, the first “official” brothels were opened to fight with the ills of clandestine prostitution. Consequent to this, in the liberal environment *Islahat Fermani* provided, non-muslim foreign residents either invested in prostitution business or prostituted themselves in Ottoman territories, therefore they increased both prostitution activity and venereal contagion.³⁶² It is quite interesting that *Islahat Fermani*, the second official declaration of equity for Ottoman subjects, was deemed interrelated with the increase of “illegitimacies”, which were thought to be the source for syphilis. It is quite often referred that some of the non-Muslim foreigners felt free to open brothels following the proclamation of the rescript, and government had nothing but condoned the presence of brothels within the context of capitulations and the principles laid by the rescript’s emphasis on *teşebbüs-i şahsi* (private enterprise). Moreover, it was suggested that as a result of the very foundations of the

³⁶¹ For allusions about foreign prostitutes and the increase of their numbers in Ottoman cities, see Hot, 36; for Black Sea workers, i.e bakers, in Russian port cities and migrant workers from cities such as Bolu and Kastamonu see Başkan, 142.

³⁶² See Alpay Kabacalı, *İstanbul: From the Past to the Present*, (İstanbul: Creative Publishing Ltd, 2003), 161-163 that he talks about the rise of cosmopolitanism of İstanbul during the Crimean War. The ally powers, French and British troops and fleets, were placed in the city beginning from the 2nd of November 1853, and their life style and visibility changed the city in turn; consumption and entertainment along European lines became popular, and this also caused the enrichment of certain classes and changes of customs. Beyoğlu(Pera) became the basic site of new life style and European military personel. It is widely accepted by Ottoman historians and contemporaries that brothels became officially established vis-à-vis clandestine prostitution during the Crimean War. See Zafer Toprak, “Fuhuş”, *Dünden Bugüne İstanbul Ansiklopedisi*, 3: 342-345; for contemporary accounts about the change of life style, entertainment and consumption patterns during the Crimean War, see Ahmed Cevdet Paşa, *Maruzat*, (İstanbul: Çağrı Yayınları, 1980), 9.

reform edict, Ottoman state could not regulate and control these brothels. By referring to the individual freedom conferred by reform edict, it was argued that non-Muslim foreigners and residents protested medical inspections, and resisted against any permanent means of regulation.³⁶³ These claims should be carefully tested for couple of respects. For instance the claims about Crimean War and its social impacts as factors increasing and initiating prostitution activity in Ottoman society along with epidemical syphilis are hardly proven.

First of all, prostitution had been long existed in the Ottoman society, and brothels were the integral parts of at least prominent port cities, especially of the capital city, İstanbul.³⁶⁴ In other words, Ottomans neither fully legalized nor totally

³⁶³ See Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 6: 3296; Toprak, 1994, 343; Kalkan, 63.

³⁶⁴ See Giovanni Scognamillo, *Beyoğlu'nda Fuhuş*, (İstanbul: Altın Kitaplar Yayınevi, 1994) ,12-13, 16, 33 for the unavoidable and integral position of brothels and prostitution activity from Byzantian past to the Ottoman times. According to Scognamillo, city districts and quarters such as Galata, Beyoğlu and Pera were the centers of entertainment which also included brothels. Scognamillo also argued that these brothels were founded by non-Muslim minority groups, mainly by Greeks and Armenians, however they employed Muslims as well as non-Muslim women beginning from the sixteenth century onwards. Refik Ahmet Sevengil also talks about the presence of Muslim women in this trade, and İstanbul had famous Muslim prostitutes as many as non-Muslims. He reports that Galata, Tophane and Eyüp as the regions prostitution performed up until the nineteenth century in his work titled *İstanbul Nasıl Eğleniyordu: 1453'ten 1927'ye*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1990) , 20–30. Beginning from the late sixteenth century onwards, Otoman state tried to take precautions to prevent prostitution Although post-Crimean era is referred as the period that brothels became officially established, clandestine and unregulated brothels were common in the major Otoman cities; there were certain trades which were set up as covers for prostitution, such as creameries and washhouses. Creameries and washhouses were susceptible of being overlooked by the authorities, and prostitutes met their customers or arranged their business at such stores. See *ibid.*, 23-24. Another practice as one of the major source of prostitution in Otoman society was the slave trade that slave dealers provided young slave girls to single men so that they could keep these women for a while for sexual services, then return them to the dealers. In September 1583, a group of slave dealers and auctioneers complained to the local court about aforesaid practice that it destroys the principles of their trade, and consequently caused the disqualification of women dealers and other auctioneers who did not have any surety regarding slave trade and stained the transactions in Bedestan. For details of this issue see Y. Hakan Erdem, 32. Although prostitution was deemed to be prohibited under the premises of Islamic Law in Ottomandom, we learn from Evliya Çelebi that male prostitutes and their procurers were represented in the guild system. Evliya Çelebi reported that “hız oğlanları /hızan” (homosexual boys performing prostitution) were recorded into specific registers, “defter-i hızan”, in the guild system and they were taxed. These young professional male prostitutes were represented by 300 pimps, and together with these “scoundrels”, they even participated to one of the military parades of Murat IV(1623-1640) along with other artisans. For details of this account see Evliya Çelebi, *Evliya Çelebi Seyahatnamesi*, Prep.by Seyit Ali Kahraman & Yücel Dağlı, (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1996) , Vol.1. Female prostitutes had been put under arrest and exiled in the same period, however, prostitution became common again the reign of İbrahim I (1640-1648). In the late eighteenth century, around 1780s, Taksim –Ayazpaşa became the centre of prostitution according to Giacomo

banned this practice. Secondly, it can also be claimed depending upon the archival sources that there were two competing discourses regarding prostitution in Ottoman society. A memorandum, dated 20 September 1841, which was addressed from the Ministry of Police to the Director of the Imperial Gunnery (*Tophane-i Amire Reisi*), exemplifies this dual and contradictory discourses that authorities condoned the presence of street walkers due to their poverty while they were critical about the visibility of these women. 30-35 prostitutes, according to the document, were forcibly and temporarily resided in a religious functionary's home in Tophane.³⁶⁵ As reported by the document, it was a requirement to “banish them from going outside and moving around for eliminating their wickedness for the duration of the holy months of *Receb*, *Şaban* and *Ramazan*.”³⁶⁶ However, document also pointed out that these were impoverished women who would be exempted from their trade for this

Casanova de Seingalt, who visited Otoman İstanbul in 1745 as cited by Scognamillo, p.21. During the Ottoman-Austrian and Russo War, which broke out in 1787, İstanbul became the centre from which military conscripts were sent to the fronts, and such an excess male population triggered prostitution activity. In addition to the recruits and medrese students, İstanbul, as the capital city, hosted people who sought for their livelihood and people who tried to pursue their business and legal transactions that they filled the guest houses and cheap rooms. Such males were believed to indulge in prostitutes while they were served for their needs of accomodation, food and entertainment. In 1790s, gangs of prostitution and robbery were formed that the imperial administration had to take harsh precautions to eliminate such mobilizations from provinces. Therefore, Selim III (1789-1807) issued decrees to prohibit prostitution and other forms of illegitimacies which were believed to cause the failure of Otoman armies. Among the measures to curb prostitution, imprisonment, exile, and execution of well-known prostitutes can be counted. Among the prostitutes of İstanbul, Muslims were the majority and prostitution was practiced not only in European quarters of the city, but also around Anatolian regions such as Üsküdar. For the details of these accounts see Osman Köse, “XVIII. Yüzyıl Sonları Osmanlı Rus ve Avusturya Savaşları Esnasında Osmanlı Devleti’nde Bir Uygulama: İstanbul’da İçki ve Fuhuş Yasağı”, *Turkish Studies* 2/1 (Winter 2007): 105-116; see also Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 2: 869-870 for Selim III’s disciplinary measures. For informal social control exerted by neighbors and quarter administration over Muslim prostitutes and clandestine prostitution, see Abdülmecit Mutfak, “Osmanlı’da Zina ve Fuhuş Olaylarına Karşı Toplumsal Bir Tepki: Kapiya Katran Sürmek ve Boynuz Asmak”, *Osmanlı’dan Cumhuriyet’e Balıkesir*, (İstanbul: 2007), 93-104. For the participation of Muslims into prostitution activity and legal measures regarding policing of prostitution see Nuran Yıldırım, “19. Yüzyıl Sonu ve 20. Yüzyıl Başında İstanbul’da Fuhuşla İlgili Bazı Belgeler”, *Tarih ve Toplum* 35/208 (Nisan 2001): 4; Orhan Türker, *Galata’dan Karaköy’e Bir Liman Hikayesi*, (İstanbul: Sel Yayınları, c2000), 89; Özen Tok, “Kadı Sicilleri Işığında Osmanlı Şehrindeki Mahalleden İhraç Kararlarında Mahalle Ahalisinin Rolü (XVII. Ve XVII. Yüzyıllarda Kayseri Örneği)”, *Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 18/1 (2005), 162-169.

³⁶⁵ BOA- C.ZB. 2557 (3 Şaban 1257/ 20 September 1841).

³⁶⁶ As excerpted from ibid.

duration; therefore “they must be supported for their survival.”³⁶⁷ The memorandum ordered the Director of the Imperial Gunnery to provide daily ration for these women since they would not be able to go out and make their living for the said period.³⁶⁸

Thirdly, mass migrations into Anatolia, military mobilizations and non-Muslim prostitutes with regard to their relationship with syphilis-infected areas were held responsible for syphilis. In other words, foreign and non-Muslim prostitutes, and Russian Empire and its provincial population were thought to be the source of syphilis in Ottoman society. For the reasons behind syphilis upsurge, these were not value-free claims. The blaming of the foreign and non-Muslim prostitutes was based on the idea that syphilis contagion was not an original problem, but an outside one since Muslim women were not practicing prostitution. The Jewish, French, Spanish, Italian and Greek women settlers from European polities in Ottoman cities such as Thessaloniki, Edirne, İzmir, İskenderun and Beirut were practicing prostitution; therefore they were susceptible outside sources of syphilis.³⁶⁹ However, the aforesaid “foreign” Greek and Jewish women were the former Ottoman subjects who gained European protection and citizenship in the post-1856 period. Similarly, Circassian, and Crimean Tartar émigrés from Russia in the post-Crimean and Ottoman Russo Wars again held responsible for the increase of syphilis infection in the Ottoman territories, and this claim based on the idea that Russian countryside was the basic source of syphilis.³⁷⁰ Unless comprehensive and comparative historical studies

³⁶⁷ As excerpted from *ibid.*

³⁶⁸ *Ibid.*

³⁶⁹ See Ramazan Çalık & Muzaffer Tepekaya, “Birinci Dünya Savaşı Esnasında Anadolu’daki Salgın Hastalıklar ve Ermeniler”, *Selçuk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 16 (2006), 212.

³⁷⁰ According to Engelstein, Russian Empire was represented as the basic source of the nineteenth century syphilis epidemics both by the Russian medical authorities and European counterparts in the Syphilis Congress of Brussels in 1899, which aimed to launch the struggle against syphilis on an international scale. As a reason for the prevalence of syphilis, the high rate of rural to urban migration,

conducted about the epidemics both in neighbouring and rival countries in the nineteenth century which would endow the the real map of epidemical expansion, these claims will remain difficult to prove. Besides, for the Ottoman case, there are indications that syphilis was epidemical prior to the post-Crimean War period. A memorandum dated 8 April 1851 indicated that syphilis was epidemical in the Ottoman territories prior to the Crimean War. This memorandum reported that majority of Muslim population in a small town called Iyorona in Hezergrad [Razgrad], a northeastern province in present day Bulgaria, were infected with syphilis.³⁷¹ The document also pointed out that “syphilis was an epidemical one, and if not prevented, it would spread among other people in the province.” The local administration, therefore, requested the appointment of a physician on temporary basis to the region.³⁷² A French physician called Dr. Dominique, whose competence and diploma approved by the Imperial Medical School, was assigned to this short-term post with a monthly income of 1200 guruş.³⁷³ The employment of foreign subjects, mainly expert dermatologists, would be frequent in the following decades as it will be discussed in the following sections.

Syphilis became a real public health problem during 1870s that Ottoman administration made first remarkable attempts to prevent the disease. Between late 1860s and 1870s, there were two social groups susceptible for the spread of syphilis infection; one of them was the prostitutes, and the other was the migrant domestic servants, such as cooks and butlers employed in wealthy households. These two

increase of prostitution in Russian cities which were on the verge of industrialization and local customs and traditions in Russian countryside which did not make room for modern hygiene were suggested. For details of this account see Engelstein’s footnote number 6.

³⁷¹ BOA *C.SH. 1324* (6 Cemaziyyü’l ahir 1267 /8 April 1851).

³⁷² As excerpted from *ibid.*

³⁷³ *Ibid.*

groups were thought to be interrelated; domestic migrant workers were single males frequenting brothels and prostitutes, who were not subject to any medical control.³⁷⁴ İstanbul, at this resort, was thought as one of the major centers for syphilis infection, and male cooks and other domestic servants from northern Anatolia believed to infect their families on their return to their homes. The spread of illness into whole Black Sea coast, mainly to Bolu and Kastamonu provinces were explained by this way. Another group deemed responsible for the spread of disease to various parts of the empire was the sailors from Anatolian coastal areas who also visited brothels of the capital city and carried the contagion two-wardly.³⁷⁵

In the year 1869, a public health committee was established in the Sixth Division of Municipality of İstanbul, and physician Serviçen Efendi³⁷⁶(1815-1897) was appointed to take charge of the activities of this committee. He prepared a report, which was discussed in the Association of Civil Medicine, to determine the scope and means of controlling prostitution to combat syphilis.³⁷⁷ In 1878, Dr. Mişel [Michael] applied to the Sixth Division of the Municipality of İstanbul to establish medical control over women working in the brothels. Then together with Dr. Colonel Agop Handanyan³⁷⁸ (1834-1899), he prepared a report that became the first

³⁷⁴ Kabacalı, 164.

³⁷⁵ See Mehmed Börekçi, “Osmanlı Basınından Yakın Devir Tıp Tarihimizi İlgilendiren Bir Yazı,” *Yeni Tıp Tarihi Araştırmaları* 4 (1998): 255.

³⁷⁶ His real name was Serofve Viçenyan. He studied medicine in Paris, and taught medical jurisprudence and law in Imperial Medical School and School of Civil Medicine. He worked as the chief physician of the Bâb-ı Seraskeri Hospital in 1860s. He was one of the executive members of Cemiyet-i Tıbbiye-i Şahane between 1868-1881. He worked for the organization of *Kızılay* (The Red Crescent) between 1876-1877, and contributed to the publishing of *Tıbbiye Gazetesi*. He published articles on child discipline and medical subjects both in Otoman and French scientific journals.

³⁷⁷ R. Ögütman, “Türkiye’de Zührevi Hastalıklarla Savaş”, *Türkiye’de Atatürk Döneminde Bulaıcı Hastalıklarla Savaş Toplantısı*, (İstanbul: İ.Ü. Cerrahpaşa Tıp Fakültesi Yayınları, without date) , 36-38.

³⁷⁸ Agop Handanyan taught forensics medicine both in the Imperial Medical School and School of Civil Medicine in 1870s and 1890s. He was one of the members of the Association of Civil Medicine.

systematic measure for syphilis. This report underlined the need for government intervention into the realm of prostitution; since syphilis put public health in jeopardy and it was contracted from prostitutes, it had to be controlled. Especially brothels located in Galata and Beyoğlu districts, the ones embraced in the Sixth Division's responsibility, reported to be put under medical scrutiny. This report was actually a petition which emphasized the role of a state to maintain public health conditions for its subjects against a disease that had undeniable and grave impacts on people.³⁷⁹ Consequent to the correspondences and debates between the Association of Civil Medicine and the Sixth Division, a regulation, which included periodic medical inspection of brothels and prostitutes was prepared, and submitted to the Council of State.³⁸⁰ After receiving the sultan's instructions and approval on 5 February 1880, it was apprised to the municipality, and the Regulation of Venereal Diseases [*Emraz-ı Zühreviyye Nizamnâmesi*] was put in effect.³⁸¹ The first medical inspections started shortly after this date, and they were conducted two times a week. If found infected, prostitutes were sent to the hospital. With respect to the principles of regulation, two physicians were to be appointed to handle these medical examinations. These measures were applied for four years, and this regulation was amended in 1884. With respect to these amendments, all brothels within the boundaries of the Sixth Municipal District classified into five distinct administrative areas each of which was appointed physicians to apply medical controls.³⁸² However, legitimacy of the compulsory medical control over brothels and prostitutes was

³⁷⁹ Kabacalı, 164; Kalkan, 63.

³⁸⁰ Hot, 37.

³⁸¹ Ibid.

³⁸² See Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 6: 3296-3306; Kalkan, 64.

problematical; Dr. Mişel and Dr. Handanyan had already expressed their worries about straining and hindering the commercial and individual freedoms of brothel owners and prostitutes in 1878 report. However, the amendments made in 1884 also included the assistance from armed forces: the corps of municipal police would therefore accompany physicians while they were conducting weekly medical inspections on the sanitary conditions of the brothels and medical controls of the women working within. The physicians in charge also had to report to the committee formed in the Sixth Division on monthly basis about their findings and recommendations. Probably for eliminating the risk of bribery and nepotism as well as resistance on the part of brothel keepers, regulation also stated that physicians would be rotated among these five distinct administrative divisions twice a year, and their activities would be supervised by medical inspectors.³⁸³

It is stated previously that syphilitic prostitutes would be hospitalized with regard to medical examinations. Between 1880 and 1884 two clinics in Beyoğlu and Galata were utilized for interning and locking of the ill prostitutes. In addition to these, under the auspices of the Sixth Division of Municipality, *Altıncı Daire-i Belediyye Nisa Hastanesi* (The Women's Hospital of Sixth Division) was established in Yüksekaldırım for the hospitalization of the “*illetli kızlar*” (syphilitic prostitutes).³⁸⁴ This hospital indeed functioned merely as a lock hospital, and having only thirty to forty beds, it severely lacked medical and laboratory equipment³⁸⁵, and ran down eventually.³⁸⁶ The physical conditions of the hospital caused

³⁸³ Ergin, Mecelle-i, 6: 3300.

³⁸⁴ Ibid.; Nuran Yıldırım, “Beyoğlu Nisa Hastanesi”, *Dünden Bugüne İstanbul Ansiklopedisi*, 2: 222; Kalkan, 65.

³⁸⁵ Kabacalı, 164; Kalkan, 65-66; Hot, 37; Yıldırım, “Tanzimattan”, 1309.

³⁸⁶ Kalkan, 66.

administrators to arrange another building around Şişli, nevertheless, complaints of local residents in Şişli and a group from among administrators prevented this attempt to be accomplished.³⁸⁷

There were other problems in addition to the problems of legitimacy and physical conditions of the hospitalization process. For example, running costs of the hospital, the salaries of the medical and assisting personnel posed troubles for the administration. In fact, neither the central administration nor the municipal division was able to spare a budget for such expenses. The fees for medical examination and other expenses tried to be met by the brothels, and individual prostitutes, who were street walkers. With respect to the size and location of the buildings and number of prostitutes working within, brothels were classified into distinct groups and obliged to cover these expenses.³⁸⁸ However, as it will be shown in a while, extraction of fees from brothels was also problematical, and Ottoman administration was concerned about probable reaction from the public. In the eyes of people, the state was allowing and legitimizing a vice like prostitution in return for such fees no matter it served public good, such as prevention from syphilis. In addition to these, street walkers, the poorest group of prostitutes were also held liable to pay these fees if found practicing prostitution unless they proved their inability to pay. In sum, Ottoman administration tried to implement policies to prevent syphilis, however they were lack of financial means to apply the projected anti-syphilis regulation, and this in turn placed a double burden over the poorest of women, who made their living through prostituting themselves.

³⁸⁷ Hot, 37.

³⁸⁸ Kalkan, 65.

As it is shown above, parallel to the introduction of compulsory medical control over brothels and prostitutes between 1878 and 1884, the real process of registration became also established. By the amendments of 1884, each medical board, which was formed in the embrace of five district divisions, had to keep registries about individual prostitutes. Among the registration criteria, both real names and nick names of the prostitutes, their physical features, ages, nationality and ethnic descriptions, and addresses were included. Any change in the residential status of these women had to be recorded into the registry, and medical inspectors had to prepare annual statistical reports about physical conditions of these women. Medical inspectors were also in charge of reporting the complaints of brothel owners and prostitutes³⁸⁹ if necessary, possibly for eliminating the risk of irregularities and oppression on the part of officials responsible for inspection. These measures were in accordance with the overall attitude of a modern-interventionist state, which was in its making, in terms of its emphasis to the creation of “modern” registries, statistics and constant preparation of reports.

The compulsory medical control for fighting against syphilis infection also formed resistance among prostitutes during 1880s. Especially the principle of locking the ill must have created troubles for women, who had to make their living through prostituting themselves. According to Kalkan, medical administrators of the era did not want to negotiate over this respect; if found ill, any prostitute had to be subject to compulsory hospitalization and isolation since common good precedes the individual. If necessary, even a physical force must be applied.³⁹⁰ Clandestine prostitution and street walkers continued to be a problem for the implementation of

³⁸⁹ Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 6: 3300, 3303, 3305; Kalkan, 65.

³⁹⁰ Kalkan, 66.

compulsory medical control up until the early twentieth century that capitulations and foreign protection over commercial activities, including brothels, was abolished.³⁹¹ As referred above, the idea and establishment of compulsory medical control was also problematical; these measures meant the regulation, therefore recognition of the “vice”, and consequent increase in the prostitution activity in legitimate margins. In other words, medical regulation over prostitution created anxieties that though it was deemed to decrease the risk of venereal contagion, it would increase the brothel visits and customers of brothels. It was believed that people would start frequenting brothels more than ever since the danger of contagion would be reduced, and prostitution would surely surge. In contrast to this possibility, an effective and just government deemed to reduce the number of brothels.³⁹² Nevertheless, Ottoman administration did not bargain over these concerns since syphilis was in real upsurge beginning from the 1880s onwards both in the centre and provinces.

Controlling and preventing syphilis epidemics through the subjection of prostitution into routine medical control was still an important issue up until the 1900s. A memorandum from the Ministry of Police to the Municipality of İstanbul, dated 20 June 1906, reported that the number of brothels in Galata district was on increase while underlying this phenomenon’s drawbacks to public health as well as general public order. The increase of brothels was deemed dangerous since it meant the increase in the number of unregistered prostitutes who could easily be overlooked for medical control. The ministry requested from the municipality to take necessary

³⁹¹ Ibid.; Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 6:3302.

³⁹² Ibid., 3298-3299; Kalkan, 66 ; Also see the document BOA *A.MKT. MHM 502/23* (1308 Zi'l-hicce 26/ 1307 Temmuz 21/ 2 August 1891), which accounts for the provincial complaints regarding administration of the syphilis regulation, and its discontents.

precautions so that those new brothels would be immediately closed down.³⁹³ The rise in the number of brothels, which functioned clandestinely, and street walkers had been alarming the authorities of the capital city beginning from the 1860s onwards. Even prior to this date, in 1840s, Ottoman administration issued orders for the control of provincial population's movement into the capital city, and these orders had specific emphasis for destitute women who traveled alone to the capital.³⁹⁴ A correspondence, dated 15 February 1860, from the Sublime Council for Judicial Ordinances to the office of the Seraskeri stated that the number of "unemployed and ill-mannered ones" increased in the capital city and people of "indefinite endeavor from variety of classes and ethno-national backgrounds" had also been coming to the city by ferries arriving on daily basis.³⁹⁵ The document stated that previously exiled persons of the aforesaid type managed to return to the capital city either before or after they went back to their homelands since "they changed their names on travel documents or borrowed the travel licences of other people".³⁹⁶ The personnel liable to control these travel documents both in provinces and in the centre were deemed to be irresponsible by not paying enough attention to check the authenticity of these documents. However, the correspondence is crucial in terms of its emphasis on the improperly-controlled movement of provincial population and increasing problem of prostitution in the capital city: "not only vagabonds and males of mysterious

³⁹³ As excerpted from BOA ZB 373/98 (1324 Rebiyyü'l-ahir 27/ 1322 Haziran 7 / 20 June 1906).

³⁹⁴ See documents BOA *I.DH.* 11303 (3 Receb 1265/ 25 May 1849) and BOA *IMV.* 4029 (28 Muharrem 1265/24 December 1848) for these orders that provincial administrators and population registry officers were warned to be careful while providing travel documents and licence for passage to women, especially destitute ones that these women had troubles in the capital and the central administration had difficulties to provide them security. For the unruly and suspicious ones for illegitimate activities in their destination, central administration asked for guarantors back in their homelands.

³⁹⁵ As excerpted from BOA *A. MKT.* NZD 295/87 (1276 Rebiyyü'l ahir 23/ 15 February 1860).

³⁹⁶ As excerpted from *ibid.*

undertakings”, but also “large numbers of prostitutes” were reported to be arriving, and clustering around the vicinities of Beyoğlu and Galata. As report revealed “each of these women had been performing illegitimate businesses, and various vices had been taking place”.³⁹⁷ The document concluded with the request that municipality and its quarantine officers must comply with the *mürûr nizamnamesi* (the regulation of passage and travel) and any person, whose reason to reside in the capital city is “susceptible and unacceptable”, and other people without proper travel documents must altogether be surrendered to the police.³⁹⁸ Similarly, in two years time, in the medium of another correspondence between the Sublime Council of Judicial Ordinances and the grand Vizierate, the same issue was discussed. This time it was decided that additional orders would be sent to the local population offices and population registry personnel to not to provide travel licence to anybody who did not have any “reliable reason for travel”, especially for visiting the capital city. It concluded that foreign commercial companies which ran ferries between the capital city and its hinterland did not pay attention to the control and authenticity of the passengers’ travel documents, and they solely acted profit-orientedly to give way such problems.³⁹⁹

During the period between 1870s and 1900s, the increase in the number of brothels was already on its onset around Galata and Beyoğlu, and there was no demarcation line between the residential arrangements of ordinary people and brothels that people started to petition the administration. A memorandum addressed to the Directory of Police on 25 September 1872 reveals that during 1870s, it was

³⁹⁷ As excerpted from *ibid.*

³⁹⁸ *Ibid.*

³⁹⁹ BOA A.MKT. MVL 140/3 (1278 Receb 22/ 23 January 1862).

possible to find lower-income families and prostitutes side by side as tenants in the rooms which were let around Galata.⁴⁰⁰ Similar cases can be found in Karagümruk⁴⁰¹ and Şişli.⁴⁰² Families complained about their neighbours, who either prostituted themselves or others. Clandestine brothels, in other words, were not the feature of the areas where commercialization and gentrification was the case; one could find houses where couple of women prostituted themselves around ordinary neighborhoods such as *Feriköy*.⁴⁰³ While people in close proximity to brothels complained about their “immoral” and “unruly” neighbours, the brothels in Beyoğlu were also customers of some lower income groups since the latter provided certain domestic services to the former.⁴⁰⁴ As revealed by this correspondence from the Chief Scribal Office in Yıldız Palace, some inhabitants of Bahçeköy, a small village in the vicinity of Sarıyer, made their living by doing the laundry of brothels.⁴⁰⁵ The document complained about the negative aspects of this undertaking that both the households of these laundresses and the streams in which they washed those laundries were not hygienic, and this village did not have even a closed sewage system. Allowing those villagers to do the laundries of brothels would both exacerbate the sanitation problem in the said village and brothels that “the water had

⁴⁰⁰ BOA ZB 5/26 (1289 Receb 22/ 25 September 1872).

⁴⁰¹ BOA HI. 118 (1322 Muharrem 25/ 29 July 1894).

⁴⁰² BOA Y.PRK. ZB. 32/16 (1319 Zi'l-kade 14/ 22 February 1902). This memorandum, addressed from the Governorship of Beyoğlu to General Directorate of Police, accounted that a woman called *Madam Mami*, a Greek subject, who previously banned from running a brothel and forced to evacuate her flat in Şişli, was found to be doing the same business by subletting the same flat.

⁴⁰³ BOA Y.PRK.ZB 2/72 (1301 Şevval 26/ 19 August 1884). A memorandum addressed from the General Directory of Police to the Yıldız Palace reported that three women who were French subjects and known by their inclination to prostitution, an illegitimate trade, resisted to leave the house that they rented in Feriköy.

⁴⁰⁴ BOA HI. 76 (1311 Şevval 11/17 April 1894).

⁴⁰⁵ Ibid.

already been polluted, and it would not be free of various grave diseases.”⁴⁰⁶ Yet not directly, this special decree pointed out the concern of central administration towards epidemical diseases in general and venereal diseases in particular by underlining the rationale of keeping brothels under constant medical inspection. In short, brothels were places various people got in contact, a bed for various contagious illnesses, and they had to be controlled.

There were other acclaimed reasons for the increase of the number of brothels. According to an intelligence report addressed to the Sultan, policemen also intermingled into the process of prostituting women since persons of ill fame, vagabonds and the ones previously expelled from the professional army posts made their way into the police force.⁴⁰⁷ We know from variety of occasions that Ottoman administration tried to increase the number police officers through periodic recruitments to handle the security problems of a transforming city.⁴⁰⁸ Even if it was an intelligence report of an officious employee, this document reveals that women who were alleged to be prostitutes, but actually had nothing to do with prostitution, deemed prostitutes by the police officers who misused their institutional power;

Public order and peace in a given a country depend on the security personnel who are gifted with honor and high morals. [...] the inclusion of people of misbehavior and disgrace in to the police force increased the rates of crime, [...] that they intentionally attacked the honor and chastity of people, [...] and huge number of women were either obliged to prostitute themselves by the police officers or imprisoned blamelessly due to the wrong allegations.⁴⁰⁹

⁴⁰⁶ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴⁰⁷ BOA *Y.PRK.AZJ.* 21/65 (1309 Şaban 23/ 23 March 1892).

⁴⁰⁸ See BOA *ZB* 74/73 (1324 Eylül 22/ 5 October 1908) for the process of recruiting additional policemen to work in Beyoğlu.

⁴⁰⁹ As excerpted from *ibid.*

In 1901, the Ministry of Interior sent a memorandum, which included new measures to handle the issue of “suspicious persons” who traveled and resided in the capital city, to the Ministry of Police.⁴¹⁰ These measures comprised the compiling of specific registers for the owners and directors, and customers of hotels, rooms and houses for rent, alehouses and coffeehouses as well as hospitals. These registers were to be compiled with respect to ethnic and national criteria and had to be organized with proper street and location addresses. More important than this, every hotel and inn owner had to keep a book in which information concerning the “homeland, name and reputation of the visitors” was recorded.⁴¹¹ Landlords and landladies were also obliged to report the “suspicious and uncertain persons” to the police, and if they failed to do so, they would be treated as “collaborationists”. In order to ensure this measure’s enforcement, police officers were also given the responsibility of periodical inspection.⁴¹² Though this measure had to do with the tightening of Hamidian police state vis-à-vis political criticism of the Constitutionals and ethno-religious minorities, the principle of recording unknown persons with regard to their name, ethno-national peculiarity and their fame must also have related to the concerns regarding clandestine and unregistered prostitution activity that hotels and inns were the susceptible places for the exchange of sexual services in return for money if it did not take place in brothels.

If we go back to the year of 1906, we see that the Ministry of Police made a second request from the municipality to confirm whether the rise in the number of brothels in the vicinity of Galata was the case. The ministry asked a report which

⁴¹⁰ BOA *DH.TMIK.S 34/10* (1319 Muharrem 5 /24 April 1901).

⁴¹¹ Ibid.

⁴¹² Ibid.

would include the number and locations of recently established brothels, both registered and unregistered ones, in order to compare these figures with numbers they obtained through inspections.⁴¹³ In the following year, motivated by the concerns regarding the rapid increase of brothels, the police kept performing routine investigations to find out unregistered brothels and prostitutes. They found out that a person called Miço had been running three brothels in Beyoğlu, about which police did not have any information whether these were registered brothels or not.⁴¹⁴ The said person argued that he had been previously given a licence, and even taxed to keep this business by the municipality. The police requested from the municipality to confirm Miço's claims whether they were genuine or not.⁴¹⁵ In the course of the end of the year 1907, police still had troubles with the brothels; a memorandum sent from the Governorship of Beyoğlu to the Ministry of Police on 24 September 1907 revealed that brothels established in Paşa Bakkal and Gölbaşı streets in Tarlabası in the vicinity of Beyoğlu had been causing various illegitimacies and local inhabitants petitioned for the evacuation of these houses.⁴¹⁶ The inhabitants of the said neighborhoods argued that these brothels were recently established ones, however, the consequent investigation based on the registries kept by the municipality and health board revealed that these brothels had already been registered for five to ten years. The council of police acknowledged the difficulty that people of the locality had been experiencing, yet they could not evacuate these brothels since ousting of these brothels and their inhabitants would disperse them into other honorable

⁴¹³ BOA ZB 374/34 (1324 Cemaziyü'l- ahir 17/ 1322 Temmuz 26/ 8 August 1906).

⁴¹⁴ BOA ZB 1324 (Zi'l-kade 20/ 1322 Kanun-ı evvel 23/5 January 1907) as cited by Kalkan, 67.

⁴¹⁵ Ibid.

⁴¹⁶ BOA ZB 73/55 (1323 Eylül 11/ 24 September 1907).

neighborhoods and this would cause further complaints. It was reported that “the relocation of these brothels into a new place, determined by the municipality, would be more suitable.”⁴¹⁷ Finally, there was another important dimension, which has been often ignored while analyzing both the presence and increase in prostitution activity in the nineteenth to twentieth century Ottoman society. This was the trafficking of young women;

Angeliko, who resides in Hacı Ahmed neighborhood in Tatavla district [of İstanbul], kidnapped fourteen year old Maria and brought her [...] to a brothel run by Mariana on Bağçeli Hamam street around the Mosque of Ağa in Beyoğlu district eight days ago, and he raped, then sold her [Maria] to the said Mariana for 20 liras” [...].⁴¹⁸

It is argued before that Jewish women were deemed to be prostituting themselves and contributing to the rise of syphilis infection among the Ottoman subjects with an emphasis that they performed prostitution voluntarily and keenly. However, these Jewish prostitutes were “young and simplehearted Jewish women” from Ottoman provinces in Balkans, such as Bulgaria and Rumenia, and neighboring countries like Russia, who were brought into the capital city to work as prostitutes forcibly as revealed by a memorandum handling a previous complaint written from the Office of the Chief Rabbi in İstanbul on 17 August 1909 to İstanbul Directorate of Police.⁴¹⁹

The complaint of Chief Rabbi was as follows;

Young and ingenuous Jewish women from Russia, Romania and other neighboring countries has been habitually deceived and abducted by a bunch

⁴¹⁷ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴¹⁸ As excerpted from BOA *Y.PRK. ŞH. 2/61* (1304 Rebiyyü'l evvel 24/ 21 December 1886) , a report addressed from the Metropolitan Municipality of İstanbul to Yıldız Palace.

⁴¹⁹ BOA *DH.EUM.THR 1/34* (4 August 1325 / 17 August 1909).

of disgraceful either for getting married or to be employed in decent places, however they ended up to be sold into brothels. [...] Since these cases are becoming frequent and customary, and it is impossible to deny the detriments of this [prostitution of these women] for public health and morality, and [finally] [these women] have hearthrending lives since they cannot escape the tyranny they are subjected to, [...] an investigation committee must be sent to this locality [Beyoğlu].⁴²⁰

As it is shown above, Ottoman administration had to fight against syphilis in the capital by subjecting prostitution into compulsory medical controls and disciplining the clandestine brothels by either registering them into the system or closing them down up until the year 1910. Another memorandum written from Ministry of Interior Public Security Correspondence Office dated 3 January 1910 to the İstanbul Metropolitan Municipality complained about the brothels within the city quarters. We understand from this correspondence that the idea of designating a specific area for brothels, as in the case of “civilized societies”, was proposed to be deliberated by the municipality council since municipality was authorized to decide upon such matters, and “moral and medical perils of prostitution were obvious.”⁴²¹ However, this measure was not accomplished. According to Ergin, the administrative efforts considering the control of the spread of syphilis in the medium of syphilis were far from being successful. He argued that these attempts failed due to the capitulations, which shielded the brothels established and ran by foreign residents against the venereal diseases regulation. On the other hand, the compulsory medical examination was applied exclusively for the brothels which were comprised by the administrative duty radius of the Sixth Division of Municipality, i.e., Beyoğlu and Galata vicinities. The means of medical surveillance were not effective; if found infected,

⁴²⁰ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴²¹ BOA *DH.EUM.THR* 20/26 (1327 Zi'l-hicce 21/3 January 1910).

prostitutes usually fled to other districts in the city, therefore, managed to escape the jurisdiction of the medical board.⁴²²

As mentioned before, Ottoman administration had financial difficulties to apply medical controls, and allocated the financial costs of medical controls to the brothel owners and prostitutes. Neither central nor municipal administration up until 1910s did have separate budget and financial means to implement the regulation policy accordingly. The cost of hospitalization and medical inspections, therefore, tried to be met by the fees collected from prostitutes and brothels. In addition to these, required fees were not reasonable enough to meet the expenses, especially expenditures of the hospital; “there was mal-administration and misuse”, and in fact, “this policy was in disarray”.⁴²³

The case of İzmir is crucial in terms of financial difficulties and legitimacy of the licencing and taxing brothels so that hospitalization and medical surveillance fees could be covered in the medium of Ottoman anti-syphilis policies. In 1880s, the municipality of İzmir commenced a similar regulation with that of Sixth Division of Municipality in İstanbul. A health commission, and separate clinic for syphilitic prostitutes, however with limited capacity, was formed in a way emphasizing the role of prostitution in the spread of the disease. Slightly different than the practice in the capital city, municipal administration in İzmir managed to move brothels, which were dispersed around the city, into a specific district called *Sakızlılar*, a remote area from the city centre. Periodical medical examinations were performed over prostitutes and recorded into registries. In order to prevent malpractices and nepotism, inspectors were also employed. The municipality wanted to build a better

⁴²² See Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 6: 3296-3306; Kalkan, 67.

⁴²³ Ergin, *Mecelle-i*, 6: 3300-3302; Kalkan, 68.

hospital, which would function as a lock hospital for the increasing number of syphilitic prostitutes and they projected to cover the construction expenditures by the fees collected from brothels as well as other expenses such as salary of the medical and assisting personnel. For this respect, they classified brothels into three groups with regard to their size and number of their employees.⁴²⁴

A correspondence from the Council of State dated 2 August 1891 deliberates the consequences regarding both the aspirations and application of syphilis regulation in İzmir. The correspondence reports that syphilis is “a serious illness which poisons the body of the infected and even destroys the future generations”.⁴²⁵ Since İzmir was a crowded city and significant in terms of commercial activities and its ports, huge numbers of people, including foreign ships and their crew, arrived into the city daily. Syphilis was claimed to be widespread among the inhabitants of İzmir, both in the city centre and provinces; there were villages completely infected by syphilis, and these villagers, who were not treated at all, easily moved into the city centre and clustered around the inns, cheap hotels and coffeehouses, therefore spreading the disease to their fellow people. It was also claimed that those foreign ships arriving daily to the ports contributed to the spread of syphilis among the city population, and there were still clandestine brothels despite the efforts to keep them in a specific district. Depending upon these conditions, city administration decided to build a hospital to treat syphilitics, however, they had difficulty to pay even the monthly expenditures for the salary of physicians and other types of personnel, which costed

⁴²⁴ Information provided by Abdullah Martal, “İllet-i Efrenciyye (İzmir’de Frengiyle Mücadele)”, *Tepekule Tarih*, 1(2000) as cited by Kalkan, 68. Being classified with respect to their size and number of prostitutes they employed, the first group of brothels had to pay 2,5 guruş, the second group had to pay 2, and the last group had to pay 1,5 guruş monthly for the fees. In sum, it equals to 135, 5 gold liras . For the full account of this classification, see BOA *A.MKT.MHM* 502/23 (1308 Zi’l-hicce 26/ 1307 Temmuz 21/ 2 August 1891).

⁴²⁵ As excerpted from *ibid*.

at about 12600 guruş.⁴²⁶ Administration perceived the construction of a special hospital as a necessity; “to maintain civilized and humane living conditions for people”, but they ran out of funds.⁴²⁷ City administration enumerated their financial difficulty as follows;

[...] taking taxes from brothels would be the recognition of their existence and activity, therefore the tax measure was given up. [In addition to this] the treasuries of the Municipality of İzmir are not able to cover [the expenses] of the construction since the taxes reserved for the municipality were previously transferred to the central treasury. The expenditures of this hospital could be covered by the charitable donations from people; however, there have been numerous occasions that people had to donate. And the great drought in the preceding year was detrimental to the people and they did not have such financial power to contribute. [Moreover] municipality could not even pay its salaried officials and physicians, and keep the city clean, [and under such circumstances] it is a requirement to request this amount from the central treasury.⁴²⁸

The answer of the central administration for these financial difficulties was a negative one; it was recommended that the hospital should be founded in a rented building and its rent expenditures, maintenance together with medical inspections must be covered by monthly fees from brothels. Instead of hiring a new physician to perform medical inspections, a physician already employed for municipal medicine should be assigned for this task to spare the salary payment. Similarly, it was recommended that there was no need for hiring a permanent pharmacist for the hospital, and medicines could be obtained from an outside pharmacy.⁴²⁹ These were the cost

⁴²⁶ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴²⁷ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴²⁸ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴²⁹ *Ibid.*

reduction strategies proposed by the central administration to handle epidemical syphilis.

3.5.3. Syphilis in Anatolia

Syphilis had been widespread almost all regions in Anatolia beginning from 1850s onwards. In 1883, Prussian General Baron Von der Goltz⁴³⁰ (1843-1916), who was appointed for a training post for military reform in the Ottoman Empire, reported that syphilis was prevalent among Ottoman conscripts, and he prepared a report to recommend the sultan to take necessary precautions against syphilis. Again on Von der Goltz's recommendation, a German dermatologist, Ernst Von Düring (1858-1944)⁴³¹ was invited to supervise syphilis epidemics and treatment in the Ottoman capital and countryside. For Dr. Von Düring, the situation in Anatolian provinces was as follows;

⁴³⁰ Willhelm Leopold Colmar Freiherr Von der Goltz. Prussian soldier and military writer; he was born at Bielkenfeld, East Prussia. When Abdülhamid II, asked for German aid in reorganizing the Ottoman Army in 1883, Baron von der Goltz took a training post in The ottoman Army. He spent twelve years in ottoman empire on this work which provided the material for several of his books. Having spend some years in this post, he was given the title Paşa and he was given the title Müşir (field-marshal).in 1895. His improvements to the Ottoman army were crucial especially for the Greco-Turkish War of 1897.He served as a commander in chief of Turkish forces during the Great War against British.

⁴³¹He was a professor of Dermatology and dermatological diseases. He became the professor of Dermatology in the Imperial Medical School in the Otoman Empire. He also worked as a second chief physician in Haydarpaşa Military Hospital. Between 1889 and 1902, as a General Health Inspector of Kastamonu and Ankara, he conducted 14 field trips to inspect syphilis epidemics in Anatolia together with 16 Ottoman physicians and 2 pahrmacist. He trained local physicians around Anatolia about the modern treatments of leprosy and syphilis. He initiated the establishment of Syphilis hospitals in Kastamonu, bolu, Bartın, Düzce and Cide. He was also given the title of Paşa due to his contribution to the medical and sanitary reform in Otoman Empire. For Düring's appointment, see Yıldırım, *Tanzimattan*, 1330; H. Alper Tanrıverdi & H. Taylan Öney, "Tıp Alanında Türk Alman İlişkileri", *Artemis*, 4/3 (Spring 2003) ; Çalık & Tepekaya, 212.

Except for the population of Syria, and Euphrates and Tigris basin, Ottoman population decreased from 12 to seven million in Minor Asia between 1844 and 1890. The compulsory and arduous military service, which is applicable to all Turks, and syphilis caused this population decrease. While I was traveling from İstanbul to Düzcce, a dramatic scarcity of population caught my attention. High numbers of Turkish cemeteries in the region confirmed this observation. Today, Tatars and Circassians are residing in the said area. There are no Turkish people in the region anymore. Turks completely died out. A Circassian muhtar showed is village's population registry; there were 500 inhabitants living in 100 households thirty years ago. The next day, we paid a visit to this village and saw that there were seven inhabitants left in three households in the village. An old man in one of these households reported as follows: "all of the inhabitants [of this village] died due to frengi", that is, syphilis.⁴³²

Supporting Von Düring's claim, syphilis became widespread in Kastamonu, including whole Black Sea coast, and İzmir, Konya, Sivas, Ankara, Hüdavendigâr (Bursa), Erzurum, Bitlis, Bağdad and Syria between 1880s and 1890s. During his field trips, Düring found out that 70 to 80 percent of whole population in Kastamonu province was infected with syphilis.⁴³³ A memorandum addressed to the Council of State and dated 7 August 1893 revealed that between 1881 and 1887, 3307 persons, who were infected with syphilis, applied to the hospitals in Kastamonu, and 38 among them deceased.⁴³⁴ It was also reported by the document that there were countless but unrecorded syphilitics and syphilis-related deaths in the region. The memorandum basically described syphilis as a disease which was one of the main causes of population decline.⁴³⁵ Therefore, Ottoman administration had to commence its fight against syphilis from Kastamonu province.

⁴³² As excerpted from Ernst Von Düring's "Ärztliche Kulturaufgaben in der Türkei", *Archiv für Schiff- und Truppen Hygiene*, Bd. 20, Nr. 41920, 83-84 as quoted in Çalık & Tepekaya, 212. Translation is mine.

⁴³³ Helmut Becker, *Aeskulop Zwischen Reichsadler und Halbmond, Sanitätswesen und Seuchenbekämpfung im Türkischen Reich Während des Ersten Weltkrieges*, 41-42 as cited in *ibid*.

⁴³⁴ BOA *A.MKT.MHM. 531/13* (1311 Muharrem 24/ 7 August 1893).

⁴³⁵ "[...] nüfus-ı beşeriyenin tenziline bais olan frengi illeti [...]" as excerpted. from *ibid*.

Prior to the conception of the scope of measures which were taken to eradicate syphilis in Kastamonu province, it is worth to cite the reaction of central administration to the epidemics in provincial areas and their impact over the population in capital city. For example, a document addressed from the Metropolitan Municipality of İstanbul in December 1894 reveals that syphilis, a prevalent illness among the population in Anatolian provinces, was “carried into the capital city especially by young maids and concubines who were hereditarily infected and carelessly recruited from these regions.”⁴³⁶ Therefore, municipality requested the “establishment of a committee, which would deliberate the strategies to eliminate syphilis from Ottoman countryside, under the directives of the Ministry of Interior.”⁴³⁷ Municipality administration also specified that this health committee had to be constituted by scientists and experts who would be well informed about the disease.

Accordingly, a memorandum dated 16 September 1895 and addressed to the Ministry of Interior also points out the problem of maidservants and concubines recruited from Anatolian provinces. The document reports that two fourteen year old maidservants from İzmir were recruited to be employed in the service of imperial household, however, found syphilitic subsequent to a medical examination carried out by physicians. They were sent back to their homeland, and subsequent to this event, “a Circassian, fourteen –year- old *bekâr* (virgin) concubine was purchased to be employed for the palace service, yet, whose infection with syphilis was also

⁴³⁶ As excerpted from BOA *Y.PRK.ŞH.* 5/58 (1312 Cemaziyyü'l-evvel 27/ 1310 Teşrin-i Sâni 14/ 26 November 1894).

⁴³⁷ As excerpted from *ibid.*

determined by the physicians with regard to the boil in her mouth.”⁴³⁸ The document reports that the latter, Circassian virgin concubine, was sent back to her homeland, too. Nevertheless the situation was alarming enough for the sultan, and “for the sake and health of the Ottoman peoples” he ordered the establishment of a scientific committee to determine the strategies for eradicating this dangerous illness from the Ottoman lands completely.⁴³⁹

This memorandum was crucial for couple of respects; first of all, it reveals the fear of infection which reached even to the imperial household that a virgin concubine, who was not sexually active but contracted with syphilis congenitally brought to light the possibility of a serious peril for the extend of the illness. Basically, around 1880s, the scientific arguments regarding congenital syphilis were acknowledged by the Ottoman public in addition to the well known venereal forms of infection. Secondly, the document warned the administrative units responsible for the promotion of public health and order that this illness became widespread through illegitimate and insanitary forms of sexual activity of specific social groups prior to its congenital extend;

[Syphilis] is widespread in various parts of Anatolia due to troopers in the Ottoman Imperial Army and persons who traveled either to the capital city or various parts of the Ottoman country for making their living as workers. [These troopers and workers] get this disease in the *fuhuşhanes* (brothels), and contract it to their homes when they return to their homelands.⁴⁴⁰

⁴³⁸ As excerpted from BOA *A.MKT. MHM. 531/13* (1313 Rebiyyü'l-ahir 26 / 1313 Teşrin-i Evvel 1311/ 16 September 1895).

⁴³⁹ Ibid.

⁴⁴⁰ As excerpted from *ibid.*

Thirdly, this memorandum complains about the quality and effectiveness of the already taken preventive measures against syphilis that especially medical personnel needed to be instructed and controlled for providing better service and information for the masses in return;

[...] Previously, preventive attempts were introduced concerning two basic domains from which illness arises; first one was regarding the protection of the inhabitants of brothels, and the second was building special hospitals to treat the syphilitics in various provinces so that the seed of the disease would be destroyed. However, let alone treating syphilitics, the physicians appointed to these [syphilis] hospitals are far from being able to diagnose the illness. [...] Therefore, a commission, which will be led by *Mösyö Düring* [...] and accompanied by two other expert physicians as well as two functionaries from Metropolitan Municipality and The Ministry of Interior, must be formed for the benefit of informing the public and specifically peasants about the physical and moral hazards of this illness.⁴⁴¹

The quality and motives of physicians continued to be a problem in the context of controlling syphilis epidemics in the countryside. A special decree dated 17 March 1899 and addressed to the Council of State divulges that the preventive and medical measures taken for syphilis epidemics in Ottoman lands were far from being effective and carefully applied that “an illness fatally detrimental for population even reached to a nine year old Circassian girl in İzmir.”⁴⁴² After having referred to a report prepared by Dr. Von Düring about syphilis epidemics in Anatolia, which currently spanned provinces such as Hüdavendigâr (Bursa), Erzurum, Kastamonu, Konya, the capital city and Bağdad, decree becomes crucial that it inquires both the motives and technical capabilities of new graduates from the Imperial Medical School, who were supposed to take part in the fight against syphilis ;

⁴⁴¹ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴⁴² BOA *H.I.* 8 (1316 Zi'l-kade 5/ 17 March 1899). Also see the initial parts of BOA *Y.A.RES.* 99/32 (1316 Zi'l-kade 19/ 1315 Nisan 18/ 30 April 1899), which exactly repeats the deliberation of the previous document.

Some of the physicians trained at the Imperial Medical School prefer to serve the affluent and elite in İstanbul, and they idly wait to be given ranks and honorary titles instead of serving the society. They do not want to visit the patients by whom they are called to examine, and even among military physicians one can find physicians avoiding to treat people who cannot provide any material invigoration to them. [Moreover] there are even cases that one cannot find an obstetrician or a midwife for the same reasons that these were previously reported to the sultan. Instead of improving themselves in the field of medicine, these recently graduated physicians also dealt with politics at the schools where they were trained at the expense of excessive costs. It was revealed from the investigations performed by the Court Martials that they had been inclined to ideas which were contrary to the religious principles. Due to these reasons, people recourse no one but foreign physicians named *Horasancı*, *Moliğ* and *Kanburoğlu*, and two Ottoman physicians named Nafiz Paşa and surgeon Cemil Paşa, and this fact is congruent with the primary endeavor that initiated the establishment of neither Imperial Medical School nor the School of Civil Medicine. Although physicians took an oath to serve humanity and remain loyal to the sultan on their graduation, they do not serve society and the state as a consequence of dealing with politics but science. Therefore, in order to eradicate syphilis which becomes widespread day by day across the country, it is requested from the Council of State to introduce necessary ameliorations in medical schools which would ensure the training of loyal and professionally capable physicians who would serve people that have been obliged to consult foreign physicians.⁴⁴³

Briefly, Ottoman administration had two difficulties regarding physicians for maintaining their prospected fight against syphilis; one was related to the quality and professional skills of physicians, as will be shown in a while in the context of physician appointments and itinerary field examinations for Anatolian provinces, and the second one was regarding the expectations and carrier paths that trained physicians did have in the late nineteenth century. Sometimes, these two factors intermingled. There was neither sufficient number of physicians to treat syphilis cases, nor willing ones among the few physicians who could treat syphilis. As early as 1851, when Ottoman central administration had to appoint a physician to the outbreak of syphilis in the rural sections of Hezargrad, Bulgaria, they had a difficulty

⁴⁴³ As excerpted from *ibid.*

to persuade Dr. Dominik to work in the said region with a salary of 1200 *guruş*.⁴⁴⁴ The said physician must have been in need of persuasion either for the amount of salary or the difficulties regarding the payment of salary. In other words, a physician who had already established his clinic and clients in the capital city might not have wanted to go and work for a temporary post in a remote provincial region. Moreover, as previously suggested for the case of İzmir, and it will be revealed in consecutive sections of this chapter in the context of syphilis regulation in Anatolia, neither central nor local administration was able to make salary payments of the appointed physicians unprecedentedly. Majority of the regulation and preventive attempts became defied by financial bankruptcy both at the center and in provinces that the former had to compensate its limited revenues, or keep the number of appointed officials and other necessary medical expenditures at the minimum rates. Therefore, Dr. Von Düring's appointment must be analyzed under the light of these problems. There were also unlicensed and traditional healers, such as *hekime hanıms* and *ocak hekimleri*, as well as non-expert physicians who manipulated, monopolized and treated syphilitics inefficiently, sometimes fatally. These healers were criticized and Ottoman public and professional personnel were warned against these healers' evil impact over both the treatment process and the ill in the medium of press and advice genre. However, in the absence of sufficient number of physicians who had expertise over syphilis, the intimate nature of illness and social stigma which attached an illegitimacy to it in addition to the costly and difficult treatment, with full of side-effects surely encouraged illiterate and ignorant masses to these traditional and ineffective healers. And allegations about political and promotion related inclinations

⁴⁴⁴ BOA *C.SH. 1324* (6 Cemaziyü'l ahir 1267 /8 April 1851).

of newly graduates from medical faculties should also be analyzed in the repressive and reactionary atmosphere of Hamidian administration which tended to bridge any disorder in the empire with the political criticism against itself as a defensive reflex. Approximately a month later from the complaint attuned by sultan, *Meclis-i Mahsus* reported back that the training and discipline of students at the medical schools had been revised and taken care of meticulously. As for the concerns regarding the diagnose and treatment procedures of syphilis, it was also claimed that Dr. Von Düring had already instructed the medical students who graduated from the medical schools in that specific year in the premises of Imperial School of Medicine at *Gülhane*.⁴⁴⁵ For the physicians who were avoiding the consultation of syphilitics and people with other complaints “would be warned and corrected since their behaviour was neither compatible with the requirements of being a state employee nor their oath as physicians.”⁴⁴⁶

Around 1896, the syphilis cases rose in Kastamonu province among both Ottoman Imperial Armed Forces and peasant population to such a level that central administration had to create a specific regulation. As suggested by evidences, within districts and counties such as *Araç, Bartın, Bolu, Boyabat, Cide Çerkeş, Daday, Düzce, Safranbolu, İnebolu* and *Sinob*, syphilis was tremendously widespread.⁴⁴⁷ There were various claims about the occurrence of illness in Kastamonu province though neither conscription to the army nor the sanitary level of everyday life in the region was exceptional as compared to other provinces. The first reason for the outbreaks of syphilis in the region had to do with the *hassa efradı* (troops of

⁴⁴⁵ BOA *Y.A.RES.* 99/32 (1316 Zi'l-kade 19/ 1315 Nisan 18/ 30 April 1899).

⁴⁴⁶ Ibid.

⁴⁴⁷ BOA *A.MKT.MHM.* 531/13 (1311 Muharrem 24/ 7 August 1893).

guardsmen) who had been predominantly recruited from Kastamonu from relatively well to do social groups. The barracks of these hassa conscripts were located near to Galata, where majority of capital city's brothels were established. These troopers were believed to frequent brothels thanks to their material affluence and consequently get infected with syphilis that on their return to their homeland, they spread the disease to their kin. Secondly, sailors from the region were also deemed to visit brothels in Galata that they not only spread it to Kastamonu, but also to the other regions.⁴⁴⁸ Thirdly, young males from Kastamonu habituated seasonal and long-term paid work as migrant workers in İstanbul. Since they were not accompanied by their wives due to the nature of works they took and financial reasons, they basically lived as bachelors who had to fulfill their sexual desires with prostitutes. While spending their vacations back at their homes, they contracted their wives and other family members eventually. As a fourth claim, Kastamonu province's coastal proximity to the capital city was suggested that roundtrips especially between Safranbolu, a town within the province, and İstanbul made syphilis epidemical among the population of Kastamonu; syphilis was believed to spread from coastal areas to the interior by the seamen and provincial people visiting brothels.⁴⁴⁹ As a result, syphilis also became widespread among the military units placed in Kastamonu province, which gained the illness during their service, and extended into other regions in the aftermath of their military duty. Moreover, the military administration both central and provincial levels had to undertake preventive

⁴⁴⁸ See Börekeçi, 255.

⁴⁴⁹ See Uğuroğlu Barlas, "Safranbolu Frengi Hastanesi ve Cüzamlılar Barınağı Hakkında Bir Araştırma Denemesi," *Tıp Tarihi Araştırmaları* 5 (1993): 153-154.

measures, and they became one of the liable parties for the application of the syphilis regulation in the aftermath of these.⁴⁵⁰

In the initial years of 1890s, a specific regulation was drafted by *Meclis-i Tıbbiye-i Mülkiyye ve Sıhhiyye-i Umumiyye* (Council of Civil Medicine and Public Health) under the directives of the Ministry of Military Schools, then to be deliberated and applied by the Council of State. In summer 1893, The Council of State requested from the central health administration to designate other kinds of preventive measures which could be applied to curb the further spread of syphilis in the provinces and at the centre. According to this memorandum, the syphilis hospitals were only serving the infected, however effective measures and strategies were needed for its complete eradication and preventing its expansion among the healthy.⁴⁵¹ The Council of State accepted the prepared draft however with some amendments. According to the draft, hospitals founded for the treatment of syphilis victims had to be improved as well as establishing new hospitals in towns and districts, such as Ereğli and Bartın, where upsurge of syphilis required specific establishments like lock hospitals. It was also proposed by this draft that specific duty centres with permanent physicians were to be opened for the infected that were not in need of urgent hospitalization. These special duty centers were proposed to treat the ill for free of charge.⁴⁵²

A crucial dimension in this regulation was the registration principle; it suggested the registration of all syphilitics in cities and rural areas into specific registry books. The recording would be done with respect to age, gender, religion

⁴⁵⁰ Şehsuvaroğlu as cited by Kalkan, 72.

⁴⁵¹ BOA *A.MKT.MHM.* 531/ 13 (1311 Muharrem 24/ 7 August 1893).

⁴⁵² “Kastamonu Vilayeti ve Bolu Sancağı Frengi Mücadelesi Teşkilat-ı Sıhhiyesi Nizamnamesi”, *Sıhhiye Mecmuası* 2/3 (1329/1913): 524-526.

criteria, and the most striking of all, the location from which the victim believed to get the infection would also be written down. Physicians who were responsible for compiling these registries also had to keep statistics deduced from the information gathered with respect to the criteria above, and report them to the Ministry of Medicine on monthly basis.⁴⁵³

Another renovation which targeted ordinary syphilitic persons in the draft regulation was the compulsory hospitalization: any syphilitic individual, or anybody who had skin complaints resembling syphilis symptoms but had not consulted a medical functionary would be placed coercively to these hospitals. Moreover, if a person, who had been previously diagnosed with syphilis and placed in a hospital, managed to run away, he would be coercively corrected and re-placed into the medical institution. In order to make this coercive interning achievable, the provincial government was also deemed responsible to assist the medical authorities with their armed forces. The syphilitics who were discharged from these hospitals in the aftermath of their treatment would be kept under incessant surveillance for three years; they were obliged to be examined by the expert physicians four times a year.⁴⁵⁴

To detect the infected and contribute the effectiveness of the regulation, special itinerant health committees composed of physicians were to be appointed to investigate the countryside. These committees would be responsible to visit villages and remote residential areas so that they would send the infected to the hospitals established in town and city centres. In case of any probable reaction from the people of a locality, these committees were to be accompanied and collaborated by the

⁴⁵³ See *ibid.*; also see “Kastamonu’da Teşkil edilen Frengi Mücadelesine Dair Mütalaat”, *Şihhiye Mecmuası* 3/8 (1331): 549-562.

⁴⁵⁴ BOA Y.PRK.RES. 99/32 (1316 Zi’l-kade 19/ 1315 Nisan 18/ 30 April 1899).

officials and magistrates of the local administration. Therefore, local administrative authorities, religious functionaries such as muhtars and imams had firstly to assist the field trips of the itinerant committees, and then report the syphilitics within their vicinity to the medical authorities subsequent to the latters' visits.⁴⁵⁵ In other words, Ottoman administration resorted to the assistance of same communal agents to whom they had also resorted in the medium of anti-abortion and vaccination regulations. Utilizing the collaboration of local administrative and religious functionaries was crucial for two respects; first these functionaries acquainted with the people of their locality more than anyone, and secondly the assistance they provided for example for clandestine marriages, delaying or avoiding the registration of civil matters such as death, birth and marriage would also be controlled through indirect means which incorporated their initiative and will.

A prospective but syphilitic bride or bride-groom would not be allowed to get married unless he or she proved to be free of infection with regard to the draft regulation.⁴⁵⁶ In other words, anyone who wanted to get married had to apply for a special health certificate which demonstrated the claimant's health. In addition to this, anyone who bore suspicion of syphilis infection had to be taken under medical examination prior to the matrimony, and the ones diagnosed as syphilitics among them could not get married unless they were cured. Following this, the regulation also stipulated that a physician had to approve the marriage of persons only if they proved to be incapable of spreading disease to the others. In order to receive a medical approval for getting married, any syphilitic had to wait at least five years which was claimed to be a minimum required period for one to be treated

⁴⁵⁵ See Kastamonu Vilayeti.

⁴⁵⁶ See *ibid.*

completely, and the illness would not be contagious anymore. The measure of minimum five year interval for syphilitics so that their disease would not be contagious to their social environment was also frequently utilized in the medium of advice genre over syphilis.

Accommodating to the abovementioned claims, draft regulation stipulated that muhtars and imams who condoned to clandestine marriages and marriages between syphilitic parties would be liable to fines, and these fines were to be used as financial support for the syphilis hospitals. Nevertheless, during its application, people did not welcome the health certificate measure prior to marriage, which reservedly detected venereal contagion. As a reaction, people started to get married clandestinely that they did not register their marriages to the courts and registries of religious functionaries. These unlicensed and unrecorded marriages were problematical for two respects in 1890s; for the implementation of public health and anti-syphilis regulation on the one hand and registration of population on the other. Children who were born out of unlicensed and unrecorded marriages were not registered into population offices either. These, in turn, caused Ottoman administration to have neither reliable nor accurate population records from which military conscription could be made. People got married clandestinely for other reasons as well, as it has been discussed elsewhere⁴⁵⁷; for instance for being able to get married with the women they kidnapped, or for avoiding the payment of fees demanded by functionaries for their matrimones to be performed. All in all, the provincial administration in Kastamonu demanded the repeal of medical certificate implementation prior to marriage during the deliberations of the draft regulation. It

⁴⁵⁷ See Tuba Demirci, "Family, State and the Blurring of the Public and Private; Ottoman State and the Emergence of "Marriage Proper" in the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century," *Conference Proceedings of Social Behaviour and Family Strategies in the Balkans XVI-XX. Centuries, Regional Symposium* (Bucharest: New Europe College, forthcoming).

was claimed that applying such a control would be difficult in the first place. Secondly, especially rural population had material difficulties to consult physicians even if they wanted to be examined prior to the matrimony since the latter stationed in the town and city centres. Moreover, medical personnel were insufficient and they would be unable to meet the demands of such certificates.⁴⁵⁸ However, the Ministry of Interior rejected this claim, and the draft remained as it was before.

Regarding marriage and syphilis, there was another important dimension, which was keenly elaborated in the advice genre but referred only passingly in official documents of the era. The documents belonging to mid-nineteen to twentieth century which conveyed the proper organization of marriage quite often connected late marriages and “illegitimacies”. These illegitimacies included kidnaps, marriages with underage non-muslim women and finally bachelor males’ increased probability of brothel visits, which were supported by the historical evidence pinpointing the latter’s propensity to have sex and carry the contagion to their kinspeople. Beginning from 1850s, central administration had to issue decrees which condemned illegal and unacceptable rates of fees demanded by functionaries liable to perform matrimones, extravagant expenditures for marriage ceremonies, high bridewealth demands as customary practices in addition to *mehr* payments for causing late marriages, therefore illegitimacies. These disorders believed to be responsible for late marriages and abundance of single youth that population was affected by all means. Ottoman administration quite often claimed that the rate of marriage was in decline, and aforesaid practices encouraged especially men to engage in illegitimate ways for getting married or satisfying their sexual needs.⁴⁵⁹ For example, the memorandum

⁴⁵⁸ See *BOA DH.ID. 63/13* (1331 Rebiyyü’l-ahir 18/1329 Mart 14/ 27 March 1913).

⁴⁵⁹ See Demirci, Family, State.

dated 7 August 1893 complains the decline of marriage among the youth in Kastamonu region and rise of syphilis both as factors causing population decrease.⁴⁶⁰

The draft regulation of 1899 for Kastamonu province had another crucial measure which is worth to be analyzed. This was the measure of travel and passage restriction for the single persons from Kastamonu province that they could travel neither to the capital city nor to other areas where syphilis regulation was not put into practice.⁴⁶¹ “Unless they were examined and given medical reports revealing that they were free of infection, these bachelors would not be permitted to travel.”⁴⁶² People found to be syphilitics in the course of medical examinations were to be sent to their homes, and syphilitics from areas where no specific syphilis regulation was introduced were also restricted to travel into other parts of the empire. In February 1904, a memorandum from the provincial government of Hüdavendigâr underlined the logic behind such a stipulation; the governor of Hüdavendigâr reported that although the frequency of syphilis previously diminished among people in his province with regard to the scientific medical measures, “it became recently upsurged due to the ones who were coming into the area from outside.”⁴⁶³ Provincial government went onto differentiate the outsiders into two groups one of which was the conscripts who performed their military service in other provinces. Since “it is an illness which does not let a minute peace to the Muslim community”, specific means that would help to reduce the rate of syphilis upsurge among local population, such as restrictions to the travel of strangers, were requested to be introduced from the

⁴⁶⁰ BOA *A.MKT.MHM.* 531/13 (1311 Muharrem 24/ 7 August 1893).

⁴⁶¹ See Kastamonu Vilayeti, 526.

⁴⁶² Ibid.

⁴⁶³ As excerpted from BOA *Y.PRK.UM.* 68/62 (1321 Zi'l-kade 26/ 31 Kanun-ı Sani 1319/ 13 February 1904).

central government.⁴⁶⁴ As mentioned previously, syphilis was attributed to be brought into Ottoman lands from outside and by outsiders. Here, it is once more claimed that it was a contagion travelled into the said locality from outside. The claims attuned by the provincial governor about the local upsurge of illness were xenophobic, however not completely since he also incorporated the undeniable contribution of native recruits. Yet, the source of illness was still perceived to be an outside one though the half of the intermitters was local folkmen.

With the draft of the regulation of 1899, certain trades were obliged to provide sanitary standards both for the service they provided and staff they employed. For instance barbers, wig makers and public bath keepers had to keep their establishments clean with respect to the scientific hygiene standards enlisted by the municipal organizations, and employ “healthy personnel”. Routine inspections and “certificates of propriety” which would be provided by physicians, whose diplomas were previously approved by Imperial Medical School, were means to keep up with these sanitary standards. Connected with these measures, the draft regulation also laid down the principle of severe correction and annulment from medical profession for the ones who were treating syphilitics without having expertise either in dermatology or about syphilis.⁴⁶⁵ This measure also targeted traditional healers that provided treatment for syphilis in general, and super cures and quick treatment for syphilitics in particular.

There was also a stipulation for the treatment towards women, who were claimed to be prostituting themselves, in the draft regulation. Their medical controls would be performed twice a month by a physician from the municipality division

⁴⁶⁴ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴⁶⁵ See *Kastamonu Vilayeti*, 525.

they lived in. The infected prostitutes had to be hospitalized and recorded into a specific registry. Unless completely treated, they would not be released from the hospitals they were interned. “These common women” would also be subject to regular health controls even after becoming completely free of infection.⁴⁶⁶ However, the local administration in Kastamonu had objections to this requirement, especially towards the registry system for prostitutes. They argued that prostitution was not a common practice, i.e., in specific quarters in Kastamonu province in contrast to the case of capital city and İzmir in the first place. In addition to this, there was no significant prostitution activity in Kastamonu which would require such registries. Thirdly, they believed that it would be improper to record the name, age, and residence details of the infected and “allegedly prostitute” women, since such a measure would stigmatize and condemn these women to prostitution eternally, therefore it would prevent them from “*ıslah-ı nefis*” (self discipline) in the long run.⁴⁶⁷

In September 1899, this draft regulation was amended by Dr.Von Düring. The amended version stated that population decline was a serious problem in Anatolia as proven by the statistics gathered from within. Such a population decline was claimed to put the state into serious jeopardy, and create serious concern for the administration. Due to these concerns, sultan had to issue a special decree to order the necessary and effective means to prevent syphilis infection. Dr. Von Düring also reported that at least 10 percent of whole population in Black Sea region was infected although there were intra-regional differences.⁴⁶⁸ After these, he went on to

⁴⁶⁶ Ibid.; also see Kastamonu’da, 205.

⁴⁶⁷ See BOA *Y.A. RES.* 99/32 (1316 Zi’l-kade 19/ 1315 Nisan 18/ 30 April 1899).

⁴⁶⁸ Ibid. For the process Dr.Von Düring prepared his report and its submission, also see BOA *Y.PRK.BŞK.* 60/18 (1317 Rebiyyü’l- evvel 24/ 2 August 1899).

enlist the necessary measures, and financial aspects of these measures; for example city of Kastamonu needed a new hospital to treat patients on long-term basis. The syphilis hospitals in Sinop, Bolu, Safranbolu and İnebolu were not in good state in terms of medical equipment and number of beds.⁴⁶⁹ The government of Kastamonu province supported these claims that previously established syphilis hospitals in their region could not properly treat the infected; they did not have sufficient *tahsisats* (appropriations) to run and renovate these hospitals.⁴⁷⁰

Dr.Von Düring proposed the establishment of additional hospitals in other towns in the region, such as in Ereğli, Bartın, and Düzce as well as Çorum though the latter was not in the administrative vicinity of Kastamonu province. Similar to the draft regulation of the year before, he urged the constitution of itinerant medical committees which would be responsible for field trips and inspections in the countryside “since people managed to escape from cities to countryside for avoiding compulsory hospitalization.”⁴⁷¹ Unauthorized, and non-specialist physicians together with traditional healers providing syphilis treatment was another problem Dr.Von Düring underlined among the amendments he made to the regulation.

Dr. Von Düring stated that there had to be at least nineteen physicians to perform itinerary field inspections, however there were only eleven expert physicians in the empire. This statement can also be read as the feedback on which Abdülhamid II’s special decree, which complained about the insufficiency, inefficiency and irresponsibility of newly graduated physicians, was built in March 1899. Five physicians from among the eleven specialists available in the capital city had already

⁴⁶⁹ BOA Y.A. RES. 99/32 (1316 Zi’l-kade 19/ 1315 Nisan 18/ 30 April 1899).

⁴⁷⁰ BOA Y.PRK.UM. 48/3 1317 Cemaziyyü’l-evvel 23/ 1315 eylül 17/ 29 September 1899).

⁴⁷¹ BOA Y.A.RES. 99/32 (1316 Zi’l-kade 19/ 1315 Nisan 18/ 30 April 1899).

been sent to Kastamonu as he reported; however the medical establishments and the epidemical status of the illness in countryside required at least eight more physicians. Among other urgent needs regarding infrastructure for a successful struggle with syphilis, he reported the situation of ongoing hospital constructions and material needs of the already established hospitals.⁴⁷² Dr. Von Düring kept reporting to the central administration about the financial problems regarding construction work of syphilis hospitals through telegraphs when he was in Kastamonu.⁴⁷³ Finally, he also opted for syphilis inspections in Konya and Ankara provinces, and the medicines that would be provided for the patients in general.⁴⁷⁴

A special decree dated 31 March 1901 emphasized the importance and decisiveness of the meager but accomplished medical measures in Kastamonu province. According to this decree, “more than 3000 people were diagnosed with syphilis, and treated in the region”, and if introduced, similar measures such as building of syphilis hospitals and appointment of itinerant physicians into other regions “would bring the same benefit as suggested by Dr. Von Düring.”⁴⁷⁵ The sultan, therefore, requested from the liable ones to keep building syphilis hospitals in other areas where syphilis was an endemic illness.⁴⁷⁶

Ottoman press also provided commentaries over syphilis and epidemics in Anatolia in the decades between late 1890s and 1900s. An article published in *Tanin*

⁴⁷²“the construction of projected syphilis hospitals must be immediately completed since they are significant means to serve public good and realize the requirements of struggle against the illness” as excerpted from BOA *H.I.* 3 (1318 Şaban 29/ 22 December 1900)

⁴⁷³ “since the required allotments for the construction works could not be provided on regular basis, the construction of hospitals has nearly come to a halt” as excerpted from BOA *H.I.* 3 (1318 Şaban 29/ 22 December 1900).

⁴⁷⁴ BOA Y.A.RES. 99/32 (1316 Zi'l-kade 19/ 1315 Nisan 18/ 30 April 1899).

⁴⁷⁵ See BOA *H.I.* 18 (1318 Zi'l-hicce 10/31 March 1901).

⁴⁷⁶ Ibid.

deliberated the case of Kastamonu province that although state sought variety of solutions for the epidemic, neither fundamental nor sound results were achieved between 1890 and 1914.⁴⁷⁷ The financial difficulties of the central government were suggested as the prime reason for this failure; the case of unaccomplished hospital projects of the Directory of Public Health was the result of lack of appropriations both at local and central level. It was also reported that already established hospitals were closed down due to same financial difficulties. The article also pointed out the reaction of people against the syphilis regulation; despite the fact that regulation was an interventionist one with mediums such as health certificate prior to marriage, and compulsory hospitalization of the infected, people managed to defy it. Especially medical control over women proved ineffectual since examinations could be performed only superficially, and detection of the illness became nearly impossible. Patients also rejected the medication although it was free of charge; the medicines were bitter and imposed serious side effects that made the illness more visible. Therefore, a very little progress was achieved.⁴⁷⁸

The situation in eastern Anatolian provinces around 1890s was also worth to be discussed. A survey conducted in 1886 revealed that half of the patients in the Military Hospital of Erzurum were suffering from syphilis. In addition to these urban syphilitics, there was a considerable number of infected in the countryside. Akin to the anti-syphilis policies implemented in Kastamonu province, the foundation of special hospitals for syphilitics were opted and a special health committee was formed to determine the strategies against syphilis. It was decided that three expert physicians and three pharmacists per each hospital which would be built in Erzurum

⁴⁷⁷ See Kalkan, 78.

⁴⁷⁸ Ibid.

and its counties would be enough to regulate the epidemics. The appointment of an additional itinerant physician was also suggested to carry out the inspection trips in the countryside. The aforesaid health committee was constituted under the directives of the Chief Physician of the Military Hospital, and projected to launch monthly reports about the course and scope of illness in the region. These reports were to be addressed to the central administration. However, financial bankruptcy both at provincial and central levels made the fulfillment of the enlisted aspirations difficult; the proceedings of the Council of Ministers dated 29 August 1886 reveals that hospitals established for the syphilitics in Erzurum province were able to treat only the destitute and poor syphilitics due to capacity problems. The Council of Ministers, therefore recommended the local administration to implement a policy which would treat syphilitics for whom beds could not be arranged, at their homes instead of providing financial assets for increasing the number of beds at the hospitals.⁴⁷⁹ In the following year it became utterly impossible to meet the construction costs of projected syphilis hospitals in Erzincan and Bayburt within Erzurum. The central administration was well aware of the problem, and solely for the 1887-1888 years, they decided to cover these costs from the annual budget of the Ministry of Interior.⁴⁸⁰ Although the reserve of appropriation for extraordinary expenditures from the annual budget of the Ministry of Interior was utilized to support these constructions for a year, the projected hospital could not be accomplished in the

⁴⁷⁹ See BOA *MV* 11/97 (1303 Zi'l-hicce 29/ 1302 Ağustos 17/ 29 Ağustos 1886).

⁴⁸⁰ BOA *MV* 21/5 (1304 Ramazan 28/ 1303 Haziran 8/ 20 June 1887).

following seven years.⁴⁸¹ This failure to establish projected hospitals was crucial since syphilis remained an unresolved problem in the region.⁴⁸²

While having difficulties to treat syphilitics and curb infection in the medium of hospitals due to unaccomplished hospital constructions, the local administration in Erzurum also had problems regarding the control over prostitution to prevent epidemical syphilis. Having alarmed by the widespread symptoms of syphilis among the recruits, three military physicians from the Military Hospital of Erzurum prepared a report which was subsequently submitted to the Commander in Chief in Erzurum. The report stated that every single soldier in the troops stationed in Erzurum was medically examined and at least three percent of these were found to be infected with not only syphilis but also gonorrhea. When these findings were compared to the previous figures regarding the amount of syphilitic troopers, it appeared that there was a decline. Though declined, syphilis and other venereal diseases were still a problem creating disorder among the troopers, and certain necessary measures had to be taken to eradicate them completely. The regulation and medical surveillance over prostitutes was one of these necessary measures according to this report. It argued that there were remarkable numbers of streetwalkers in the city that majority of these were infected with syphilis. These street walking prostitutes were deemed responsible to contract the disease to the conscripts placed in the city. Hence the report urged the immediate clearance of these streetwalkers from the streets of the city “for the sake of health and safety of society.”⁴⁸³ The physicians who prepared the report also recommended the establishment of brothels

⁴⁸¹ BOA *Y.PRK.MYD 17/24* (1313 Cemaziyyü'l-evvel 13/ 1311 Teşrin-i Evvel 20/ 1 November 1895).

⁴⁸² Ibid.

⁴⁸³ As excerpted from *ibid.*

in a suitable quarter of the city of Erzurum so that routine medical controls could be done over prostitutes, however there is no evidence about whether this proposal was accomplished or not.

Around 1900s, *Ahlat*, one of the provincial districts in *Bitlis*, experienced a serious population decline due to syphilis and alarmed the authorities. Local administrators informed the Ministry of Interior, which subsequently reported the case to the Ministry of Military Schools. The Military Medical School therefore decided to appoint a physician to handle syphilis epidemics in Ahlat after deliberations. Ahlat did not even have a municipal physician, and this made the situation more detrimental for the public health. Not surprisingly, the salary payments of the projected appointee became problematical; central administration ordered that the physician's salary had to be paid from the local administration's budget while the latter claimed that they were unable to do it. The budget of neither Ahlat nor other municipalities in the province was able to pay the salary of this physician. The local administration claimed that they were requesting once more from the central administration to do it since they knew that the latter provided this financial support for other regions.⁴⁸⁴ The outcome of this controversy regarding the salary payment and appointment of the physician remained unknown since archival evidence for the following stages has not been reached. However, the case of Ahlat is essential to underline once more the effectiveness and will of Ottoman administration both at central and local levels. Although they really willed to prevent syphilis epidemics, their projected and sometimes commenced preventive attempts were encumbered by financial difficulties.

⁴⁸⁴ See BOA *DH.TMIK-S 45/4* (1321 Safer 4/ 1319 Nisan 19/ 2 May 1903).

Although medical measures such as building syphilis hospitals and employing full time and itinerary physicians in Eastern Anatolia failed, the provincial administration managed to provide the statistical representation of the amount of syphilitics in the region. The measure of compiling monthly statistics regarding the amount of deaths, births, marriages as well as death reasons in provinces had already been introduced as early as 1836 onwards.⁴⁸⁵ In 1880s, the Ministry of Medicine requested from the ministry of Interior to launch the preparation of monthly statistics and reports about the amount of syphilitics in provincial areas. For instance, local public health committee in Erzurum provided a statistical table demonstrating the amount of syphilitics in the region, and this was submitted to the Ministry of Health in 1887.⁴⁸⁶ Similarly, the county of *Muş*, which was in the administrative vicinity of Bitlis province, also sent a report stating the number of people infected with syphilis.⁴⁸⁷

Syphilis was also an incessant public health problem in *Domaniç*, a northwestern rural community in the vicinity of Ertuğrul County.⁴⁸⁸ Thanks to the measure which initiated the preparation of routine reports and statistical representations regarding syphilis epidemics by provincial administrations, central administration was once more informed about this case. In this document, syphilis was defined as an illness “which was injurious for religious, moral, economic and political respects, and therefore a great care had to be taken towards the

⁴⁸⁵ See BOA *C.DH.* 5424 (29 Receb 1253); also see chapter 2.

⁴⁸⁶ See BOA *DH.MKT.* 1460/30 (1305 Safer 16/ 1303 Teşrin-i Evvel 22/3 november 1887). This document is actually a cover letter which reveals the preparation and subsequent submission of statistics, therefore the actual figures and statistical table could not be found in the directory. These figures must be in the specific achive of the Ministry of Health, which has been under classification process and has not been opened yet for research.

⁴⁸⁷ BOA *DH.MKT* 1461/55 (1305 Safer 21/ 1303 Teşrin-i Evvel 27/ 8 November 1887).

⁴⁸⁸ BOA *H.I.* 26 (1319 Zi'l-kade 11/ 16 February 1902).

implementation of preventive measures against it in the region.”⁴⁸⁹ Briefly, syphilis was represented as an illness which impaired not only physical health of the Ottoman peoples, but their outfit as well. As will be discussed in the medium of advice genre, syphilis boils and sores were claimed to be detrimental for one to perform his religious duties which required ritual cleaning. In order to be ritually clean, one ought to have a healthy and clean body, where bodily fluids were under control.⁴⁹⁰ The participation to daily prayers and Friday prayer at the temple required to be healthy, and the tight police administration must have informed Abdülhamid II, who was well known about his approach to religion and the primary function he attached to it *vis- à- vis* the rising separatist minority nationalisms. Syphilis had already been suggested to be specifically widespread among the Muslim masses⁴⁹¹, and due to its contribution to population decline, it was again perceived as a political and economic problem which had been impairing the economic and demographic primacy of Muslims, which became crucial for the administration in the wake of ethno-religious conflicts characterized the era. All in all, Abdülhamid II ordered Meclis-i Mahsus to deliberate the introduction of preventive measures for the said region during their meeting on the same day.⁴⁹²

The controversy regarding the effectiveness of available and new medicine and treatment methods was another argument regarding syphilis in the empire. For

⁴⁸⁹ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁴⁹⁰ See Julie Marcus, *A World of Difference. Islam and Gender Hierarchy in Turkey*, (London: Zed Boks, 1992), 76-81; Ayşe Saraçgil, *Bukalemun Erkek; Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nde Ataerkil Yapılar ve Modern Edebiyat*, (İstanbul: İletişim, 2005), 40-43 for ritual cleaning in Islam.

⁴⁹¹ See documents BOA *C.SH. 1324* (6 Cemaziyyü'l-ahir 1267/ 8 April 1851) for syphilis epidemic in Iyöröna which spreaded mainly among Muslims and BOA *Y.PRK.UM. 68/62* (1321 Zi'l-kade 26/ 31 Kanun-ı Sani 1319/ 13 February 1904) which accounted the frequency of syphilis among Muslims in Hüdavendigâr province.

⁴⁹² BOA *H.I. 26* (1319 Zi'l-kade 11/ 16 February 1902).

example, some of the physicians and dermatologists believed that a syphilis vaccine similar to the process by which smallpox vaccine was obtained could be possible.⁴⁹³ A memorandum, dated 17 March 1899 revealed that syphilis was also an ongoing problem in Bağdad, together with other provinces in Anatolia.⁴⁹⁴ Parallel to the medical measures in Anatolia, medical authorities in Bağdad started to implement free medication around 1900. As previously referred, *salvarsan* (arsphenamine) was developed as a new medication for syphilis in 1909. Nizameddin Bey, who used to work as a member of the Council of Civil Medicine and Public Health then appointed to Bağdad as an inspector –general of health presented his case study regarding test trials of salvarsan on syphilitics in Bağdad.⁴⁹⁵ He demanded to be authorized to use this new medicine legitimately since he found out that the medicine had good results. He also recommended the utilization of this medicine in Kastamonu province, where syphilis had been incessantly occurring. However, deliberations took place among the experts in Ministry of Medicine and Interior as well as General Inspectorship of Kastamonu Syphilis Hospitals and they rejected Dr. Nizameddin Bey's claim. The reason for the central health administrators' rejection of this proposal was related to the nature of the medicine. They believed that the benefits of this newly improved medicine had not been fully approved by the European medical experts, there were even disagreements about its positive impact.⁴⁹⁶ Dr. Nizameddin Bey was given permission to carry out his research as

⁴⁹³ See Besim Ömer, "Frengi Hakkında Tecarib-i Cedide-yi Fenniye", in idem., *Nevsal-i Afîyet* 4, (İstanbul: Ahmet İhsan ve Şürekası, 1322/1906-1907), 482-483.

⁴⁹⁴ See BOA *H.I.* 8 (1316 Zi'l kade 5/ 17 March 1899).

⁴⁹⁵ See BOA *DH.ID.* 55/44 1330 Rebiyyü'l-evvel 6/ 24 February 1912). Dr. Nizameddin Bey's case study was submitted to the Ministry of Interior, then to the Ministry of Medicine and General Inspectorship of Kastamonu Syphilis Hospitals on 16 January 1912.

⁴⁹⁶ As excerpted from *ibid*

long as he worked over- cautiously. It can be said depending upon this evidence that Ottoman administration was well aware of the problematic reaction of the masses to the syphilis regulation in general and renovative treatment measures, which would also be applied compulsorily, in particular. They probably did not want to harm the already meager and problematical obedience that people showed to the regulation. Finally, they wanted to see scientific proofs regarding salvarsan, a medicine whose contribution towards the treatment of syphilis had been contested from the beginning.

Between late 1880s and 1900s, Ottoman administration tried to introduce modern means of syphilis treatment and yet curbed by financial difficulties. Even under the impact of serious financial bankruptcy, they tried to universalize preventive measures against syphilis across the empire. Up until 1896, Ottoman peoples had to rely on traditional means of treatment such as mercurial ointment, and incenses prepared by traditional healers.⁴⁹⁷ It was inevitable for Ottoman administration to deal with traditional and counterfeit healers while trying to introduce coercive and preventive measures about syphilis. For example, two cases about counterfeit and unlicensed healers are worth citing in terms of Ottoman administration's sensitivity towards the issue. The first case was about two persons named Muhammed Ali of Safranbolu and Hakkı bin Abdi of *Çirpan*, who were found to be practicing dentistry, surgery, blood-letting, and healing syphilis, in a store which sold coffee and wigs around *Ağa Camii*, Beyoğlu. Officers from the Sixth Division of Metropolitan Municipality noticed, and then arrested them during their routine controls in the region. They were prohibited to practice aforesaid

⁴⁹⁷ See Muhammed Sa'ad, "Kastamonu-Bolu Hastaneleri ve Seyyar Etıbbası Müfettiş-i Umumiliğinden Vürud Eden 1330 Senesi Raporudur", *Sıhhiye Mecmuası*, 2/3 (1331): 202-206.

activities and released on heavy bail.⁴⁹⁸ The second case related to one Bogos, who was practicing treatment for venereal diseases, again in a coffeeshop on *Arabacı Street* around Ağa Camii, Beyoğlu.⁴⁹⁹ Similarly, he was proscribed to practice treatments, and subjected to bail. It was not surprising to find counterfeit and traditional healers who predominantly provided cheap and supposedly quick treatments in an area which was close to the brothels, crowded, full of cheap inns for city migrants and center of attraction for people, basically for bachelors.

People who utilized the counterfeit physicians' treatment also complained to the magistrates. For example, Hüseyin Efendi, who worked as a court crier in Üsküdar, consulted Aşçı Çavuş for treatment of gonorrhea. Aşçı Çavuş had been active in business at a store opposite to *Garb Kapusu* Police Department.⁵⁰⁰ Having taken the remedy Aşçı Çavuş provided, his illness became severe and he showed symptoms of poisoning. He was finally brought to a real expert physician. The store Aşçı Çavuş ran was inspected and sealed not to be open anymore, and he became liable to the correction prescribed in law.⁵⁰¹

Syphilis and gonorrhea could be a reason for a state employee to be fired for the possibility of contracting the disease to the close environment he was working within. A case from the year 1897 is quite interesting for this dimension that a police officer named Mustafa Efendi accidentally found to be syphilitic while he was performing a routine security check in one of the dockyards of the capital city. He was forwarded to *Habshane-yi Umumiye Hastahanesi*, and an investigation was

⁴⁹⁸ BOA ZB 40/41 (1323.03.12/ 6Rebiyyü'l-ahir 1325/ 6 May 1323/19 May 1907).

⁴⁹⁹ BOA ZB 21/89 (1323 Cemaziyü'l-evvel 2/ 31 May 1323/13 June 1907).

⁵⁰⁰ BOA ZB 40/38 (1325 Rebiyyü'l- evvel 9/ 1323 Nisan 16/ 29 April 1907).

⁵⁰¹ Ibid.

initiated to decide “whether his ties with the police had to be severed or not”.⁵⁰² The Ministry of Police decided that “since Mustafa Efendi’s illness was a contagious one which could relapse again and again, it would not be proper to allow him to work as a police officer”.⁵⁰³ As a syphilitic police officer, Mustafa Efendi was not an exception. A memorandum dated 9 September 1909 and written from the office of Mümtaz Nuri Bey, the Director of İstanbul Police School, revealed that gonorrhea was quite widespread among the students of the Police School. As the memorandum argues, the students got the contagion from the brothels around Beyoğlu which they kept visiting during their weekend holidays.⁵⁰⁴ This document is crucial for two respects; firstly it demands an amendment in the school’s regulation that “the infected officer candidates’ moral grades had to be lowered when they found infected for the first time, and if they got infected again after being cured they had to be dismissed from the school.”⁵⁰⁵ The director also believed that the said illness impaired the moral standing of these police candidates which was totally unacceptable for an occupation destined to provide social order. Secondly, the presence of gonorrhea contagion attributed to the ineffectiveness of the municipal physicians that they failed to accomplish their routine medical inspections on brothels. The memorandum concluded that the liable administrative units and their personnel had to be “warned to examine brothels and prostitutes properly and regularly so that infirmities could be avoided.”⁵⁰⁶ It is unclear whether the projected amendment in school regulation was accomplished or not, however this evidence is

⁵⁰² As excerpted from BOA ZB 62/39 (31 T 1313/ 25 August 1897).

⁵⁰³ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁵⁰⁴ BOA DH.EUM.THR. 3/1 (1327 Şaban 23/ 9 September 1909).

⁵⁰⁵ As excerpted from *ibid.*

⁵⁰⁶ As excerpted from *ibid.*

still crucial for understanding how venereal diseases became infiltrating into different segments in society and how they were not reserved for specific lower social order groups such as prostitutes, the destitute and peasants.

Between 1850s and 1900s, syphilis became a multi-dimensional health disorder for Ottoman administration. Due to its quantitative and qualitative impacts over population, it was perceived as a serious encumbrance for the outfit and might of Ottoman society and state.⁵⁰⁷ In the medium of syphilis, repressive means were utilized to discipline different social groups in the empire; prostitutes were disciplined and prostitution activity became “legitimately” regulated. Though medical regulation over prostitution became one of the vital means for fighting with the syphilis contagion, financial difficulties and reaction from people prevented it to be fully accomplished as it was projected. Compulsory medical controls over army conscripts and bachelors from areas which were deemed to be the cradle of illness and long-term hospital confinements of the infected were all repressive and disciplinary measures of the anti-syphilis regulation. The most important instrument of these interventionist implementations were lock hospitals, and these hospitals were utilized thanks to the effort of medical professionals, magistrates of municipal and police administration, and community leaders such as hocas and imams that all of whom were held responsible to detect, record and report the ill.

The moral dimension of the illness imprinted itself to the prevention and treatment policies even at the early stages of projection that the contagion was believed to be brought outside by outsiders, and the connotation of outside-outsider changed over time. For example syphilis was deemed to be contracted by *Frenks*,

⁵⁰⁷ “ kuvve-i umumiyyeyi ve devlet- i aliyyeyi taht-ı tehdidde bulunduran illet-i efrençi” as excerpted from BOA Y.A.RES. 99/32 1316 Zi'l-kade 19/ 1315 Nisan 18/30 April 1899).

foreign prostitutes, refugees from Russian Empire, then by sailors from coastal areas, bachelors, army recruits returning home and migrant workers.

These groups, in turn, were tried to be disciplined and intervened by eager medical measures, however financial difficulties at local and central level made them difficult to be accomplished. People, who were objectified in the medium of anti-syphilis policies, also resisted against these measures. Especially long term confinement to lock hospitals and prolonged treatment in general motivated them to find ways they could evade the regulations. As a result, they got married clandestinely, or fled from the areas where regulation was in force, rejecting prescribed and freely provided drugs as well as making medical inspections difficult, i.e. causing or demanding cursory medical examinations if the patient was a female, or simply refusing whatever they confronted. When financial boundaries of nearly bankrupted polity combined with a set of moral, religious and traditional reactions from the masses as well as limits of the available medical treatment methods of the period, there is hardly any other way to define Ottoman anti-syphilis regulation except the following: well projected but financially non-feasible one.

3.5.4. Syphilis in the Ottoman Advice Genre

It is argued in the preceding section that in late 1880s, Ottoman administration had to take preventive measures to eradicate and curb the extend of syphilis in the countryside since it caused population decline, disorder for army discipline and injured fighting capacity of armed men. These were clearly the negative influences of illness on the physical outfit and production capacity of subject people. As

previously argued, it became even probable for imperial household to be contracted with the contagion by means of hired maids and concubines. Around 1900s, as a supplementary attempt towards preventive precautions, pamphlets, books and newspaper articles started to be published so that people would be informed about the causes, course, spread and the treatment of illness.⁵⁰⁸ For the same end, charity institutions, and physicians who had expertise and experience about fight against syphilis were encouraged to partake in organizing panels and publishing simple but instructive pieces for the masses. Since prostitution had been deemed the prime cause of the spread of syphilis, charitable organizations were promoted by the Ottoman administration in the medium of anti-syphilis regulation to open workshops so that women could earn their living respectably.⁵⁰⁹

Firstly, the articles, commentaries and scientific treatises, and pamphlets on syphilis elaborated certain points which were either visited passingly or non present in the scope of anti-syphilis regulations put in force. Secondly, these works aimed to sustain regulations by providing practical instructions to the target population and agents, who were liable to enforce the preventive measures. Thirdly, they also provided information on the informal dimension of syphilis epidemics since they were written by literary figures who had a critical outlook, and area specialists who reported the reactions to, and the impact of the regulations in force.

The information and instruction on syphilis, its course and impact as well as its causes were not solely provided by distinct conduct books on syphilis. The issue

⁵⁰⁸ For example, between 1870s and 1910s, twelve different medical books and treatises on syphilis were published in the Ottoman Empire that this number constitutes 23 percent among all publications regarding contagious diseases. For details see Adnan Ataç, “Milli Kütüphane’de Bulunan Eski (Arap) Harfli Türkçe Basılı Tıp Kitapları”, In *IV. Tıp Tarihi Kongresi: Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler, İstanbul, 18-20 Eylül 1996*, (Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 2003), 270-273.

⁵⁰⁹ See Kastamonu’da, 205-206.

of syphilis was visited as an illness among other contagious diseases in the medium of advice genre that aimed to instruct and recuperate Ottoman-Muslim marriage and Ottoman peoples as males and females. Majority of these treatises on marriage and family had either specific sections on syphilis or they handled the issues of infection, prevention from infection and impacts of syphilis in chapters regarding marital sexuality, procreation, familial health, and morality. Although all of them aimed to inform and create a disciplinary-behavioural scheme in the medium syphilis, moral claims of some of these works were stronger than the others’.

Though there were earlier Ottoman treatises on syphilis, such as Hayatizâde Mustafa Feyzi Efendi’s (1643-1693) *Risâle-i Maraz-ı Efrenci*⁵¹⁰, it became a systematically handled public health problem in the medium of advice genre beginning from 1870s onwards. The earliest reference to syphilis in the nineteenth century advice genre made by Edhem İbrahim Paşa (1818-1893).⁵¹¹ Edhem İbrahim Paşa incorporated the issue of syphilis into his book on child discipline along with another health disorder, smallpox. His treatise was the first, but at the same a significant one since he elaborated both the illness and the ways by which it was contracted;

⁵¹⁰ This treatise was written by Hayatizâde Mustafa Feyzi, a court physician to Mehmet IV, by making use of sixteenth century venereologists such as Grilomo Frocastro (1483-1553). He talked about mercury treatment in this treatise. For details see Sina Akşin, ed., *Türkiye Tarihi 3: Osmanlı Devleti, 1600-1908*, (İstanbul: Cem Yayınları, 2000), 321.

⁵¹¹ He was born in *Sakız* (Chios) as a member Greek-Orthodox family, but adopted and became one of the young members of Koca Mehmet Hüsrev Paşa’s entourage in 1820s when uprisings and public disorder broke out in the island. He was one of the first four Ottomans who were sent to study in Paris in 1827. He was a contemporary of Louis Pasteur, however he studied mining engineering at Sorbonne. Although he started to work as an expert on mining in Anatolia, he was transferred to various levels of Ottoman central bureaucracy such as chair in *Encümen-i Daniş*, and The Council of Tanzimat, deputy in Ministries of Interior, Foreign Affairs, Commerce, Public Works and Justice, and Ambassador of Vienna during his career. He served as a grand vizier between 1877-1878 after Midhat Paşa was discharged from this office. He was the father two important figures for late Ottoman history; Osman Hamdi Bey and Halil Ethem Bey. He wrote two books on child discipline titled as follows: *Terbiye ve Talim-i Adâb ve Nezayihü’l Etfal*, (Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı Yayınları, c1979) and *Terbiye-i Etfal Risalesi*.

Frengi [syphilis] is a contagious and terrible illness, which initially appears as boils similar to pimples and rashes around the face and private parts of one. Then it extends into other areas [on the body]. If a person afflicted with this disease does not consult a physician and have himself treated immediately, the boils of syphilis expand into his mouth, tongue, nasal passages, forehead and inguinal [...] [Then these boils] destroy his muscles, and cause his nose to plunge. It devastates his brain and weakens his reasoning, and finally grows him deaf. There are lots of people who lost their uvulas and private parts due to syphilis.⁵¹²

Edhem İbrahim Paşa wanted to clarify the symptoms of illness which were quite often confused by other skin diseases. For example, *şark çıbanı* (*leishmania tropica*; Aleppo boil) was also a widespread skin disease among Ottoman people that syphilis boils were often mistaken as *şark çıbanı*. Moreover, as Nuri Bin Ömer⁵¹³ reported, syphilis was known and confused with other illnesses such as *külleme*, *çiçek*, *kötü yara* and *emraz*.⁵¹⁴ Physicians and polemicist who wrote on syphilis later in the periods would try their best to distinguish syphilis and syphilis boils from other skin sores for the masses.

Edhem İbrahim Paşa's advising manner and descriptive approach also governed literature on syphilis in Ottoman society. His work, *Terbiye-i Etfal Risalesi*, was written in the form of an advising monologue addressed to a son, and provided both moral and medical hints;

⁵¹² Edhem İbrahim Paşa, 96.

⁵¹³ Also called Ömer Nuri Bey. It proved impossible to locate information about Ömer Nuri Bey except for the fact that he worked as an itinerant physician in Hüdavendigâr province in 1900s. He was probably one of the physicians trained by Dr.Von Düring and the expert team he trained in Imperial Medical School or School of civil Medicine. He wrote two books, which were referred in the preceding chapter.

⁵¹⁴ Nuri Bin Ömer, *Frengi Risalesi*, *İstılahat-ı*, 2.

O my dearest, there is no doubt for the infectiousness of syphilis. Since the victims of syphilis gained their illness through touching, and contacting their private parts with the ill, you should not ever approach and lay a hand on a person whose illness is obvious. [and] you should not have anything to do with a syphilitic one, therefore keep away from them. Do not ever use their belongings. Listen to me, stay away from syphilitics. Do not injure and waste your body in the youth.⁵¹⁵

Majority of the authors commenced their treatises on syphilis by defining what kind of illness it was. Nuri Bin Ömer reported “syphilis, is an extremely dreadful illness, which poisons whole blood circulation and body of individual.”⁵¹⁶ Similarly, Hüseyin Remzi defined it “one of the most disastrous illnesses in the world which impairs human beings.”⁵¹⁷ He informed his readers through making analogies between other contagious diseases, such as cholera and plague which dominated the lives of Ottoman people for long. However, syphilis was more catastrophic for him ; since it did not immediately end the life of the body it was inflicted on like plague and cholera, and “destroys the body of the infected and natural conditions of human race in a pitiable manner”.⁵¹⁸ For Celaleddin Muhtar (1865-1947)⁵¹⁹, an expert

⁵¹⁵ Ibid. , 97-98.

⁵¹⁶ Nuri Bin Ömer, *Frenji risalesi, İstilahat-ı*, 2.

⁵¹⁷ Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-ı Sıhhat-i Müteahhileyn*, 105-107.

⁵¹⁸ Ibid.

⁵¹⁹ He was born in İstanbul and entered into military School of Medicine in 1881. He was graduated from this school in 1887 and started to work in the Institute of Rabies and Bacteriology (Dersaadet Darülkelb ve Bakteriyoloji Ameliyyathanesi). In order to replace the position Dr. Von Düring left, he was sent to Paris to be further trained. In Paris, he worked with famous bacteriologists and syphiologists of the time such as Philippe Ricord (1800-1890) and Alfred Fournier (1832-1914), Emilie Vidal (1825-1893), Ernest Besnier (1851-1909) F.H. Hallopeau (1842-1919) and Jean Darier (1856-1938). He also worked in St. Louis hospital, which was a well-known hospital for syphilis treatment. He partook in the First International Congress of Dermatology in 1889, then became a member of Association of French Dermatology and Syphiology in 1892. After he returned from Paris, he was appointed to instruct Dermatology and Syphilis in both of the medical schools in Ottoman capital, and kept lecturing in different institutions such as Haydapaşa and Kadirga Hospitals. He became the Inspector General of Ottoman Red Crescent Association, then Minister of Commissariat (İaşe Nazırı) in the cabinet of Ahmet İzzet Paşa. He had several publications about dermatology and syphilis in Ottoman-Turkish and French. For details, see Ekrem Kadri Unat, “Müderrris Dr.

physician on syphilology, the social impacts of the illness became more crucial. He defined syphilis as a disaster which destroys not only individual, but also “wellbeing of society in which that [syphilitic] individual lives, on constant basis.”⁵²⁰

The descriptions of symptoms and consequences of infection were also remarkable; for instance, being the worst among all illnesses, it destroys “one’s uvula, nose, lips and eyes one by one. It causes one to go insane, it blinds and grows one deaf.”⁵²¹ Moreover, strokes, numbness and loss of speech were susceptible to syphilis.⁵²² “Rotten bones”, “devastated kidneys, heart and nerves” were altogether consequences of syphilis on health.⁵²³ Villagers were represented to fail in attributing strokes and paralysis, which were quite common among them, to syphilis. “Regrettably”, as Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey⁵²⁴ reported, “they [villagers] bring [these] persons, into verse readers (*okuyucular*) or *hocas*.”⁵²⁵ “Stinking and inflaming discharges from sores” were also the troubles of syphilis inflicted on the body of the ill that they prevented one from proper worship and descent social relationship with

Celeleddin Muhtar Özden,” In *III.Tıp Tarihi Kongresi: Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler, İstanbul, 20-23 Eylül 1993*, (Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1999), 9-24.

⁵²⁰ Celeleddin Muhtar, *Frengi ve*, 1.

⁵²¹ Nuri bin Ömer, *Frengi Risalesi*, *İstilahat-ı*, 11; also see Ahmed Said, *Hıfz-u Sıhhat-i İzdivac ve Tenasil*, (İstanbul: 1892-1893), 46 about information over loss of organs due to infection.

⁵²² Ibid.; also see

⁵²³ Ibid.

⁵²⁴ It proved impossible to locate birth and death rates of Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey. However, we know that he served as a physician at İnebolu Syphilis Hospital in Kastamonu province. Later, he became General Inspector of Health. Apart from medicine, his main interests were Islam ,Turkish language and language reform. In addition to his book cited below, he also wrote a book titled *Hakikat-i İslam*. He was one of the members of *Türk Derneği* in 1910s. He was also among the organizers of Sultanahmet Mitingi, which protested the occupation of İzmir by Greeks on 30 May 1919.

⁵²⁵ Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, *Frengi İlleti Hakkında Herkese elzem Olan Muamelat*, (İstanbul: Asır Matbaası, 1317/ 1901-1902), 16.

other people.⁵²⁶ It was also claimed that syphilis triggered other illnesses, which were “hidden in the blood”, such as tuberculosis, to develop and become serious.⁵²⁷ Requiring long and intricate treatment, syphilis was portrayed as one of the most dangerous bodily and social malady that could be transferred to generation to generation.⁵²⁸ Some of the writers also instructed their readers about the pathology of illness that it was caused by “microbes”, or “poisons” called viruses, which could be contracted through sexual intercourse.⁵²⁹ However, almost all of them revealed that syphilis was primarily contracted through illegitimate intercourses with prostitutes.⁵³⁰ Syphilis infection in the aftermath of “illegitimate” intercourses, mainly taking place in early periods of life, i.e. initial years of puberty, was also treated in the context of marriage as well. Accordingly, brothels and the prostitutes body were represented as the prime beds of “contamination” although there were other ways to be infected. Some of these claims are worth to be cited;

[...] the prime symptoms of syphilis are boils, red blemishes, and sores appear at the edge of male genitalia after having sex with an evil woman [prostitute]. Disgusting boils and ulcers also emerge on face and legs as well as boils [tumors] in brain and liver. General paralysis and dying in griping pains were the results of such intercourses.⁵³¹

⁵²⁶ “It prevents one from worship since inflammation from sores and boils require ritual ablution in every time, and illness causes indolence therefore one cannot worship” as excerpted from *ibid.*, 7.

⁵²⁷ *Ibid.*

⁵²⁸ “it not only ruins one’s life, but also spoils his/ her descent” as excerpted from Nuri Bin Ömer, 2, 11. Also see Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivaç*,

⁵²⁹ Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-ı Sıhhat-ı Mütehhileyn*, 101-102; also see Milaslı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 28.

⁵³⁰ See *ibid.*, 98,107; Nusred Fuad, 31-32, 87-88; Ahmed Midhat, *Musahabe-i Leyliye; Teehhiil*, (İstanbul: Kırkambar Matbaası, 1307/1891-1892), 24; Ahmed Said, 46,54; Milaslı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 22; Melikzâde Fuad, *Vezaif-i Beytiyyeden*, 92.

⁵³¹ Nuri Bin Ömer, 4-8.

[...] majority of syphilis infections caused by sexual intercourse with women performed in brothels. Men who commit illegitimate sex always get caught to this terrible disease.⁵³²

If a healthy man have sex with a syphilitic prostitute, the body parts by which he touched to the syphilis contagion turn black and a small boil appears in the following two to three days.⁵³³

Bachelors gratify their sexual urges with women who exchange their honor in return for money or the ones who make use of their chastity for bodily pleasures. But majority of bachelors prefer prostitutes who are the commodities of brothels. Syphilis lays its devastating clutches on nearly all of these in brothels that they become lethal and sufferers.

Syphilis certainly catches the ones who roam along the path of prostitution and illegitimacy⁵³⁴

[...] bachelors throw themselves into the world of wickedness and become subject to numerous contagious diseases.[...]

And it is undeniably proven that alcoholism, syphilis, gonorrhea, tuberculosis, insanity, murders and suicides are altogether present in the world of prostitution. The health of prostitutes is eternally destroyed [...] and their customers' health are under constant threat. One should consider the health conditions of people, who inherited syphilis in brothels when they are interned in dermatology clinics of hospitals. God have mercy! What a miserable scene is that! Some of them lost their eyes, some others their noses and arms! It is impossible to be not dreaded when exposed to these miserable.⁵³⁵

As revealed by the quotes above , a vocabulary of thrill was also utilized while the connection between syphilis and prostitution was drawn. In other words, a remarkable degree of condemnation put into practice through this thrilling vocabulary that both syphilis and prostitution became the yardstick of being outcasts. In short, syphilis was a moral degradation regarding its connection with prostitution in the medium of Ottoman advice genre.

⁵³² As excerpted from *ibid.*, 4-5.

⁵³³ As excerpted from Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-ı Sıhhat-ı Müteahhileyn* , 106-107.

⁵³⁴ As excerpted from Ahmed Said, 46, 54.

⁵³⁵ As excerpted from Nusred Fu'ad, 31-32; 87-88.

The contraction issue was not solely reduced to the syphilitic body of the prostitute. In order to prevent its consequent and extended spread, other forms of infection were also laid down for better informing the public.⁵³⁶ For instance infection with inanimate objects such as pots and plates, cups and glasses, cutlery, baby bottles, cigarettes, and mouthpieces of water pipes, toothbrushes and *misvaks*, linens and towels, handkerchiefs, needles of piercing and tattoos, syringes, lancets, razors, pens, wigs, toys, candies and gums were among such instruments of infection when they were interchangeably or repetitively used among people.⁵³⁷ “The majority of syphilis contraction in Anatolia is due to ignorance about these [instruments of infection] instead of prostitution” wrote Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey.⁵³⁸ The inanimate objects of infection were one of the significant reasons that these authors prepared such pamphlets and books. Especially authors, who had served as physicians, repetitively argued that the extent of syphilis among masses actually caused by this factor, and Ottoman people had to be informed accordingly as result of their public and professional duty;

⁵³⁶ “Syphilis threatens the life of a whole nation due to the way it is contracted; by passing from individual to his/her family, then from family to society. It is among the most serious and terrible *içtimai* (social) illnesses, such as tuberculosis. [...] the preventive methods against syphilis are not yet satisfactory, and for majority of cases, imaginary. Therefore, the way it is treated and prevented has already been proved to be in need of amelioration” as excerpted from Celalettin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 2-3.

⁵³⁷ “[...] When infected from outside, it passes from the following objects and individuals; i.e., pots, plates, cutlery, glasses and cups, pens, cigarettes and cigarette holders, mouthpieces of water pipes, and toothbrushes and *misvaks* of syphilitics as well as razors used by barbers for shaving syphilitics, needles of *iğnecis* who pierce the ears of girls, lancets of surgeons” as excerpted from Ömer Bin Nuri, 4-5. Also see Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 18-19; Celalettin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, (İstanbul: Karabet Matbaası, 1901-1902), 46-51, 60; idem., *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 377-379; Besim Ömer, *Ebelik*, Prologue, and 6; for wigs (*eğreti saç*) and their impact on contagious diseases see Mehmed Said, *Vezaif*, 45.

⁵³⁸ See Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 18-19.

[...] contraction of syphilis is possible in all ways, and everybody can infect another one: it extends from parents to children, children to parents, relatives to their kin people, and among neighbors, with variety of ways.⁵³⁹

In order to protect the uninfected and treat the ill properly, preparation of pamphlets, which are penned absolutely free of scientific medical terminology and therefore comprehensible to everyone, is the most fundamental one among all precautions against syphilis. [These pamphlets] should be explicit and simple as much as possible so that the hazards of syphilis would be instructed at schools and comprehended by everywhere among the masses.⁵⁴⁰

[...] the way [syphilis] is contracted must be well-comprehended so that its detriments would be better understood. [...] The prime reason for me to translate and supplement this book is the fact that our people have not been instructed properly and yet they have not acknowledged the benefit of treatment and danger of syphilis. I hope this book will amend such ignorance properly.⁵⁴¹

I prepared this treatise with the request of Council of Public Health, to be distributed among the elderly, *muhtaran* and *imams* in villages in provinces, which undergone prolonged and severe syphilis epidemics.⁵⁴²

The issue of infection with inanimate objects also put forth the distinction between “merited syphilitics” and “non-merited” ones that the latter group was portrayed as the innocent victims who got the infection from the former by means of either these inanimate objects or the former’s irresponsible behavior, totally not knowingly. In this conception, main evil agents of contraction were men, or specific occupational groups, such as midwives, wet-nurses, barbers, wig makers, cafe, restaurant and public bath keepers, people making piercing and tattoo, street peddlers, cooks, maids and butlers, who carried the contagion and transferred it in non-sexual ways.⁵⁴³ Only

⁵³⁹ As excerpted from *ibid.*, 18.

⁵⁴⁰ Nuri Bin Ömer, Hatime [epilogue].

⁵⁴¹ Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi ve*, Prologue, 1-2.

⁵⁴² Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 16.

⁵⁴³ See Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 51, 60-62, 64-66, 69 ; and *Frengi ve İzdivac*, 377-379 for concise discussion of evil agents of contraction ; also see Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 18-19; Nuri Bin Ömer, 4-5, Besim Ömer, *Ebelik*, prologue, 6, 323, 329.

some of the midwives and wet-nurses, majority of physicians and surgeons, however, were represented as innocent victims since they were accidentally got the illness while they were treating or caring the ill. As a reflex to be correct as much as possible, Celaleddin Muhtar, also a physician himself, reported that surgeons, physicians, midwives, dentists, circumcisers, inoculators could spread and be infected by syphilis simultaneously.⁵⁴⁴ However, in another occasion, while he was talking about the reasons behind destructive extent of syphilis in Anatolia, he did not refrain from scolding a specific group, midwives, who provided both assistance in deliveries and inoculation; “It can be said that midwives have spread syphilis more than they have been infected by it. Inoculators do the same.”⁵⁴⁵ He was probably arguing about traditional and untrained midwives, and his reasoning reminded the discourse on traditional midwives, which imprinted itself on anti-abortion, and moder midwifery regulations in the preceding period. As a professional advice to prevent such occupational accidents, another physician, Mustafa Hüseyin recommended the use of vaseline to midwives and nurses, who took care of new mothers and infants, since the scratches and small cuts could cause infection when they performed vaginal examinations.⁵⁴⁶

The most important and elaborated forms of instruction were nevertheless provided on instruments of infection and how one could protect him/herself from contagion. These elaborations included practical advice at three levels; the advice addressed to the uninfected, the infected and finally to the state and administration, the most important agents for regulating and controlling the illness. For example,

⁵⁴⁴ Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 64.

⁵⁴⁵ Ibid., 65.

⁵⁴⁶ Mustafa Hüseyin, *Genç Valdelere ve Yeni Doğmuş Çocuklara Hizmet ve Takayyüdat*, (İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1893-1894), 82.

personalized use of pots and plates, cups and glasses, cutlery, baby bottles, cigarettes, and mouthpieces of water pipes, toothbrushes and misvaks, linens, towels, handkerchiefs were strongly recommended by nearly all physicians who prepared specific pamphlets about syphilis.⁵⁴⁷ Celaleddin Muhtar even went on to recommend that toothbrushes and razors had to be locked due to probable abuse of maids and servants in big households⁵⁴⁸, in a way reproaching the domestic servants due to their impoverished social and economic conditions. Depending upon this and other references to rural population, it can be suggested that syphilis was a great danger, but predominantly identified with lower income groups and rural people.

Eating from the same food bowls and plates as a common custom among rural families was criticized to be relinquished with regard to epidemical syphilis.⁵⁴⁹ Similarly, mothers were recommended to not to share their beds with their children⁵⁵⁰, and this custom was condemned to be widespread among poor masses that quick spread of infection inside poor families attributed to this.⁵⁵¹ Chewing and using these half-digested food for young children, using same baby bottles for different infants and any form of breast milk exchange were prohibited as “the most

⁵⁴⁷ See Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 51, 60-62, 64-66, 69 ; idem. *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 377-379 for concise discussion of evil agents of contraction ; also see Milaslı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 18-19; Nuri Bin Ömer., 4-5,

⁵⁴⁸ “It is not enough to personalize shaving sets and toothbrushes. These instruments must be locked. Maids and butlers, who secretly use their masters’ personal belongings, quite often transfer their diseases to them” as excerpted from Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 61.

⁵⁴⁹ Ibid., 18.

⁵⁵⁰ “If mothers infected with venereal diseases share the same bed, bathing water, and towels and linens with their children, their children would surely be subject to genital fluxes and infected by the same bacteria. Bacteria and viruses settled in reproductive organs of young children can easily advance into constriction in the reproductive tubes and [...] finally cause sterility in later years” as excerpted from Kenan Tevfik, 9-10.

⁵⁵¹ Milaslı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 19-20; Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 69.

disgusting habits”, which definitely contributed to the extent of the illness.⁵⁵² Moreover, full scientific sterilization of all medical and surgical equipments was also urged to medical personnel.⁵⁵³ Inoculation issue was also visited; Ottoman administration was launching and propagating modern means of vaccination in the same period, and as an old practice vaccine extract from human donors was deemed responsible for the spread of the disease. “There are cases that thirty to forty people were infected due to such vaccine extracts in a village” wrote Celaledin Muhtar in a way reminding the possibilities to families and medical specialist.⁵⁵⁴ Instead of vaccine extract from humans and ill children (children who were already infected with smallpox), extract from calves was recommended to health personnel and families.⁵⁵⁵

Service sector, goods and services provided in this sector, employees and owners of such establishments, i.e. restaurants, public baths, and coffee houses were severely criticized to contribute to the rapid spread of syphilis among population on account of not complying with the requirements of hygiene. Celaledin Muhtar complained about lack of sanitary measures in barber shops and public baths that he urged the medical control of these establishments, their owners and employees as part of anti-syphilis regulation.⁵⁵⁶ For example barbers were deemed irresponsible for putting their fingers on the scars they inflicted on their customers to stop bleeding.

⁵⁵² Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 68-69;

⁵⁵³ Mustafa Hüseyin, 82; Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 64-65; Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 16-19; Nuri Bin Ömer, 4-5, Besim Ömer, Ebelik, prologue, 6, 323, 329.

⁵⁵⁴ As excerpted from Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 66. He warned medical practitioners for not using their saliva to fix syringes, and not utilizing the same syringe or lancet repetitively on different people when performing inoculation at schools and army.

⁵⁵⁵ See Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 22 ; Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 66; Besim Ömer, Ebelik, 449.

⁵⁵⁶ Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 51, 61-62.

Or they failed to provide sterilized razors and other equipment that they put themselves and their customers into jeopardy.⁵⁵⁷ Cooks, both employed in higher income house-holds and restaurants were deemed responsible to infect their own families back in their hometowns and the families they serve;

It is well known that syphilis is predominantly widespread in Bolu. Cooks, who are mostly from this region, frequent coffee shops which do not have adequate number of glasses and mouthpieces for water pipes. They use this limited amount of glasses and mouthpieces interchangeably among each other, and contribute the spread of disease. Due to these men syphilis became such detrimental illness in Bolu. [...]These syphilitic cooks taste the food with the ladle they stir the pan.⁵⁵⁸

The most compact set of preventive recommendations was provided by Nuri bin Ömer that it is worth to cite here;

Even in his own house, one should personalize the possession of the following utensils; cutlery, glasses, towels, handkerchiefs, toothbrushes, pens, cigarette holders and mouthpieces of water pipes, razors. In coffeehouses he should bring his own mouthpiece for water pipes and ensure that the cups from which he drinks coffee must be washed with a boiling water. If he is having his hair and beard done at barber shops the latter must wash the razor and whetstone with boiling water in front of him. He must avoid the cups and glasses and cutlery of *şerbetçis*, *salebcis* and *dökdürme çaycıs* and must not buy anything from these. He must never have his child inoculated with a vaccine extracted from somebody else's boil. He must disallow his children to be kissed anybody and never employ a wet-nurse unless she is carefully and periodically examined by a physician. He must absolutely keep away from adultery and any sort of illegitimate (sex) , which are also prohibited by God almighty.⁵⁵⁹

With regard to the quote above, and as suggested by many of the contemporaries, kissing was another way by which syphilis contagion exchanged among people.

⁵⁵⁷Ibid. 51,62, 64.

⁵⁵⁸ Ibid., 62, 69.

⁵⁵⁹ Nuri Bin Ömer, 9-11.

Especially kissing between adults and children was deemed disastrous that families were warned to forbid people to kiss their children.⁵⁶⁰ Celaleddin Muhtar specifically cautioned families to be watchful about their maids and butlers that these must not kiss young children.⁵⁶¹ Parents were also warned to be careful about their children since they also spread the illness in exceptional speed once they got infected. Although unmerited, they were deemed responsible to contract the disease while playing with other children.⁵⁶²

General recommendations to keep safe from infection were interesting in the medium of this genre. Since syphilis could possibly be widespread in “crowded places”, and “among crowded families”, people were cautioned to not stay in such places.⁵⁶³ In addition to this, it was also suggested that “one should keep away from the place where syphilis is obviously present”, that is, the home of syphilitics, or their dinner table.⁵⁶⁴ This social out-casting even became a preventive measure itself that Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey commented as follows;

Since syphilis is caused by wrongdoings prohibited by God and Prophet, and it is intolerable by people, nobody is keen to befriend with them [syphilitics]. When people hear one's infection, they immediately sever their relation with them due to its [syphilis'] infectious nature. They perceive them dreadful and disgusting. Since it is not permissible by religion to put others' lives in to jeopardy and infecting somebody is wiping him or her off from the earth, it is certainly a big sin [...]⁵⁶⁵

⁵⁶⁰ Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 59. Also see “Mini Mini Çocukları Öpmemeli,” *Servet-i Fünûn*, 894, 29 Mayıs 1324/ 11 June 1908, 147-148. a specific article on kissing and children

⁵⁶¹ Ibid.; also see Milaşı İsmail Hakkı, 20-21.

⁵⁶² See Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 59; Milaşı İsmail Hakkı, p.20.

⁵⁶³ As excerpted from *ibid.*, 69.

⁵⁶⁴ Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 20-21.

⁵⁶⁵ Ibid., 16.

However, most elaborated and speculated dimensions of epidemical syphilis belonged to wet-nursing and marriage. Wet-nursing was an old custom both in rural and urban areas in the Ottoman Empire, and people also breastfed each other's children for various reasons. For example Islam honored wet-nurses on account that Prophet of Islam was also breastfed by a wet-nurse as an orphan. Due to irregularities of health, a Muslim mother could refrain from breastfeeding and, Islam obliged fathers to hire wet-nurses in such occasions.⁵⁶⁶ There were also legal stipulations regulating "milk relation" in Islam among the following groups; wet-nurses, their family and children, the children they breastfed, and the children's family. In other words, breastfeeding was another form of kinship along with the blood kinship in Islam, although it did not entitle the parties related through exchange of milk to have inheritance and property repercussions.⁵⁶⁷ In short, wet nursing was a common custom for Muslim families in the Ottoman society that they resorted to this option either in exchange of funds or just for cooperation.⁵⁶⁸ We know depending on the historical evidence that Ottoman administration also employed wet-nurses for the suckling and care of orphaned children in return for salaries in the absence of state-run orphanages. Wet-nursing was one of the most common occupations for women

⁵⁶⁶ For Islamic provisions about wet-nursing and wet-nurses, see Akgündüz, Mukayeseli, 231-232.

⁵⁶⁷ See Jane Khatib-Chahidi, "Milk Kinship in Shi'ite Islamic Iran," in Vanessa Maher, ed., *The Anthropology of Breastfeeding : Natural Law or Social Construct*, (Oxford, Washington D.C.: Berg Publishers, c1995), 109-118; Valerie Fildes, *Wet Nursing*, 26-31, 269-270.

⁵⁶⁸ See Eremya Çelebi Kömürciyan, *İstanbul Tarihi: XVIII. Asırda İstanbul*, (İstanbul: Eren Yayıncılık, 1988), 56. [c1952]; Robert Mantran, *17. yüzyılın İkinci Yarısında İstanbul*, vol.2, (Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1990); Leyla Saz, *Haremin İçyüzü*, (İstanbul: Milliyet Yayınları, 1974); Ahmed Nedim S. Tör, *Nevhiz'in Günlüğü*, (İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1998), 21; Bekir Onur, *Türkiye'de Çocukluğun Tarihi*, (Ankara: İmge Kitabevi, 2005), 230-234; Abdülaziz Bey, 25-30; Sezer & Özyalçın, 38 for position of wet-nurses in Ottoman life and child care practices. Especially Abdülaziz Bey gives full account of how wet-nurses were arranged, how they were paid and treated in Ottoman household.

in the Ottoman Empire.⁵⁶⁹ However, parallel to the development of modern medical regulations, modern child discipline and care paradigm which centered on mother-child relationship, wet-nursing became a practice that was critically evaluated and even condemned. Contemporary Ottoman intellectuals criticized wet-nursing and families' resort to wet-nurses as an evil custom which impaired parent-child relationship, parental affection and child discipline. Between 1850s and 1900s, majority of the polemicists and intellectuals encouraged women to breastfeed and care their own children for intimacy, better discipline and preventing children from maltreatment.⁵⁷⁰ In the medium of syphilis debate in Ottoman advice genre, wet-nursing also became under criticism that families were tried to be disciplined both for the sake of children, who were the future generations of Ottoman society, and for the prevention of epidemic syphilis. Majority of authors informed their readers about severe impact of syphilis on children. High infant mortality rate was one of these severe impacts. For example, Hüseyin Remzi, referring to a statistical study regarding child mortality and syphilis in England, reported that between 1857 and 1867, 12,786 people died as a result of syphilis and 69 percent of these deceased were infants before their first age.⁵⁷¹ Similarly, miscarriages, premature births and

⁵⁶⁹ See Chapter 2 for details.

⁵⁷⁰ “All healthy mothers must breastfeed their own infants. If breastfeeds, the womb of a new mother would quickly and easily transform into its normal shape, and therefore breastfeeding is beneficial both for mother and the infant” as excerpted from Kenan Tevfik, 93; “Every mother must breastfeed her own child and not resort to another one as long as she is healthy” as excerpted from Nusred Fuad, 64; See A.Rıza, *Kızlara Mahsus İdare-i*, fifth and sixth chapters, 8; Kenan Tevfik, 93. Hüseyin Remzi, “Ümümet” in idem. *Validelere Yadigar*, 89-96; idem., *Mirat'ül Beyt*, 19-22, 22-29; Nusred Fu'ad, 64; Besim Ömer, *Sıhhatnüma-yı Etfal*, idem., Ebelik, 319; for better discipline and care see Melikzâde Fuad, *Vezaif-i Beytiyyeden*, 110-120; idem., *Aile Vezaifi*, 122-125, 145; Muallim Naci, *Vezaif-i Ebeveyn Yahud Lahika-yı Ta'lim ve Kıraat ve Mekteb-i Edeb*, (İstanbul: Arakil Matbaası, 1304/1888-1889), 80-89; Ahmed Midhat, “İstidad-ı Etfal, 15. Musahabe” in idem. *Musahabe-yi Leyliye*, (İstanbul: Kırkambar Matbaası, 1307/ 1891-1892); Azmi Ömer, *Hanım Kitabı*, (İstanbul: 1328/1912-1913), 29-30,44; Mustafa Hüseyin, 74; Ahmed Said, 9-11; Süleyman Nesib Bey, “Şair Süleyman Nesib Bey'in Konferans Metni: Osmanlı Kadınlığı Üzerine”, *Mehasin*, 6 (Şubat 1324/ 1909): 382-387.

⁵⁷¹ Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-ı Sıhhat-ı Müteehhileyin*, 104-105.

sudden infant deaths were also deemed to be related to syphilis and families were advised to be careful about these problems.⁵⁷² Concerned by high infant mortality rates attributed to syphilis and medical researches suggesting lethal impacts of syphilis on children in countryside, families were warned against prospective wet-nurses from Anatolian provinces, where syphilis was epidemical. They were instructed about outward symptoms of syphilis infection so that they would be able to identify syphilitic wet-nurses.⁵⁷³ Apart from syphilis, when wet-nursing was an inevitable option, all families were recommended to hire healthy wet nurses.⁵⁷⁴ As Kenan Tevfik reported;

If a mother cannot breastfeed her infant due to her health conditions, the best way to feed it is to hire a wet-nurse. However, wet-nurses must be free of any kind of illness among which syphilis is the most important one to be prevented. Families must especially have the blood of their prospective wet-nurse examined since it may contain old or incubating syphilis. Similarly, the infant of the wet-nurse must also be examined along with her mother by a physician. The syphilitic parents have to breastfeed their own children or feed them by the milk of an animal so that its infection would not pass to others. [...]If this syphilitic child is going to be cared in a village by animal milk, the family who is going to feed and care for this child must be informed about child's health condition beforehand.⁵⁷⁵

⁵⁷² See Milaslı İsmail Hakkı, 17, 24; Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivac*, 4, 6, 56, 64, 138-139; Besim Ömer, *Ebelik*, 382; Kenan Tevfik, 37

⁵⁷³ “Since syphilis is widespread in Anatolia, wet-nurses from these provinces must be treated with suspicion: one can detect syphilitic wet-nurses by the shape of their nose, sores and boils in her body, big glands around her neck and teeth. Unless they are examined by an expert physician such wet-nurses susceptible to be syphilitic must not be hire” as excerpted from Besim Ömer, *Ebelik*, 330.

⁵⁷⁴ “There are also conditions that families must take into consideration when hiring a wet-nurse; she must be free of any sort of disease and with full teeth” as excerpted from Nusred Fuad, 64.

⁵⁷⁵ Kenan Tevfik, 98-99, 74.

Supporting Kenan Tevfik's claim, due to the risk of syphilis contraction, Nusred Fuad⁵⁷⁶ recommended a similar precaution that all syphilitic mothers were obliged to breastfeed their children.⁵⁷⁷ With Celaledin Muhtar, wet-nursing issue acquired a moral dimension. First of all, he scolded wet-nurses for contracting syphilis to respectable families. Secondly, he also condemned families who let their syphilitic children be breastfed by uninfected wet-nurses. Then he severely criticized wet-nurses, intermediaries arranging employment for wet-nurses and the families of infants altogether for their inconsiderate behavior. His approach to the issue was a remarkable one that while he was disparaging intermediaries, parents and wet-nurses, he also criticized the Ottoman administration;

It is a shame that there are many people who would easily convince a wet-nurse to breastfeed an infant that is obviously ill. They would say "this is only eczema, do not miss the chance of such a good payment". [...] as well as circumscribing marriage with a medical license for curbing syphilis, a regulation endeavors to control some disgraceful syphilitics would be beneficial for the protection of public health. For example, wet-nurses are quite often found by intermediaries. [...] Everybody will appreciate the formation of a unit which would administer issues related wet-nurses; for example wet-nurses would be hired by means of this institution and they would be given medical license before and after their service to a household along with the children they breastfed. It is regrettable that an institution regulating wet nursing has not established yet. I hope a regulation about wet nurses would be prepared immediately [...].⁵⁷⁸

Actually, Ottoman administration became concerned about the issue of wet-nursing and governesses hired for young Ottoman Muslim children around 1901. Abdülhamid II, thanks to his *jurnal* system, ordered the further investigation and

⁵⁷⁶ See Chapter 2 for details.

⁵⁷⁷ "Under no condition a syphilitic mother must leave her child to a wet-nurse since the child's illness would definitely contract the latter" as excerpted from Nusred Fuad, 64.

⁵⁷⁸ Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 51.

prohibition of the “illegitimacies committed by foreign women, who were hired either for wet-nursing or attending Muslim children, especially Muslim girls for their upbringing and discipline”.⁵⁷⁹ These foreign governesses and wet-nurses were deemed to be leading especially young Muslim girls to illegitimacies and improper behavior, such as unacceptable attire with regard to Islamic codes. Although this special decree targeted to discipline and regulate wet-nursing, disciplining and caring issues about Ottoman Muslim children, it specifically concerned about foreign women. These foreign women, as the decree reported, were actually had nothing to do with child discipline and care, they were predominantly “loose in morals” and outrageously improper for their “public attire”. This deficiency of the said wet-nurses and governesses were perceived to be injurious for “proper discipline and care” of Ottoman Muslim children “along Ottoman-Islamic morals”.⁵⁸⁰ In short, the sultan’s concern was towards foreign women hired for child care and discipline, and had nothing to do with real wet-nursing.

Consequent to wet nursing, the most important and serious warning regarding syphilis was made to the bachelors, prospective couples who were about to get married, and married couples. In the medium of late nineteenth to early twentieth century conduct books, marriage became an institution which could be monitored, propagated upon and regulated for its biological and social reproduction functions. Ottoman administration, beginning from 1850s onwards introduced certain measures which put matrimony under official- administrative surveillance. This surveillance created a concept of “matrimony-proper”; such as marriages performed between equals in terms of ethno-religious-denomination proximity, matrimony, which were

⁵⁷⁹ BOA *HI.* 36 (1319 Ra 22/ 9 July 1901)

⁵⁸⁰ As excerpted from *ibid.*

carried out consequent to pre-investigation and followed by perfect registration.⁵⁸¹ Advice literature, in turn propagated the same issues, such *küfû* (alikeness in terms of ethno-religious, social and economic status), and appropriateness in terms of age, education and health. The last dimension, health was a primary issue about which Ottoman advice genre urged for the constitution of proper families and households. In the medium of advice genre, family became a more significant social unit that its procreation and education functions along with its economic tasks turned into decisive parameters for military issues, economic and social development. In short, Ottoman Empire was a territorially, economically and demographically diminishing one that disorderly families were deemed both responsible and responsive for these processes. Therefore, all syphilis-related works, and treatises addressed for married couples started with the detriments and vices regarding bachelorhood. Unmarried young people (*şaban*) were called upon to get married timely for refraining from illegitimate-out of wedlock sex, and deadly illnesses such as syphilis and gonorrhea as a result of illegitimate intercourses.⁵⁸² İbnü'l Hakkı Mehmed Tahir⁵⁸³ clearly warned young people and their families about the significance of the well being of prospective grooms and brides prior to marriage as follows;

⁵⁸¹ See Tuba Demirci, *Family, State*.

⁵⁸² “Marriage is closely related with medicine [health]. However, this statement does not suggest that health care solely concerns the life after marriage. The connection between marriage and health about which I am about to deliberate extends the life prior to marriage. And this connection is extremely crucial. Wellbeing [of couples] is one of the most fundamental conditions in marriage because diseases imprint their evil influence primarily on marital life.” as excerpted from İbnü'l Hakkı Mehmed Tahir, 15-16.

⁵⁸³ The information regarding birth and death dates of this author could not be located, however he was a crucial figure for Ottoman press from 1880s through 1890s that he was the chief columnist of newspaper *Tarik*. He was also the publisher of *Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete* (1895-1908), *Çocuklara Mahsus Gazete*, and *Nevsal-i Nisvan* (1897) together with Avanzâde Mehmed Süleyman. He wrote following books after 1908; *Meşrutiyet Hanımları* and *Meşrutiyet Beyleri*, *Kadınlarımıza Mahremâne Bir Mektup* and *Sefalethaneler*. He was known to be close to Yıldız Palace, and Abdülhamid II's administration.

When a young man about to get married with a young woman families from both sides mutually investigate the familial, economic, social as well as individual traits such as age, beauty, and education of the prospective pair by means of matchmakers. The family of a prospective husband may even visit their bride- to -be in disguise at her home to monitor her real conduct. Then, they settle the matrimony. However, the most important dimension for such an investigation is often disregarded. It is the piece of information regarding this prospective couple that whether they are free of contagious diseases or not.

It is due to this inadequate investigation from the standpoint of health that some marriages are disastrous for either one or both of the spouses instead of being a source of happiness. [...] there are diseases instantly non-curable but possible to be treated in the long run. Therefore, it is vital to consult an expert physician so that the prospective couple can be medically examined and both parties can know whether their future spouse is free of any infirmity or not. It is a shame that people ignore this crucial benefit provided by medicine.

Though people quite often bring the wet nurses they would like to hire for medical examination-and this surely saves the life of many innocents- they do not bother themselves to consult and be examined by an honorable and trustworthy physician. A medical license approved by the means of lofty medical science prior to the marriage is significant for the benefit it bestows on families and their descendants. Such a medical license would also oblige young men to keep away themselves from evil indulgences and carnal inclinations, and lead a descent life.⁵⁸⁴

Nusred Fuad, another physician, argued due to “his patriotic zeal towards public good”⁵⁸⁵ that marriage was a significant and inevitable episode in one’s life which t should not be postponed for any reason;

The objective behind marriage is procreation and bringing up new generations so that social life would be maintained. However, marriage is subject to certain religious and medical conditions. Since constant activity is the prime factor for an organ to work properly, and deferral from activity impairs the organ, marriage must not be postponed for the viewpoint of health. [...] Only the married ones have a long life expectancy since it bestows the satisfaction of sexual desires and prevents one from debauchery. However, bachelors throw themselves into the world of wickedness and become subject to numerous contagious diseases. If the statistics regarding diseases among the single consulted, this point would be comprehended

⁵⁸⁴ Ibid. 16-19.

⁵⁸⁵ Nusred Fuad, Introduction.

better. [...] Men can prevent themselves from syphilis and gonorrhea, which are called shameful diseases, by getting married timely.

Prostitution is an unacceptable practice both from the viewpoint of religion and public health. It destroys the wealth, peace, comfort and health of individuals. [...] Is it a bad idea to keep your youthful bodies away from brothels and spend your life planning your future? Is it irrational to wait for the pure and chaste lap of your prospective wives instead of throwing yourselves into the prostitutes? Wouldn't it be good to have children born free of numerous diseases and live in a society which is constituted by absolutely healthy individuals?⁵⁸⁶

As revealed above, contemporaries were concerned about growth of bachelorhood among the youth since one could easily make mistakes and be indulged in debauchery, i.e., illegitimate sex, during his transition from childhood to adulthood.⁵⁸⁷ Parallel to the discussion of medical hazards of bachelorhood, some of them also provided a critique of costly marriage customs⁵⁸⁸, about which Ottoman administration had troubles to regulate beginning from 1850s onwards.⁵⁸⁹ However, none of them included the impact of modern education process by which especially males became subject to lengthy and demanding training. Or none of them made real financial estimates regarding marriage and setting up a home. Instead, some of them calculated and compared the probable health and living expenses of bachelors with

⁵⁸⁶ Ibid., 31-32, 34-35, 87-88.

⁵⁸⁷ "Since the age of youth is the period in which people are indulged in debauchery, danger must be instructed specifically to this age group. There are classes on public health at some schools, but curriculum of these do not include syphilis" as excerpted from Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 78-79. Also see Ahmed Midhat, *Teeshül*, 24 for a similar account.

⁵⁸⁸ See Melikzâde Fuad, *Vezaif-i Beytiyyeden*, 93-94, 104-105; idem. *Aile Vezaifi*, 114-119 Hüseyin Remzi, *Sağdıç*, 54-56; İbnü'l Hakkı, 22-24; Nusred Fuad, 89-92.

⁵⁸⁹ Demirci, *Family*. Also see Ahmed Cevdet Paşa, *Tezâkir*, V.3, (Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1986), 43-48 for this point. Ahmed Cevdet Paşa, one the most well-known statesman of Tanzimat period, accounted for such costly marriage customs, i.e., high rates of bride wealth as a disincentive for marriage, and causing late-age marriages in Bosnia. In one of his official visits to Bosnia, he interfered into the organization of a marital ceremony, and prevented the bride's family to demand bride wealth, with a threat that families who asked for such a payment would be paying double land tax.

that of married ones.⁵⁹⁰ Since bachelors did not have homes and wives, they had to buy every single domestic task as a commodity from the market. Accordingly, since they could not have a proper and sterile sex, they would also be infected with venereal illnesses while exchanging money for sex. For supporting their claims over financial and medical hazards of bachelorhood, some of them used statistics regarding the correlation among bachelorhood, life expectancy, insanity, suicides and murders.⁵⁹¹ Some others made more striking suggestions such as polygyny to curtail illegitimate sex and venereal contagion.⁵⁹² In short, spread of syphilis and expansion of bachelorhood were deemed interrelated processes. They were represented detrimental both to the population increase and public welfare in Ottoman society. In order to make people comply with the requirement of marriage as a protective shield against venereal syphilis, various impacts of bachelorhood were emphasized.⁵⁹³

Having discussed the relationship between bachelorhood, illegitimate sex and venereal diseases, advice genre discussed marital health, marital sex and syphilis. The relationship between marital sex and procreation issue was significant that all of

⁵⁹⁰ “Syphilis lays its devastating clutches on nearly all of these bachelors that they become lethal and poor sufferers. These bachelors spend lots of money to cure themselves” as excerpted from Ahmed Said, 46. See Ahmed Midhat’s *Teëhhül*, 23-27; Melikzade Fuad, *Vezaifi-i Beytiyyeden*, 87-93; idem. *Aile Vezaifi*, 84-86.

⁵⁹¹ “Spending life as a bachelor or postponing marriage provokes many dangers for both males and females. The ones who disregard this natural requirement in human life, i.e., marriage, are to be commended sooner or later by the nature itself. The medical authorities of the civilized world have already proved that bachelorhood is closely connected with public health problems and deaths, different sorts of illegitimacies such as murders, suicides and insanity. As excerpted from Hüseyin Remzi, *Hıfz-ı Sıhhat-ı Müteëhhileyn*, 12-13, also see 19; Ahmed Midhat, *Teëhhül*, 23.

⁵⁹² “Polygamy (polygyny) has many benefits from the viewpoint of public health when conducted as a result of woman’s sterility or grave illness. If the husband of a sterile woman does not get married for the second time, society would be negatively influenced through population decline. [...] as proved by statistics, women are numerous than men. If a man gets married into only one woman, so many women would be left as bachelors some of whom could resort into illegitimacies. Therefore it is better [to practice polygyny] instead of turning them [bachelor women] to this way [illegitimate sex]” as excerpted from Nusred Fuad, 68; also see

⁵⁹³ “Reality! Marriage is an institution which prevents one from debauchery while bachelorhood further provokes the tendency for corruption among human beings” as excerpted from Ahmed Midhat, *Teëhhül*, 28.

them urged both descent and chaste sexual orientation, medical control prior to marriage and proper treatment once infected. Ahmed Midhat, writing in 1899, asked “is it such a bad idea to not bring unhealthy children into world? Is it such a bad idea to investigate the health condition of a woman or a man with whom somebody is about to get married?”⁵⁹⁴ Similarly, Celaledin Muhtar claimed that the connection between epidemical syphilis and marital life was the most crucial one since family life was the most vulnerable domain on which the illness inflicted its grave impacts. He claimed that unless properly treated, syphilis caused troubles for the infected persons, their children and society.⁵⁹⁵ The gravest hazard of syphilis was the one inflicted on new generations by those syphilitic parents that they would have either “miscarried and stillborn”⁵⁹⁶, or “unhealthy”, “pale” “weak”, “short –figured”, “hunchbacked”, and “imbecile” children due to congenital syphilis.⁵⁹⁷

⁵⁹⁴ Ibid., *Teeshül*, 12.

⁵⁹⁵ “It is a social (epidemical) illness which primarily threatens family institution, which constitutes the smallest part of a larger family, that is, society. Therefore, the way it is contracted must be well-comprehended so that its detriments would be better understood. Due to these reasons, I am publishing this distinct work which primarily focuses on the connection between syphilis and marriage. Marriage is such an undertaking that it constitutes family and serves population increase. [...] Patients, who get married without having met the required medical conditions for marriage, are not aware of the fact that they are contaminating the life of family they constitute. They are also unaware that they are partaking in the devastation of the life of their wives and they cannot have the children they longed for. In short they do not acknowledge that they will not be happy as they wish as it will be argued in this book. [...] Their disease is a long-lasting calamity not only for their selves but also for [their] helpless wives, children, and grandchildren.”[...] as excerpted from Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivac*, 1-6, 56-57.

⁵⁹⁶ “It is not anything else but the syphilis of husbands that many healthy women miscarry their fetuses for no apparent reason. The syphilis of fathers quite often causes the waste of the fetuses which are secured in their mothers’ womb” as excerpted from *ibid.*, 63-64; “Let’s think about it! It is for sure that people get married in order to have comfort and raise children. Whereas a syphilitic who gets married not having been treated would undergo the frequent miscarriages and constant complaints of his wife, even her death. Moreover he would be subject to his parents complaints about these. Therefore, instead of experiencing these, it is better for one to not to get married” as excerpted from Milaslı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 17.

⁵⁹⁷ “It is impossible to have a syphilitic infant born out of a healthy woman. It is a positively and scientifically proven fact that father’s syphilis directly affects its offspring” as excerpted from *ibid.*, 57. Also see following pages 10, 56, 58-59, 138-139; “Prior to proper treatment, villagers get married. Then the woman gets pregnant. In couple of months, she miscarries the fetus. She conceives once more, she either miscarries it or she gives birth prematurely this time, then the baby passes away in couple of months. Poor people cannot understand the real cause behind disease and attribute these

The issue of medical examination prior to marriage was the frequently contested dimension of official anti-syphilis regulation in the medium of advice genre both for its relation to syphilis, and general welfare it would bring for the marital life. For instance, Melikzâde Fuad firmly argued over the complete bodily health as the most important precondition for marriage among two persons.⁵⁹⁸ He clarified his strikingly progeny-oriented viewpoint as follows;

[...] An unhealthy girl can spread the seeds of disease to the human society by contracting his husband, husband's family and children she will bear in the future. The opposite is also possible that prior to any arrangement regarding betrothal, families must have their prospective daughter and son-in-laws examined by a capable physician, or they must consult the physician of the girl's or the man's family.⁵⁹⁹

İbnü'l Hakkı Mehmed Tahir suggested the introduction of full compulsory medical examination of men and women prior to marriage. He proposed the introduction of such a regulation by referring its positive impact on social welfare in Germany.⁶⁰⁰ Moreover, in order to prevent the expansion of syphilis, it was also suggested that syphilitics had to be subject to compulsory medical examination and truly scientific treatment under the directives of an expert physician at least three to five years prior

losses to her misbehavior, such as carrying a bulky thing, or a sudden fear. Or nothing makes sense for them about these losses. Here! All these are indeed caused by syphilis, and if they consult a proper physician, all of these complaints can be treated. That woman certainly can have healthy children" as excerpted from Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 117 and see page 24 for "shapeless, hunchback, lame, and scrawny children who were born with congenital syphilis"; "[...] there are three basic causes behind miscarriages. Miscarriages occur due to irregularities in mother, father and the fetus. The most important irregularity [causing miscarriage] regarding parents is syphilis that it becomes much detrimental on fetus if the infection is a recent one" as excerpted from Nusred Fuad, 84-85

⁵⁹⁸ Melikzade Fuad, *Vezaif-i Beytiyyeden*, 98, 108.

⁵⁹⁹ As excerpted from *ibid.*, 100.

⁶⁰⁰ İbnü'l Hakkı Mehmed Tahir, 20.

to their marriage.⁶⁰¹ However, medical license for marriage, which was drafted by *Meclis-i Tıbbiye-i Mülkiyye ve Sıhhiyye-i Umumiyye* (Council of Civil Medicine and Public Health), and put in force in Kastamonu in 1893 for regulating marriage among syphilitics proved useless for couple o respects.⁶⁰² For example, people denied this regulation, and got married clandestinely. Or by simply ignoring treatment and managed to be overlooked by medical authorities, they got married and spread the disease. Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı Bey, a syphilis expert who worked in the region where the aforesaid regulation put into practice, supported these clandestine marriages. He reported that “prior to treatment, villagers often get married”.⁶⁰³ For preventing such cases and further spread of syphilis among population and especially for congenital syphilis, Celaledin Muhtar advised the physicians, who would be consulted by syphilitics for being careful. He basically warned them to not to approve their marriage unless required “intricate treatment” was performed.⁶⁰⁴

⁶⁰¹ “Unless treated at least for three years, syphilitics must not get married. Even when they treated for three years, they still need to consult their physician and get his permission to get married. [...] It is only possible for a physician to decide the correct time for marriage even after three year treatment, therefore they need such a permission” as excerpted from Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı, 23; “Do not get married unless it is allowed by a physician. At least four year of treatment and medication prior to marriage is a requirements. Because treatment has to be performed in intervals due to the side effects of the cures” as excerpted from Nuri Bin Ömer, 12-13; “I claim depending upon my innumerable observations that majority of the infected get married after having couple of consultations with physicians. When they do not spot any of the external symptoms of [syphilis] on their body, they deem that they are perfectly treated. This is not an applicable excuse against the scientific principles. [...] syphilis recurs in the end, and destroys the body and family with all of its force. It is not an unimportant illness. [...] It must be treated in the long run and carefully” as excerpted from Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 8.

⁶⁰² See the preceding section in this chapter.

⁶⁰³ As excerpted from Milaşlı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 17.

⁶⁰⁴ “By disapproving the marriage of a syphilitic, you not only serve and save that specific person but person is not solely restricted to him; The benefit you provide by disapproving the marriage of a syphilitic is not restricted with that specific patient, but it serves the general public interest. Only by this way you manage to save a young girl, a family and finally human society at once....the infected will admit that syphilis is not a trouble easily discarded through an instantaneous treatment. Recently infected ones spread disease to their wives more easily.” as excerpted from Celaledin Muhtar, *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 7-8, 138.

The regulation of compulsory medical control on prospective spouses was contested for couple of other respects. It can be argued that the stipulation on marriage enforced in the context of anti-syphilis regulation in Kastamonu transformed the issue of marriage licence into a core one. Although the said regulation had its own problems regarding its enforcement, it became a primary precaution for syphilis in the medium of advice genre. The three to five year marriage prohibition on syphilitics in the medium of Kastamonu syphilis regulation was repeated as a core advice to syphilitics elsewhere by the advice genre.⁶⁰⁵ All of the polemicist, except Celaleddin Muhtar, urged for the introduction of compulsory medical control prior to marriage. Celaleddin Muhtar was critical about it since he did not believe that it would prevent the spread of disease, and stimulate increase the population. The main reason for such a criticism was caused by the nature of illness, which was recurring, but hard to detect by instant examinations.⁶⁰⁶ Secondly, the way medical control over women performed was problematical.⁶⁰⁷ Thirdly, these medical measures, for him, would not chastise men, who were the primary agents of infection within the family.⁶⁰⁸ Parallel to the application of specific regulations for marriage and travel limits on migrant workers, he urged Ottoman administration to take precautions in more general domains of health; such as tightened medical control

⁶⁰⁵ See preceding section, 231.

⁶⁰⁶ Due to incubating, or tertiary syphilis he made such a comment. See

⁶⁰⁷ “It is very difficult to detect syphilis in women, therefore their medical examination requires utmost attention” as excerpted from *ibid.*, 57 “[...]women’s full medical examination is not approved by their families and therefore non applicable. Medical examination for syphilis became useless when it is performed cursory. Moreover, families will be offended and become hostile to certain doctors when their female kin given such reports. There are numerous virgins who were infected with syphilis as unmerited victims” as excerpted from *idem.*, *Frengi Makalatı*, 42-46.

⁶⁰⁸ “[...]we also accept that males are the one who spread the disease instead of women. There are numerous honorable women contracted with syphilis. [...] Respectable wives suffer an ordeal due to their husbands. One cannot find a more scoundrel than another one who poisons the pure body of a young woman with his disgusting syphilitic body, which was worn out in debauchery ” as excerpted from *idem.*, *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 52-53, 377-378, 7.

over public sphere.⁶⁰⁹ The medical investigations over wet-nursing, public baths, restaurants, and barbers were recommended that people employed in these sectors were quite often overlooked for their infection potential. His demands must have been well acknowledged by the administration that suggested means of medical controls were introduced accordingly.⁶¹⁰ He also suggested the instruction of preventive methods against syphilis at schools and its inclusion in public schools' curricula. Ottoman press was also appealed to provide more information about illness, its impact and preventive methods against it. Celaleddin Muhtar urged public conscience to build a moral and hygienic society, which was only achievable through the total elimination of poverty and prostitution. He claimed that a total compliance with moral and religious requirements on chastity would also prevent this illness.⁶¹¹

For Celaleddin Muhtar, the influence of aforesaid precautions as well as treatment of the infected was only achievable with the disciplining of a specific group, counterfeit physicians and traditional healers. The physicians, who claimed to treat syphilis instantly and traditional healers who did everything else but curing people were deemed evil social agents preventing the full accomplishment of anti-syphilis regulation. In addition to this group, there was another problematical group that opposed to the official anti-syphilis regulations on account of legitimizing vice and tolerating the immoral individuals. Basically, the latter group stigmatized the illness as a purely moral and venereal one that their approach became another

⁶⁰⁹ "Both women and men must be subject to proper medical examination. However, this will not prevent population decrease. Only the expansion of public health measures among population will bring this result" as excerpted from idem., *Frengi Makalatı* . 56-57.

⁶¹⁰ See preceding section, 237.

⁶¹¹ See idem., *Frengi Makalatı*, 64-79 for all of these respects; a similar account was suggested by Ahmed Said as follows "Syphilis certainly catches the ones who roam along the path of prostitution and illegitimacy. Syphilis is the most disastrous pest which invades the tree of life. It is prevented only if one lives honestly" as excerpted from Ahmed Said, 54.

obstacle to enforce systematic preventive measures effectively. According to Celaleddin Muhtar, one could come up with such reactions even among administrators who designated and put anti-syphilis regulations into force.⁶¹² This reaction was the predominant pretext of the failure of regulations which had been put into effect from 1890s onwards for him. As a field physician and an academic person who spent most of his time on researching latest and effective treatments, and best means for regulation, he obviously could not find the necessary esteem and administrative support. His complaints once more revealed the social and moral stigma attached to the ill, and the disease, which had long dominated administrations' and people's perception about venereal disease not only in the Ottoman Empire, but elsewhere.

Nonetheless, the misguidance provided by the first group, traditional healers and counterfeit physicians, were the most detrimental one for Celaleddin Muhtar. Counterfeit physicians and traditional healers were deemed responsible for misinforming people in terms of duration and methods of treatment, which were of prime importance considering the scope and impacts of syphilis;

It is unacceptable to console and deceive the ill on account of unreliable advices discarding the severity of disease.⁶¹³

⁶¹² "There is a wrong belief among magistrates, municipal police, municipality council members, the ones who prepared the syphilis regulations which made effective regulation difficult. They claim that "preventive measures regarding syphilis are useless since the wise ones would surely prevent themselves from this danger" by taming themselves and not visiting brothels. However, syphilis is not a disease solely contracted through debauchery, and it is not peculiar for the ones putting themselves into jeopardy by [visiting prostitutes]. In order to be infected, one does not need to go and put himself into danger, or having an illegitimate intercourse. I claim depending upon my observations that syphilitics are not wicked as they were deemed to be by inhumane moralists. They are human beings as everybody is. They are neither lesser nor better than anybody else. [...] I am quite often blamed to be working for the interest of the debauched, the prostitute, and the ones visiting brothels" as excerpted from idem., *Frengi ve İzdivaç*, 376, 386- 388.

”.

⁶¹³ Celaleddin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 9.

I am addressing the charlatans who claim that they can treat syphilis for 5 to 6 consultations; [...] syphilis cannot be treated in a short time as you have been proclaiming to the ignorant masses. Moreover, it requires lengthy and scientific treatment. If syphilis was not contracted by unmerited ways, and if it did not decrease the population by spreading from generation to generation, your unscrupulousness could be disregarded. [...]The persons who deceive helpless victims for the sake of pure material interest are the biggest enemies of society. Unfortunately, it is not a rare occasion to see many innocent people who have their limited funds snatched to these charlatans. [...]The people whom you deceived firstly by your adverts, then counterfeit treatments and false indoctrination that they are completely cured kept infecting their innocent family members when they returned to their homes. Just try to reconsider the treason you committed under the pretext of medicine. They do not have any capital [knowledge] but fraud. How on earth you argue that you are capable of treating patients in such a short time even the most famous *syphiologists*, i.e., *Mösyö Fournier*, could not ensure such good news? It must be totally disregarded by patients that syphilis is instantly curable with couple of injections so that they could be treated decently. A person, who cares about the welfare and health of his own, his family, people and his nation, must not avoid the long but useful treatment. It is only in their hands to be treated completely.⁶¹⁴

Similar warnings against counterfeit physicians and traditional healers were also provided by Nuri Bin Ömer and Milaslı İsmail Hakkı. But they were more informative about other dimensions regarding people's resort into this group. For example, some of the infected consulted these improper healers for their prejudice against the side-effects of the medicines provided by experts and concerned about the cost of scientific treatment⁶¹⁵, some of them found it difficult to visit hospitals, which were established in cities.⁶¹⁶ Another group did not take their infection seriously that

⁶¹⁴ As excerpted from *ibid.*, 1-4, 41.

⁶¹⁵ "New medicines are not evil, and they do not cause trouble unless they are taken under the control of an expert physician. Being under treatment costs only 5 *guruş* per month, and 280 *guruş* in total. And it is not expensive for any individual since it costs only five *guruş* per month" as excerpted from Nuri Bin Ömer, 14; "Prejudices about mercury treatment is widespread among people. However, under constant control of a physician, it is harmless" as excerpted from Milaslı İsmail Hakkı Bey.27

⁶¹⁶ "There is no need to go faraway for treatment. Majority of the villagers go to towns and cities at least once or twice a week. They should consult either municipal physicians or physicians at hospitals established for this, and they should follow the given instructions completely" as excerpted from *ibid.*, 27.

they were totally unaware about their health condition.⁶¹⁷ Moreover, the avoided side effects of medication, i.e., extreme teeth problems such as discoloration, were indeed attributable to the treatment provided by traditional healers. People were informed to use only the medication provided by pharmacies in return for the prescription of expert physicians.⁶¹⁸ Nevertheless, preventive measures against both traditional healers, who were the inevitable parts of rural life, and spread of syphilis had to be enforced with the help of local administrators and community leaders such as *muhtaran* and imams in the context of advice genre. According to Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, community leaders and local administrators were key figures who would critically contribute the progress of anti-syphilis regulation. Therefore, their instruction about illness and already launched liabilities would in turn provide more accomplishment at least for the prevention of the disease's epidemical forms.⁶¹⁹ The economic and religious reprimands of syphilis together with Islamic sanction towards spreading illness were also dictated to people in the medium of advice

⁶¹⁷ "Majority of men assume that they are not infected when they have an intercourse with a suspicious [prostituting] woman and when they do not get [syphilis] rashes or sores in five to ten days. However, initial symptoms of this illness do not appear immediately, it takes sometime; three weeks, sometimes up to two 2 months" as excerpted from *ibid.*, 16; "People do not recognize the devastating impacts of syphilis, and do believe that it is a simple boil which would be easily treated with couple of pills and incenses. However, it not only ruins one's life, but also spoils his/ her descent" as excerpted from Nuri bin Ömer, epilogue.

⁶¹⁸ "Due to pills and incenses made from cinnabar and various poisonous substances that are given by *ocak hekims* and *tütsüciis* who extended into Anatolia like devastating locust that so many people die everyday. Since these *ocak hekims* and *tütsücüs* assume any boil or sore particular indication of syphilis, they cause the misery of hundreds. Even if they [patients] do not die, their teeth, hair, and moustache befall devastated if people resort into these remedies" as excerpted from *ibid.*, 14-15, 32. for wrong diagnosis, also see Celalettin Muhtar, *Frengi Makalatı*, 53-55.

⁶¹⁹ "Muhtars, imams and elderly of a village must follow and advice syphilitics in their locality. They should act and have their people act upon the principles I introduced in this treatises. Since they are the most knowledgeable and enlightened ones in a village or neighborhood and they are delegated by government, they are obliged to perform these actions. [...] Since majority of the syphilis epidemics caused by people returning from *gurbet* [cities], men currently returned from İstanbul, or soldiers discharged from army, a group who have more propensity for disease, must consult local physicians. Or these men should be brought into these hospitals by muhtars, imams or local administrators prior to meet with their families" as excerpted from Milaşı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 21-22.

genre.⁶²⁰ In addition to advices for community leaders, people were also provided practical guidance for what had to be done when there was a risk of infection, or if they accidentally infected people in their families. For example abstaining from pregnancy, refraining from sex during menstruation and ultimate hygiene during sex were recommended for syphilitics who got married without knowing they were infected.⁶²¹

At the end of nineteenth century, epidemical syphilis troubled Ottoman administration due to its quantitative and qualitative impacts over the subject population. It was handled as a delicate public health issue due to its adverse impacts on population. Since syphilis imprinted itself to the young generations' physical and mental capacity, families were warned to re-evaluate their treatment towards children in terms of daily care and traditions. Syphilitic parents were reminded the responsibility and risks of having congenitally syphilitic children together with the possibility of repetitive miscarriages. Syphilis was also deemed to be a significant factor responsible for population decline for other respects as well; first of all it had adverse effects on military, economic and familial domain. It was claimed that army discipline and fighting ability of soldiers were curtailed by syphilis. The recruits and migrant workers held liable to spread the disease, and in turn this exacerbated the economic problems of countryside. Syphilitics became incapable of performing their daily tasks, such as agriculture, and this reflected itself to the imperial finances. Financial and military problems of centralizing Ottoman

⁶²⁰ "Since it is not permissible by religion to put others' lives in to jeopardy, and infecting somebody means wiping him/her off from the earth, it is a big sin to spread syphilis. It is also a murderous sin to infect an innocent wife"; "The most desirable thing on earth is health. If somebody loses his health, he cannot raise the income he needs for his children. One cannot worship properly if unhealthy. Syphilitics cannot work properly since this illness makes them powerless. It is a requirement dictated by religion and rationality to prevent health" as excerpted from Milaslı İsmail Hakkı Bey, 7, 8-9.

⁶²¹ Ibid., 25.

administration became more exacerbated under the de-populating influence of syphilis. Thirdly, the outward peculiarities of syphilis along with its “cynical” infiltration into different segments of society created a disgust and terror among people that population became nearly divided into two as syphilitics and non-syphilitics both in the medium of official regulations and advice genre. However, as suggested by the repetitive publication activity on the concept of syphilis, it was the most social illness among others that could crosscut through class, status and regional identities. Since it was the most social and moral among other illnesses, advice genre was utilized for informing the masses, administrators and medical professionals for effective and sound prevention. These insights were crucial for their accommodating function for another aspect that the official anti-syphilis regulation was a bankrupted one from the beginning due to the financial shortages characterizing Ottoman finances. For example repressive measures regarding prostitution, establishment of lock [syphilis] hospitals for the ill and medical administration in problem areas were not enforced as it was projected. Moreover, people also resisted against the stipulations and preventive measures for variety of respects; such as traditional values, religious opinions and simply for resisting. For example, medical examination of both prostitutes and respectable women were problematic. Although curbed by different reasons, medical examination over women could not be enforced as it was planned and projected. Nevertheless, Ottoman administration and advice genre accomplished a discourse over venereal contagion that crosscut different social institutions such as wetnursing, marriage, family, the hospital, village, municipality and the armed forces. Ottoman anti-syphilis regulations resembled its contemporaries for couple respects, at least discursively. Instructions for personal hygiene, child care and orderly homes for

prevention of syphilis interconnected with other debates regarding these areas. In through the troubles and necessities of an epidemic illness, Ottoman (Muslim) individual and Ottoman (Muslim) family was disciplined and amended. Syphilis, and gonorrhea continued to be on the agenda of medical and military administration up until the foundation of Turkish Republic, which handled the issue in a more systematical way, thanks to an already built and legitimized meta-narrative and institutional structure.

CHAPTER IV

OTTOMAN MUSLIM HOUSEHOLD AS A PESSIMISTIC LANDSCAPE IN EARLY TURKISH NOVELS

4.1. Ottoman Novels As Mediums to Search upon Nineteenth Century Ottoman Muslim Families

When European economic and political hegemony started to make overt inroads into the Ottoman society more than ever in the nineteenth century, it encouraged Ottomans to import not only institutional and technological elements of the West, but also European cultural elements as differing from the preceding centuries of reform. In other words, the adoption of “European way” of life through imitating its decorative, conversational and clothing elements was the second dimension of European influence after the institutional and bureaucratic changes modeled on the West. Basically, Ottoman society was also in search for aesthetic inspirations from the Western world, and from the second half of the nineteenth century onwards new verse forms, and new themes and styles in poetry made their onset.

The emergence of novel as a genre in Ottoman Empire in the last quarter of the nineteenth century was not an isolated, and merely a literary phenomenon. It was closely related to the social, intellectual and political milieu, in which (constituted the) cultural and institutional transformation period, called *Tanzimat*

(Reorganization). The introduction of novel form into the Ottoman world came after the educational reforms of *Tanzimat* since these reforms paved the way for a “new breed intelligentsia”, progress of the press and privately owned newspapers.

The major reforms shaping the ruling body in the Ottoman polity came between the years 1820s and 1908. The establishment of *Tercüme Odası* (Translation Office) as attached to *Bab-ı Ali* (The Sublime Porte) in 1821 created the opportunity to employ promising young Ottoman men, who in turn formed the core of “new modernizing bureaucracy”.⁶²² The founding of this office is of prime importance not only for its bureaucratic supplement, but also for its outcomes contributed to the development of the literary circles and novel genre, which is the primary concern of this chapter.

The declaration of *Gülhane Hatt-ı Hümayunu* (Imperial Decree of the Rose Chamber) in 3 November 1839 officially marked the beginning of *Tanzimat* period. The chief stipulation of this decree was the guarantee that it provided for the protection of life, honor, and the property of all Ottoman subjects, and fair public trial of every individual regardless of ethnic and religious difference. This basic provision, which implicitly underlined the “equality of all before the law”, required changes in the state apparatus and the bureaucracy itself. In other words, this proclamation furthered the changes through which civil bureaucracy turned to be a central institution in the Ottoman political structure *vis-à-vis* the traditional Ottoman

⁶²²For a detailed account of reforms addressing the formation of modern bureaucracy and its modernising outset in the nineteenth century Ottoman Empire, see Carter V. Findley, *Kalemiyyeden Mülkiyeye: Osmanlı Memurlarının Toplumsal Tarihi*, (İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, c1996); and idem., *Bureaucratic Reform in the Ottoman Empire*, (Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press: c1980).

bureaucracy. From the ranks of this new bureaucracy emerged the cadres of reformists, or generally speaking, new *münevvers* (the enlightened).⁶²³

The ideas of these young bureaucrats and intellectuals were colored by a variety of causes; progressive, critical and conservative. These young *münevvers* felt the need of publicizing their ideas to the literate public. This need was principally about informing the “Turkish reading” public on political and material aspects of Western cultures, and the compatibility of Ottoman institutional and social structure *vis-à-vis* the West. The knowledge of European languages in general, and translation activity in particular were quite crucial at this point, since these attempts furthered the establishment of privately owned newspapers in modern sense from the 1860s onwards⁶²⁴, both for informing Turkish reading public and forming a public opinion about westernization and modernization. In short, with the advent of press designed under the precept of introducing material, social and cultural achievements of the age as well as the compatibility of the Ottoman ethos, the reform question ceased to be confined to higher-order administrative ranks; it became popularized through public opinion.

⁶²³ Mahmut Kemal İnal, *Son Asır Türk Şairleri*, 11 vols., (İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi, 1969-1971) for a concise account of biographical source on Turkish literary figures in the nineteenth century.

⁶²⁴ See Nesimi Yazıcı, “Tanzimat Dönemi Basını Konusunda Bir Değerlendirme”, *Tanzimat’ın 150. Yıldönümü Uluslararası Sempozyumu*, (Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1994) , 55-84; Niyazi Berkes, *The Development of Secularism in Turkey*, (New York: Hurst & Co., 1998), 127-128.

4.2. Early Novels in Turkish

The novel as a genre entered into Ottoman intellectual life with the translations from French and predominantly from the eighteenth century French authors.⁶²⁵ However, slightly before the appearance of translations from French romantics and realists, traditional and popular *meddah* (public story telling performance) stories and folk tales were published; *Tûtinâme* (Parrot Tales, 1841), *Hançerli Hanım* (The Lady with the Dagger, 1851-1852), and *Letâifname* (Tale of Jests, 1852) were examples of this kind.⁶²⁶ In the first decades of the Tanzimat period, neither private publishing houses nor consumer demand were formidably big enough as they would be in 1870s to talk about a boom either for generating or publishing fiction.⁶²⁷ In 1859, İbrahim Şinasi (1826-1871), a recruit in *Tercüme Odası* and who would become a well-known writer-journalist of the decades after 1860s, published *Tercüme-i Manzûme*, which included short translations from Racine, Lamartine, La Fontaine, Gilbert and Fénelon.⁶²⁸ Again in 1859, Münif Efendi (1828-1894), later Paşa, translated dialogues from Fontenelle, Fénelon and Voltaire, and published them under the title *Muhaverat-ı Hikemiye*. Yusuf Kamil Paşa (1805-1876) translated *Telemaque* from Fénelon in the same year, however it was published in 1862 with the title *Tercüme-i Telemak*. Again in 1862, Victor Hugo's *Les Misérables* was translated by Münif Paşa

⁶²⁵ For this account, see Taner Timur, *Osmanlı-Türk Romanında Tarih, Toplum ve Kimlik*, (İstanbul: Afa Yayınları, 1991), 13-22; Jale Parla, *Babalar ve Oğullar: Tanzimat Romanının Epistemolojik Temelleri*, (İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002) ; Robert E. Finn, *The Early Turkish Novel (1872-1900)*, (İstanbul: Isis Press, 1984).

⁶²⁶ Ahmet Ö. Evin, *Origins and Development of the Turkish Novel*, (Minneapolis: Bibliotheca Islamica, 1983), 38.

⁶²⁷ Alpay Kabacalı, *Başlangıcından Günümüze Türkiye'de Matbaa, Basın ve Yayın*, (İstanbul: Literatür Yayınları, 2000), 79-80.

⁶²⁸ Evin, 38.

, and published as instalments in a newspaper titled *Rûznâme-i Ceride-i Havadis* under the heading *Mağdurin Hikayesi*.⁶²⁹ Daniel Defoe's *Robinson Crusoe* was translated from Arabic by a court historian, Ahmed Lûtfî in 1864 with the title *Hikâye-i Robenson*.⁶³⁰ Chateaubriand's *Atala* and Saint Pierre's *Paul et Virginie* were the following translations from French.⁶³¹ These translations can be regarded as preparatory activities for constructing native fiction in the Ottoman Empire on account that they firstly produced models on which native novels could be built, secondly through such translations Turkish reading public was prepared to consume native fiction, and lastly new forms of creative writing were popularized thereon.

Before examining the first novels in terms of their structure and thematic features, it is useful to focus on the very atmosphere in which they emerged, and the people who instigated the novel as a genre. The first novels in the Ottoman Empire were produced by a new breed intelligentsia, who were trained in government service and well exposed to French literature through their acquaintance to French. Actually, publishing and civil service circles were overlapping during the initial decades of Tanzimat period, and this aspect would last until 1970s in the republican period. The overlap of publishing and civil service circles actually fulfilled Ottoman *homes des lettres* to assume multiple roles for themselves such as intellectuals, authors, journalists, reformists and polemicists at once. There were many dynamics for this “overlapping and multiple roles” pattern; first of all, *Tercüme Odası* was a very prestigious and promising department to begin for a career.⁶³² It entailed a

⁶²⁹ Ibid. For a detailed account of Münif Paşa and his work, also see Ali Budak, *Batılılaşma Sürecinde Çok Yönlü Bir Osmanlı Aydını; Münif Paşa*, (İstanbul: Kitabevi, 2004).

⁶³⁰ Evin, 38-40.

⁶³¹ Timur, 20.

⁶³² See Münir Süleyman Çapanoğlu, *Basın Tarihine İlişkin Hatıralar*, İstanbul: Hür Türkiye Dergisi, 1962). In this work, Çapanoğlu talked about the close connection among *Tercüme Odası*, translation

considerable amount of income, fair promotion opportunities, and most important of all, remarkable acquisition of a foreign language, which was very often French. As compared to other intellectual circles, or other corps of political, administrative and bureaucratic elite such as *İlmiyye* (Muslim Theological Scholars), and *Mülkiye* (Civil Administrative Bureaucracy) in general, the young males trained in *Tercüme Odası* had an obvious propensity for looking out Europe with great curiosity.⁶³³ Different from the preceding Ottoman reformers, it can be argued that those *homes des lettres* brought up in *Tercüme Odası* had a considerable admiration, and outspoken appeal about material progress, scientific achievements and socio-political institutions in the West with respect to their regular utilization of up- to- date information over western societies. Though with a similar defensive vigilance as that of their predecessors regarding the compatibility between Ottoman and Western ethos, they ardently aspired the emulation of European cultural elements as well as other aspects of Western civilization.⁶³⁴ Here, literature and novel form appeared as a medium to promote Western civilization as well as idea of progress, patriotism, morality and social change, which were still carefully and selectively amalgamated with tradition.

activity and press as creating carrier paths for the nineteenth century Ottoman youth through the memoirs of Ahmed Rasim.

⁶³³ For example, *İlmiyye* elite was active in the Ottoman reform attempts prior to 1830s, and they had actively taken part in the establishment and constitution of educational cadre in new educational institutions for military and administrative bureaucracy, however, their function had gradually diminished in those institutions, and they were increasingly reserved for the religious domain, and function of legitimising the new reforms initiated by new modern bureaucracy and reformist cadres especially after Tanzimat. They owed this change to the rise, expansion and promotion of the modern bureaucrats and technocrats which were brought up in modern secular educational institutions *vis-à-vis* the *medreses*. For the details of this argument see Ahmet Cihan, *Reform Çağında Osmanlı İlmiyye Sınıfı, İstanbul*, (İstanbul: Birey, 2004), 229-230, 245-255, 260-273. Depending upon the information provided by Cihan about firstly the transformation of *medreses* into institutions of religious higher learning with the advent of modern institutions designed for bureaucracy, secondly gradual but effective restriction of *ilmiyye* members into religious domain and their function into legitimising the ongoing reforms thereon, it is also arguable that their reaction and acquaintance with western ideas with respect to a new breed intelligentsia is at least comparable.

⁶³⁴ See Şerif Mardin, "The Mind of the Turkish Reformer", *Western Humanities Review*, 15 (1960): 413-436 for a detailed discussion of this point as well as for a historical perspective on reformist thought in the Ottoman Empire during the nineteenth century.

These enlightened bureaucrats endeavored literature, and specifically novel for conveying their reformist ideas. In other words, this new breed intelligentsia assumed a new role for literature. According to their claims, especially those of İbrahim Şinasi and Namık Kemal as the pioneers, literature had a “didactic value” and it had to function properly through the “priority of content over rhetoric”. In 1866, Namık Kemal suggested, “meaning ought not to be sacrificed for art”⁶³⁵, which had been the case for traditional approach characterized previous centuries of Ottoman literature. Namık Kemal believed that literature entails “a great utility of discourse [...] in its service in the proper education of a nation”.⁶³⁶ Underlying this principle, in another occasion he claimed as follows: “Just as the source from which the ‘literature’ is stemmed is literally ‘learning’, therefore it could be said that the spiritual source from which learning is derived is literature.”⁶³⁷

Young Ottomans had brought up appropriating the traditional literary forms and Ottoman classical poetry, in which rhetoric was the main essence through the application of an abstract imagery, however, they attacked this tradition, and engaged in several polemics with traditionalist.⁶³⁸ The predominance of poetic form over prose through high engagement with Arabic and Persian languages, known as *Divan Literature*, was a very rich tradition. At the same time, it was a very difficult task to reform *divan* poetry for several reasons; the main hardship was stemming from the

⁶³⁵ Namık Kemal’s quote as cited in Evin, 11.

⁶³⁶ Ibid.

⁶³⁷ An excerpt from Namık Kemal, “Lisan-ı Osmani’nin Edebiyatı Hakkında Bazı Mülâhazatı Şamildir”, *Tasvir-i Efkar*, 416, 28 August 1866.

⁶³⁸ See Ahmed Hamdi Tanpınar, *Ondokuzuncu Asır Türk Edebiyatı Tarihi*, (İstanbul: Çağlayan Kitabevi, 1997) ; M.Kaya Bilgegil, *Harabat Karşısında Namık Kemal*, (İstanbul: İrfan Yayınevi, 1972) for Namık Kemal’s challenge on Ziya Paşa, who published a three volume anthology on Arabic, Persian and Turkish poetry in 1874, and for other challenges of Young Ottomans on classical prose and poetry forms.

strong resistance of traditionalist. Despite the strong resistance from traditionalists who opposed the reform of divan poetry, new poetic forms were occasionally provided; Şinasi's praising *Kasides*⁶³⁹ for Mustafa Reşid Paşa (1800-1858), the prime mover of Tanzimat reforms to "celebrate Tanzimat reforms" were the early examples of those attempts.⁶⁴⁰ In the course of time, the reform demands in Ottoman divan poetry became a demarcation point for the distinction between "more committed reformists" and "moderate progressives". As a result, "poetry was set in a course of gradual change [though] under constant assault."⁶⁴¹ The reformist intelligentsia, therefore, chose to create a new genre, just as creating a new social or bureaucratic institution rather than reforming the existing one, which would be much more a painstaking task. The introduction of novel as a new genre to express the reformist ideas created an oppositional duality. This duality was similar to the one that occurred with the establishment of new military units parallel to the existence of *Yeniçeris* in the preceding century. The clashes were inevitable, and long polemics over creating a new genre typified the rest of nineteenth century.⁶⁴²

It was in the atmosphere defined just above that the "modern Ottoman novel" and dramatic literature was introduced into Ottoman literary domain. Not only novels, but also plays in modern sense were thought to be purposeful in terms of preparing the public for the debates on the reform issue. The nineteenth century Ottoman reformists were well aware of the non-existence of theatre, and more

⁶³⁹ *Kaside* is defined as an eulogy, commemorative poem, or poem of more than fifteen rhyming distiches in which a person is praised in 17th edition of Redhouse Turkish-Ottoman-English Dictionary.

⁶⁴⁰ See Evin, 16 for a detailed account of this point

⁶⁴¹ Ibid., 13.

⁶⁴² See Ahmet Hamdi Tanpınar, *Edebiyat Üzerine Makaleler*, (İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi, 1969) , 13-41 for a detailed discussion of this point.

generally, the shortcomings of Ottoman dramatic literature. Hence, they urged to produce plays, and translations in the form of adaptations either from traditional native, or Western examples for meeting these shortcomings. According to Namık Kemal, one of the leading Young Ottomans, theatre is a very important literary genre; since

[it] [...] is a celestial form of entertainment which contributes to political ideas such a weapon for victory as clarity. It discovers the fundamental principles of patriotism to which everybody would conform. [...] If a nation's power of expression lies in its literature, then the liveliest of the literary genre is the theatre. The theatre adds conscience to the imagination, soul to the loftiness of conscience, and expression to the life of the soul. Because it admits of [such] a wide variety of qualities, the theatre in Western countries is considered to be superior to other types of literature, and furthermore, in Europe the best works of the greatest authors are dramas. [...] It could be claimed and proven that the greatest pioneers among [Turkish] political reformers, who came from Europe, had been students of theatrical culture there, and that the greatest of patriots have been educated thanks to authors of drama.⁶⁴³

Namık Kemal himself and İbrahim Şinasi wrote plays before undertaking the task of fiction. In fact, plays predated the novels, and this may lead us to think that dramatic literature was more helpful to create immediate supporters for reform as audience in a society like Ottomans' where converse was dominant over prose due to low literacy. The first play, *Şâir Evlenmesi* (The Poet's Wedding) was written by İbrahim Şinasi in 1859, and this comedy generated huge public esteem. Namık Kemal was the author of more patriotic, so more famous plays such as *Vatan Yahut Silistre* (Fatherland or Silistria, 1873), *Gülnehal* (1875), *Celalettin Harzemşah* (1875). Especially his first play, *Vatan Yahut Silistre* gained so much popularity, and provoked the public in patriotic terms in such a way that it was banned and Kemal

⁶⁴³ An excerpt from Namık Kemal's "Mukaddime-i Celal" in idem. *Celalettin Harzemşah*, (İstanbul: Hareket Yayınları, 1972), 16-17 as translated and cited in ibid, 14.

himself was sent to exile in Cyprus in 1873. Namık Kemal and İbrahim Şinasi were both right about their claims over theatre's patriotic and didactic potential; through their plays, already growing interest in theatre was contributed a lot. There were two drama companies in İstanbul beginning from the third quarter of the nineteenth century, and these new plays utilised those companies' audience.⁶⁴⁴ Secondly, the popular-traditional drama forms like *karagöz* (shadow play), *meddah* (storytelling) and *ortaoyunu* (improvised comedy) and their themes inspired the new theatre, and there occurred no clash between these traditional forms of theatre and the new one as in the case of *Divan* and Tanzimat literatures. This smooth transition could be caused by the very essence of the social strata frequenting the traditional theatre, who were not in a sharp critical position towards new aesthetic forms like the consumers of *divan* literature. It was obvious from the amalgamated and complex meaning structure of the *divan* poetry that only the educated few, the *élite*, understood and produced it, mainly through patronage-clientele relationship. For the reformists' part, they were not hostile to the taste of the "people", or commoner's habit. Though amalgamated with the existing drama tradition, theatre was intended to be modeled on the Western examples, and this would be exemplary for the future development related to novel.

According to Namık Kemal, each literary activity should entail a public function, and he actually saw the possibilities of this notion in the Ottoman society. In any case, the increasing public attention over theatre motivated new Ottoman intellectuals to see novel as an index both for the progress achieved by a certain society, and emulation of the means for modern civilization. In a complaining fashion, Namık Kemal clarified his cause as follows;

⁶⁴⁴ See Evin for this respect.

The Europeans have made so much progress in the way of the novel that it is possible to find in the language of each civilized nation thousands of stories, from which moral, and even to a certain extent educational, benefits can be derived. Among them, especially some novels by such famous writers as Walter Scott, Charles Dickens, Victor Hugo, and Alexandre Dumas' immortal works are source of pride for the civilization of our time. [...] In our country, however, the novel is the most deficient among the types of literature produced. Perhaps not even three stories can be found that could be read with pleasure.⁶⁴⁵

As for the novel, in the course of the last quarter of nineteenth century, it appeared both as the fruit, and means for a critical-reformist thought, whose ideological commitment can be understood not solely with Western influence, but with a broad philosophical continuum in-between the Eastern and Western. This point will be helpful to understand both the limits and potentials of Western influence over the development of novel genre in the latter part of this chapter. The first novels in Turkish were about a society that displayed the surface effects of the process of westernization. Since the time of Mahmud II (1808-1839), Ottoman Empire had been in the phase of modernization, and these attempts started in the state apparatus itself. In time, the reforms addressing modernization gained social locus, and with the proclamation of *Tanzimat* in 1839, Ottoman society aimed to be reorganized not only along the “material” achievements of the West, but also along the “social criteria” in an intensifying fashion. The social point in the nineteenth and early twentieth century reforms were culminated in the nation-building process with the Kemalist reforms. However, the reform issue was a contested one, and truly a “cadre movement”; since it was formulated by competing groups according to diverse ideological commitments. Equally important as the materializations of these reforms in the course of history, the very definition of the diverse reform formulas and problematic

⁶⁴⁵ Another excerpt from Namık Kemal's “Mukaddime-i Celal” as cited in *ibid.*, 16.

areas which were delineated to be improved are vital to have a more concrete picture of both the formation of reformist agency and contemporary Ottoman socio-political processes. In other words, it can be claimed that there is a crucial connection between the novels and the socio-political history of the milieu, in which these novels emerged. As Morroe Berger points out,

The novelist abstracts, but in a different way. He selects and emphasizes to reveal a portrait of a special world that is self-contained while resembling the real world in varying degrees. [...]He takes the large world, or the many worlds, of reality, plays upon them imaginatively, and presents to the reader a smaller, more specialized world.⁶⁴⁶

Parallel to the quote above, it can be argued that the reform formulas, actual changes, and transformations both in the course of Ottoman life and surrounding value system reflected themselves in the novel, albeit through a selective process. However, it is misleading to expect a precise picture of the course of things in a society in the novels produced within. Nevertheless, the selective thematic orientation in the novels can be a power as well as being a limit to understand what is desirable, what is longed for or what is to be avoided. The fictive activity as delving and depicting the nature and course of life in Ottoman society can help us to understand, or map out firstly the problematic areas that social reforms were suggested, then making of reform formulas and reformist agency, and lastly the testing ground of what was opted and what was realized as the reform of Ottoman private domain, which are the central problems of this study.

⁶⁴⁶ An excerpt from Morroe Berger's *Real and Imagined Worlds*, (Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1977), 220 as quoted in Finn, 5.

4.2.1. Love, Marriage and Family in Early Turkish Novels (1872-1900)

It is argued in the preceding chapter that the criticism over classical Ottoman literature was part of the general socio-political criticism posited by Young Ottomans during the Tanzimat period. The main dimension in this literary criticism was constituted by the complaints addressing the lack of utilitarian value in classical Ottoman literature. “Arcane symbolism, a tendency to hyperbole, the subjugation of meaning to form, and the complexity of the literary language, which could only be apprehended by the educated elite”⁶⁴⁷ were believed to prevent masses from the basic human exchange and creation of public opinion in an age in which motivation towards and debates on social reform were called for more than ever. Literary reformers, who were not yet a distinct group from the political thinkers and reformist groups, put these claims forward. In other words, Turkish literary reformers and first novelists were coming from the critical and reformist political circles. These intellectuals’ engagement with literature was shaped by their political ideas and search for a solution that would blend the ethical Islamic values with the material achievements of the West. Accordingly, the enterprise of novel as a genre in the Ottoman intellectual world had three basic dimensions; firstly, the literary-political elite were concerned with publicizing their ideas to a wider community and drawing public attention to the current issues. Secondly, the novel form appeared as an aesthetic medium through which contemporary issues were enunciated, transmitted and implied. And thirdly, the first novelist-reformers utilized the novel genre as a didactic medium through which “what was desirable” and “what was not” decided upon, in a way revealing the Tanzimat’s boundaries for reform.

⁶⁴⁷ Evin ,17.

The espousing of social and political ideas was the fundamental logic here, and these intellectuals believed that a “realistic fiction” would parlay the personal as universal as opposed to the properties of classical Ottoman literature. Having misjudged the disparity between the romantic and realist novel in European literature, and especially in French, the novel and realism became synonymous for the first novel writers. Though criticized and tried to be left behind, the classical Ottoman and near Eastern narrative traditions made their influence felt in the early novels.⁶⁴⁸ Evin defines this process as a “transformation from the oral narrative technique to that of “showing” through impersonal narrative”.⁶⁴⁹ In the preface of his half autobiographic, half fictive work titled *Temaşa-i Dünya Cefakâr-u Cefakâr* (Spectacle of the World and Suffering of the Long-sufferer, 1872) Misailidis underlies what Evin argued;

The stories collected in this book do not serve to teach people the things about which they do not have any idea, but it is for calling their attention to keep them vigilant, and guide them to engage with the best and leave the bad like a honeybee.

Therefore, Suffering of the long-sufferer is an agreeable book that collects diverse situations and advices if necessary, and it is a wheel/mirror of fortune that everybody can watch his/her imperfection to ameliorate it.⁶⁵⁰

Nevertheless, the Tanzimat novel made interesting innovations along the European novels; from romantic to realist, and patriotic to didactic frameworks as well as their thematic contributions. In the rest of this study, the thematic amendments of early novels in Turkish will be discussed along with the formation of both reform agendas, and reformist and critical intellectual.

⁶⁴⁸ See Finn, 2-3, and Evin, 19-38 for this point, which was discussed at length.

⁶⁴⁹ Evin, 20.

⁶⁵⁰ Evangelinos Misailidis, 21-22.

The novels written during the Tanzimat period are important not only for referring to a reform in traditional literary activity⁶⁵¹, but also for the themes around which they were constructed. When the themes that prominent Tanzimat writers-or intellectuals- chose to build their works are considered, one sees that family became the centre of attention through the depiction of marital and extra-marital relationships, intergenerational and gender relations and their asymmetrical nature as well as slavery, super - westernized households and individuals. Through these depictions, it is possible to grasp the reform-related and reform anticipated areas as well as ideals posited by early Ottoman novelists about private domain. Secondly, it is also possible to quest for to what extent novelists reflected the real course of life in Ottoman society. As a rule, one cannot expect one to one manifestation of reality in fictive activity; however, the surrounding milieu can make itself noticeable through writing activity and aesthetic mediums. Therefore, the depiction of family and relationships embedded in family can give us clues both about the life the novelist was accustomed to, and the idealizations that he or she projected. In other words, it is clear that novels are limited to portray the real course of life in a certain period, and this limit is usually colored by class, ethno-religious and status criteria that the novelist fits in. The depiction of higher order, upper class İstanbul –Muslim households, problems surrounding families in this social order and conflicts within these families in early Turkish novels were partly related, or even might not be related to the whole Ottoman society. One must keep in mind that early Ottoman novels were about urban upper class Muslim households, which were in quite proximity to the novelist. And reformist individuals, who usurped the novel as a didactic medium, addressed the urban upper class stratum, which they perceived both

⁶⁵¹ See Parla, 51-79 for a concise account of this point.

as the agent and subject of change. A very few number of Tanzimat writers chose the Ottoman country life as a subject matter for their works; Nabizade Nazım's *Karabibik*⁶⁵² (1890) and Evangelinos Misailidis' *Temaşa-i Dünya ve Cefakâr-u Cefakeş* narrated Ottoman country life and the state of affairs though the latter was half-fictional half-autobiographic.

Tanzimat novelists were also “conservative critics”, and this dimension is echoed via their “moderate reformism”; they did not opt for a radical break with tradition or a disruptive change in state of affairs, since they believed that certain aspects of Ottoman life were essential and core. For example, one cannot expect to espouse all Western mores related to courtship, gender relationships, or civic life without taking the specific features and traditions of Ottoman society into account. Rather, early Ottoman novelists offered moderate reform formulas that would neither destroy tradition nor would keep the tradition as it was. In any case, the Ottoman Muslim family and familial ground was depicted as a pessimistic landscape that must be reformed, restructured and rehabilitated in particular respects, and preserved under the light of tradition, which used to be the source of integration and happiness in the glorious past.

In contrast to the contemporary European novels' all-embracing scope, nineteenth century Ottoman novels were centered exclusively on urban upper class Muslim families. The marriage, marital life, women and children *vis-à-vis* the male protagonists' unease with social and domestic tragedy were the main focus in the Tanzimat novels. In other words, Tanzimat novel made its advent through the appraisal of “domestic troubles”; problems related to Ottoman private realm and its surrounding. Through the depiction of the relationships within and around the

⁶⁵² Nâbizade Nazım, *Karabibik*, (İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayınları, 2002). [c1891]

private realm, and family with respect to the themes such as polygamy, illicit love, extra-marital relationships, prostitution, superstition, ignorance, problems of parenting, children's instruction and discipline, modern education, illegitimacy, abortion, orphans, co-habitation with in-laws, seclusion and veiling, women's problems, and conspicuous consumption, slavery, gender inequality and domestic power politics, Tanzimat novel made its outbreak.

Şemseddin Sami's *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* (The Romance of Talat and Fitnat, published as fascicles in *Hadika* in 1872, and as a book form in 1875) is often referred as the first novel in Turkish though there were earlier novel-like works such as Ahmed Midhat's *Kıssadan Hisse* (The Moral of the Story, 1870-71) and Emin Nihat's *Müsameretname* (Night Tales, 1872-1875).⁶⁵³ *Müsameretname* is crucial in terms of incorporating the contested issues like slavery, arranged marriages, courtship and the threat of extra-marital relationships with non-Muslim and European women along with the earliest excursions to *Beyoğlu* (Pera) to the scope of Tanzimat novels.⁶⁵⁴ The biographical information about Emin Nihat is very limited; it was just noted that he was a senior officer in the Ministry of Foreign Affairs when he published his work. Though very scanty, his position in the bureaucracy seems the only account as well as his work to evaluate him as one of the westernized elite.⁶⁵⁵ Another work called *Temaşa-i Dünya ve Cefakâr-u Cefakeş* was written by Evangelinos Misailidis (1820-1890) in 1872, and preceded *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*. However, it was exposed to the same technical confusions exhibited by the works prior to Şemseddin Sami; its depiction technique, the obscurity of the text in terms of

⁶⁵³ For a concise account of the shortcomings of these early works for not to be classified as novels, see Finn, 13-24, Evin, 23-78

⁶⁵⁴ Ibid.,52.

⁶⁵⁵ Ibid.

what was real and what was fictive and incorporation of popular stories to posit moral and practical advice make it difficult to classify *Temaşa-i Dünya* solely as a novel.

It is difficult to call *Temaşa-i Dünya* as a novel, yet, it needs a bit elaboration. The writer of this book, Evangelinos Misailidis, was a Greek-Orthodox journalist from Kula, a Western Anatolian town, and the owner of a newspaper called *Anatoli* (Anatolia), which had been published in Turkish.⁶⁵⁶ *Temaşa-i Dünya* was written in Turkish, but printed in Greek letters; this is one of the reasons which curbed the work to be categorized as a well-known novel and a novel of high publicity. The incorporation of Misailidis's own experiences as well as his observations related to, and testimonies taken from Orthodox- Greek community make the novel rather an autobiographic and documentary one. *Temaşa-i Dünya* was published in Misailidis's own printing house, and it gives one of the first accounts of "super -westernized" life and gaiety in Beyoğlu through the examination of social decadence and unrest in Greek community, prostitution and *vice versa*. Moreover, autobiographic and biographic sections in the work enable us to have a panorama not only of İstanbul, but also of the Ottoman countryside and provinces about variety of regards.

Şemseddin Sami's *Taaşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, widely accepted as the first Ottoman novel, is chiefly about the nature and critique of arranged marriages. Quite similar to Saint Pierre's *Paul et Virginie*, this novel revolves around the tragic romance of a fatherless youth, Talat, who falls in love with Fitnat, a girl whom he sees from her window above a tobacco shop where Talat frequents on his way to home and work. Fitnat is the stepdaughter of Hacı Baba, who keeps Fitnat segregated after her mother's death. The real father of Fitnat is not known since he divorced

⁶⁵⁶ Misailidis, 8-9.

Fitnat's mother before her birth. The novel continues with the plot that Talat disguises himself as a girl in order to meet with Fitnat. Then, Hacı Baba, and Emine Kadın who is Hacı Baba's stepmother, accept the marriage proposal of old but wealthy man called Ali Bey for Fitnat without consulting her, and matrimony takes place through a swindle. Fitnat is sent to her bridal home, and rejects her husband, Ali Bey. Fitnat does not consummate the marriage, and while Ali Bey is trying to convince her for consummation, he tears the locket around her neck that she has been wearing on her mother's will. She commits suicide after this move on her. Tragedies do not end here; Talat arrives Fitnat's bridal home disguised again as a girl, sees her dead body, and then dies out of a nervous breakdown. When Ali Bey opens the locket belong Fitnat, the note inside reveals the fact that Fitnat is actually the daughter of Ali Bey, who left Fitnat's mother while she was pregnant.

As it can be understood from the course of events, this novel is a melodrama, written under the influence of romanticism, which began to affect Turkish literary activities from the 1870s onwards. The protagonists in early Turkish novels frequently end up with tragedies. It can be assumed from the regularity of these tragedies that Tanzimat novelists wanted to draw attention to painstaking issues about Ottoman private realm through the medium of tragedies. It is also possible to argue with respect to the frequency of tragedies in the Tanzimat novel that tragedy had a positive function for positing new alternatives and criticizing the socio-moral order without creating any disturbance for the collective conscience through radicalism.

While customs surrounding the arrangement of marriage are at the heart of main debate in *Taaşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, the novel criticizes certain traditional values, superstitious beliefs, and ill-fated individuals through minor characters. For example,

Talat's Arab wet-nurse, *Dadı* (nanny), is criticized and caricaturized due to her inevitable ignorance that she was posited to owe for her slave-background. Moreover, Talat's mother and his wet-nurse put forward a dichotomy in domestic affairs; Saliha, Talat's mother represents the desirable, enlightened mother with modern values and deeds, however, *Dadı* is pictured as the envoy of tradition and ignorance through binarism. In one occasion, *Dadı* commended the treatment that she received from a *hoca* for fever while criticizing the modern practitioners.⁶⁵⁷ In a similar manner, *Dadı*'s conversation with Saliha, about young Talat's marriage to -be -arranged reveals this notion quite interestingly;

What God has willed, May God protect him, your son reached his twenty years of age. We should arrange a marriage for him now. We should bring a bride to home. May God protect him from the evil, what we would do if somebody deceives him to be a groom in parent in-laws home? Two old women like us [*Dadı* and Saliha], at a home. A bride is the merriment of a house. Let's arrange a marriage for him.

-No, *Dadı*, do not worry. Don't you know my Talat? He is such a well-behaved person. He loves me a lot. [...] Don't be upset. [...] Talat is still a child. It is a big mistake to arrange a marriage for a child at his age.

-Oh, my lady, İstanbul is such a wicked place. Young girls, ladies go out in very tiny veils. Whenever they see a handsome boy, they flirt with him. Even if he is old enough, he can be easily misled. I am worried, my lady.

-You do not know what you are saying, *Dadı*. [...] My son does not pay attention to such things. [...] He is not like the youth of today. [...] My poor Talat was disciplined in the way his father desired. We should be grateful to God, because you cannot find another young man like him in İstanbul. [...] What should we do? You cannot find a bride from the market place [...]

-Why not? We will do in the way everyone does. Let's get veiled and go to a neighborhood today, and visit another tomorrow. If we find a girl we like, we would take her as a bride.

-Oh, *Dadı*. You are getting my nerves. We have been living together for nearly twenty years. Don't you understand my character? You have never asked in which way my husband took me as a wife. How can I be acquainted with a girl seeing her at once? I cannot even understand her beauty. [...] And should a bride only be charming? If a girl is not wise, chaste and good mannered, I will never take her as a bride. And what about the girl that we like, will my son want the girl we like? You always say that we should take the way everyone takes. But don't you realize that majority of people get

⁶⁵⁷ Şemseddin Sami, *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, (İstanbul: Oğlak Yayınevi, 2001), 26. [c1872]

married today, and get divorced in the next day. Thousands of disgraces take place.⁶⁵⁸

As it is revealed from the quotation above, the key messages of the novel were carried out through direct speech and conversation. It can also be argued depending on the frequency of this theatrical outlook that the problems related to the arrangement of marriages uttered in quite an influential way. The bitterest complaints in this novel are related to marriage and its organization by parents. Şemseddin Sami chose to enunciate these problems through supposedly “women’s point of view” and through direct speech;

Oh, poor women we are! They never consider us as human beings! Our fathers give us away to whichever men they wish as if they were giving away presents; they do not bother themselves about what those men are like. [...] They never ask, “Do you want him as your husband?” They say, “Well, we arranged a marriage for you with such and such man”. We remain silent, but what do our hearts say? “My lord, this man my father talked about, may he be young, handsome, and may he have a nice character!” To tell you the truth, sometimes it works out in this way. But sometimes, it is totally the opposite. [...] When we see the man, who is to be our husband, is sixty years old, or blind in one eye, without a nose or he is a drunkard or an idiot. Oh, you men, how cruel you are! If a girl is a slightly cross-eyed or her foot is a little lame, the poor thing grows old without getting married, nobody deign to take her. But look at the worst one of you, the most dishonorable, the most inauspicious, the seriously crippled, he will take the prettiest, most decently brought up girl and enslave the poor thing.⁶⁵⁹

Though the first outspoken and the most prominent writer in terms of revealing his ideas related to the nature of marriage in Ottoman society, Şemseddin Sami was not the only novelist who wrote about the problems of arranged marriages in this period. Many other Tanzimat authors chose this subject to centre their criticism on Ottoman

⁶⁵⁸ Ibid., 28-33.

⁶⁵⁹ An excerpt taken from the conversation of Talat’s grandmother and grandfather, who were arguing on their daughter’s marriage, *ibid.*, 41.

familial domain. Generally speaking, we see that arranged marriages on parents' will, the question of love in the constitution and continuity of marriage, companionship during and courtship before matrimony, the importance of affection between couples, marriages arranged for wealth and status between old men and young women, the marriages between slave women and free men, polygamy, men's and women's unfaithfulness, married couples' problems in relation to cohabitation with parents-in-law were the main themes in the novels produced between 1870 and 1908.

In the majority of novels, the elderly made the marriage decision and proposal irrespective of young people's will. And getting married through parents' will was depicted as an evil custom mostly related to urban upper middle class and upper class families. For instance, in Sami Paşazade Sezai's only novel, *Sergüzeşt* (The Adventure), this notion was investigated through a very dramatic course of events. Published in 1889, *Sergüzeşt* is another story of romance, which resolved into a tragedy. In *Sergüzeşt*'s case, the main protagonists, Celâl, who is a painter educated in Paris thanks to be from a wealthy and prestigious İstanbul family, and Dilber, a Caucasian slave woman in Celâl's home, are in a sharp discord in terms of class and status. This class and status discrepancy causes Celâl's family to interfere into the romance between Celâl and Dilber, which is actually at its onset since they are intending to set up a bright marriage with a woman of noble origins to help Celâl to climb the status ladder easily. Then this interference causes the destruction of both Celâl and Dilber; Dilber is sold to another household in Egypt, and eventually commits suicide, and Celâl becomes mad out of sorrow.⁶⁶⁰

⁶⁶⁰ Sami Paşazade Sezai, *Sergüzeşt*, (İstanbul: Altın Kitaplar, 2000). [c1889]

While condemning the parents' intrusion into marriage issue, Sami Paşazade gave no hope for this couple in his novel in terms of realizing their will similar to many early novels in the Tanzimat period. As quite a common trait in Tanzimat novels, the ideal and desirable alternatives are suggested while the protagonists are perished not realizing those alternatives. Though he cannot violate the social customs bringing his misery, Celâl often criticizes the search for harmony in terms of status and wealth quite bitterly in the course of novel. According to Celâl, such kind of pursuit, the marriage between equals of class and status, is something very miserable, and humble people's choices are free from such kind of troubles. Quite misleadingly, and misinformed under his romantic failure, he thinks that lower class people are happier and more satisfied in their private lives since they can choose and get married with the person they fall in love.⁶⁶¹ In fact, Celâl ignores through the novel that people of humbler background have such kind of advantage only because they do not have any other option to choose a partner. Briefly, the upper class families are the only social category that predominantly utilize the domestic slavery, so the slave women as probable partners in marriage. The lower class people were the ones exempt from such a luxury, and moreover they were represented to get married with persons who are in accord in terms of status and wealth with themselves in any case. It is interesting since lower class people's probable problems in choosing their spouses such as through the limitations of customs like bride wealth and dowry, or ethno-religious difference within the same class and status groups were totally ignored that "lower classes" were depicted to be free from the pain of selecting "the best match". The problem of the best match and its resolving through the mutual satisfaction of both parents and children is not a trouble-free experience for any class

⁶⁶¹ See *ibid.*, for Celâl's sorrow when he meets with a villager, and he chats with him about the latter's marriage, 107-108

and status group. Lastly, love and desire is not a forbidden criterion for the marriage of upper class youth only; material calculations and status criterion through the co-play of variety of matters like religion, ethnic background and parents' desire were also operative among the lower classes. At least the archival sources about kidnaps and runaway lovers in Ottoman lower class neighborhoods and countryside supported this point in contrast to what was represented in Sezai's novel. In any case, Celâl is the character, or the channel through which Sami Paşazade's acute criticism on the nature of arranged marriages and question of accord in terms of class and status is revealed. In this way, but quite vaguely, he provided the main criteria that one could employ while looking for a partner;

The chastity and beauty comes at first. [Nobility, wealth and status] these come next when we think of love. [...] As stars shine in the dark, there are pure and noble souls that shine in poverty and misery. [...] Do you think that our hearts absolutely in need of nobleness and prosperity to feel love? [...] is there any other dignity which is nobler than the dignity of heart? ⁶⁶²

I do not think that nobility and wealth are important aspects for marriage; on the contrary, these are unnecessary and vain notions for me. Do you think that marriages made for wealth, nobleness, status or self-interest are morally proper? [...] the most natural and essential right of the young people in life is to get married whomever they want, because they will be together for a life time. Isn't it the biggest injustice, and the greatest cruelty that parents interfere into the eyes' choice, the freedom of judgment, and the harmony of souls and characters? ⁶⁶³

As opposed to Celâl's criticism and attack on contemporaneous values pertaining the process of choosing a spouse, his uncle represents the tradition and commonsense;

Young people must leave the marriage question to their parents. [...] the[ir] eyes cannot distinguish under the fire of youthfulness. The taste is always

⁶⁶² An excerpt from Celâl and his mother's conversation on compatibility of possible partners for marriage *ibid.*, 74-75.

⁶⁶³ *Ibid.*, 95.

misleading in the youth. [...] Everyone should get married with his or her match. When the crazy desires of youth are over, what the human beings see? Their mistakes and wrongs [...].⁶⁶⁴

It is quite interesting that while Celâl represents “the new”, the tradition was represented by an elder male figure, his uncle, a person even superior to his own father. Therefore, tradition was symbolically put forward as a stronger force once more *vis-à-vis* the young Celâl’s case. The probable sympathy and appreciation on the part of Celâl’s parents became defied by the elder uncle’s incomprehension in a way tragedy of romance was once more used as a didactic medium in the Tanzimat novel. Briefly, tradition was not condemned explicitly and radically in early Turkish novels; the traditions were ascribed a virtue, at least they were represented to have a value and rationale through the representation of opposing claims, and refutation of “the new”. In Sami’s *Taaşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, Fitnat’s stepfather, Hacı Bey, who arranged a bright marriage for his daughter, justifies his decision’s righteousness as follows illustrating the aforementioned claim;

How did she fall in love with a man that she has just seen once? [...] and how did she manage to love him so much that she rejects happiness like this? [...] She does not know anything, she is inexperienced. [...] Consulting her and doing what she wants is the fault itself. After matrimony, [...] she will forget about her beloved in an hour.⁶⁶⁵

I appreciate her, and I have a pity for her. But I prefer her to cry couple of days rather than allowing her to suffer in a lifetime. [...] She cannot have such a fortune everyday.⁶⁶⁶

Then, Fitnat argues for her cause pertaining to choose a husband as follows;

⁶⁶⁴ Ibid.

⁶⁶⁵ Sami, *Taaşuk*, 130.

⁶⁶⁶ Ibid., 142.

I do not want. [...] I do not care for nobleness. I do not want prominence. I do not want prosperity. I want what my heart wants. Shall be my heart joyful, I care neither being bare foot nor hungry.⁶⁶⁷

Talat and Fitnat in Şemseddin Sami's, and Celâl and Dilber in Sami Paşazade Sezai's novels are the examples of miserable young people who neither have union with their beloveds nor get married to the persons their families choose. There are also novels which focus on the unhappiness in marriages realised through the will of elderly. For example, in Ahmed Midhat's famous novel *Felsefe-i Zenân* (The Philosophy of Women, 1870-1871), Zekiye was forced to get married to Sıdkı Efendi, who is a clerk in *Divan* (Council of State), by the family that she works for.⁶⁶⁸ In *Vâh!* (Alas!, 1883-1884), another novel written by Ahmed Midhat, Ferdane and Talat are betrothed in their childhood, and forced to get married later. Ferdane is a charming and well-educated young woman, but her husband is an unattractive and a bad-mannered one. These disparities in terms of manners and temperament cause Talat to be jealous about Ferdane, and drive them to have a very problematical marital life. Out of one of these jealousy scenes, Talat divorces Ferdane, and she destroys her beauty through a self-sacrificing manner on grounds that her beauty creates all the problems in their marriage. This couple is destroyed through the marriage arranged by their parents to whom they could not stand against.⁶⁶⁹ Again in a similar way, in Misailidis' *Temaşa-i Dünya*, Anna gets married with Coani Favini through her parents' will that she dies due to her husband's brutality soon after giving birth to the protagonist-writer. Then, the protagonist had to stay with his grandparents that they did not want to discipline him as they normally would do since he was believed to be

⁶⁶⁷ Ibid., 127.

⁶⁶⁸ Ahmed Midhat, *Felsefe-i Zenân*, (İstanbul: 1870-1871).

⁶⁶⁹ Ahmed Midhat, *Vâh*, (İstanbul: 1883-1884).

doomed by being an orphan. He utilizes his sorrows and unruly childhood to warn parents about the dangers of arranged marriages as follows;

Though my mother Anna did not want to get married with my father Mösyö [Mr.] Coani Favini, she had to do so, since her parents were mistaken about the said person that he was reputed to be prosperous and genteel, and have political influence, and they promised to give their daughter as bride, and eventually Anna was forced to get married to him.⁶⁷⁰

Even though she could not have genuine feelings for her husband from her depths, my mother had never disregarded her wifely duties, and refrained from respecting and glorifying him.

Finally, Coani Favini, so called father of mine, was well aware about my mother's forced inclination, [...] and he became increasingly jealous thereupon though he should have attributed the reason for this unnatural inclination to his repulsive defects.⁶⁷¹

My poor mother got so scrawny due to his beatings and troubles that he inflicted in ten months time that the physicians gave up from the hope that she would sustain her pregnancy, [...].⁶⁷²

My grandparents did not use to punish and discipline me when I made wrong, because they excessively adored me and they did not want me to be grieved [since I was orphaned].⁶⁷³

As you see, such an inappropriate wedlock is not so much different from a disaster. This must be lesson for parents that they should consult their children while arranging marriages for them, my mother's parents became so upset that they had been mislead by vain interest in reputation and prosperity, and let their only daughter to get married with a [...] brutal person and consequently preparing her ruin, but what can one do? What's done is done. The forced and improper marriages result in these. This should be a warning for parents!⁶⁷⁴

In *Hayâl ve Hakikât* (The Imagination and Reality), which was jointly written by Fatma Aliye and Ahmed Mithad and published in book form in 1892, an unconsummated marriage, which is arranged on parents' will, is portrayed regarding the probable shortcomings of arranged marriages. This novel does not end with a

⁶⁷⁰ Misailidis, 26-27

⁶⁷¹ Ibid., 28.

⁶⁷² Ibid., 29

⁶⁷³ Ibid., 34.

⁶⁷⁴ Ibid., 31-32.

dual tragedy different from the novels reviewed before. In fact, *Hayâl ve Hakikât* is composed of three parts; the first part, named as *Hayâl* was written by Fatma Aliye and stands for the experience of Vedâd, the female protagonist. The second part is called *Hakikât*, and written by Ahmed Mithad to express the thoughts of Vefa, the prospective husband. Vedâd is an orphaned but a wealthy young woman under the legal guardianship of Vefa's father, who is the closest friend of Vedâd's father before he passed away. The novel is basically about the betrothal of Vedâd and Vefa on their fathers' desire. Vedâd has no problem about this decision, and she easily adjusts to the idea that Vefa and herself will be a happily married couple. All of a sudden, Vefa's father, Hüseyin Sabri Efendi, the prime pushing force behind this marriage arrangement, dies. From this moment on, problems break out. Though Vefa has never opposed to the idea of getting married with Vedâd, he starts ignoring her, and then postponing the marriage. Eventually, he makes her know that he does not want to get married with her at all. Vedâd's tragedy begins at this point that she becomes a hysterical and sad woman, about which Ahmed Mithad wrote an independent commentary as the third part while revealing hysteria as a common social ill captivated upper class Ottoman women. Finally, Vedâd dies out of sorrow.

In the second part, we learn about Vefa's own cause for rejecting Vedâd. In fact, Vefa has never been sympathetic with the idea of getting married with Vedâd, although she is a well educated, well mannered and prosperous young woman. Vefa is rather in the pursuit of his career, and he perceives marriage as an obstacle preventing him from further studies;

My father, Hüseyin Sabri Efendi, was a well-educated man with respect to the period he lived. [...] He did his best to not to leave me in ignorance. But he could not grasp the difference between education in the past and education

today. Therefore, he thought that [...] he would make his son pleased by arranging a marriage for him.⁶⁷⁵

[...] My father wanted me to get married with Vedâd. Accepting a prosperous girl as a bride, who is also well educated and well mannered, was natural and essential for a man like my father. However, [...] I have never had such kind of feelings [...].⁶⁷⁶

[...] they betrothed us, this is the way I was involved with the matter. But in which way they betrothed us? Has anybody asked my opinion? [...] I was graduating from *Mekteb-i Sultani* with an honor degree. I was the second top student in my class, which included thirty seven students. According to my father, I had already completed my education, and since I reached twenty-one years of age, I must have settled down. But I barely had a diploma, which could only enable me to be accepted as a student for a higher school. What happens to a graduate from *Mekteb-i Sultani*? Can he become a judge, soldier, engineer or a lawyer? What happens to him? One has to go to the school in which he can receive the proper education for these jobs. [...] At least, you have to attend *Mekteb-i Mülkiyye* for two years in order to have a position which amounts 600 *kuruş* per month as a salary. It was not possible to convince my father on this respect. Let me tell you more, [...] if a graduate from *Mekteb-i Sultani* attends *Mekteb-i Tıbbiye*, and if he becomes a practitioner, he should go to Europe, and spend some time there in order to have a mastery over his occupation. [...] The age we are living through is the age of progress and truth; it is not the age of imagination. The person of this age should think and should be concerned firstly with his duty and responsibility. Yes, I agree that the marriage is a natural right of a person. [...] But, [...] it is also a duty for a man who proved his worth to work to become useful individual for the state and religion. Though I found this potential in myself and perseverance in my heart to realize these, should I sacrifice my great zeal since my father wanted me to get married, and a girl fell in love with me?⁶⁷⁷

The above quote is interesting not only for revealing the nature of arranged marriages and early betrothals, and reaction of Tanzimat youth thereupon, but also for positing the idealizations about modern, alternative, and young male of the era in which early Turkish novels were generated. Vefa's reference to progress and truth, his yearning for personal advancement as a household head and a "useful individual for the state and religion" actually divulged in contemporary Ottoman intellectuals' search and

⁶⁷⁵ Fatma Aliye, Ahmed Midhat, *Hayâl ve Hakikât*, (İstanbul: Eylül Yayınları, 2002) , 44.

⁶⁷⁶ Ibid., 44-45.

⁶⁷⁷ Ibid., 45-47.

desire for a new type of a man, family head and individual, however individual betterment was suggested as the very foundation of a healthy marriage, well-functioning and sustained families. Though Vefa was not represented as a young person not in favor of marriage at all, his rationality is the keystone here that marriage and its arrangement should be subject to rational choice, and long-term evaluations. Ahmed Midhat in fact inexplicitly criticized the current situation of Ottoman Muslim men, especially young prospective husbands through his ardent emphasizes on education; his stress over self-betterment and development of young males were actually covert critics about men of mere consumption, super-westernization and idleness who were also evident in other Tanzimat novels. As he acknowledged elsewhere, he took the issue from the vantage point of a teacher, instructor and a mentor that he provided guidelines for young males to set up their lives.⁶⁷⁸ The guidelines are obvious; responsible, well-educated, modern and rational family men versus idle, ignorant, superficially modern, that is westernized⁶⁷⁹, and consumption-oriented men. It is also obvious from the long quote above and its reference to available institutions of study that the writer went on to explain the contemporary course of educational adventure that an ordinary young Ottoman graduate possibly had for maintaining his claims through a verifying manner. Ahmet Midhat's such idealization of "new family man" is not exclusively specific to this

⁶⁷⁸ Ahmed Midhat very often called himself *hâce-i evvel*, a primary school teacher when he talked of his position as a novelist for his readers, and this dimension is cited by İsmail Hakkı Sevük, *Tanzimat Devri Edebiyatı*, (İstanbul: İnkılâp Kitabevi, 1951), 292-293.

⁶⁷⁹ Through his prolific writing career, Ahmed Midhat argued for a modern, civilised but not westernised Ottoman culture and society. Basically, he opted for the emulation of material progress in western societies such as in technology, industry, education, city planning, service sector, transportation, law, but he did not argue for the adoption of European morals, or spiritual and moral developments together with ill-fated achievements of modernity like fashion, entertainment, prostitution and materialism in western societies. For him, the achievements of materially progressed but spiritually rotten western societies should be subject to a selective process of adoption. Though he repetitively argued about this notion elsewhere, the most prominent works of him that illustrate the demarcation between westernisation and modernisation are *Avrupa'da Bir Cevelan*, (İstanbul: 1307/1891-1892) and *Avrupa Âdâb-ı Muaşeretini yahut Alafrangra*, İstanbul, 1312 / 1896-1897).

novel, through his inexhaustible writing endeavor, he continued to produce such idealized “new men”.⁶⁸⁰

If we return to *Hayâl ve Hakikât*, Vefa’s response towards Vedâd’s sorrow, and her accusations against him, Vefa continues to comment as follows but underlying once more the traits Ahmed Midhat perceived as indispensable to be accomplished by a young man ;

Am I a healer? In fact, I cannot sacrifice my future to solve the problems of others! [...] I do not want to get married. I want to pursue my studies. A person who is still studying as a trainee and person who has not reached the level of mastery in terms of knowledge cannot be a household head.⁶⁸¹

Vefa’s priority about self-development over settling down is something, which draws a new frame for the marriage in Ottoman context. In other words, through Ahmed Mithad’s pen, marriage became something, which is not the aim, but a means for achieving a healthy and balanced social life as well as personal one. He did not ignore the significance of marriage, especially the ones realized on the mutual consent and love of both parties in an individual’s life, but love and marriage became the means rather than the aim of a balanced modern life.⁶⁸² And marriages during or before individual mastery and development were seen irrational, in a way highlighting the negative influences produced by marriages at early age on character development and domestic life. In short, marriage started to be regarded as a

⁶⁸⁰ For this respect, see Ahmed Midhat’s following novels *Felâhî Bey ile Rakım Efendi*, (İstanbul: Kırkanbar Matbaası 1292/ 1876-1877); *Paris’te Bir Türk*, (İstanbul: 1293/ 1877-1878) ; *Karnaval*, (İstanbul: 1298/ 1882-1883) ; *Henüz Onyediyi Yaşında*, (İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayın, 2004) [c. 1298/1882-1883] ; *Vâh*, (İstanbul: 1299/1883-1884) ; *Taaşîf*, (İstanbul: 1313/1897-1898) and short stories “Esaret”, “Mihnetkeşan”, “Bahtiyarlık”, “Para” in *Letaif-i Rivayat*, (İstanbul: 1287-1312/ 1871-1896).

⁶⁸¹ Fatma Aliye & Ahmed Mithad, *Hayâl* , 47.

⁶⁸² Ibid., 48.

contractual institution to which husband and wife should go in heedfully. These points furthered by Fatma Aliye, in her work titled *Levâyah-i Hayât* (The Scenes from Life, 1897-1898) which is based on fictive correspondences about spousal conflict and marriage issue among five kinswomen. The following quotations are crucial for underlining the idea of getting married after apprehending what marriage means both for men and women, however mostly reiterating what Ahmed Midhat idealized as “new family man”;

[...] Young men should get married after acknowledging what wife means, girls should go into marital life having retained the necessary feelings towards a husband and they should bring respect, affection and trust to their husbands as the greatest dowry.⁶⁸³

[...]A man who is about to marry should know what kind of responsibilities he would shoulder, should not he? Otherwise, why is he taking such a duty? Why is he getting married before acknowledging what marriage is? [...]⁶⁸⁴

Marriages at early age and before personality development were also criticized in Tanzimat novels. Mehmet Celal, a novelist not well known as his contemporaries, gives the account of a young girl who is not ready for marriage both physically and psychologically in his novel titled *Küçük Gelin* (Little Bride, 1892). This novel revolves around the tragic romantic trials of Celâl, a depressed young man who cannot not have a happy union due to his family’s interference into his romances, and his “bad luck”. As the second wife, he gets married with Fahriye but she is really young for being a wife, and child-delivery. She dies soon after she gives birth together with the baby; consequently Celâl goes mad out of sorrow. Throughout the novel, Fahriye’s vulnerable position as a young bride in an extended household is

⁶⁸³ Letter no. 9 from Sabahat to Fehame as excerpted from Fatma Aliye, *Levâyah-i Hayât*, Transcribed and prepared by Tülay Gençtürk Demircioğlu, (İstanbul: Boğaziçi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2002), 37-38. [c1897]

⁶⁸⁴ Excerpted from Letter no.3 from Mehabe to Fehame ibid., 10.

discussed for highlighting the ills of marriages at early ages and young women's naivety towards marriage institution. According to writer, young women are not informed about wifely duties; they are solely acquainted with ceremonial and adornment aspects of marriage. Below quote well exemplifies young women's expectations about "being a bride" through Fahriye's case:

Fahriye finally understood. She was about to be the wife for this young genteel man [Celâl]; but she did not know what wife means yet. She knew nothing apart from being a bride, wearing the golden threaded bridal dress, appearing in diamonds.⁶⁸⁵

Matchmaking, or mismatches as results of traditional marriage arrangement is another painstaking issue for Mehmet Celâl and Fatma Aliye. Both of them criticised the lack of profundity in the custom of matchmaking instead of condemning this practice completely. For them, matchmaking and inspecting for prospective brides is not an evil practice, rather the way it is performed is improper and inconsiderate. Mehmet Celâl emphasizes the humiliating bodily examination while Fatma Aliye is pointing out the remorse of a matchmaker about injudicious inspection that centered on shallow traits rather personality over a prospective bride in the following quotes;

Then she [Fahriye] was fastidiously examined. Mebrure Hanım lifted up a pinch of her golden hair. She concentrated. Did she have lice? She [Mebrure] was amazed with the whiteness of her forehead. She liked her golden eyebrows. [...] She said "Daughter, look at me!" [...] Full attention should be paid whether she had a cross-eye or a stain in one of her eyes. Whether those teeth protected by two gorgeous lips were decayed or not? Inside of her ears were examined. Every part of her is stunning. Her toes were also beautiful. She wondered whether her chest have any imperfection? That's the problem, do you appreciate? They saw whatever they wanted to see.⁶⁸⁶

⁶⁸⁵ Mehmet Celâl, *Küçük Gelin*, (İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayınları, 2004, 80. [c1892]

⁶⁸⁶ Ibid., 81-82.

[...] I am also abraded for Rezin, our brother whom I put his life into risk blindly. I acknowledged that you were right then. When you told that “Let’s not hurry. We have seen this girl’s beauty, heard about her education. However, the essential thing is to discover her opinion, get know about her disposition” I replied “Fehame ,do you really expect me to do this! We listen how she performed with piano, we heeded her French. Not every matchmaker is able to ascertain such extent, she decides to take [someone as a bride] meeting at once. We also inquired about [her] as everybody does. In order to do what you suggested, we have to strike up a friendship [with her]!” How mistaken I was! I behaved covetously that I thought she was disciplined and educated properly regarding the languages she had learnt by rote, the piano she learnt to play on her father’s will and by her mother’s slap. I supposed that an educated person would also have perfect manners. [...]What unwariness was that! Yes, that inattention of mine cost Rezin a lot. Poor boy puts up with such troubles! [...] ⁶⁸⁷

Levâyah-i Hayât, possibly pertaining to the fact that it was written by a female author, provides another illustrative response from a young woman who does not have any acquaintance with her husband during her nuptial ceremony in the Letter no.11 which is addressed from İtimâd to Nebahat. Having been troubled and isolated by the traditional matchmaking in the course of her marriage’s arrangement, Müeyyet is reported for her protest during her wedding ceremony in a way both criticizing arranged marriages and mistakenly taken for granted idea that contentment will follow once marriage is consummated;

You are acquainted with Müeyyet. Her situation was a real deterrent for me. It is nearly a year; on the day we brought her into her marital home, her friends and relatives approached and asked her as a custom “did you like him?” after *koltuk töreni* [ceremony during a wedding when the bride-groom gives his arm to the bride] took place. With quite a serious posture, Müeyyet replied “did I like him? What do I know about him so far so that I like him?” On this reply, her aunt approached her and asked “ohh, girl, did not you like him?”. Müeyyet responded, “liking him? How can I know before acknowledging that he is lovable or not?” People posing these questions were not able to understand poor girl’s point. Her aunts became purplish, and commented “You will cause us to experience the thing which has been unfamiliar for our line. He is like a lion [healthy], he is a top-notch young man. What does he have which hinders him to be loved?” Müeyyet went on

⁶⁸⁷ Letter no.1 from Mehabe to Fehame as excerpted from Fatma Aliye, *Levâyah*, 2-4

“It is not my task, but his that he has to make himself lovable”. But these utterances of poor girl were very much misunderstood.⁶⁸⁸

While above quote underlines the fears, and unhappiness as a possibility in arranged marriages, in *Muhadarat* (The Debates), another novel written by Fatma Aliye in 1892, we come across with a consummated but discontented arranged marriage. Fazıla, the main female protagonist in the novel, is forced to get married with Remzi by her stepmother, and her father. Her husband, Remzi, treats Fazıla in a very inhumane way beginning from the initial days of their marriage. She has to leave her marital home when her husband wants to take another wife.⁶⁸⁹ In Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar’s *Mürebbiye* (The Governess-trainer, 1899), Dehri Efendi arranges a marriage for his daughter, and in order to guarantee a long-lasting marital life for her, he prefers an uneducated and poor man as a son-in-law.⁶⁹⁰ In his other novel, in a similar way, in *Metres* (The Mistress, 1899), Firuze Hanım finds a bride for her son, Hami. Firuze Hanım is an ill repute woman of having number of extra-marital relationships. To guarantee that her son, Hami, would not find out these illicit affairs, she chooses a very ignorant and feeble-minded woman as a bride. In time, Hami gets bored of this mismatching wife, and betrays her repeatedly. Then he leaves her to start another life in Paris, and the bride’s life becomes very sorrowful.⁶⁹¹

As it can be understood from the above-mentioned plots, the significance that love, affection and companionship carry in marital life was emphasized in Tanzimat novels quite frequently. According to Tanzimat novelists, love is the crucial source

⁶⁸⁸ Excerpted from Letter no.11 from İtimâd to Nebahat in *ibid.*, 41-42.

⁶⁸⁹ Fatma Aliye, *Muhadarat*, (İstanbul: Kasbar Matbaası, 1892).

⁶⁹⁰ Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar, *Mürebbiye*, (İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 1995). [c1899]

⁶⁹¹ Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar, *Metres*, (İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 1998). [c1899].

of happiness in marriage, if it is mutual. *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat, Vah, Turfanda mı Turfa mı* (The Good or the Bad Seed?, 1891)⁶⁹², *Muhadarat, Jön Türk* (The Young Turk, 1908) *Sergüzeşt, Çengi* (The Dancer, 1877) have crucial insights about the role of love in terms of creating a balanced and contented marital life. In *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, the marriage of Talat's parents, in *Çengi*⁶⁹³, the marriage of Melek and Cemal are examples of this kind. In *Vah*, Ferdane and Necati, in *Turfanda mı Turfa mı* Mansur and Zehra get married through courtship, and live contentedly. In *Muhadarat*, there are two blissful couples as opposed to Fazıla and Remzi; Fazıla and Şebib, and Rüveyde and Şefik. In *Jön Türk*⁶⁹⁴, Ahdiye and Nurullah's marriage is posited as an alternative marital relationship, which is based on love and affection. The ideal marriage, according to Tanzimat novelists, should be based on the mutual love and affection between husband and wife. But what is meant for mutual love and affection? Şemseddin Sami's definition of an ideal marriage in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* is worth to cite here by being the first outspoken depiction in the early Ottoman novel;

The wife, and husband will spend their life together, they will manage a home. They will have children, and they will raise, instruct them together. If they do not like each other, and if there is no harmony between them, what will happen? [The marriage] It is not for a day, or two days, it is something for lifetime. Think about a home that there is no affection between the spouses, May God help this home! Then, what kind of manners that the children will acquire? Well, then, this must be considered.⁶⁹⁵
[My husband and I] we lived together for 23-24 years. [...] He had never broken my heart, and I had never disappointed him. Our joy was our home. Neither he needed to go over in *Kalpakçılar*⁶⁹⁶, nor did I have zeal to go to

⁶⁹² Mehmed Murad, *Turfanda mı Turfa mı?*, (İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayınları, 2004). [c1891]

⁶⁹³ Ahmed Midhat, *Çengi*, (İstanbul: 1877).

⁶⁹⁴ Ahmed Midhat, *Jön Türk*, (İstanbul: Tercüman-ı Hakikat Matbaası, 1910) .

⁶⁹⁵ Sami, *Taaşşuk*, 32-33.

⁶⁹⁶ A famous recreational and shopping area in the old part of İstanbul.

*Kağıthane*⁶⁹⁷. We were enjoying by having conversation. Especially after Talat was born... Oh, what kind of happiness, what kind of prosperity was that? But not every couple loves their child in this way. Would you expect a couple to love their child, if they do not have any affection to each other?⁶⁹⁸

With respect to the passage above, it can be suggested that love and affection between spouses is not only the foundation of a balanced and congruent marital life, but also the precondition for upbringing healthy children. For example, when Sami introduces Talat in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, he comments as follows “Talat Bey is a very handsome and wise child, who is the fruit of love and affection between Saliha Hanım and Rıfat Bey.”⁶⁹⁹ Evangelinos Misailidis is already referred that he unequivocally provides the best example for the significance of love and affection between couples with regard to child-rearing; his father’s brutality towards his mother caused him to be a problematical orphan brought up by grandparents. The letters disposed in Fatma Aliye’s *Levâyah-i Hayat* also have interesting emphasis for spousal love and affection as the precondition for good parenting; thus, following dialogue through correspondence between Mehabe and Fehame over this issue is worth to cite:

[...]What was supposed to be a husband in our opinion, and what did I come across in return? I was brought up in a different world, with different manners. You believe that I am miserable since I could not find spousal love and loyalty regarding that our hopes and dreams were of same once. These were preliminary thoughts and endeavors. However, after realizing that these were unattainable in my world, I acknowledged that conviction was the only thing to console me, and I pursuit happiness with this. I was not looking for a partner, companion or a lover anymore, but a head for my home, a father for my kids. You do not believe how I tried to love and respect this man, who is

⁶⁹⁷ Another popular recreational area that Ottoman people frequented beginning from the 18th century onwards.

⁶⁹⁸ Sami, *Taaşşuk*, 33-34.

⁶⁹⁹ Ibid., 58.

far from being acknowledged as a husband and companion! But his behaviors with which I bear and tolerate regarding he is my husband are absolutely not acceptable for a family father. I sacrificed my own happiness. I disregarded the hope of happiness. However, is it possible for a mother to forfeit her children's happiness? How possible is it for a mother, whose only hope is to be pleased for her children's happiness, discipline and education, to approve a model in front of her children that would spoil their discipline and morals? Think about a son whose father; the person supposed to guide him resorts to disgraceful and repulsive ways. Think about a girl whose supposedly guarding father actually needs advice. The unhappiness of these poor kids caused me to disregard my own unhappiness. Be sure that my chest, which is the shield for the cuffs of a drunkard directed at my children, aches not with the pain inflicted by these cuffs and punches, but by such concerns. [...] Ohh, Mehabe, I have already forgotten about myself. You are advising me to disregard the past. I cannot even go too far. I anticipate that the man who failed as a husband at least should behave as a father.⁷⁰⁰

In her reply, Mehabe comments as follows; "Well, you tell that you endure such suffering and submit to those troubles for your children. But I think I love my child such an extent as it is the fruit of this [spousal] sweet love."⁷⁰¹ Fatma Aliye's *Levâyah-i Hayat* irrefutably the best work which depicted the contemporary values about the role of mutual love and affection in marriage. She utilized different views about what spousal love means through different claims put forth by five correspondents. The first quote argues for the necessity of love and affection in marriages;

Oh, Fehame, we spent our childhood and youth all the same. I wished our marital lives would be of the same, I wish you were happy like I am! Believe me my dear sister; only thing that casts a shadow upon my happiness is this. If you were happy, if I witnessed that you were happy as I am, I would think that I was completely happy. Having or not having contentment in marriage is really important. It is same both for man and woman.[...]
[...]Yes, discontent in marital life is really appalling. Nevertheless, contentment is what an excellence. Oh Fehame, you should enquire me about this [contentment in marital life]! You were telling me "Tell me about the pleasures in your marriage so that I would be consoled at least, I would

⁷⁰⁰ Letter no.2 from Fehame to Mehabe as excerpted in Fatma Aliye, *Levâyah*, 7-8.

⁷⁰¹ Letter no.3 from Mehabe to Fehame as excerpted in *ibid.*, 10.

discover something, which was not granted to me, through your depiction". How should I completely depict this, my dear sister? It is really hard to recount this [happy marriage] to someone who did not experience such as oneself. [...] The affection between spouses, mutual love! Oh!... Is there any boundary for this issue so that writing and utterance would entirely depict. [The affection and love between spouses] is not similar to the love and affection usually seen around. Moreover, it is incomparable with the crazy passions. The genuine love and affection should be inquired after among couples.

Is there any other happiness in the world comparable to this? When I take a look at the novels, poems, work of art, I do not find any of these qualified to depict my happiness. [...] how should I describe it? This is like a sea. I am not able to describe my condition as if I fell into that sea and nearly drowned. Even though I am drowned, I am not passing out. This does not kill me. But it gives me life little by little. [...] Is there anything enduring in the world, Fehame? [...] Try to enjoy the world to the full. But this is based on spousal love.⁷⁰²

In return for this argument, Fehame chooses to argue as follows that mutual love and affection is a possibility instead of being the norm for everybody; regarding her grandmother's urge to marry her off she argues that she got married to have a decent survival while she is utilized as bride for tame their unruly on by her in-laws;

[...] First of all, the primary notion for marriage is mutual love in your world. Actually, this is the chief concern. Correspondence of temperaments, mutual love and faithfulness are the things searched for this kind of marriages. A woman married regarding these can expect both love and loyalty from her husband. Those got married to please each other. However, sister, we [she and her husband] are not from the ones who got married in this way. Your marriage is a contract for happiness, but ours is a contract for livelihood. When you were about to get married, your uncle [...] told that "I want to marry you off with this man since he is able to make you happy", and I expected the same, you now. When my grandmother was about to marry me off, you also heard and reported me that my grandmother had told [about my husband] "this is a perfect man who is able to manage a home and provide for his wife". You can expect love and devotion from your husband. You are entitled for this. However, I should not even think of expecting this. Therefore, it is not precise that you attributed the troubles I bear with to the disloyalty of my husband. This man has never promised to make me happy. In fact, he has never been asked to behave such. Then, I do not have the right to be offended for not keeping his promise for which he has never pledged. If my uncle was alive he would not deny the support he provided for you for me

⁷⁰² Letter no.1 From Mehabet to Fehame as excerpted in *ibid.*, 2-4.

too, or if Rezin was around he would interfere into the way I got married [...]. Whereas, there are husbands who either purchased a *cariye* [concubine] or took a poor girl, and equipped and embellished, then treat this [girl] absolutely as a wife, companion, and lover. However, those men are the ones who take wives with the concern of designating them as companions and partners. In my marriage, were not they looking for a bride who would inflict a sense of devotion on their son for his home? Is it really possible that devotion and sincerity of a poor woman, who is acquired by some –thousand-*guruş* wedding expenditure, would bind a man that has been a disgrace for his family for loathsome undertaking of any kind [...]? ⁷⁰³

While critically arguing about arranged, early and mismatching marriages, and the lack of love and affection between spouses, none of the Tanzimat novelist rejected the positive posture and sense of responsibility that marriage bestows upon youth. In other words, marriage is still represented as providing an aim and sense of duty to lead into a descent life. However, they problematized the ones who could not grasp the positive influence marriage endows, none of them offered a bachelor life, or spinsterhood as alternatives against probable marital disorder. Moreover, they believe that it is quite probable for one to better off him/herself or his/her partner through continual trial and insistence for the best instead of giving up, that is, divorce. Mehabe, in her reply to Fehame's helplessness in terms of enhancing her marriage with mutual love and affection, argues as follows that every wife is entitled to claim love and affection, which are basic human needs from her husband;

You are entitled to ask your share from the pleasures of life. You do not deserve to be obliged for sacrifices and whims of others. You deserve to be loved and praised. What kind of imperfection do you think you have for not being loved and praised? Beauty, knowledge, intellect, good morality, is this a flaw? What kind of influence the issue of wealth impose on this respect? Yet penniless, there are lots of women adored by their husbands, and as opposed to these, there are women who are not loved, and who do not have anything but wealth. Here, the issue is being deceived through the pretence of love. Fehame, I could not quite understand the utterance "the way our marriage is [set up]". I cannot admit to the thought that a woman should not

⁷⁰³ Letter no.2 From Fehame to Mehabe as excerpted in *ibid.*, 6-7.

expect anything other than her livelihood from her husband. I believe that it is truly natural for every woman to demand love and companionship from her husband. Provided that she deserves to demand that! It does not matter that his family, or somebody else picked you as a bride for him, it is not his mother that got married with you! Your beautiful heart was not created for suffering with the wounds inflicted by troubles and concerns, or to be shaken and beaten by cruelty. [...] It does not matter what you tell, but I understand the needs of that [your] spirit. Oh, these needs are more serious than the hungry person's need for bread, or an indigent's need for cloth. As machinery, the creature called human cannot be sufficed with only material needs. It [humanity] also has a spiritual side.⁷⁰⁴

Also referring to the inconsiderate alacrity of elderly to arrange marriages for the youth and regularity of unhappiness of married women, Fehame tries to refute the claims of abovementioned letter regarding the compatibility of partners as the guarantee and precondition for spousal love. In short, love and affection is claimed to be something which can grow in marriage in time, but for this is to be accomplished, the included parties should deserve to be loved and esteemed. Accord in terms of chastity, manners and moral standing instead of love in its own sake are suggested as the prerequisite for spousal love and affection, and successful marriage as follows;

You know that I have never been a kind of girl fancy about bridal adornments, spangles, or ostentation. I used to imagine that when I was about to be a bride, my husband would be a companion, partner, and a beloved person who would love, care and have a pity for me. Well, my poetic imaginings, and enthusiasm for happiness were made up of these. [...] Might he be handsome, ugly, rich or poor, I was not concerned by these. It was enough that he would love, care and have a pity for me. I was married off with these ideas. What did I hope, and what actually I experienced? [...] Well Mehabe, to love somebody, that person must deserve to be loved. [...] If it is really the case that one cannot live without love and being loved, I prefer to give up my life, instead of loving somebody [who is not worthy of love]. [...] Since it is not granted for a woman to choose her husband, she should not be ashamed of that husband's misdemeanor. If it is really a cruelty to not to appreciate a worthy partner, is not it a disgrace to love an unesteemed person who has gone into debauchery and acted imprudently that everybody ridicules?
[...]

⁷⁰⁴ Letter no.3 From Mehabe to Fehame as excerpted in *ibid.*, 10-11.

Though I formerly shared your opinion about the “indispensability of love” [in one’s life] I do not regard it as important anymore. Maybe the way I have been living for years and years and such experiences changed my opinion.⁷⁰⁵

Above quotation sharply emphasizes the role of mutual love and affection in marriage, but it also argues for the spousal accord regarding chastity, manners and morality as the key source for marital happiness. Other novelists also placed the question of compatibility of partners into the scene; since love without any accord or love between incompatible partners in terms of character traits, chastity and social status would not last long, therefore creating ill-type of marriages. Moreover, love as the prime motive in itself is not regarded as a proper cause to get married. Following quotation from Fatma Aliye’s *Levâ-yih-i Hayât* demonstrates this notion illustratively;

[...] I acknowledge that love is a disease. And it is a pretty dangerous disease! Like tuberculosis, a constant pester for the youth! Infectious! It is such communicable that it contagions even through correspondences sent by a patient to another. The society is shaken by this illness in such a way that it destructs the orders of families and gives way so many improper and unacceptable marriages. Neither fathers, nor guardians get in the way of these patients. Advice does not function as a cure for them. Only therapy for this disease is unification [matrimony]! Yes! After unification, this disease is over. Those lovers start to be indifferent to each other. In contrast to the previous yearning apathy, instead of that prior loyalty disregard and irresponsibility annul the issue [of love]. [...] Lovers admit their mutual shortcomings and faults afterwards. The congruent unification through love and passion saves the matter to be remorseful, and brings happiness in return. But, is it always the case? Will not be possible to find a solution other than unification for this disease whose spiritual destruction shakes society? If love is a disease, how come it is seen less important and worthy of attention? Today, they work for [the cure of] tuberculosis this much. Who knows, may be they will work for this psychological disease which pesters the youth. Who knows, also experts for this issue may appear one day, or even the microbe causing this illness may be found.⁷⁰⁶

⁷⁰⁵ Letter no.6 from Fehame to Mehabe as excerpted in *ibid.*, 23-25.

⁷⁰⁶ Letter no.4 from Fehame to Mehabe as excerpted in *ibid.*, 18.

Nabizade Nazım's *Zehra*⁷⁰⁷ is another good example for the “misjudged role” played by love in marriage. In this novel, Suphi and Zehra fall in love, and get married on their own will. However, Zehra and Suphi do not spend a remarkable time as fiancés, and they cannot notice the personal imperfection of each other. Still devastated by the Zehra's jealousy according to the writer, in fact, this couple's marriage is influenced by Suphi's indulgence in women due to his young age. Moreover, by getting married with Zehra, he acceded to a remarkable wealth that enables him to search for and indulge in extra-marital relationships.⁷⁰⁸ Another work which demonstrates love as a temporary so imperfect cause to get married is *Siyah Gözler* (Black Eyes, 1911) which was written by Cemil Süleyman. This novel recounts an “illegitimate”, that is extra-marital affair between a young man and young divorcee. *Siyah Gözler* is one of the few examples of early Turkish novels that centered on the issue of carnal love, and the work revolves around the dilemma of this young divorcee to have a love affair with a single man who is also younger than her. Finally she is drifted into a relationship with him since she cannot resist her bodily desires and the young man's charm. However, from the onset of their courtship, she is alarmed with the deceitfulness “love”; she is a divorcee, her previous cause to get married was purely love and this cause soon became a mundane feeling that she was forgotten. Also distressed by her mature age, she perceives love as a trivial basis, so not a serious cause for long-lasting relationships; “Love... Isn't it love that put her into this situation? The arms once opened to embrace her now hugging somebody

⁷⁰⁷ Nabizade Nazım, *Zehra*, (Ankara: Ayraç Yayınları, 2000) . [c1896]

⁷⁰⁸ Ibid., 66-111.

else. This would surely be same at the end. At that time, she was more beautiful, and younger. She had features which would enchant a man. But now?”⁷⁰⁹

Depending upon the arguments arose in early Turkish novels, it can also be argued that one has to choose the most suitable person for the sake and continuity of marriage institution. In brief, love is not the sole precondition for a successful marriage; though complementary as exemplified by other early novels, actually appropriateness in terms of honesty, purity, chastity together with wealth, social well being and education was urged by the Tanzimat novelists. But what if someone gets married and could not find an affectionate and lovable spouse? Or more firmly, how one can cope with the lack of love in marriage? For Fatma Aliye, as long as the partner under question is not “abhorring” -here it is husband- one should still “try to get along well” instead of getting a divorce. Probably regarding the difficulty of, and disadvantages subsequent to divorce for women in Ottoman society as a female, she was not prone to divorce, but compromise. Though she presented competing views about marital issues among five different women and each correspondence tried to refute the view that the former presented, her emphasis was always in favor of the “constructive” one, that is, the view of Fehame who was the most miserable, still unlikely to get a divorce among others. After complaining about her misery and unhappiness, she still searches for a possible reconciliation as follows;

[...], only indispensable thing in between spouses is companionship. Mutual love that you have been arguing upon is only peculiar to your world. For friendship, it is enough to not to feel disgust or hatred. Though she does not get married with the man of her dreams and she is unable to love him, she can still get along with him. As long as she does not abhor him! I will tell you something which may sound bizarre for you. The loyalty or unfaithfulness of the husband is irrespective in this regard [companionship]. [...]⁷¹⁰

⁷⁰⁹ Cemil Süleyman, *Siyah Gözler*, (İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayınları 2003), 61. [c1911]

⁷¹⁰ Letter no.6 from Fehame to Mehabe as excerpted in Fatma Aliye, *Levâyah*, 26.

Similarly, in another correspondence she addressed to her sister in-law, Sabahat, that she should be beware of not to be “flighty” about love issue; since Sabahat could not put up with the unfaithfulness of her husband to whom she got married on her parents will, and she was at the onset of another romantic engagement. Probably alarmed by the possibility of an infuriation on the part of her audience, Fatma Aliye revealed the details of this “romantic undertaking” neither in Sabahat’s nor in Fehame’s correspondence. It was called “other issue” and refuted through Fehame’s ideas about “further trials” as referred above;

Think broadly Sabahat, flightiness is not what you need at all! Being miserable of your husband, and getting a divorce thereupon is somewhat different than the other issue. [...] If you survive safe and sound from a storm, you would understand the following one better. [...] Do not confuse these two issues. Being married with a man whom you do not love may seem to you as wickedness, and you may not be with him then. You may marry with another one. Whether you are married or not, it is a really big disaster to acknowledge that you were mistaken. Since you got married on your parents will, you do not resent yourself for the unhappiness you experienced, but think what kind of responsibility and dejection you would experience everyday if you chose your husband yourself. I wonder the man you choose will worth to such sacrifices and weariness? Are you sure that you will find the happiness that you have been dreaming [with him].⁷¹¹

As regarded up to now, Tanzimat novel does not opt for divorce; divorce is somewhat creating more trouble than unhappy marriages. Moreover, carried out divorces are erroneous since they are either for punishing a misinterpreted wife, i.e., as in the case of Dilaşub in *İntibah*, Ferdane in *Vâh* , or ill-timed as in the case of Suphi’s divorce of Zehra in *Zehra*, Fitnat’s mother in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* so causing more problems instead of bringing order to the couples’ post-divorce lives. Instead of positing divorce under circumstances not promising at all for a balanced

⁷¹¹ Letter no.8 from Fehame to Sabahat as excerpted in *ibid.*, 32-33.

marital life, i.e. in the case of Meftun and Edibe in *Şipsevdi*, or Bihter and Adnan in *Aşk-ı Memnu*, deserting and suicide are suggested as definitive alternatives. In this way divorce is refuted to be an alternative that unsuccessful couples can better off while unity and sacredness of family is sacrificed.

Having reviewed the ills of customs surrounding the arrangement and institution of, and refuted and suggested cause for marriage, and love, affection and divorce, one need to ask, then, who were the suitable and potential partners for marriage in Tanzimat novels? It is very interesting that one often does not find the description of proper partners, but the opposite in. In other words, Tanzimat writers depicted from whom one must stay aside while making a marriage decision through their fictive activity. For instance, Ali Bey in Namık Kemal's *İntibah* (The Awakening, 1876), and Bihruz Bey in Recaizade Mahmud Ekrem's *Araba Sevdası* (The Carriage Affair, 1896) are two young men from well-to-do families who fall in love in an exaggerated and hilarious way, and make marriage proposals to the women with whom they are not acquainted appropriately. However, the women that they fall in love are not posited as suitable matches that they can realise successful marriages. Periveş in *Araba Sevdası*⁷¹², and Mehpeyker in *İntibah*⁷¹³, are famous courtesans, or women of ill repute who frequent the recreational areas and public parks in İstanbul. Their acquaintance with other males and “scandalous lives” that they inhabit are suggested to mark women like these two as “evil –types”. The destruction of both Bihruz Bey and Ali Bey together with their misuse of family property are claimed to be caused by their foolish aptitude to these ill-fated women. Despite the fact that “fallen women” are the victims of broader social problems such

⁷¹² Recaizade Mahmut Ekrem, *Araba Sevdası*, (Ankara: Akçağ Kitabevi, 1999). [c1896]

⁷¹³ Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, (İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 2000) . [c1874]

as poverty, lack of protective parents and relatives, and underdeveloped social services for the orphaned children, these two women and women of high-popularity in contemporary İstanbul are claimed to be the source of decadence. Moreover, as quite frequent characters that one can easily encounter in any of the Tanzimat novels, women of ill repute, or *femme fatales* stand at the demarcation point of good and ill type of love. The carnal love, or sex was condemned, or surpassed that cannot be a rational basis of a good marriage. It can also be claimed that love is neither a divine nor a purely carnal thing in Tanzimat novel. The Tanzimat novelists profanized the love, determined its limits by defining it through a romantic, unphysical and idealized way. The main point in Tanzimat novelists' approval of affectionate and love-based marriage is to suggest an ideal type, which only involves the marriage between the ones in close proximity to each other in terms of wealth, status, and chastity.

First of all, the Tanzimat novelist chose to warn audience about the dangers of “unchaste” love, that is, “carnal”. Sensuality is a very problematical issue for early Turkish novels that bodily desire is mostly represented as negative, provisional and evil; “An unchaste love turns into a hard-hearted and merciless wrath as soon as the apathy of the other party begins” wrote Namık Kemal.⁷¹⁴ Secondly, carnal love and sensual inclinations reserved into “illegitimacy”, that is extra-marital and promiscuous undertakings, not inside the idealized margins of marriage, therefore “sterilizing” family and spousal relations. The best examples of carnal inclinations, i.e., bodily desire of Meftun to Madam McFerlan⁷¹⁵, Suphi to Sırrıcemal⁷¹⁶, Bihter to

⁷¹⁴ Ibid., 129.

⁷¹⁵ Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar, *Şipsevdi*, (İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 2003), 270-271. [c1911]

⁷¹⁶ Nabizade Nazım, *Zehra*, 51.

Behlül⁷¹⁷, and thirty-year old- divorcee to twenty year old young man in *Siyah Gözler*⁷¹⁸ are all out of wedlock, therefore illegitimate and destined to be passing, worn-out and misleading. To put it differently, none of the exemplary couples in Tanzimat novel are talked off their bodily inclination towards each other; sexual dimension of healthy marital relations are somewhat censored, or omitted. Shortly, desirable and acceptable sexual inclination is not depicted, but the opposite. When sex and bodily desire is the issue, it is problematized, not instructed through novels as in the case of didactic mediums, or “good behavioral lines” provided for other issues discussed before. Nevertheless contemporaneous advice genre supplied numerous counseling and suggestions over sex probably regarding its more qualified audience. Carnal inclination is passing and not trustworthy since it is; [...] “something which is passionately yearned for today but would be discarded like a worn-out rag tomorrow” [...], then it is all but “impermanent desires that the sparks of it would slowly die down after having couple of zealous days; [...] and nothing but the wrecked walls of a ruin, which chills one’s soul, would be left behind.”⁷¹⁹ Relationships instigated on sexual desire are destined to die and ill -fated especially in the mind and reasoning of the female protagonists; probably due to this sexual desire is represented in detail when it is illegitimate, and omitted when it is felt for the legitimate spouse. In a vulgarized and terrorizing manner, carnal love is something to be abstained or shielded from but well defined when it is illegitimate ;

[...] while being surrounded by his young and strong arms, she might alleviate the sorrows her deprivations inflict upon, [...] while dreaming the

⁷¹⁷ Halit Ziya Uşaklıgil, *Aşk-ı Memnu*, (İstanbul: İnkılap, 1999), 110-139. [c1900]

⁷¹⁸ Cemil Süleyman, 22-25-45.

⁷¹⁹ Young divorcee’s delirious self-indoctrination as excerpted from *ibid.*, 22.

delight of the moments spent in the lap of an attractive young man, [...] her body was shaking from head to toe; in the heart she was having an ache which was inflicted by thin but passionate teeth looking for her lips.

[...]

She tried to find a remedy for this. There was neither a shielding hand to rescue her from this danger, nor the remedy of a consolation which would empower her self-control around her. Having no protector, no consolation...and she was doomed to live like this...

The carriage was moving tremblingly over the stones, drawing them near to each other. Both of them were ecstatic to be so close to one another, they took pleasure in this. [...] With the gentle touch of knees, desirous currents were passing from one to the other, and inflaming them with a fervent shivering, [...].

[...]Then what would people think of her? When she remembered this, she felt stunned as if she heard the mocking laughter of people who saw them together.⁷²⁰

Sensuality is especially regarded harmful if it is the case for a woman. There is a gendered difference for the issue of bodily desire; it is thought normal for men to incline into bodily pleasures, their nature believed to cause so; “He cannot halt the masculine motive for tasting other beauties like that of bees which move from one flower to another with the strong impulse inflicted by nature” wrote Hüseyin Rahmi still critically personifying the “mislead” Meftun in *Şipsevdi*.⁷²¹ Ahmed Midhat also underlined men’s sexual desire as something insatiable at times, therefore necessitates polygamy.⁷²² In short, men are criticized not for having sensual inclinations but satisfying these desires through illegitimacy and bringing in disorder when they lose their control in early Turkish novels. In other words, the need for physical love does not create everlasting demarcation like “family man” and “ill-fated man” for men. That means it is always possible for a man to reprimand and better himself after indulging in bodily desires. Not married and chaste women, but

⁷²⁰ Ibid., 19-25-47-60.

⁷²¹ Gürpınar, *Şipsevdi*, 373.

⁷²² See Ahmed Midhat’s *Paris’te*, 160 as cited in Parla, 38.

quite often prostitutes, or “courtesans” as called by novelists, are represented to have strong sexual desires; if a woman has sensual inclination, her chastity and honor becomes questionable in a way not leaving room for reprimand. Women’s bodily desire is something evil, both for themselves and for social and family order. Bihter’s case, young wife of Adnan Bey who cannot stand against her bodily inclinations, and gets involved with young Behlül in *Aşk-ı Memnu* is a good example for this notion.⁷²³ In the medium of Tanzimat novel, the female sensuality and chastity are deemed to be negatively correlated; if highly sensual is a woman, her chastity is low, or *vice versa*. Under this reasoning, the prostitutes believed to be the most and deadly lustful women, so devastating men, who are also regarded sensual by their nature. Carnal love and love is also demarcated that the former is evil though through a gendered approach; women’s love should be purely spiritual while men can incorporate spiritual and carnal dimension of love and experience it if legitimate. The following depiction of Mehpeyker, famous courtesan who perishes the main protagonist Ali Bey in Namık Kemal’s *İntibah*, exemplifies the gendered conception of carnal love and bodily desire best;

Since she was extremely lustful she wanted to keep the men she liked under her command with coquetry of all kinds, and she almost succeeded to do so skillfully.

She really loved good-looking men. However, she loved them just as a snake loves a flower; just as a snake coils around a person, so too she would like to cuddle, just as grave embraces the body, she tries to do so, [...].

She loved Ali Bey not *by her heart, but by her flesh*.⁷²⁴

Another issue related to proper partners which is derived indirectly from the depictions of improper partners that one should stay aside is age differential.

⁷²³ Uşaklıgil, *Aşk-ı*.

⁷²⁴ Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 39-40, 47. Emphases are added.

Tanzimat novel does not approve big age differences between spouses, however this also gendered. There is no case for a consummated but improper marriage that is in between a woman and man younger than her. Marriages between older men and young women are condemned for couple reasons, i.e., marriages for material concern, disaccord in opinions, etc., but still men should be older to be able to edify, command and manage the wife and family. Widowhood does not matter for men to get married young unmarried women.⁷²⁵ On the other hand, even the possibility of a mature, widowed woman to get married with an unmarried man is nullified from the beginning. It can be argued that age matter for women and men in a different way that is gendered; male maturity is something praiseworthy, positive and constructive unless it is extreme, but if woman is more mature, senior, experienced, that is previously married, or widowed, it is troublesome, not everlasting and derisive. In Cemil Süleyman's *Siyah Gözler*, young divorcee herself refutes her own desire to get married with the young man she fell in love. First of all, she invalidates her desire to get married with him since she believes that young man's desire and love towards her is passing, or transitory, therefore, disempowering for her in the long run *vis-à-vis* the probable young and charming rivals. Secondly, and more importantly, she disregards her abovementioned desire regarding the "impropriety" of age issue, in other words, the gendered conception age difference;

She was feeling all the pains of widowhood; [...]
 Well, why should not we involve in [love, an affair] ? As she is herself dying to be with him...
 [...] at first the age difference between us, that's the biggest obstacle, then I am a widow, whereas he [you] can take the daughter of any person as a wife...[...]
 [...]

⁷²⁵ See for example Şemseddin Sami's *Taaşşuk*, Mehmed Celal's *Küçük Gelin*, Uşaklıgil's *Aşk-ı Memnu* for widowed men who get married to young and unmarried women.

Actually this was the thing that worried her. Then being the wife of a twenty-year-old man...It seemed such unusual to her that she was pleased that she had not promised him anything when she thought that she once happened to think of marrying to him. Then what would people think of her? When she remembered this she felt stunned as if she heard the mocking laughter of people who saw them together.⁷²⁶

Tanzimat novel set limits for the difference in-between prospective spouses instead of fully deploring them. In other words, Tanzimat novelists did not opt for the marriage between the persons who entirely resemble each other for status, education, wealth, etc. However, they put inviolable limits; such as ethno-religious, national, cultural and moral. For example none of the Tanzimat novelist approves intermarriages, and non-Muslim men to Muslim women marriages are not even talked of. Hüseyin Rahmi is the most prominent one that he argues for the ill-effects of intermarriages-marriages between non-Muslim Levantine or European women and Ottoman Muslim men- in *Şipsevdi*. The acceptable lower limit of difference between spouses is also delineated through women; if there will be an unlikeness but only in terms of status, wealth, and education, this must be the wife's. That means, if a prospective wife is from a lower class, status and educational background that is acceptable instead of vice versa. Even if Tanzimat novelists are portrayed up to now that they repeatedly argued for the marriage and love between the ones who resemble each other in terms of variety of matters, they believed that an enlightened and conscious husband could train and edify his wife through marriage as well as providing her livelihood. At this point, a concubine or a slave girl can be suitable enough to realize a good marriage. The following excerpt from a dialogue between Ali Bey and his mother Fatma Hanım, central characters in Namık Kemal's *İntibah*,

⁷²⁶ Cemil Süleyman, 25-36-57-60.

about purchasing a concubine for Ali Bey to do away with the seditious and ill effects of the courtesan, Mehpeyker, is crucial;

Look what you are talking about! Don't you know what you would do with a *cariye* [concubine]! Thank God, you are nearly twenty-two years of age. [...] If I find a girl [bride] from an affluent family, you cannot see her face before the matrimony. If you do not like her after the marriage is realized, you will be in sorrow until the end of your life. [...] Perhaps, she will be quarrelsome with her mother-in-law. You will be in-between, and you will be bothered. [...] But she [bride] is a concubine; if you like her, you can take her into your bed, and instruct her in the way you want.⁷²⁷

Quite similarly, Ahmed Mithad's famous novel *Felâatun Bey ve Rakım Efendi* (1875) approves a marriage between an educated slave girl, Canan, and Rakım as opposed to that of Rakım's and Josephine, who works as a governess-trainer in Rakım's mansion.⁷²⁸ Both Namık Kemal and Ahmed Mithad preferred the marriage of a slave girl and a freeman since the latter can train, and raise the social status of the former with his cultural and economic resources. Though not quite preferable to that of free-women of chastity and honor, slave women were perceived as the safety valve for preventing the Tanzimat's youth from the subversive free-women. However, as for the women, the lower limit is the male with equal cultural and financial standing. Ferdane's case in *Vâh*, and Dehri Efendi's daughter in *Mürebbiye* exemplify the extreme mistakes made by families for choosing lower status, or mismatching husbands. There is a gendered difference in the Tanzimat novels' description of what is suitable and what is not in terms of a partner in marriage. The well educated women and women with economic and cultural capital were not suggested as capable of edifying their partners. Rather, these women with

⁷²⁷ Namık Kemal , *İntibah*, 100.

⁷²⁸ Ahmed Midhat, *Felâatun Bey*, .76.

capabilities are portrayed as the victims of ignorant, envious, and fortune hunter males.

Tanzimat novelist does not refute the traditional breadwinner ideology, that is, providing of household is the men's utmost responsibility. Though they also emphasize women's responsibility and skillfulness as one of the musts of "rational managing of homes", and underline their instruction thereon, the economic asymmetry between wife and husband is not problematized in terms of creating asymmetry in decision making. In other words, there is hardly a novel which talks of the problems and conflicts between the breadwinner and homemaker, moreover happy, balanced and well functioning family is the one where man provides and wife manages assiduously in all of the early Turkish novels. These novels do not argue for, for instance, the inherent hierarchy in between providing and managing, which strips women off from having an equal control over home dynamics. Basically, Tanzimat novel believes that men and women function in different spheres of life but they are equal; actually equality is deemed to be generated since spouses "work for the same end", that is, the well functioning of the family. However, equality is not such an easy outcome to achieve in a socio-familial order which is truly patriarchal, and equality despite the difference which is generated by gendered division of labor is a fairy tale. Women's employment, the value attributed to their domestic labor and entire subordination to male breadwinner since he is the sole provider are not the concerns of male Tanzimat novelist, but below quote, which belongs to the only female author in Tanzimat generation realistically accounts how economic subordination to husbands silences women;

Talking about your concerns, and uttering words to create a pity for yourself put you into the position of a fool instead of tenderizing him. Such complaints

are called “nagging” here [in this home]. Since she complains, woman is believed to be loathsome, and deserve insult. You should not cry and complain about unfairness [...] though it is really difficult to not be upset and hurt. There is an excuse for all these: you are woman and he is man. Are these words incomprehensible for you? Well, then, you are the supported [fed] one, he is the supporter. Would you like to argue the opposite? Then you should put your hand into your pocket and prove the contrary. Don’t you have power for that? If that’s the case, you should shut up. You do not have the right to voice your opinion! Are you hungry, bare-foot, or left penniless by your husband? These are the complaints to be uttered. They do not listen and appreciate anything else. [...] ⁷²⁹

Another important point which had to do with accord between spouses was manifested in Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar’s and Ahmed Mithad’s works that the marriage between the European women and Ottoman -Muslim men are not desirable. Especially in Gürpınar’s *Şipsevdî* (originally titled as *Alafranga* in 1900’s edition, and published under this title in 1909), marriages between Ottoman men and foreign women are condemned on the grounds that it creates disharmony and confusion in terms of culture and nature of husband-wife relationships because of the latter’s (pseudo) superior cultural and national feelings. ⁷³⁰ He continues to argue that marriages between native males and foreign women can produce ill-typed children both physically and mentally as well as distorting the minds of healthy offspring by cultural confusion occurs between partners. The last point he argues about these inter-marriages is that due to the *alafranga*’s aptitude to foreign women, worthy Ottoman women of good-manners, chastity and excellence will be imprisoned at their homes, basically to spinsterhood, without having any marriage proposals. ⁷³¹

⁷²⁹ Letter no.6 from Fehime to Mehabe as excerpted in Fatma Aliye, *Levâiyih*, 25.

⁷³⁰ See Gürpınar, *Şipsevdî*, 271-273 for author’s negative thoughts about Şehim Bey and his French wife Madam Şehim.

⁷³¹ See Gürpınar’s preface to *Şipsevdî*’s 1909 edition, which is republished in *ibid.*, 30-31 for this respect.

As opposed to the aforesaid “edifying potential” of husbands for lower status wives, praise of love in marriage, and overall condemnation of parents’ interference into romantic relations in the course of marriage, in his *Sergiüzeşt*, Sami Paşazade did not consider the romance between Celal and Dilber as an ideal love that can start off a conjugal life as a Tanzimat novelist. While opposing the inhumane nature of domestic slavery and parents’ severe reaction towards Celal’s passions, Sami Paşazade did not provide any liberating potential to Dilber’s love to Celal. The author was against the slavery itself, not to the prejudices towards the love between a free man and a slave woman. This reaction can be remarkable due to his own, and his contemporaries’ disapproval of marriages between slave women and free men since these marriages were seen to be contributing to the disharmony in private lives and domestic affairs because of the formers’ ignorance and underdevelopment under the system of slavery. In through the Ottoman centuries, marriages between slave women and free men were very common and legitimate⁷³², and it should not be inadvertent for Tanzimat novelists to focus on slave women while searching for the ills inherent in the Ottoman familial ground. The subversive elements of the domestic slavery were believed to cause long-lasting impacts on the female slaves; though these female slaves could climb up the status pyramid and realise upward social mobility through marriage and birth giving, the ignorance and psychological trauma was seen as eternal in these women. The relative ease that Ottoman-Muslim men were endowed for divorce was already an everlasting threat for women especially of humble and slave origins. Concomitantly, the ex-slave status, the lower profile that

⁷³² “The female slaves are not intended for pleasure but for general household tasks. Majority of our female slaves perform tasks that other women do, from what are called maids of honor in Europe, or just as maids and cooks. [...] if the master’s wife dies falls into illness or old age, he takes a female slave as concubine and there is practically no difference between her and a legal wife. Children of that women are considered legitimate” as Ahmed Midhat cited by İsmail Parlatur, *Tanzimat Edebiyatında Kölelik*, (Ankara: TTK, 1987), 43.

the slave background bestows, and the painful experience of being under service of masters might have produced the discouraging character development in slave-mothers, and these “undesirable moral fiber” might have been incompatible with the gendered ideals prescribed for the era. It was widely accepted that the experience of a free man born from a slave mother was something also subversive; the novelist in this period could also be born out of marriages of this kind.⁷³³ And the very asymmetry revealed in the private lives of the authors might have aroused the motive to condemn slave women to free man marriages wholeheartedly. A separate study probing the biographical accounts of Tanzimat novelists would better illuminate this argument; nevertheless the portrayal of slave girls as good wives and mothers in Tanzimat fiction is endemic to Ahmed Mithad, and Namık Kemal’s only novel *İntibah*.

The parents’ intrusion into the private lives of the couples was another problem in the Tanzimat novels. Especially mother in laws’ interference into the household matters were also portrayed as creating tension between couples. In Nabizade Nazım’s *Zehra*, Sırrıcemal, who becomes the second wife of Suphi, is bought and brought in service by Suphi’s mother, Münire.⁷³⁴ Through a mutual seduction, Suphi and Sırrıcemal get involved in an affair, but Nabizade Nazım prefers to relate this event to the ignorance of Münire Hanım’s lack of insight about how to behave in a newly married couple’s abode. Actually, Münire Hanım purchases this slave girl, called Sırrıcemal, to please her son and daughter-in-law in terms of assisting domestic tasks, but Sırrıcemal’s beauty grounds the divorce of Zehra and Suphi. In Sami Paşazade’s *Sergüzeşt*, we find the rationale of purchasing

⁷³³ For example, Ahmed Midhat was the son of a Circassian female slave and a free man. See *ibid.* for this point.

⁷³⁴ Nabizade Nazım, *Zehra*, 39.

beautiful and youthful slave women for domestic service in upper class homes; the servant women should also be beautiful in upper class homes since these households have guests all the time and everything should be in accord with respect to the aesthetic criteria shaped the Ottoman upper class interiors.⁷³⁵ The exquisiteness of slave girls was a crucial for them to be purchased for the genteel households; contemporary travel accounts also support this notion that households of prominent Ottomans, i.e., Fuad Paşa's household, were full of young and attractive slave girls in İstanbul in late 1850s.⁷³⁶ Sezai also examined the problem of having beautiful slave women in upper class homes and their potential to seduce the men in those households, and being seduced by the male masters of these homes, accordingly.⁷³⁷

While parents were intervening into the setting up of marriage, they were also causing divorces and disaccord between husbands and wives. One of Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar's stories titled *Mutallaka*⁷³⁸ (The Divorced Woman) is a satirical example for this notion. In this story, Akile Hanım is a divorced woman who believes that her husband divorced her under the influence of her mother-in law's scolding. Through correspondence, she tries to remarry with her ex-husband, from whom she has a son. In a compliant manner, Mail, the husband, admits his mother's negative role in the dissolution of their marriage, but the most important part of this story is the

⁷³⁵ Sezai, 45-46.

⁷³⁶ La Baronne Durand De Fontmagne, *Kırım Harbi Sonrasında İstanbul*, (İstanbul : Tercüman Yayınları, 1977), 249-256. [c 1902] Also see memoirs of Balıkhane Nazırı Ali Rıza Bey which gave similar accounts, 363; Ahmed Midhat, *Acaib-i Alem*, (İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Klasik Yayınlar, 2004) [c1882] for how female slaves could become concubines in Ottoman households. For Ottoman domestic slavery and women slaves, see Y. Hakan Erdem, Ehud R. Toledano and M. C. Zilfi's already cited works as well as Ehud. R. Toledano, *Slavery and Its Abolition in the Ottoman Middle East*, (Seattle, London: University of Washington Press, 1998) ; Parlâtır, 42-43 for the seduction and marriage between slave girls and their owners.

⁷³⁷ Sezai, 45-46; Balıkhane Nazırı, 363-364.

⁷³⁸ Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar, "Boşanmış Kadın (Mutallaka)" in idem. , *Şık*, (İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 1997). 355-384. [c1898]

generational difference between two women; between the bride and mother in-law. For example, her mother in law perceives Akile's literacy as an evil side⁷³⁹, she criticises Akile's affection to his son as a death-end effort⁷⁴⁰, or she opposes Akile's bodily care; her make-up and clothing, severely.⁷⁴¹ Then, two women involve in endless quarrels that give way to Akile and her husband's divorce. Bad-tempered mother-in laws, or quarrels and conflicts among in-laws are often found in Tanzimat novels. Though not a novel in itself, in Fatma Aliye's fictive correspondences titled *Levâ-yih-i Hayat*, mother in-laws are also represented manipulative as they interfere into private lives of their daughter in-laws, i.e. their friendships, visitors etc., so contributing domestic troubles. In the below quote Mehabe complains that she cannot visit her, Fehame, due to Fehame's mother in-law, and in return Fehame characterises the nature of relations in between in-laws and brides in Ottoman Muslim households;

[...]We are not together anymore. Oh, I wish it was possible that we see each other more often. However, you cannot blame me for this! Because your mother-in-law looks sour-faced if I visit you a little bit frequently. But that is not the issue. I bear with lots of things in order to see you. In fact I am downhearted that she roughs you up and she sulks after my visits.⁷⁴²

Do not think the treatment I would receive from my mother-in-law as an excuse for visiting me not so often. Even if you do not visit me, she will find other reasons to rough me up. If she cannot find, she will create such reasons. [...] In order to have a livelihood, I am obliged to follow their[her husband's and in-laws'] orders and submit to their judgements no matter they are right or wrong! Oh, what wickedness is this!... But my children!...⁷⁴³

⁷³⁹ Ibid., 358-359

⁷⁴⁰ Ibid., 360.

⁷⁴¹ Ibid., 358.

⁷⁴² Letter no.1 from Mehabe to Fehame as excerpted from Fatma Aliye, *Levâ-yih*, 2.

⁷⁴³ Letter no.2 from Fehame to Mehabe as excerpted from *ibid.*, 8.

Another interesting but a destructive mother character is Firdevs Hanım in Halit Ziya Uşaklıgil's *Aşk-ı Memnu* (The Illicit Love, 1900). Firdevs Hanım is the mother of one of the main protagonists, Bihter, in this novel. In fact, Halit Ziya portrayed Firdevs Hanım as an evil-type middle-aged woman quite similarly to those of women of ill fame in the previous novels. For example, Firdevs Hanım has never been an affectionate wife and mother from the beginning and this side of her is referred very often through the work. Represented as incapability, her indifference to two basic womanly duties, wifedom and motherhood, and her indulgence in young men and extra-marital relationships caused her to be a negative character affecting her daughters' marital life and fame as respectable ladies. Bihter gets married with Adnan Bey, who is not a proper partner due to his age and widow status, both for his wealth and to get rid of her mother's negative influence on her reputation, which prevents her to receive bright marriage proposals from noble families. Actually, Halit Ziya's novel is a very important one that for the first time in the Tanzimat novel we come across with the case of *Elektra Complex*. However, in *Aşk-ı Memnu*, *Elektra complex* is an extended and unresolved one that it causes the devastation of many people at the end; Firdevs Hanım does not want her daughter to get married with Adnan Bey, since she herself is expecting a proposal from Adnan Bey. Even after marriage, her negative influence affects Bihter, her marital home, even her stepchildren. At the end, Firdevs Hanım helps the illicit affair that outbreaks in the course of events between Bihter and Adnan Bey's nephew to be disclosed. Bihter's cause to get married with Adnan Bey is another problem, which was thought to be widespread and must have been alarmed the Tanzimat novelist in this period. Though Bihter's marriage with an old widowed man is evaluated as a precaution to prevent her own reputation as an honorable woman *vis-à-vis* her ill-repute mother, Bihter's

indulgence and passion for fortune and material aspects of this marriage becomes the prime motive in the course of novel. She is represented to be fascinated with the idea that she would be the lady in charge of governing a rich and respectable household. This notion is well expressed by the quote below which depicts her passionate mood subsequent to the marriage proposal of Adnan Bey:

[...] a small, plump foot was hanging out of the mosquito net, and it was swinging nervously with a shrew that as if it was a kind of vivacious invitation which calls for set of dreams to this bed. “Here you come ostentatious mansions, white furs, mahogany rowboats, carriages, garments, jewelry, all those charming things, all those adorned dreams... All you are, come here”⁷⁴⁴.

Generally speaking, the marriages for wealth and material gains were condemned in the novels produced between 1870s and 1908. In a similar fashion, the marriage of Calibe and Sai Efendi in *Muhadarat*, and Sadi Efendi and Firuze Hanım’s marriage in *Metres*, satirical plot of Meftun and Edibe in *Şipsevidi* (1911) are examples of problematic marriages, which are made for the material concerns and self-interest. The most important notion in terms of these asymmetrical couples is that always the women are young and in search for material gains. When males are in search of affluent wives in Hüseyin Rahmi’s Meftun in *Şipsevidi*, Şatırzade Şöhret Bey in *Şık* (The Chic, 1898), and Rezaizade’s Bihruz Bey in *Araba Sevdası*, they are spendthrift - protagonists from well-heeled families trying to assure their present dwelling through marriage, not the ones looking for upward mobility as in the case for women. Here, women’s affluence and mobility oriented pursuit of potential husbands is crucial; if a woman’s cause for marriage is not for love, affection and interdependency but for material gains, her faithfulness comes under scrutiny.

⁷⁴⁴ Uşaklıgil, *Aşk-ı*, 30

Although Tanzimat novel tried to engender supposedly symmetrical motives to guide women and men alike, i.e. for coupling, marriage etc., these motives are gendered and function inequitably; if affection and faithfulness is issue under consideration, it is predominantly a female duty. For example marriages consummated through female's material concerns are destined to dissolve; Bihter's case in *Aşk-ı Memnu* epitomizes this dimension perfectly, and in such occasions women are eventually devastated. However, Tanzimat novel always opt for an opportunity for males to correct themselves, who formerly concerned and act senselessly towards seeking fortune and got married thereupon, and betrayed their wives. In other words, early novels in Turkish confer an awakening that they would supposedly achieve truly a responsible and manly attitude, reprimand their faults and chastise themselves. In addition to this, female protagonists' endurance to the deeds of unfaithful and fortune-looking husbands is another dimension derived from the double standard based on gender inequality, and *Muhadarat*, *Aşk-ı Memnu*, and Fatma Aliye's work titled *Levâ-yih-i Hayât* (The Scenes From Life, 1897-1898), which is based on fictive correspondences among five women, exemplify abovementioned double standard for marriages made for material concerns, and marital infidelity.

Polygamy is another problem that Tanzimat writers quested upon. When we talk about polygamy in the Ottoman case, it is referred to polygyny, which stands for the multiple wives, and the period before the twentieth century. *Hukuk-ı Aile Kararnamesi* (The Decree of Family Law) of 1917⁷⁴⁵ circumscribed the males' right to have many wives according to the first wives approval, and this institutional stipulation can be a reason for the decline of this issue in the novels. Duben and Behar's study over İstanbul households between 1885-1940 also provides insights on

⁷⁴⁵ See Mehmet Akif Aydın, *İslam ve Osmanlı Hukuku Araştırmaları*, (İstanbul: İz, 1996, 20-21, 177-189 for a detailed analysis of this decree.

this respect that Ottomans practiced polygamy as polygyny, and according to the census of 1885 only 2.51 percent of all males in İstanbul had more than one wife, and this rate reduced to 2.16 with respect to the Census of 1907.⁷⁴⁶ In addition to this, polygamy was practiced predominantly as bigamy, which meant, very little number of Ottoman males had more than two wives in the late nineteen-century İstanbul.⁷⁴⁷ After the nineteenth century, we do not come across with polygamy as a popular theme in the novels; this can be related to the gradual -though not overall- decline of polygamy in general due to the financial burden inflicted by this practice to household heads, however it can also be argued that extra-marital affairs instead of polygamy was demonized since the latter was still perceived as legitimate form of relationship which would provide population increase in an era population dynamics mattered more and more with regard to wars, migrations and ethno-nationalism. Whatever the case, *Turfanda mı Turfa mı*, *Muhadarat*, *Felsefe-i Zenân*, *Metres*, *Mai ve Siyah*⁷⁴⁸ (The Blue and The Black, 1897), *Mürebbiye*, *Zehra*, *Kırık Hayatlar*⁷⁴⁹ (The Broken Lives, 1902) are contemporary novels in Turkish that polygamy and extra-marital affairs were problematized. In these works, the unfaithfulness of the males and polygamy is analyzed somehow through a single discourse that such practices cause the depravation of the family life and family members. In other words, polygamy and extra-marital indulgences are criticized in terms of distorting the ideal case that spousal companionship and interdependency was disrupted.

⁷⁴⁶ Alain Duben & Cem Behar, *İstanbul Haneleri*, 161-162.

⁷⁴⁷ Ibid.

⁷⁴⁸ Halit Ziya Uşaklıgil, *Mai ve Siyah*, (İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 2003). [c1897]

⁷⁴⁹ Halit Ziya Uşaklıgil, *Kırık Hayatlar*, (İstanbul: İnkılap, 1989). [c1902]

Nevertheless, as opposed to illegitimacies and immorality inflicted by prostitution and love out of wedlock in Europe, Ahmed Midhat provides an argument sympathetic towards polygamy one of his works titled *Paris'te Bir Türk* (A Turk in Paris, 1876) but soundly contrasting what he argued in *Felsefe-i Zenân*;

Our Canonical Law of Islam does not regard human as superhuman, or angelic being and build its commands as that of Christian Canon. It [Islamic Canon] deems necessary to pave the way for all human needs. If it had not permitted polygyny for the men, who could not be content with a single wife, it would also have not regarded prostitution as dishonorableness.⁷⁵⁰ [They say] polygyny has not been practiced in Europe. Everybody has to be content with single wife. Well, that's fine but regarding their economic power who from higher classes or middle gentry is content with one and only wife? [Then] who have been managing [as mistresses] so many theatre actresses, or prostitutes as they usually called *demi-monde*?⁷⁵¹

Regarding population increase and men's temperament, or virility, Tanzimat authors adopted somewhat conflicting approaches towards polygamy, and this notion is not solely peculiar to Ahmed Midhat. Namık Kemal is also cited as a proponent of polygamy elsewhere with respect to population increase and military service.⁷⁵²

Domestic violence was another problem appearing in the Tanzimat novel, but quite seldom. Only in Ahmed Midhat's *Çengi*, and Halit Ziya's *Mai ve Siyah* pointed this problem as causing unrest in personal lives. In *Mai ve Siyah*, Vehbi batters his wife though she is pregnant, then she dies out of injuries that she has. Raci is another figure in *Mai ve Siyah* who utilises violence. Similarly, in Namık Kemal's *İntibah*, Dilaşub, concubine-wife of Ali Bey, is the victim of his violence on Mehpeyker's slander. Misailidis reports a great detail about Anna that she is abused by her

⁷⁵⁰ An excerpt from Ahmed Midhat's *Paris'te*, 160 as cited in Parla, 38.

⁷⁵¹ An excerpt from Ahmed Midhat's *Paris'te*, 215-216 as cited in *ibid.*, 38-39.

⁷⁵² See *ibid.*, 40 for this point.

husband, Coani Favini, and dies thereupon in *Temaşa-i Dünya*. However, we see that women do not actively resist to domestic violence in these examples. Even if they do not deserve these infliction of violence, they approach their husbands tolerating and mildly. Generally speaking, Ottoman Muslim women are portrayed as passive and docile individuals in the novels; a high degree of fatalism took a complete command of them. The following quote is crucial to support this point;

We poor women! When we get married we expect to get a husband or a companion, but the men do not perceive us that way. When they get married, they give less attention to their wives than to a horse or a carriage they would purchase. [...] Yes, [...] they are right on this respect, [...] because if they buy a horse and it turns out not to be good, they will be able to sell it again, but they may not be able to sell it at the same price; so they are afraid of taking a loss. However, if a woman does not turn out good, if she does not turn out to be suitable to his temperament, they leave her without any loss; they take another, a better one. Thus, they do not even consider us as significant as animals, but what can we do? They control things; they can do whatever they want.⁷⁵³

It can be claimed that in the medium of upper and upper middle class Ottoman Muslim households, marriage became the most contested issue by Tanzimat novelists. While depicting problems regarding marriage, they opted for a harmonious and conflict-free marriage from its constitution that it would contribute to the making of well-functioning families. The Tanzimat novelist chose to write upon marriage since they believed that this was among the most disorderly institutions in Ottoman society in the course of modernization. There is a crucial connection between novel-generation and reformist mind that novels were the first niche to disclose and popularize their reform proposals. Tanzimat novels frequented marriage issue quite often, since critique over marriage suited best first to create a basis for criticizing and secondly mean to transform *ancien régime*. While constructing this critical base,

⁷⁵³ Sami, 114-115

their approach was inductive and didactic at once; the Tanzimat novelist believed that administrative and political reforms would fail when unaccompanied by social reforms which would pertain the creation of a new individual, and marriage stood as the chief institution to produce ill or good type of families, thereupon proper and improper individuals. Tanzimat novel is frankly didactic since it generated behavioral codes and norms to what to do and what not to do considering marriage.

4.2.2. The Members of the Tanzimat Family: Mothers, Children and Servants

The Tanzimat novelists expressed the reformist males' unease with the contemporary state of gender relations through variety of matters. While criticizing the traditional as well as super-westernized Tanzimat male, the women's seclusion, consumption patterns to which Ottoman females accustomed, the feature and contend of women's education, the importance of mother and child relationship as well as proper female behavior in private and public spheres are the painstaking issues that Ottoman reformists took up through fictive activity. The questions and problems addressed to the "woman question" are quite central in early Turkish novels, because the novelist-reformers were trying to capture the unpleasant and problem generating features of the Ottoman family life at the point where they broke out. The proper and improper traits of family members in Ottoman families became the subject of fictive activity, which was seen and utilized as a didactic medium.

First of all, women are central characters in Tanzimat novels despite the fact that they were posited either as the source of misery or happiness for the male protagonists. In all novels examined for this study, there is always a male protagonist

who is the index of contemporary problems of the era. Women, with regard to their ill traits or personal worth, influence the lives of male protagonists, and course of events in the novels. The most important channel through which women involved with men is mothering as depicted in the novels. Approximately in every novel, there is a mother character; Tanzimat novels were chosen to be constructed around a mother-to child relationship rather than the father to child one.

Before examining the endemic features of mother-child relationships in early Turkish novels, it is better to focus on how mother-child relationship was contextualized. The absence of fathers as deceased personalities or persons abandoned their families also shaped the way mothers and children were depicted. The majority of Tanzimat novels do not have a father figure; or there is always a family, which has no father as a household head while the main course of events is taking place. *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, *İntibah*, *Zehra*, *Felâhî Bey ve Rakım Efendi*, *Muhadarat*, *Araba Sevdası*, *Şipsevidi*, *Şık*, *Aşk-ı Memnu* are prominent examples that strikingly argue about the non-existence of fathers as an influential collision over child discipline, and the negative outcomes accordingly. The early Turkish novels demonstrate the problems inherent in Ottoman Muslim families in urban setting, and these ills became symbolically effectual combined with the absence of father, the authority figure in the private domain. In other words, the absence of father is represented as a crucial factor, for example for the protagonists' upbringing, education, utilization of family property, future prospects, and probable dangers awaiting them. This might be caused by couple of reasons; first of all, the novelists aimed to write upon the social ills and unrest in familial life, and their claims over these ills, such as conspicuous consumption, lavishness, lewdness, imprudence, irresponsibility and ignorance, were idealized through the absence of a father figure

quite interestingly. To begin with, fathers were represented as personalities who positively direct and guide, especially young men's lives at the early phases of their lives. The following two quotes from Nabizade Nazım's *Zehra* and Namık Kemal's *İntibah* about the positive attribute bestowed for young protagonists' up-bringing prior to their fathers' death respectively clarifies this notion;

Suphi is a very well-bred and handsome young man. His father passed away couple of years ago, but his mother, Münire Hanım, is still alive.⁷⁵⁴

A great attention was paid for Suphi's instruction and discipline. He received the initial instruction from his father, [...] then he was sent one of the schools in their neighbourhood. [...] While living, his father placed this young man as a scribe in the undertaking of an affluent and honest merchant in *Asmaaltı*, and he [Suphi's father] passed away at ease.⁷⁵⁵

Thanks to his father's unique mildness and tenderness which is nearly an exception in our country, his [Ali Bey's] innate sincerity and kindness swelled such a way that the ones beheld his deeds and manners had thought he was an angel.⁷⁵⁶

However, Ali would indulge in contemporaneous ways and deeds that he started to pursue women in excursion areas, and Suphi's promising life would become utterly perturbed following his marriage to his boss's envious daughter, and his eventual father-in-law's decease that he wastes family property, and involved with lewd women in a way destroying not only his own life but also his mother's, his wife's and his concubine's. Non-attendance or disappearance of fathers in the course of events in early Turkish novels also embodied fathers as multitalented and resourceful personalities, and this absence in turn justified the disorders that Tanzimat youth experienced in a reinforcing manner;

⁷⁵⁴ Nabizade Nazım, *Zehra*, 13.

⁷⁵⁵ Ibid., 14.

⁷⁵⁶ Ibid., 19

When the kid [Ali Bey] reached his twenty-years of age, he lost his father. He was such a father that he used to be a friend, mentor, educator, in sum, everything for him [Ali Bey]. On his father's decease, variety of changes and troubles started to appear in Ali Bey's life one after another.⁷⁵⁷ [...] Ali, [...] lost his enjoyment about life altogether when he unexpectedly and eternally lost that beloved being[his father]; he completely became dejected.⁷⁵⁸

Moreover, in the absence of fathers, children, especially young man were easily misguided, and they fell behind to accomplish the contemporary perfect male archetype that is clearly defined in Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar's *Şipsevidi*;

When his father died, Meftun was a kid at about fourteenth to fifteenth years of age. That [Meftun's] family was indifferent to *alafranga* [up to that time]. Meftun's uncle had some connection with this [alafranga] infirmity/ malady. After Meftun's father died, his [Meftun's] uncle took the responsibility of instructing and disciplining him. He sent Meftun to Paris to complete his education. *What did this young man study in Paris? Did he study warfare, medicine, law, commerce, agriculture, or industry? He studied none of these. He wanted to pursue an easy profession.* [...] Meftun fooled his uncle, who moronically waited in İstanbul with the hope that his nephew would become an exceedingly omniscient man, with weekly-compiled letters, and he did not desist to frequent plausible institutions that he would like to attend in that country [France]. [...] He [Meftun] even ventured to arrange fake diplomas to deceive his uncle who sent a bundle of money every month with a long advising letter. *He killed time frequenting cafès, concerts, balls,* he was either in *Folies Bergères* one day or in *Olympia* after, or in *Eldorado* in the next day... He had time for neither studying nor sleeping. He was teeming with love and passion like the volcano *Vezüv*.⁷⁵⁹

Another crucial example is from Rezaizade that he specifically condemns lavish spending and pecuniary approach of young men unaccompanied by fathers;

⁷⁵⁷ Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 21.

⁷⁵⁸ *ibid.*, 22.

⁷⁵⁹ Gürpınar, *Şipsevidi*, 79. Emphasis is added.

Since Bihruz Bey was the only child of his parents he was brought up quite pampered anyway.⁷⁶⁰

[...] On his Paşa father's passing, he attained a twenty-eight lira- bequest all at once, and he immediately set about an extravagancy to annihilate that immense wealth in the absence of somebody restraining him. Since none of his mother's considerations and warnings about his behaviors has ever been influential. [...]⁷⁶¹

Actually above quote also criticizes the way parents discipline their kids; even in the health of his father, Bihruz's early education was problematical, "*he was pampered*" and he could not receive the instruction of formal schooling until he became sixteen since his father had been appointed to different posts in various provinces. He was sent to school, a *rüşdiye* [high school] when they moved to İstanbul finally, however, his father left Bihruz and his mother in the capital for another appointment. At that point private teachers were hired for Bihruz's education, but in the absence of his father these private teachers were far from providing advantage to Bihruz's personal and professional development, since Bihruz was not a disciplined student and his father could not provide monitoring to his instruction.⁷⁶² One of these private teachers, *Mösyö Piyer* (Mr. Pierre) was represented negatively contributing Bihruz's eventual character development in a way not questioning any of Bihruz's spoilt behaviour;

[...] Since French teacher called *Mösyö Piyer* was a cunning old man well accommodated him [Bihruz], he [*Mösyö Piyer*] was allowed to continue instructing him, besides, his four- lira- salary was also raised to six liras.⁷⁶³

[...] [On *Mösyö Piyer*'s intention to initiate a debate about Suez Canal] Bihruz Bey was absolutely paying no attention to what *Mösyö Piyer* was

⁷⁶⁰ Recaizâde M. Ekrem, 16

⁷⁶¹ *ibid.*, 18.

⁷⁶² *Ibid.*, 15-18.

⁷⁶³ *Ibid.*

telling, even if he listened, he would not understand anything. [...] Bihruz Bey's summoning his teacher for a conversation about love completely surprised him [Mösyö Piyer]. [...] He wanted to scold him [Bihruz] severely. However, he could not do it; since [...] his monthly salary of six liras [...] was like an esteemed companion. Whenever Bihruz infuriates Mösyö Piyer, that esteemed companion appeared on the scene.[...] ⁷⁶⁴

As revealed from the above quote, even teachers are represented to take advantage of the young men in the absence of their fathers. Fathers, however through their absence, are symbolized as personae capable of providing the proper behavioral lines that a young man should inherit; the novels written between the second half of the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries call for zealous and capable fathers who could influence their children's personality development positively and deliberately; their untimely passing away creates the perfect setting for the young males, and whole family's perish for moral and financial accounts. Fathers' positive influence is not reserved for their children, but for their wives as well; it can also be argued that with the accompanying of a "good family father", mothers also accomplish certain virtues indispensable for child discipline and mothering in these novels. However, with their loss, mothers' such accomplishment becomes defied and interrupted; the following excerpt from Namık Kemal's *İntibah* about how Ali Bey's mother misleadingly tries to change his mood demonstrates this point interestingly;

His [Ali Bey's] mother forgot his own suffering about her husband's death [...]. Though she was not very cultured, she was an extremely intelligent woman. She had spent nearly twenty-five years with a sophisticated and cultured man, she had benefited from his education, and she had learnt how to acknowledge the facts about whatever she witnessed and heard. ⁷⁶⁵
If she let herself go with respect to her husband's death and subsequent grief of her son thereupon, [...] she would also lose her sweet little kid. While trying to find a way out for her son's melancholy, she summoned up

⁷⁶⁴ Ibid., 47-48.

⁷⁶⁵ Ibid., 2

*Çamlıca*⁷⁶⁶ that is quite close to their home. [...] Realizing the loveliness of weather and countryside, Ali Bey's mother persuaded him for a promenade with requests, insistence and all kinds of difficulty. [...] However, the kid gradually started to enjoy those areas thanks to the recurring excursions to *Çamlıca*. And this enthusiasm for countryside became a habit day by day such that he became bored if he did not frequent *Çamlıca* for couple days.⁷⁶⁷ [On one of these days] His friends started chattering the women passing around. [...] while he was wandering with his friends, he made a gesture in the way he again learnt from his friends for one of the carriages passing by. [...] Poor young man, how could he foresee that that gesture would turn his life into a tragedy?⁷⁶⁸ Three problems like pursuing women for couple of days, lying, and perceiving his mother's desire for felicity bewildered him. [...]⁷⁶⁹

As exposed by the above quote, Ali Bey starts frequenting excursion areas and imitating the conduct of contemporaneous youth in those areas, such as courting, and pursuing women. Though through naivety, his mother causes his debasement that he eventually falls in love with a famous courtesan in one of these excursions. He meets with Mehpeyker in *Çamlıca* to where he was previously sent by his mother to escape from the melancholy his father's decease inflicted on him. Again with respect to the quotes above, it can also be argued that the factors preparing the debasement of Tanzimat youth in early Turkish novels became valid through the allusion of "not present fathers", and this situation became intensified with incautious mothers who are paralyzed with their husbands' death that they could not recognize apparent dangers awaiting their sons, or the personality flaw that their sons had anymore. In sum, it can be claimed that the crises that Tanzimat youth experience were attributed to their fathers' non-attendance, and non-attendance of fathers in turn disaccords everything, including mothers' pre-acknowledged virtues and achievements.

⁷⁶⁶ A famous excursion area on the hills of Üsküdar, İstanbul.

⁷⁶⁷ Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 23.

⁷⁶⁸ Ibid., 26-27

⁷⁶⁹ Ibid.

Especially the comparison made between the period before and after fathers' disappearance, the ideals of parenthood are somehow indirectly revealed. Constructing an ideal father model by arguing through father's loss might also have been comfortable for the novelists, since they did not need to create a disturbing environment of father-child dispute as a plot. In other words, early Turkish novelist might not have desired to use the generational dispute between father and children while claiming a new father model and reappraisal of generational relationships. Rebelling against traditional authority has always been an unresolved dilemma in the mind of Tanzimat intellectual; and this might have been reflected itself to the process ideal father model was created in the fictive activity, and not through a father-child dispute plot but through the absence of fathers, a new father model was suggested. It can also be claimed that instead of transforming the traditional outlook of a father through the reciprocal dissatisfaction and generational conflict, it was more persuasive to conceptualize the problems generated by unattended and abandoned families; both the problems of contemporary youth were criticized and ideals about new fatherhood were suggested smoothly still efficiently by the *münevvers* at once. Whatever the case, criticized or appraised, parenthood is the core and problematical issue around which early Ottoman novels were generated.

As for the absence of fathers, other claims can also be made; for example the regularity of untimely passing away of good fathers or their simple disappearance as an aspect preparing the destruction of Ottoman Muslim families and youth might have been caused by the general lack of a just father-ruler model which characterized political criticism of the Tanzimat. In other words, the traditional Ottoman political philosophy opted for a just ruler as an ideal, and a just father figure is the counterpart of this just ruler in family; Ottoman society was imagined as a family and the sultan

overruling this society resembled an overseeing father.⁷⁷⁰ According to Parla, with the stipulations laid by Tanzimat the traditional affectionate absolutism of the Ottoman ruler became questionable and limited together with the shortcomings of legitimacy as a result of institutional reform movement. Basically, the rise of *Bâb-ı Âli* (Sublime Porte) bureaucracy and modern legal provisions by-passed the traditional figure of just, monitoring and absolute father-ruler; and consequently the authority of the absolute ruler was limited, and *Bâb-ı Âli*'s influence was expanded thanks to the Tanzimat reforms in the institutional structure of the Ottoman state. Indeed, the socio-political criticism of Tanzimat born out of these changes, and initial generation of Tanzimat intellectuals quested for an able, mighty and just ruler who would incorporate the traditional good-old ways of ruling with the necessities of the day. With respect to Parla's skilful argument it can also be suggested that the legitimacy crisis produced by the institutional changes and the question of uninterrupted reform which would not fully exclude the tradition, namely Islamic and Middle Eastern traditions of fair ruling, also reflected itself to the novel as a quest for an ideal; that is, just and able father who would prevent his family especially his children from evil sides of westernization, and direct the way to modernization which was perceived not full but partial adaptation of western institutions and ways with respect to the unique needs of Ottoman society. In short, the search for an ideal and able father is parallel to the quest for an ideal ruler who

⁷⁷⁰ According to Jale Pala Ottoman political philosophy was greatly influenced from Middle Eastern traditions of political philosophy. While referring Mardin and Timur to support this claim, she argues that Ottoman political tradition was actually the coalescence of Indo-Persian political philosophy with Arabic revision of Neo-Platonic philosophy through Koran and Hadith traditions. With regard to this model, an affectionate and just ruler is idealised as a monitoring father who cares and knows what's going on about his subjects with the help of a team of consultants, though still absolute. However, the institutional changes initiated by Tanzimat also brought in changes in the absolute authority of the ruler, and in turn this caused the search for revised father-ruler in the political and fictive texts produced in the era with respect to the institutional changes. For a concise account of this argument, see Parla, 14-16, 52-54; Şerif Mardin, *Jön Türklerin Siyasi Fikirleri*, (İstanbul: İletişim, 1996), 22-31; Taner Timur, *Osmanlı Kimliği*, (İstanbul: Hil, 1987), 64-72.

would guide, guarantee and frame the reform successfully in the age of serious societal transformations. The first novelists, regarding the debate suggested above, had a feeling of “loneliness” and consequent lack of a rational and contemporary father model that can be suggested as “the ideal”, therefore through the implication of fathers as absent but seminal personalities they constructed the ideal father and ruler at once. The absence of fathers and the analogy drawn between fatherless youth and not properly governed Ottoman society, in other words, turned to be something positive and productive that the novelist easily constructed the indispensable attributes of an ideal father. In couple of novels produced in the era, Tanzimat youth and families were accompanied by their fathers, however, the existence of fathers did not prevent the imperfection of both those families and their children; this actually contributes the soundness of the argument that Ottoman Muslim household was in need of a new, able and perfect father. Fatma Aliye’s famous novel *Udi* (1899) provides a striking case for this account; Nazmi, an Ottoman provincial administrator and father of three children was represented as having shortcomings stemmed from his decadent youth in this novel. Though Nazmi had corrected himself by leaving certain habits such as entertaining himself outside of home, and alcoholism, the way he treats his young son is still problematical. In contrast to how he had good relationships with his youngest daughter, Bedia, his relation with Şemi is strenuous. Fatma Aliye through an intervening authorship style comments on the way Nazmi performs as a father as follows;

Nazmi regretted, and repented to spend his youth entertaining himself and wandering around. He did not want his son to impersonate these deeds that he gave up.[...] ⁷⁷¹

⁷⁷¹ Fatma Aliye, *Udi*, (İstanbul: Selis Kitaplar, 2002), 26. [c1899]

[Şemi's] father [Nazım] wants his son to acknowledge the wickedness of the things that he himself had experienced but eventually attributed as evil before he [Şemi] tries them. How nice it is! What kind of a perfection that a young man inhabits a life having no room for regret, which is a hard way to take, and he does not come up with any shaming moment in his life when he looks at his previous deeds! That was the way Nazmi Bey wished for his son [...] ⁷⁷² Nazmi was a literate and quite a thoughtful man. While having conversations with his children, he often made room for such advices. He was insistent that these advices would be influential over his children. Şemi was obliged to account for his father for the hours that he spent outside after work. [...] [His Father] perceived any kind of undertaking against his advices as a big audacity. ⁷⁷³

Actually, Fatma Aliye is quite critical about Nazmi's fathering even though he repented, and amended himself;

[...] A person acts out the way he recommended would be a decent son, and a standing man, spouse and father. Certainly... A father that would be model for his children... However, his youth could not be a good embodiment and moral for his children. The advices he has given to Şemi resembled instructing grammar without having instructed the alphabet of a language. ⁷⁷⁴

Albeit Nazmi provided behavioral lines for his children, his flaws in the past periled his present standing as a reliable father, and Fatma Aliye revealed this while supplementing the degree of her criticism about Nazmi in the course of events;

Nazmi was not mistaken about his ideas. His advices were good and appropriate. However, he wanted his son defer to the worthy advices that he previously did not obey. ⁷⁷⁵ When [Nazmi] he said that "a person should not commit such and such wicked deeds", he could not prevent Şemi to think about his [Nazmi's] own past. [At those times] Şemi immediately remembered a sorrowful family, and a dejected mother, [...] then he recalled that he had fallen asleep, awakened

⁷⁷² Ibid., 28

⁷⁷³ Ibid.

⁷⁷⁴ Ibid., 34.

⁷⁷⁵ Ibid., 28-29.

by a noise, saw his mother whilst she was trying to undress and guide a family man to the bed who was drained of strength out of inebriation. [...] At that moment, that father to whom a child would like to obey and respect, and that father required to guard them was actually in need of a woman's assistance.⁷⁷⁶

The *beys* and *efendis* [fathers] of neighbors around, or the ones next to them come back knocking the doors of their homes on time. Şemi used to watch these from the window, [but] his family could not experience this happiness. A mother growing pale with the sorrow besieged her soul, a depressed sister sighing though she was in the age of merriment [...] ! They could not perform the necessary cheerfulness for the dining time.

[...] When his father[Şemi's father] was on time to return home for few nights, he was in a different mood and attitude than the morning. A different look! A different addressing! Extreme rage! Children were yearning for a fatherly aptitude to respect and obey him. Though his fatherly advices uttered through sincere voice influenced them, his praises out of inebriation made them uncomfortable.⁷⁷⁷

As revealed from the long quote above, once the children witnessed the decay of their parents, specifically their fathers, it is not seen probable for them to erase the unpleasant memoirs, live decently, and correct themselves if they are misguided. Parallel to these claims, for instance Şemi started drinking, though in secrecy, after he lost his wife in childbed, and Bedia blindly got married with a wayward officer.⁷⁷⁸ Fatma Aliye's conception over proper fatherhood is also interesting in terms of emphasizing the irreversibility of childhood reminiscences. In other words, childhood is accepted as a very crucial period after which one's life is determined once and for all. Accordingly, the former improper life style of fathers is also condemned to influence the future well-being of the children negatively. In the following quote, Şemi's elder sister comments that their father's drinking and unruly behaviours would be disempowering for her in the future illustrating the aforesaid claim;

⁷⁷⁶ Ibid., 29-30.

⁷⁷⁷ Ibid., 30-31.

⁷⁷⁸ Ibid., 26-35.

I cannot bear with such things [drinking and unruly behaviors] as my mother does. I would surely object if my husband behaves accordingly. I bear with any retribution. However, I know I cannot tolerate [such behaviors]. I feel it. So how will I have gall to criticize my husband? How will I reproach my husband? If my own father mercilessly spoils my future in this way, a stranger [prospective husband] will not have a pity for me, that's the way it will be!⁷⁷⁹

Basically, Fatma Aliye also despised the undesirable ways fathers behave in terms of preparing a problematical future. In contrast to what previous novelists did, she did not employ an absent father, but a defective one owing to his wasted youth, and in this way she urged for a rehabilitated fatherhood. In short, all-absent or untimely passed fathers in novels prior to Fatma Aliye stood for the ideals of fatherhood, and this claim is reversed through the deficient but alive father in Fatma Aliye's *Udi*, though she similarly served to draw what is desirable and what is not to act as a father. Different from the male novelists, Fatma Aliye urged for an all –consistent and entirely incontestable father ideal if he is to guide and guard a family through the texts she produced.

As the last corollary for the non-existence of fathers in the literary texts produced in Tanzimat era, the Tanzimat novelists' deliberate criticism over motherhood can be suggested. In fact, Ottoman Muslim motherhood was the most problematic issue, and issue over which Tanzimat intellectuals ardently speculated. Through the absence of a father figure in majority of novels produced in that era, novelist –intellectuals tested, retested and draw the boundaries between what ought to be a good mother and what ought not to be. Therefore, the rest of this part is dedicated to discuss motherhood in Tanzimat novels.

⁷⁷⁹ Ibid., 34.

To begin with, it should be noted that Tanzimat novelists were critical about mothers and motherhood in Ottoman Muslim households. Generally speaking, they complained about the superstitious, ill-fated practices surrounding motherhood, and mothers' disinterestedness, powerlessness and lack of initiative in terms of leading their children's lives into good. Especially through the disappearance of fathers from the plot of Tanzimat novels, Ottoman Muslim mothers' defects in mothering became increasingly influential. Celebrating or vilifying mothers in the absence and sometimes inertia of fathers, Ottoman novelist- intellectual completed the desirable behavioral scheme for proper parenting. These novels and depiction of motherhood in the medium of them are quite important to detect both the values attributed to motherhood in Ottoman Muslim community and the ways it was practiced. In short, mother-child relationship became a central theme about which disorders in Ottoman Muslim households were discussed. Though referring to conventional attributes, mothers are represented protective, overseeing, or at least silent observers for their children in the Tanzimat novels, however this reference was utilized to emphasize their inefficacious involvement with the personal experience of their children. For example, in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, Talat's mother, Saliha Hanım is well aware that there is a matter bothering Talat though she does not know its content. She believes to monitor Talat from a distance with the fear of spoiling him, and actually this signifies the problems regarding communication and affection inherent in mother-child relationship. Saliha Hanım is a silent spectator for her son's behaviour, and Şemseddin Sami depicts this notion in a slightly approving manner;

Every mother loves her son! But [...] Saliha Hanım loves her son more than many other mothers for variety of reasons. Nevertheless, owing to her thinking and sagacity, she does not express the love and affection inside of

her to her son, and do not allow him to be wayward. Because, you already know that ... some children, and youth who brought up as wayward...⁷⁸⁰

While emphasizing and idealizing the centrality of mother-child relationship, Şemseddin Sami was careful enough to warn us against the extreme forms of affection that a mother can exert on her child. Another model mother suggested in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* is the mother of Saliha Hanım, who helps Saliha and Rıfat to get married, though this couple's marriage is not desirable at the beginning due to Rıfat's trouble-some home. When Saliha's mother realizes that her daughter and Rıfat would commit suicide for their unresolved claim to get married, she forces her husband to allow their marriage.⁷⁸¹ However, Fitnat is an orphaned young woman, and her mother's absence, which left her to the protection of a stepfather and a step-grandmother, caused her demise.⁷⁸² In short, Fitnat has no mother that she can be surrounded by her protection and affection while she is forced to get married without consent. In *Araba Sevdası*, Bihruz Bey's, the main protagonist's mother is depicted as an ineffectual mother who is able to interfere neither to his lavish spending nor his up bringing.⁷⁸³ Recaizade criticized both Bihruz's improper treatment of his mother, and his mother's inability to posit herself as an authority over Bihruz. For example, Bihruz often ignores to visit his mother if he is not cheerful, and he also deceives her to get extra income for lavish expenditures.⁷⁸⁴ Recaizade blames Bihruz's mother slightly, since he mentions for several times that his mother's feeble influence is

⁷⁸⁰ Sami, 58.

⁷⁸¹ Ibid., 61-62.

⁷⁸² Ibid, 141-183.

⁷⁸³ Ekrem, 18.

⁷⁸⁴ Ibid.,18, 150-152.

caused not by her lack of enthusiasm in him, but because of the “genteel life” that they owed to their noble origin;

Since Bihruz Bey was left to the hands of wet nurses and men servants assigned to his service and he was a suckling infant by being a descendent of a vizier dynasty, he saw his mother very seldom. After he became a child, he spent time with his parents not often, because he was going to school or riding ponies around the market. When he reached his puberty, he indulged in carriages. Then, he was afflicted to *alafranga* malady. Subsequently his Paşa father died, and he became an extravagant and wasted a lot, he squandered and while dealing with the results of these things, he could not have time to see his mother for an hour though they were living under the same roof.⁷⁸⁵

Fatma Hanım , Ali Bey’s mother in *İntibah*, and Münire Hanım, Suphi’s mother in *Zehra*, were also posited as incompetent mothers who cannot act decisively under the threat of seditious women. Both of them are disguisedly but still comprehensively condemned by the authors, in Ali Bey’s case, Fatma Hanım is blamed to be very passive in terms of accepting every wish of Ali, and in Suphi’s case, Münire Hanım is accused of being responsible for bringing a slave woman, who initiates the Suphi’s devastation, to her son’s nuptial home. Both of these careless mothers die out of sorrow, on the streets. Their lack of strength for competent authority, and ill-fated mothering capacity cause them not to be able to control their sons, and family property. Again in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, Fitnat’s grandmother from her mother’s side causes the sorrow of Fitnat’s parents by not allowing them to get married again. According to her, she is doing the best by preventing Fitnat’s mother from a disrespectful and cruel husband, but in the long run, she causes a tragedy, which also affects Fitnat.⁷⁸⁶

⁷⁸⁵ Ibid., 151.

⁷⁸⁶ Sami, 119-124.

Yet, Halit Ziya Uşaklıgil's *Aşk-ı Memnu* provides the extreme forms of ill mothering as personalized in Firdevs Hanım's post-partum behavior;

In two years, Peyker, and three years after her, Bihter was born. These two events were like two disasters for Firdevs Hanım. [...] she was acting like a foe, who always finds a reason to quarrel with her children, whom she believed that they are the creatures aimed to prevent her from being young.⁷⁸⁷

Uşaklıgil emphasized the mothers' role as a model for the young women in this work; though Bihter gets married to Adnan Bey both for accomplishing her material desires and protesting against her mother, she still has an expectation of a happy union. However, her adventure with Adnan' Bey's nephew suggested that she is under her mother's "eternal" bad influence;

That is to say, there was something in her blood, something in the very cells of her blood, which took her out, thus, for no reason, and made her entirely into Firdevs Hanım's daughter. She was directing all responsibility of this disgrace to her mother. She was in absolute animosity to this woman, she was in disgust of her, and she was sulking her destiny that made her the daughter of this woman.⁷⁸⁸

The mother was like a phase from the future of her daughter.⁷⁸⁹

As opposed to Bihter's treatment of Nihal, Adnan Bey's daughter from his deceased wife, and Firdevs Hanım's uneasy perception of being a mother and grandmother at once, Madame de Courton, who works in Adnan Bey's *yalı* (waterside residence) as a *mürebbiye* (governess-trainer), stands as a potential and genuine mother;

⁷⁸⁷ Uşaklıgil, *Aşk-ı*, 16.

⁷⁸⁸ Ibid., 194

⁷⁸⁹ Behlul's perception about Firdevs Hanım ibid., 267.

She [Madame de Courton] had an immense requirement of loving: she could not see her mother, she could not love her father, her heart's aged virginity, which has never felt a commitment to anybody and has been fluttering in dispossession of love, always looks for something to sacrifice itself; she befriends the children around her, the servants of the house that she works for, the cat, the parrot, and she hurls the hidden treasure of her heart.⁷⁹⁰

The idea of being the mother of Nihal is honestly related to the most painful dispossession among her other deprivations... The tears for all kinds of yearning in the heart of self-sacrificing women can cease, but one among these, the pain of being deprived of motherhood, is a scar [...].⁷⁹¹

[...] the nature places a cradle that cannot stand to be empty in women's soul. There is an empty cradle like this in the soul of this old girl, [...] too. [...] There appears a sacred duty [...] in front of this old girl: helping this child [Nihal] to forget about her mother's loss.⁷⁹²

Namık Kemal wrote “the exasperation of a mother to her child lasts at most till a wet scarf becomes dry [...].”⁷⁹³ in *İntibah* for the aggression and neglect Ali Bey inflicts at home after he indulged in Mehpeyker, the courtesan. While being criticized to be over indulgent and submissive to their kids, mothers' self-sacrifice actually praised. The self-sacrificing women figures in the absence of real mothers are also quite common characters in the Tanzimat novel. For example, Fedayi in *Felâatun Bey ve Rakım Efendi* brings up and care Rakım after his parents die. Similarly, Bedia in Fatma Aliye's *Udî* takes care of her niece after her mother passes away in child-bed, and she becomes the only guardian of her especially young girl's father dies; Bedia has to resort into working life to support her financially. The orphanhood in the Tanzimat novel is another common theme; the authors might have frequented this subject in order to stress the significance and duty of parenthood. The tragedies that the protagonists experience are addressed as the outcomes of the absence of parents;

⁷⁹⁰ Ibid., 62.

⁷⁹¹ Ibid., 64.

⁷⁹² Ibid., 66.

⁷⁹³ Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 118.

if we keep in mind that these novels were produced within the Ottoman century of dissolution, and Ottomans had come up with the problem of protective social services for orphans, the authors' call for women for dutiful "mothering" in specific, and all adult individuals for "parenting" in general is remarkable. The Tanzimat novels' orphan also stands for the dangers waiting for the uncontrollable and wandering youth, who had parents. The lack of mindful parental control and instruction can be accepted as positing the Tanzimat youth as orphans stood at the verge of various grave hazards.

Evangelinos Misailidis talks a great deal about the children who were not under any protective guardianship. Especially the section devoted to the prostitutes in *Pera* (Beyoğlu) is quite crucial in terms of this notion.⁷⁹⁴ Mehpeyker in *İntibah*, Periveş in *Araba Sevdası*, Ürani, the Greek courtesan in *Zehra* are the fallen women, who were ill-treated, mal-directed and abused by the guardians assigned for them after losing their parents. However, only Misailidis suggested an organized state initiative to solve the problem of "orphans". The problems related to the safekeeping of orphaned children with respect to prostitution will be dealt later in this section.

Another problem related to children and up bringing revealed by the Tanzimat fiction is the persons that the families entrusted their children. Especially upper class Ottoman families were under severe criticism of novelists that they leave their children to ill-mannered *mürebbiye*, ignorant wet nurses, and simple servants and slaves, and this tendency was criticised. The problem related to unaware and *alamode* choices made for the governess-trainers are quite significant in Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar's *Mürebbiye*. Anjel, an ex-prostitute, is employed as a *mürebbiye* without any investigation owing to her French origin. In *Jön Türk*, slave women and

⁷⁹⁴ Misailidis, 158-233.

concubines in her home bring up Ceylan, the main character, and she learns the exotic elements of harem life in a way depriving her chastity and innocence. In *Jön Türk*, harem is under severe criticism that it is the domain under moral corruption, and superstition. Bihruz in Recaizade Mahmut Ekrem's *Araba Sevdası* is another example for the children who were left unattended to the evil influence of tutors and governesses.

One finds the portrayal of mothering in upper class homes in Tanzimat novels so that what is desirable and what is not is depicted thereupon. For example, Celal's mother in Sami Paşazade Sezai's *Sergüzeşt* is somewhat in between the good and an irresponsible mother, and the author tried to express his thoughts about the mothers' approach to their offspring in Ottoman society through the medium of Zehra Hanım;

The passion for title and felicity, the desire to supremacy, and the fancy for wealth and prominence was inherent in Asaf Paşa's wife Zehra Hanım as it was in every woman. [...] she was yearning for a bright marriage for her son. But she also had lofty ambitions for him. Sometimes she was imagining that she took the daughter of the richest, the noblest and the greatest family of İstanbul as a bride for her son, then she did not contented with this and thought about presenting her son as a groom for the palace.⁷⁹⁵

With regard to the quote above, it was in a way praised for mothers to wish the best for their children, however, the motherly desire to will "the utmost" was criticized. In other words, novelists argued for a balance, a considerate reckoning which would also make room for the children's and youth's standpoint. Again, instead of absolute condemnation of motherly attitudes in hand, a comparative evaluation is utilized to prove the "ill" and "proper" forms of motherly stance. Rather than creating a powerful and overt aversion, the novelists sought to provide the true and guided practice of motherhood employing a lenient criticism which would neither terrify

⁷⁹⁵ Sezai, 72.

their readers nor set themselves in a radical mood. The frequent revisiting of the issue “mothers’ natural aptitude and affection for children” and the essential decency accredited for motherhood should be the basic reference point that Ottoman Muslim motherhood could be recovered. Tanzimat novelist, probably for this, quite often underlined that mothers were attached to their children, and they could tolerate anything their children wished thanks to this common feature that unite all of them as mothers. Zehra Hanım, Celal’s mother in *Sergüzeşt*, also has this characteristic feeling of insight that is only intrinsic in mothers, and she reacts to Celal’s romantic failure and sorrow as follows;

[...] Oh! I committed a murder... I hurt my own child... I perished my little one myself. He was in fever till the morning. As soon as he opened his eyes, the first word he uttered was “Dilber!”... Oh, I cannot stand this anymore.
[...] I thought that this was a temporary zeal and I did away with her. Now I understand that I made a very big mistake... I cannot sacrifice my son to a goal, or persistence... What would I do with the felicity and title if he does not survive?⁷⁹⁶

Even if motherly feeling of attachment and affection is praised as universal and positive, it should be “guided” with respect to the early novels generated in late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. We grasp this requirement of guided so better mothering through the criticism accentuated by male protagonists. In other words, mothers’ conventional aptitude for their children should be reconstructed through rationality. In Sami Paşazade Sezai’s *Sergüzeşt*, we see that this motherly feeling is degraded and criticized by Celal’s father, Asâf Paşa, rigorously. Asâf Paşa’s thoughts on mothers’ influence over children are quite scolding, and they are pointing the traditional values related to mothers in the Ottoman context. Sezai chose to utter the conventional prejudices about mother-child relationship through Asâf

⁷⁹⁶ Ibid., 104.

Paşa while the latter comments on Celal's desire to get married with Dilber, the servant girl, as follows;

Oh, these mothers! They spoil their children's future all the time...Be sure that it is just a little whim, a baseless yearning, a passing desire. His grief is just for tonight, and is half-over already. That's all there is to it. If you want to start it up once more, that's your own business. But I am definitely not in favor ... I am not going to tolerate Celal's craziness and take a servant girl into a family as deep-rooted as ours...⁷⁹⁷

The majority of Tanzimat novels assumed a conflict between the mothers and fathers in terms of treating their children, and this conflict was posited as a danger for the well being of the child. However, this conflict is uttered through fathers; that is, women's caring and affectionate attitudes were evaluated by fathers, and if there was to be a criticism towards the irrelevancy of this relevant motherly feeling, it is spoken through fathers. Affection, in other words, was worth to care for child discipline and bringing-up generations, however, it had to be revived rationally; the possibility that misguided motherly affection would spoil the youth marked one of the differences that new motherhood entailed.

In addition to this, the father figure, and mother *vis-à-vis* the father were perceived crucially affiliated with the personality development of the child. For instance, Ali Bey in *İntibah* was tolerated and spoiled by his father's indulgence in him in his childhood.⁷⁹⁸ Bedia in *Udi* was instructed by her father, and actually exemplify the sole example of affectionate father-daughter relationship. Saliha Hanım in *Taaşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* is under the defence of her mother when she reveals that she wants to get married with Rifat Bey, and actually her mother helped

⁷⁹⁷ Ibid.

⁷⁹⁸ Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 19-21.

her to realize this aspiration. In general, the fathers, if they exist in the plot, stance against the young protagonists' desires more severely than their mothers in the Tanzimat novel. This can be related to the conception of new fatherhood that fathers should be incorporated into the child rearing practices and stand as influential partners while providing the fundamental discipline to youngsters. In other words, the segregated nature of Ottoman Muslim households, the gendered division of labor which had to do with males as providers and women as mothers and homemakers was tried to be reconstructed that fathers should be included in, still guiding and providing principles and rules both for mothers and children. It can be argued that mother-child relationship which was consistently oriented and affection-based, made its onset in the Tanzimat fiction. Accordingly, mothers and fathers were posited to be partners, though asymmetrical, in child-up-bringing due to the latter's upper hand over what was to be done and *vice versa*. The cross-examination of contemporaneous advice genre for families and child discipline would provide insights for this point. Often referring to his own situation, the protagonist in Misailidis' *Temaşa-i Dünya* warns parents to take up the responsibility of disciplining their children seriously, and he crucially highlights the fathers' contribution to this process;

Since child discipline is the most crucial issue, my situation should be preclusion for parents that they should pay attention to the proper discipline of their children. Since the essence of mutual understanding among people is proper discipline, and one should avoid setting up unstable bases.⁷⁹⁹ If a father takes care of his children's discipline at the proper time, and if he inculcates his kids about their duties firstly towards God, secondly towards humanity, thirdly towards their ancestors and parents, and lastly towards their selves, how it is possible to have misbehaving children? [...] If a father is acquiring wealth for his children, why should not he lead his children to study the way for preserving and managing that wealth? [...]⁸⁰⁰

⁷⁹⁹ Misailidis, 36.

⁸⁰⁰ Ibid., 312.

Another issue addressed in novels written in this period was child-welfare, and especially the customs related to physical care for the children. Since he predominantly deals with the provincial events and populations as well as urban life, we often come upon harmful practices related to infant care in Misailidis work. For example, the practice of swaddling, and use of opium and other harmful drugs for calming down the troublesome children are all condemned on account that they are abusive and hazardous customs.⁸⁰¹

[...] since I was weak by birth, and as if it was not acknowledged that I would hardly survive, the women folk [who took care of me] swaddled me very tightly and made me so stiff that I could barely inhale owing to their ill practices [...]⁸⁰²

In order to prevent her from my offences, the woman looking after me had often given me opium and *tiryak* [thearica] to put me in to sleep. And if my grandfather had not heard, and had prevented her to do so, my wet-nurse would certainly have put me into sleep everlastingly, such kind of poisonous soporific drugs are still used by mothers and wet-nurses for putting them[children] into sleep so that they would be untroubled, and they are totally oblivious of harming those innocents. This should be a warning for mothers.⁸⁰³

Actually child welfare and physical treatment regarding nourishment and sanitation towards children are among the mostly frequented issues in Ottoman advice genre. Numerous books, pamphlets, newspaper and journal articles which also referred European literature over modern means for child upbringing were written especially after 1850s for calling mothers' attention. It can be said that child welfare in general, discipline and physical care in particular became one of the most popular subjects of

⁸⁰¹ Ibid, 33-34.

⁸⁰² Ibid., 33

⁸⁰³ Ibid., 35-36

the era between 1840s and 1900s. Tanzimat novels also provided critical insights over child care and mothering. According to Tanzimat writers, parents' care, especially the way mothers care their children is quite crucial since early instruction and proper care prepares the child for future and colors its moral outlook. In quite a caricaturizing way, Hüseyin Rahmi depicts the way Ottoman mothers treated their children through the example of Vesile Hanım, a remarkable negative character in *Şipsevidi*;

The early education and discipline for Vesile Hanım's children is given at the front door of their home. There are small chairs which have holes below and bolts in front, and they are purchased from Uzunçarşı for [seating] kids. Vesile Hanım seats her children down on these. She thrusts them a slice of bread, or a fruit like apple or orange with respect to the season. She opens one of the leaves of the front door: [she addresses the kid] "listen here dear, soon giddi-ups [horses] will pass by!" [...] and she herself goes back to deal with housework.

Kid's chamber pot is down there, her food in her hand, a perfect street panorama in front. Uproar of passers-by...Poor kid is provided with everything. This kid sits and enjoys there for hours. Sometimes dogs snatch her bread or roll. If her face is smudged, these dogs even lick it. Then the girl cries out; "mommy, the doggie took my bread"....[...] But she does not go out to check her leaving what she is busy with. She gives consoling replies for the girl's crying outs. And the girl is distracted that way.

Boys play their games such as hopscotch, leapfrog, etc., in front of her. Hasene [the kid] hears all the nasty words and insolences that children uttered for each other while playing these games. She not only hears them, but also records them like a phonograph. Sometimes she addresses such bad words to her father at the dining table that poor man asks his wife:

-“Take this little scamp way from me. I will give her punch in the face that her chin will be smashed [otherwise]. Look, she swears. From whom she learns this filth?”

-[Vesile Hanım] Guess from whom my dear? It is either you or me... She has not attended school yet to learn these. Why do you get mad with the remarks of such a small kid? How does she know cursing? [...] The kid at such an age cannot be even aware of what she says...

Smiling shamelessly, Hasene [the kid] remarks;

Why I cannot be aware? Of course I know what I mean. What the heck.....
[...]

Her parents try her out meticulously. And they are greatly astonished due to her broad but unmannerly knowledge she obtained from streets which is a sort of primary school for dilapidated children.⁸⁰⁴

Accordingly, the physical violence is condemned that it destroys the child rather than disciplining it.⁸⁰⁵ Superstitious nannies, home attendants and mothers are also condemned to bring up “disturbed” children. For example, in Mehmed Celâl’s *Küçük Gelin*, main protagonist Celâl owes his depression and psychological disturbance to the horrifying stories told by his nannies, and once again underlining the importance of fathers as personalities who should have an upper hand over child discipline, his father, Halim Bey comments as follows;

Oh! Alas! Such stories, such tales of bogeyman! Anecdotes of fierce-looking woman and Wednesday witch! These are infiltrated into the mind of our children by the ignorant nannies as you see. After realizing what had happened, Halim Bey told [them] that such stories are really harmful since they direct children to terrifying dreams.⁸⁰⁶

He[Celal] was not brave at all later in his life, but he was surely very fearful in his childhood. His mind was so saturated with tales of ogress and he blew up the characters in these stories out of proportion through his imagination in such a way that, if left in the darkness, he used to cry out.⁸⁰⁷

In another occasion, Mehmed Celâl argues about the disturbing nature of *harem*, which is the secluded dominion of women in Ottoman upper class households, indeed covertly accentuating the superstition attributed to women. In other words, harem is represented as the source of, and domain governed by “superstition” since superstitious beliefs or ghost stories are utilized by ignorant women to intimidate

⁸⁰⁴ Gürpınar, *Şipsevidi*, 99-101

⁸⁰⁵ Ibid., also see Misailidis.

⁸⁰⁶ Mehmed Celâl, 37.

⁸⁰⁷ Ibid., 50.

trouble-some children. For instance in one of his visits to another household, Celâl cannot sleep comfortably due to a ghost story told by a servant⁸⁰⁸, thus he dislikes *harem* and its inhabitants as a young boy;

[...] having been hosted, or spending his time in harem was particularly bothering him [...], though he was thirteen, he used to answer the ones inquiring about his age as “I am sixteen”. Sometimes, he used to turn himself into a laughingstock [...] since he was using a cosmetic to make a moustache for being appreciated as an adult. [...] He liked to converse with men. He really disliked the world called harem since he could not do whatever he wished there. [...] he could not sacrifice the entertainment outside [i.e. teasing male servants] to the obedience in harem.⁸⁰⁹

Another example for superstitious mother is from Nabizade Nazım’s *Zehra* that Suphi’s mother looks for help from fortune tellers and charlatans to restore the spoiled marriage of his son and daughter-in-law, however no use except wasting her money. The issue of ignorant mothers is often connected with the issue of women’s education; in majority of the novels under consideration one can find “ignorant”, “uneducated”, “superstitious mothers” as archetypes. However, women’s education and discipline as prospective mothers will be handled in the consecutive part of this chapter.

As for the good up-bringing of children intermarriages, the ones consummated with European ladies were also criticized. In *Şipsevdi*, Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar argues about Ottoman males’ resort to foreign and Levantine women as wives due to the latter’s supposedly well manners and compatibility. Those intermarriages are considered ill-fated since it creates cultural confusions for children.

⁸⁰⁸ Ibid., 48-50.

⁸⁰⁹ Ibid., 47.

Ironically, Hüseyin Rahmi chose to accentuate this notion through the utterance of a foreign lady, Madam Şehim, actually a foreign bride, as follows;

[...] It is on purpose that you are [Turkish women] left in ignorance. Though this is an obvious fact, how do some of your men find fair to ridicule at your ignorance and choose us, -I mean *Frenk* women-, as wives? The persons who regard their own nation's women with disdain and consider getting married with foreign women as an honour are actually ridiculous and ill-thought. It should be endeavored to better-off the majority. Apart from couple of exceptional cases, who will benefit from motley families of Turks, *Frenks* 7⁸¹⁰

In the preface of *Şipsevdi*, he devoted a long part to the discussion of intermarriages between Ottoman Muslim males and foreign women. He disapproves such marriages since they increase as a “fashion”, “misunderstood westernization” and irrational “*sélection*” which results in cultural confusion in children, spinsterhood of young Ottoman women, and unrest in family life due to asymmetrical cultural values, and waste of family property through the consumption habits of foreign wives.⁸¹¹ Probably urged by similar causes, Celâl's parents in Mehmed Celâl's *Küçük Gelin* do not approve him to get married with Adel, an Ottoman Armenian, still perceived as alien to Muslim code of conduct. Then Celâl becomes more depressed and disturbed with this romantic failure.⁸¹²

Another important point related to children and mothering in specific, and population health in general is abortion. Death during child birth and child bed together with infant mortality are also endemic themes for many of the novels that both early marriages and defected health service of traditional midwives were

⁸¹⁰ Gürpınar, *Şipsevdi*, 351.

⁸¹¹ “Hikayemin Hikayesi” in *ibid.*, 27-32.

⁸¹² Mehmed Celâl, 56-69.

criticised. For instance, Bedia's sister in –law in *Udi*, Celâl's wife, Fahriye in *Küçük Gelin* die due to their young age and early pregnancies. Mehmet Celâl also talks about child-bed fever as a danger awaiting young mothers in the post partum period. Many of the Tanzimat novels evoke unhealthy service provided by traditional healers and midwives for women and children; but the most prominent writers that dealt with this issue are Misailidis and Hüseyin Rahmi. For example, Misailidis accounts;

There are only two truly holy and important occupations in the world, however, both are habitually abused. The first one is clergy, and the second is medicine.

If we deem that İstanbul has a population of one and half million, we can say that one thousand and five hundred physicians would be more than enough, however, if we count up barbers, herbalists, tailors and hairdressers in to the category practicing medicine, the number of “physicians” might exceed three or four thousands. And if it is a requirement to add the ones practicing medicine with the help of manuscripts and forged books [...], the number of physicians would be boundless.

The prime capital of fake physicians is their mastery over lying and [...] chattering [...]. Though such physicians are not missing in any region, they are innumerable in Anatolia.⁸¹³

Thanks to their in-depth knowledge over folk culture, Hüseyin Rahmi and Misailidis provide interesting accounts for child delivery, traditional midwives, folk medicine especially for infertility and abortion. It has already been mentioned that Misailidis's journeys to Anatolian provinces endowed him with a rich source of folk knowledge in such matters. For Hüseyin Rahmi, he was an orphan brought up by his grandparents, and then he spent the early years of his life with his aunt among women folk in a large household. He was the most outspoken writer during this period that emphasized the problems of population health, public and private hygiene

⁸¹³ Misailidis, 532-534.

together with children out of wedlock.⁸¹⁴ Abortion is directly related to illegitimate sexual affairs, that is, sexual intercourse out of wed lock for Hüseyin Rahmi that women resort to abortion. It is argued before that theatre is the didactic genre that Ottoman intellectuals resorted for enlightening and instructing people prior to the outbreak of novel. Titled as *Iskat-ı Cenin-Facia* (Abortion-Tragedy, 1290 /1873-1874), Hasan Bedreddin chose to write about abortion as one of the ills of Ottoman society.⁸¹⁵ This play is important both for underlining the role of midwives and non-Muslim physicians to guide women into abortion, and females' anxiety about child delivery. *Iskat-ı Cenin* is actually about Afife and Hilmi's romance which successfully resolved into a marriage, however, this caused cousin Şevki, who lost the chance to be an affluent person by not succeeding to get married with Afife, to have hatred towards the young couple. Şevki wants to take his revenge by manipulating Afife's marital life, and her pregnancy. Afife has a very trouble some pregnancy, she has a medical situation which negatively influences her pregnancy, and together with her husband Afife is indeed vulnerable as having concerned about child birth. Afife's intimates, her husband and wet nurse included, try to convince her for abortion, but she does not accept. Then, with the help of an evil non-Muslim physician, and midwife, who were arranged by Şevki, Afife's wet nurse managed to persuade her and her husband for aborting the baby. At the end, Afife dies due to complications emerged in the course of abortion leaving her beloved husband in vain and her property behind. Hilmi also dies out of sorrow soon after, and their family is destroyed thereon. While condemning Afife's and her intimates' ignorance that abortion is performed as a remedy, Hasan Bedreddin attributes a negative role for

⁸¹⁴ Gürpınar, Şıpsıvdi, .31, 35-40, for children out of wedlock and the ways women were trying to deal with the issue , 213-232.

⁸¹⁵ Hasan Bedreddin, *Iskat-ı*.

female-information flow and female *habitus* in Ottoman society not only for women but also for whole family's welfare. Abortion was condemned in this play as an evil practice causing ruin, and female protagonists' persuasive potential with respect to abortion was criticized profoundly that it creates a negative imagery about women's information flow.

Generally speaking, abortion was also condemned for devastating human potential of the empire in genres other than novels.⁸¹⁶ Parallel to the conception of abortion's hazardous impact over population health and empire's human potential, early Turkish novels quite often compared Ottoman population with that of the European states' in terms of its density and quality. Misailidis is quite typical for this respect;

If there is a population of a hundred in one thousand square meters in Europe, there is only a hundred in one hundred thousand square meters in Anatolia. Why is this so? Since disorderly nature of military service devastated Muslims, and earning their livelihood outside of their homeland [in cities] worn out both Muslims and non-Muslims.⁸¹⁷

As appears in the above quote, Misailidis also concerned with the hazards of rural to urban migration in terms of creating problems related to population increase and family life.⁸¹⁸ The "double marriages", households without heir, abandoned women and children were the prominent problems that he perceived as the outcomes of men's withdrawal from the family life. The prostitution, venereal disease and unauthorized medical practitioners in the Ottoman land are other important matters

⁸¹⁶ Ottoman advice genre which broke out after 1860s frequently provided insights about the hazards of abortion. Abortion together with other issues related to family, child upbringing and home economics will be dealt in the consecutive chapters of this study.

⁸¹⁷ Misailidis, 311-313.

⁸¹⁸ Ibid., 305-306.

often referred in Misailidis' work. The need for "mentally, socially and bodily" healthy individuals is accentuated for several times, and in the majority of these novels.

The education question in general and Ottoman Muslim women's education in particular is a very popular subject in the Tanzimat novel. In the majority of novels under consideration here, women's education is reported to be a scanty and inadequate one. The seclusion of young women after reaching puberty and their subsequent education are problematized as interrelated issues through many novels; young women's commencement to use *çarşaf* and *ferace* as public attire is underlined especially in *Aşk-ı Memnu*⁸¹⁹ and *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* as the factor delimiting their education.⁸²⁰ The seclusion and limits of public appearance of women, in other words, are criticised by all, but justified with respect to the limited educational institutions for women. While explaining the reason why he takes his daughter, Saliha, from school, Fitnat's grandfather in Şemseddin Sami's *Taaşşuk* epitomizes this justification in the form of yearning;

Don't cry my dear. This is the custom. If a girl reaches her ten or eleven years of age she cannot go out without being veiled. How can we behave outside of custom? Then everyone will laugh at us. But you may be worried about your classes. If you have appeal for learning, you can advance [...] on your own. I can also instruct you from time to time. What can we do? You see, we still do not have distinct schools, [and] women teachers for girls. How can a fifteen-year old girl attend to a school for boys?⁸²¹

In addition to seclusion after puberty and its unconstructive impact over young women's education, traditional values pertaining young women's instruction are also

⁸¹⁹ For Nihal's new attire see Uşaklıgil, *Aşk-ı*, 108-117.

⁸²⁰ For Saliha's leave from school and seclusion see Sami, 47-48.

⁸²¹ An excerpt from Saliha and her father's dialogue in Sami, 48-49.

posited for criticism. Uttered by an old female embroidery master who instructs Fitnat in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, Şemseddin Sami tries to inform the audience that it is also a difficult task to change Ottoman people's approach towards women's education; "Oh my God! Women do not become müderris or clerk! Why should a girl need so much writing and reading? The main things that girls need to know are sewing, embroidery, and etcetera. Well, Writing is also good."⁸²²

However, Sami does not refrain from positing exemplary, or more properly, "ideal" fathers and daughters who regard women's education not the one oriented towards domestic tasks, and he probably wants to stimulate parents and young women for further education. Following quote is interesting since abovementioned claims articulated by Talat, young man who resorted to disguise himself as a girl for visiting Fitnat, to rebut the embroidery master's point of view;

I am the daughter of a *müderris* [a professor in medrese]. My father instructs me for writing and reading. I really have a great appeal for sewing and embroidery, but he does not let me deal with these. He tells me "these[sewing and embroidery] are useless, pay attention to reading and writing".⁸²³

While Sami perceives the seclusion, and commencement of veil in terms of contributing the personal underdevelopment of women, Uşaklıgil portrayed the veil as a fashion which attributes women a sense of femininity; or at least he tried to express women's authentic view about veiling as a feminine way of displaying gender difference.⁸²⁴ However, Hüseyin Rahmi chose to talk about the concealing and obscuring function of veiling as a negative phenomenon. In *Şipsevdi*, Lebibe and

⁸²² Ibid., 86.

⁸²³ Ibid.

⁸²⁴ Please see Uşaklıgil, *Aşk-ı*, 108-117 for this respect.

Rebia, two ruined young women from an *alafranga* family, cover up themselves with *çarşaf* while they are dealing with fraudulent and illicit activities.⁸²⁵ Again in *Şıpsevdi*, Hüseyin Rahmi employs Madam Şehim, a foreign bride, to accentuate the relationship between veiling and Ottoman women's ignorance. In Meftun grandmother's, Şeküre Hanım's funeral, Madam Şehim addresses a speech through which she questions the way Ottoman women spend their life for the women gathered for condolence;

I tried to examine the incessant life that Eastern women live. What did I find? Laziness, deprivation. [...] You live beyond this world, in a different secrecy. All of your love, passion, happiness, pain is all veiled. You are living enigmas. [...] you do not know even who you are. [...] Why do you break off your relation with nature, light and truth [...]?

[...] Who was Şeküre Hanım? She was a veiled woman who used up bolts of cloth for concealing her face from the gaze of non-intimates; she was a canary-person who spent her eighty year life behind the cage. She was a person who did not know anything about the chemical structure of water she drank, a person unfamiliar with science and technology, a person mocking the ones argued for the spherical model of the world. [...] a woman who presumed that the horizon of the world only went as far as her cage allowed her to see. [...]

⁸²⁶

Similarly Namık Kemal is also quite unsympathetic with the use of veil as an embellishing and distorted item instead of a secluding one, and he does not avoid to comment on veil as something evil contributing women's ignorance and spoiling;

Everybody acknowledges that, the *yaşmak* [veil] over the faces of such women is used as an adornment in excursion areas and it is all but an exaggerated *düzgün* [make-up]. The function of it [*yaşmak*] is embellishing the face instead of covering it, and prime peculiarity about this is all but revealing the features like inconstancy, inadequate intelligence and hypocritical courtesy, which are intended to be obscured.⁸²⁷

⁸²⁵ See Gürpınar, *Şıpsevdi*, 227-232.

⁸²⁶ Ibid., 349-350.

⁸²⁷ Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 38.

If we return to Şemseddin Sami, who rather chose to emphasize the drawbacks of seclusion, we see that his protest was channeled through Talat's own experience in disguise of a woman. It is also quite interesting to understand the veiling issue, both for its impact, or dysfunction in terms of creating a gendered space;

Oh, poor women, what they have to put up with! We, men, use them like puppets. We do not let them walk freely and at ease on the streets. What a shame! What disrespect! If a man comes across a man he does not acquainted, he does not look at his face, he says nothing, but whenever he comes across a woman whom he does not know and he has never seen, he starts to stare at her laughing and to make remarks, and even if she tries to drive him away, he refuses to leave her alone. That is to say, we do not consider women as human beings. We disturb them for our own entertainment, we stop them from going about and amusing them at their ease and from another perspective, we ridicule ourselves in front of them. Thus, there are certain shrewd women who say 'what fools they are, wait, let me have some fun with them!' and play with us as if we were monkeys. Behind their carriages on their return from excursions, they drag us in dust as far as the gates of their houses. A person, who has not acquainted these manners and morality would certainly say, 'He seems crazy' seeing someone in this state.⁸²⁸

Sami Paşazade Sezai is more critical about the males' approach towards women in terms of creating difficulties for the latter in the public sphere;

Without any shame, and in a manner as if we are spiting to the face of our national honour, bullying Turkish women, whom we covered from their head to feet and secluded behind the cages... Then, when Europeans ask why we make them veiled, replying that "out of respect we have for them". What a contrast!, How inconsistent it is! At least we have to confess that these two statements are exactly the opposite of each other...⁸²⁹

⁸²⁸ Sami, 88.

⁸²⁹ Sezai, 70.

The following quotation from *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* underscores the same claim Sezai put forth while revealing that certain practices in Ottoman culture were extremely paradoxical with the idea of seclusion;

The foreign ladies go out; they participate into men's conversations, they sit in the coffee houses. But a foreign lady takes her husband's, her brother's, or her father's arm with perfect dignity and goes to a place which cannot harm her reputation and stays there with perfect ease. No one dares to look at her face. But we are not like that. [...] We entrust our wives and our daughters to a driver and then, it is up to God, [...] he can take them wherever he wants.⁸³⁰

The above quotes reveal the moral dimension of seclusion issue also manifesting a concern towards the spatial segregation of sexes in Ottoman society. In other words, one also finds a yearning in these depictions that Ottoman men and women did not have a joint entertainment culture therefore women were left to corrupted undertakings and maltreatment of males in public space. Spatial segregation of sexes and "illegitimacies" occurred upon it not only concerned the novelists, but also alarmed Ottoman administration that they routinely issued decrees and orders to regulate men and women's behavior, and women's attire and manners in public areas. Moreover, Ottoman advice genre also provided insights about "proper" behavioral and clothing conduct for men and women regarding modern, yet compatible enough with Islamic values with which consecutive chapters of this study will be dealing.

If we return the acknowledged interrelatedness of women's seclusion and women's education in early Turkish novels one sees that the former is often condemned for affecting Ottoman Muslim women's education in an imperfect way. Given that Ottoman Muslim women had to leave school customarily soon after they

⁸³⁰ Sami, 80-81.

reached puberty, and their instruction was limited solely to learn reading holy scripture, they did not have any chance to improve themselves further. The urban upper class Muslim families were able to provide further instruction at home for their daughters, yet it was the privilege of a few. In any case, the public schooling for women is emphasized as one of the “musts” of the Tanzimat thinking. The isolation of women at homes caused them to have domestic rather than professional qualities, and in turn, this triggered the scarcity of women trainers and teachers. For example, Fitnat in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* yearns for understanding what she reads; she is also bored of practicing embroidery and handicrafts that she has been dealing with after she leaves school.⁸³¹ Ahmed Midhat provides serious insights about what ought to be the young women’s education through his novels as well as his commentaries published in newspapers and journals. For example, in order to prevent young women from the paw of the contemporary “feminine illness”, hysteria which was believed to be generated by romantic indulgence, he urged parents and husbands to direct the women under their guardianship to deal with gardening, music, painting, and physical work, and other energy- requiring activities.⁸³² However, in order to provide “ideals” and “models” for the upper and upper middle class families, who were seen as the agent of change, Tanzimat novel supplies numberless young women who receive education at home along the modern lines, i.e., Bedia in *Udi*, Fitnat in *Taaşşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, Lebibe in *Şipsevdî* are such home-educated young women. But why women’s education was so crucial? Without any exception, Fatma Aliye - only female novelist among others- also included, all novelists agreed that women should be educated since all of them are either mothers, or they will become mothers.

⁸³¹ Ibid., 90-99.

⁸³² Aliye& Midhat, *Hayal*, 55-57

Again through Madam Şehim's speech to pass her condolences for Şeküre Hanım, Gürpınar explains the idea behind women's education in *Şipsevdî* as follows;

Ignorance makes people indolent, and knowledge empowers. [...]
There is no school for you apart from the experience you obtained from your mothers.[...] It should be endeavored to better-off the majority. Firstly the woman, the mother must be educated so that men for every occupation would be brought up.
Ladies! I do not want to hurt your womanly pride. I will clarify my point with a sad, but true anecdote. Think about a mother, who is grossly ignorant [...] Suppose that this mother has an eight-to nine year old son with a sharp mind. He goes to school. He has already been literate; he is able to read newspaper, write letters. [...] Poor mother...She is more uninformed than her eight-year old son. It is really a miserable situation. [...] That child acknowledges that his mother is more uninformed than himself at that age. He acknowledges her grossly ignorance, inability for judgment, mindlessness and naivety. He starts at that age to look down on her. [...] He ceases to respect her. Yes, Ladies! Your humiliation [by men] starts thereon. Now think of a cultivated and educated mother in front of a timid and respectful child. She checks her child's homework, and think about the impact and didactic attitude [...] that the words nation, duty, humanity, patriotism, civilization and progress entailed when she uses them. [...] Then this mother who has the disposition of a teacher goes up to piano, and [...] sings the national song [anthem] with compatibility that she awakens that small child's attention and feeling, she strengthens the value of meaning pleasantly with the help of that instrument. The seeds of bravery, heroism and progress can be planted this way. Such a mother always sees respect in the thankful eyes of her child.⁸³³

Actually, the rationale behind the claim to educate women was not related to women's individual and professional development, but rather the one that would to enable them for better mothering and wifehood. For example, Gürpınar ridicules Lebibe's inclination for romantic poetry and French language in *Şipsevdî* that is superfluous.⁸³⁴ In Fatma Aliye's *Levâ-yih-i Hâyât*, Nebahat, an educated woman, complains through correspondence to her friend that she is worried for wasting time for the education she received; since she believes that she would not find a decent

⁸³³ Gürpınar, *Şipsevdî*, 350, 351-352.

⁸³⁴ Ibid., 96-97.

husband who would be worthy for a wife like her. She believes that she would not be able find a husband who would praise her as an educated wife and mother, and this will in turn cause her to not to be able to make use of the talents she acquired through education for mothering;

[...] I am always thoughtful. Well, what is all about this education, upbringing, and labor? For what? Is not it for being appreciated, listen and praised by the men to whom we will be the wife and companion some day? My elder sister was also educated in this way. Now, who listens or appreciates her? [Her husband] He is literate, educated [...]. It is certain that they will ask for a husband like him for me. But what precedes the probity and talent? [...] Once upon a time, we were living with astounding hopes. At that time, life was something worthy of devotion. But today!.. Oh, there were gleaming hopes in the future. A spouse! Angelic children! Believe me, after witnessing certain things, I renounce my claim for a spouse, but I cannot get rid of the pride bestowed by being a mother. I do not want to give up this honor. That's the way it is, but try not to get married! With what will we be preoccupied in this world, from what will we get pleasure, for what will we be proud of? What do I do with that beautiful nest that I watch the exteriors from its window if I am unaccompanied by my spouse? If there is no one to share the bliss bestowed on me by nature, if there are no children to please with beautiful garments and toys, what will I do with [this] wealth? [...]⁸³⁵

Gürpınar argues both men's contribution and women's own negligence for the ignorance of Ottoman females; for him both parties are blameworthy:

Some of your men want to leave you in blind ignorance so that their inappropriate dominance over you would be permanent. [...]How it is possible for a nation to progress unless they keep their women in the age of childhood? [...]Your men think that literacy is not necessary for you. It is on purpose that you are left in ignorance.⁸³⁶

As above quote reveals, Gürpınar chose to writes through the utterance of Madam Şehim to point out men's share in women's underdevelopment. However, he also finds women accountable for their backwardness; he believes that Ottoman women

⁸³⁵ Letter no.10 from Nebahat to İtimad as excerpted from Fatma Aliye, *Levâiyih*, 39-40.

⁸³⁶ Gürpınar, *Şıpevdi*, 350-351.

are lack of insight and appreciation towards self development, they are childish and merely responsive for material and superficial decking out. His comment over the reaction of women audience, who attended the speech given by Madam Şehim about “Eastern women’s” underdevelopment, is crucial; “Among the audience there were really few donated with enough power of understanding and reasoning to be saddened by this bitter speech. Majority of the ladies spent time by staring at the rings and the black feather attached to the big hat of the woman who gave the speech.”⁸³⁷ In Fatma Aliye’s *Levâyah-i Hayat*, Nebahat believes that educated and well trained women are wasted by non-appreciating husbands and recommends that single men should choose ignorant and ordinary women as wives in her letter to İtimad. However, İtimad thinks that women’s ignorance is something also detrimental for men, and not every man is pleased with simple and uneducated wives. Then, she asks Nebahat; “Is there anything else in the world which is so discontenting like this [being married with uneducated and ignorant wives]for some of them [men]?”⁸³⁸

In addition to formal education and schooling, other important dimension about the education of young Ottoman women is their manners, or discipline. Without any exception, all novels examined for this chapter have at least couple of parts devoted to this issue. First of all, Tanzimat novelists argued that the content of education young Ottoman women would receive must not impair their moral outlook and chastity. Parallel to the formal schooling, young women must receive good morals and manners so that they would in turn discipline their kids. While majority of novelists argued for the ill impacts of seclusion and spatial segregation with

⁸³⁷ Ibid., 353.

⁸³⁸ Letter no.11 from İtimad to Nebahat as excerpted from Fatma Aliye, *Levâyah*, 41.

respect to women's education, from time to time some of them provided contrasting views which praised young women who have an isolated life;

Nazmi wished Bedia [his daughter] not to be inclined to anything other than music. He wished she would not learn of love and passion. He had mulled over the anecdotes that he would like to tell his daughter for days. Being unaware and uninformed about such things [love and passion] cannot prevent you from learning them. [...] For example, don't you hear stories of love and passion from your peers? Is it possible to not to hear and know about this? Since the remark that you heard consisted the sole depiction and praise of love, the information you obtained is incomplete. I think instead of concealing these from youth, the drawbacks related to love and passion should be put forth completely so they are elucidated [...] Do you know how much time has been entirely spent for depicting the state of lovers while disregarding the studies over love? Majority of poets praise love. Storywriters arouse the appetite for elegance [...] O.K., let's say that I wish you would not learn of these. Is it possible?
[...] Instead of telling you that "girls are forever like this", we should advise you that "girls must be such and such". Otherwise, you may nullify us when seeing other kinds.⁸³⁹

Hacı Baba took a great care of Fitnat's discipline; he sent her to school immediately after she became five, and he has never sent her to school unaccompanied [...]. Until she became nine, he let her attend the school. Then he took her from school and shut her home. [...] He kept her at home in such a way that since that time up until she became fourteen years old [...] she even could not see the front door.

Fitnat has never guffawed at all however she used to smile as her pearl like teeth, which were the miracle bestowed by nature, could be seen.

As for her innocence and chastity it can be said that she was the monument of innocence since she has not seen the front door for seven years, and she has had very limited contact with third persons.

There was no body frequenting Hacı Baba's home except the embroidery master [instructor]. Nobody among neighbors could be a guest since Hacı Baba got along well with none of them and Fitnat could pay a returning visit to no one.

[...] women in general and young girls in particular spend most of their time around windows and bay windows watching the passers-by. However, Fitnat Hanım did not have this habit.

Fitnat Hanım has never gone out of her home. She has never boarded a ferry. She has never seen the sea.⁸⁴⁰

⁸³⁹ Fatma Aliye, *Udi*, 35, 36, 38.

⁸⁴⁰ Sami, 75, 76-77, 149.

Long quotes above include the anxiety towards women's chastity and morality though the same novelist argued about seclusion's negative impact over women's self-development. According to him, a decently disciplined young woman should not laugh loudly, spend time in idleness in front of windows and go out often. Similarly, one finds such concerns over women's public appearance and movement together with yearnings related to their ignorance. All in all, it can be claimed that early novels in Turkish try to draw boundaries for women when their education and public appearance is considered, and not only schooling, but moral disciplining of women was perceived equally important in an era everything was up-side down, that is, modernization. As mentioned before, women's conduct and attire alarmed contemporaries, not only intellectuals but Ottoman administration, and promenades or carriage tours were demonised either for males' approach, or for women's. Another quote, in which Hacı Baba explains why he does not let her stepdaughter, Fitnat, to go anywhere outside of her home, from *Taaşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat* shows how the aforesaid claims are justified;

I am reputed to be thrifty. Neighbors and inhabitants in this quarter say lots of things. They argue that I do not let my daughter go out to save twenty *guruş*-carriage -fare. I am truly not an extravagant, I care about my livelihood. [...] Thanks God, he bestowed me enough. Twenty *guruş* will be spent, do I care? But if I send my daughter for excursion, she is beautiful, everybody will follow along after her. Some of them will twist their moustache [swaggering], some of them will throw their cigarettes towards her, some of them will engage in whatever the reason. My honor and endeavour does not tolerate such disgrace. There is nothing left in our time like honor and morality. The places that you called as excursion are actually places for disgrace. These are places for ill-mannered and wicked [people]. Is it possible to send a young girl to such places? [...] I am sorry but this is not either *alafranga*. *Alafranga* does not agree with this. Have you ever seen a *madama* [foreign lady] around such places, i.e., in *Kağıthane*, or *Veliefendi*?⁸⁴¹

⁸⁴¹ Ibid., 79-80.

Gürpınar is quite talented to provide a typical but persuasive example for the narrative suggested in the previous quote about women's and young men's immoral conduct in excursion areas. Along with the critique over new consumption and recreational patterns, Gürpınar employs Rebia's own speech about her moral perish as follows;

I am really bored at my narrow and dreary home in İstanbul. I come here to enjoy, breath fresh air thanks to you. May God give her a long life, my aunt treats me as her kids. To go out in public decently, she buys and provides fancy cloaks, shoes, headscarves, umbrellas, everything for me. I dress myself up. I also go out and stroll around in *Fener*, *Çiftehavuzlar*, *Kuşdili* like any other woman does. Young men tease and court with young girls. And the girls flirt with them. This is all about young lads' entertainment. We also had couple of young men who winked at us in time. Since we thought this was the custom, we replied, smiled and behaved coquettishly to their addressing. The one wearing grayish jacket became mine, and the one with green tie became Lebibe Hanım's. [...] Youth dear brother, youth...When a young man fancies about a young girl, and when a young girl longs for a man, their hearts begin to pound excitingly. They cannot stay peaceful anymore. [...] Regarding this was the pleasure of life, we also had a good time. We did the same as every other girl did. [...] just then flirting from a distance, things got hot. Then they flared up in passion. Our sweethearts started to not to be contented with flirting and winking more and more. [...] Gradually, these young men preceded everything; our lives and breathings, may God forgive me. [...] While passing, we started to have short conversations. Then, [...] our conversations became extended. We used to go to places devoid of people. While our love was growing, our courage also increased. [...] My sweetheart had the difficulty of finding proper expressions to express his love to me at the beginning. God, for persuading me he did his best. [...] Later, I found that these were all lies. The love he was feeling for me was a momentary yen. [...] He was talking about sending his mother to ask my hand. Here, his biggest lie came to light. After deciding to be husband and wife, to tell you the truth, I did not withhold anything from him. I did not reject any of his claims. Apparently, he was actually a love swindler. [...] While calling one another sweetheart, Bedri suddenly changed. [...] He started to find excuses for not to meet. He fed up with me. [...] In a short while, I realized that something else started to move inside me [...] I asked the ones who were informed about this. They said it is a child.[...]⁸⁴²

⁸⁴² Gürpınar, *Şıpsevdî*, 250-253.

For example, in another occasion that Meftun pays a visit to Mrs. McFerlan, a European lady whom he is attracted, Gürpınar justifies both Meftun's inclination, and fashionable clothing's evil impact as follows;

You know, women's garments today are based on the art of making all their curves pleasantly apparent. When the shapes emphasized under these dresses with the round contours which tightly surround nape, neck, shoulders, chest, back, and belt combined with the motions of a flighty woman, [...] they create impatience for the ones who appreciate beauty.⁸⁴³

As revealed by the quote above, the critical analysis of the youth's indulgence, - mainly young women are concerned here-, in consumption and current state of entertainment and moral decay are parallel issues; young people firstly adopt fashionable clothing and leisure activities, the material aspects of the era, then they ruin themselves morally. As argued in majority of novels, moral decay and excessive consumption are interrelated that "evil types" as well as "ideal types" of Tanzimat era produced. Indeed, the most severe criticism of the Tanzimat novel was about these evil types, *alafranga* (the ones inclined to genteel and conspicuous life). All of the novels examined for this study employed this issue through the medium of *alafranga* individuals, *alafranga* homes and *alafranga* style. One has to keep in mind that there were crucial material changes in the Ottoman prominent cities in the second half of the nineteenth century. The articulation of the Ottoman Empire and its economy to the world capitalism beginning from the seventeenth century onwards culminated in the nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. The material and aesthetic items of the West rushed into the Ottoman commercial and central cities especially after the Crimean War (1857). The Tanzimat elite, the bureaucracy, was the social stratum that successfully utilized the "pseudo welfare" in this period. The super-

⁸⁴³ Ibid., 270.

westernized and conspicuous life styles in the capital city and other major Ottoman towns became subject to the social criticism as posited in novels. As mentioned above, consumption patterns, i.e., food, dining, clothing, even ideas about beauty and aesthetics, all changed with respect to the trends released from European capitals in a way positing new but “threatening” alternative. People started to spend money for import items, and generally, they adopt new criteria for the organization of everyday life in urban upper class homes. To sum up, new aesthetic elements were introduced into Ottoman society and the aesthetic elements regarding “body” and “the body social” terrorized the novelist that they provided an ardent critique over these developments through another aesthetic as well as a didactic mean called novel. Below is a portrayal of a young Ottoman woman, Lebibe, from a superficially westernized household;

Meftun’s sister Lebibe Hanım is nearly nineteen years old. She is a girl suffering obesity. She has tried one by one the forged medicines that she saw in newspapers to lose weight, but she could not have any result but putting more weight. Her slattern attire is not so pleasing or attractive at all. She still attains a kind of peculiar attractiveness when she puts layers of face powder, blush, and darken her eyes and eyebrows with kohl even though she looks like women who turn themselves into giantess. The most crucial achievement of Lebibe Hanım in make-up is the talent that she shows while finding the perfect place around her cheek to put a fake beauty spot.

[...]

A young girl’s costume for morning, mid-day, evening, dining table, paying a visit, under these titles [Meftun] ordered five to ten sets of clothes for Lebibe. And he taught her when to dress up and take off these clothes as “*savoir-vivre*”. Poor Lebibe was so bored to change eight times a day.⁸⁴⁴

Especially women’s costume and make-up along fashionable lines infuriated many of the intellectuals that they published pamphlets, and devoted chapters in advice and conduct books for men and women about financial as well as moral and medico-

⁸⁴⁴ Gürpınar, *Şipsevdi*, 96.

sanitary encumbrances of these fashionable undertakings.⁸⁴⁵ However, moral and financial drawbacks of fashionable adornment items constituted the principal concern here; it was underscored by the novelists that women, in some cases men, dressed up and spent formidable amount of money to show off themselves in public. Especially women's make up and use of cosmetics alarmed contemporary critics that they embellished their bodies to attract attention therefore getting in touch with males and involving in illegitimate undertakings. Accordingly, one is amazed to see how wigs, corsets and expensive perfumes, garments and make-up utensils were demonized in these works. While arguing upon aesthetic transformation of clothing, interiors and bodies, the Tanzimat novel gives very detailed depictions that these works can be called somehow "*Costume Gothics*".⁸⁴⁶ Meftun's home; his living room, sculptures, paintings and his kin people's clothing in *Şıpsıvdi*⁸⁴⁷, Şatırzade Şöhret's costumes and make-up in *Şık*⁸⁴⁸, Mehpeyker's home, furniture and dining utensils in *İntibah*⁸⁴⁹ were all depicted in great detail to exemplify this notion. Misailidis is worth – citing here to demonstrate the medical and religious-moral drawbacks of as well as contemporary dislike about make-up, the most demonized fashionable undertaking;

⁸⁴⁵ For instance see Ahmed Midhat, *Kadınlarda Hıfz-ü Cemal*, (İstanbul: Kırkanbar Matbaası, 1304/ 1888-1889; E.C, *Hanımlara Yadigar; Tezyinatın Ahlakı Tesiri*, (İstanbul: Manastır Matbaası, 1304 1888-1889) ; Hüseyin Remzi, *Hocanın Hanım Kızlara*, 153-154.; 180-183; "İffet ve Edeb" in Hüseyin Remzi, *Sağdıç*, 88-91; Cemal Nadir, *Hanımlara Açık Mektup*, (İstanbul: Necm-i İstikbal Basımevi, 1906-1907) ; Azmi Ömer, *Hanım Kitabı*, (nph) ; Nabizade, *Hanım Kızlara* ,vol.1, (İstanbul,:1304/ 1888-1889) ; "Hanımlarımız Nasıl Giyinmeli ; İnce Belli Olmak İçin Giyilen Korseler ve Dar Esvabların Zararı" in Kenan Tevfik, 15-19.

⁸⁴⁶ I borrowed this concept from Margaret Atwood, *Lady Oracle*, (London: Virago, 2001, 131. In this novel, Atwood used this term for the paperbacks enhanced with detailed depictions of costumes and home decoration with respect to the age stories revolve.

⁸⁴⁷ See Gürpınar, *Şıpsıvdi*, 90,288-290, 311-312 for this respect.

⁸⁴⁸ See Gürpınar, *Şık*, 28-29, 36 for details.

⁸⁴⁹ See Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 82-83 for this notion.

[...]Only thing that I could not stand at all was women wearing make-up, God knows why they turn themselves into clowns wearing masks by putting up such [cosmetics] as if they dislike the beauty God bestowed upon them, whereas apart from being praised, they putrefy their faces quickly and turn out to be looking like old women, and the weirdest thing about this issue is that their husbands allow them to do so.⁸⁵⁰

While referring the hazardous impact of make-up and body embellishment, Misailidis calls husbands attention to handle the issue in a way underlining the taken for granted legitimacy of males' control over women's bodies. Similarly, Ceylan's father in *Jön Türk*, and Meftun as opposed to his brother Raci's criticism over their women kin's bodily adornment are represented as helpless and untalented male who disregarded their control over female family members' excessive "coquettish" and "inappropriate" embellishment.

In addition to critique over import items of consumption and new aesthetic criteria regarding body, Tanzimat novels also provided an appraisal the over use of servants in upper and upper middle class households. Those domestic servants are either young or charming slaves who are potential competent for the households male folk, i.e., Dilber in *Sergüzeşt*, Canan in *Felâhî Bey ve Rakım Efendi*, Sıdkı Efendi's concubine in *Felsefe-i Zenân*, and Sırrıcemal in *Zehra*, or ex-slaves who were freed after long years of serving as in the case of Dadı in *Taşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*. Besides, there were servants and other kinds of domestic employees retained in return for salary for domestic tasks such as cooking, cleaning, attending meals, and as gardeners, butlers, governess-trainers and chambermaids, and majority of these personnel is from ethnic origins other than Turco-Ottoman in early Turkish novels. These ethno-religious or national difference is quite used to justify those servants' ignorance, deceitfulness and maltreatment of their employers' property. For

⁸⁵⁰ Misailidis, 646.

example, Arab origin female servants, who predominantly function as cooks and wet-nurses, are blameworthy for their ignorance and superstition; they guide their patrons for superstitious undertakings; such as use of amulets, remedies of traditional healers and midwives, or anything which had to do with “tradition”. Talat’s wet nurse, Dadı in *Taaşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, and Arab female slaves in the harem of Celâl’s home in *Küçük Gelin* are examples for this notion. Zarafet, another African origin cook in *Şipsevdi*, is another negative character who indulged in young male servants in Meftun’s household and commits an unhealthy abortion to get away with the illegitimate pregnancy. As for the non-Muslim servants, Greek and Armenian for predominantly, there are couple of things to be said; first of all they are portrayed as not trustworthy, they deal with petty theft, and abuse their employers property. Secondly, they are intermediaries for the “illegitimate”, that is, out of wed lock affairs; they direct the hidden traffic of love letters, or indulge in sexual affairs with the young males of the household. Hüseyin Rahmi Gürpınar’s novels are full of these characters. Foreign governess trainers and teachers are also other negative characters; in general through their demonization, the moral decade of Ottoman youth is justified. Mr. Pierre in *Araba Sevdası*, Anjel, an ex- prostitute thoughtlessly employed as a governess- trainer in Dehri Efendi’s home in *Mürebbiye* are the prominent negative characters of such kind. It is interesting that Tanzimat novelist sought for the reasons of moral and financial decay in Ottoman- Muslim households through such “alienated”, that is, external characters; one can not easily find an Ottoman-Muslim servant, nanny, butler or trainer to mislead the youth or guide the household folk superstitiously. Ottoman advice genre provided insights for the servants issue as well; however this genre provided the critique over maltreatment of servants, i.e., inhumane treatment, disgruntling, etc., together with warning the head

and lady of the household to keep an eye over them that they performed their duties properly. It is also underlined in these works reminding the “moral shortcomings” of servants in the novels that one try to choose the best servants in terms of good manners and morals.⁸⁵¹

4.2.3. Others of the Tanzimat Family; Prostitutes and Mistresses

Seeking pleasure outside the margins of family and indulgence in illegitimate kind of entertainment are among the most important issues in early Turkish novels. Contemporary novelists provided a critique over Ottoman morality with respect to familial order that they made use of certain others; prostitutes and women of “easy virtue”. From financial drawbacks to moral and medical hazards of engaging with such women constitute a remarkable part in the Tanzimat novel.

The Tanzimat novelist firstly argued that family men indulge in such illegitimate affairs with prostitutes and mistresses for two reasons: it is either for their dissatisfaction with their wives ; i.e., careless wives, women who lost their cause to be charming after getting married, having kids, and homemaking. For example, Hüseyin Rahmi’s hilarious still negative character, Meftun, argues about how women’s negligence in this respect justifies men’s faithfulness while providing contemporary expectations from wives;

If a [...] wife, who does not want her husband to indulge in other women, performs her wifely duties completely and her husband yet acts ungratefully, then she will have the right to criticize. [...] A woman should know how to

⁸⁵¹ See for example A. Rıza “Kısm-ı Salis; Ev Hanımının Vazife-i Ahlakıyesi” in idem. *Kızlara Mahsus Idare-i*, 40; Mehmed Said, *Vezaif’al İnas*, 54, 63-80.

dress up, converse, and treat her husband by comforting, amusing, and bearing with him in order to be counted as a wife. These are necessary tasks to be learnt for prospective brides.⁸⁵²

Poor women... while your principal service duty towards humanity is to give birth, you fall into disfavor after you accomplished this sacred duty instead of being praised. Two and a half year of spousal love in between a man and woman, and a child even wear out the wings of an affectionate husband who flies in the loftiest sky of love, [...] No matter how a man is stupid, impolite and uninformed, he is still a man. He cannot halt the masculine motive for tasting other beauties like that of bees which move from one flower to another with the strong impulse motivated by nature.⁸⁵³[...]

[...] you could not skillfully help to prolong the initial passion of a husband. This is such a delicate art that some women are experts of it by birth. Do you know how displeasing, sometimes how awfully you appear to your husbands? Do you bear in mind that you sway in those half-sleeved old cardigans, underpants pulled on up to breast, and swindling your eyebrows and ears together with your hair with a worn-out scarf, all in all with a hideous attire which is simply suitable for homemaking? Love has very sensitive eyes to be injured with such neglect. You should always abstain from such occasions which would detest the revering eyes of your husbands. [...] You do not need to turn into an ogress for homemaking. A woman who learnt to be adored also finds a pleasing way of attire while doing housework.⁸⁵⁴

While Hüseyin Rahmi points out women's inattention for themselves as impairing conjugal relationship and stimulating men, who are by their nature persistently in search for other beauties, for outside rivals, Ahmed Midhat argues for a truly "womanly wifeness" which would both prolong the conjugal love and defy men's natural inclination for other women;

I am telling explicitly that the wife of one is preferable to the most charming, most cheerful and most feminine ones found here [in brothels] no matter how ugly, ill-mannered and unlovable she is. But if you are the wife and husband, your bodies mutually belong to one another. Is it possible for a person to feel disgust about his/ her own body?

I wonder whether the pleasure of being husband and wife is comparable to anything else in the world?

⁸⁵² Gürpınar, , *Şırpsevdi*, 410

⁸⁵³ Ibid., 373.

⁸⁵⁴ Ibid., 412.

If love is not mutual between husband and wife, wife does not love him whether he is rich as Croesus, or he bankrupts, and the husband is not contented with the wife no matter she dolls herself. But if they love each other, neither wife complains about her husband's poverty, nor the husband whines about his wife's untidiness. [...] If the wife is as womanly as I dream, why should she stink like food or her hair should be untidy? After completing every bit of her domestic duties, she takes a proper bath and dresses up her clean garments. It should be noted that adornment and cleanliness are different things. Though impressive clothes are expensive, it is enough to clean them with a bit of soap. Only the woman should know how to perform womanly.⁸⁵⁵

With respect to the long quote above, one can assume that “legitimacy of love”, that is conjugality, is decisive irrespective of partners' beauty to keep the love prolonged between couples, however, Ahmed Midhat believes women's liability to be attractive in the last instance circumscribes this result to be accomplished. In sum, whether family men's inclination to other women is justifiable or not, Tanzimat novelist believed that wives should be attractive and concerned about their physical outlook and manners in order to keep their conjugal relationship not curtailed. Tanzimat novelist are also referred in the preceding section that they envisaged limits for being attractive and pleasant, i.e., through the critique they provided for conspicuous consumption, import consumption items, excessive make-up and body embellishment. Though they are unsympathetic about adornment and showing off for helping to impair female chastity, they are also critical about careless pose Ottoman women inclined inside their homes. Therefore, they opted for a prudent or moderate adornment which was clearly circumscribed with the idea of purity and cleanliness for one's own husband not only through novels, but also in advice genre and pamphlets written for women.

⁸⁵⁵ Ahmed Midhat, *Henüz Onyedi Yaşında*, (İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayın, 2004) , 183-184, 190, 191-192 . [c.1882-1883]

The second reason for illegitimate indulgences of men is their own impropriety and carnal inclination, which is also referred as evil earlier. While arguing upon men's impropriety to indulge in prostitutes and keeping mistresses, the language of disgust is utilised to create a strong aversion towards these women, who are also "otherised" *vis-à-vis* legitimate wives. The novel titled *Henüz Onyedî Yaşında* (Just Seventeen Years Old, 1881), through which Ahmed Midhat argues about the course and reasons of prostitution with the manner of a documentary maker who informs from inside the event scene, employs such language quite often ;

First of all, it should be considered that what are these women for these scoundrels? It might have been realized that there are certain places on some streets which are marked with epitaphs to be prevented from the damage of passers-by that they genuinely do not comprise any dead persons, and some of those places which are not marked accordingly turn to be very disgusting. By passers defecate to those unmarked places. Thus, frequenting such filthy [brothels] is like passing through these that if somebody drops in he would never bother himself to do it again. Those women are like these filthy corners [violated by by-passers] that they would not long for the guys who visited them.⁸⁵⁶

Girls and women are frequently compared with the roses. If this girl [the prostitute] is also like rose, she is such a rose that as soon as turned to a rosebud she fell under the control of men who strongly desire to smell its charming fragrance and she faded away too early to be smelt over and over again, apart from this, it is obvious from the various disgusting stains left on her that the noses smell her infected by various illnesses, amongst which influenza is the least dangerous one.

Let's see whether your stomach is really strong to smell this thrown away rose!⁸⁵⁷

In order to sever the frequenters' incline into prostitutes and brothels, Ahmed Midhat also makes use of "repulsive depiction" regarding the interiors of brothels;

⁸⁵⁶ Ibid., 63.

⁸⁵⁷ Ibid., 73-74.

If you look around [inside the brothel], everything seems clean and ornamented. There is no doubt that it is the best place in *Beyoğlu*. [...] To keep the noise inside, windows are never opened in such filthy places! Refreshing the air inside is not deemed at all although it becomes nearly a pure acid-carbonic through the inhaling and exhaling of the lungs of a thousand lustful. Especially girls, how they are thought to be clean even if they go into baths, filth spurts out even from their pores.⁸⁵⁸

The Tanzimat novelist was very much concerned with the idea of purity and sanitation, and this was related to the position they assumed against illness. Although Tanzimat novelists were critical about moral dimension of involving in extra-marital affairs and incline to carnal love, their worries about “disease” and “infected bodies” are crucial to understand their ideals regarding society, family and individual. According to the Tanzimat intellectual, irrespective of whether s/he accentuated his/her ideas through the medium of literature or other kind of genre, s/he is concerned with the purity, purity of body, so purity of family and society. For example, Ahmed Midhat comments about the frequenters of brothels as follows; “if these ecstatic ones knew that this place is actually a den of vices, would they be able to acknowledge the horror of the jeopardy that they put themselves in instead of having pleasure?”⁸⁵⁹, similarly Fatma Aliye, spiritual daughter as Ahmed Midhat acknowledged, is fairly terrorized by the peril that one puts his own purity, that is health, and his family’s, by visiting brothels and promiscuous women. She expresses her thoughts about prostitution and males’ search for pleasure outside legitimate margins by the medium of Fehime, already acknowledged as an exemplary for disenchanted wives in the preceding sections;

⁸⁵⁸ Ibid., 68, 111.

⁸⁵⁹ Ibid., 53-54.

[...] The reason of my suffering and distress is not the fact that my husband spends his time elsewhere and enjoys with other women. The main issue is considering that he stains this clean and decent home after he visits debased and loathsome places, deeming that what kind of filths[other women] touched him while tidying up his clothes as a womanly duty, and perceiving him as an inappropriate husband for me since he frequents such women. That torment is incomparable to anything. Because I have already learnt not be jealous about, and not to love him. Only this repulsiveness kills me. Disloyalty and unfaithfulness wounds the heart, [...] I have put up with these so long. Simply heart is wounded due to this. But whole being of one despises due to hatred. Yet, you are obliged to keep silent and submit to this man! [...] This hatred is also adjoined by a fear and horror. The usual consequence for the ones accustomed to that life! He will pollute his blood, perish his body, that staining and despicable disease will poison his life irremediably and incurably! When that filth and loathsomeness is evoked, it is not either possible to bear or feel obliged for a woman!.. Then, the edifice of friendship is also ruined!..⁸⁶⁰

The above quote interestingly underlines the fear and disgust related to disease, however, the sexually transmitted one. Actually fear and disgust towards illness is not a purely modern phenomenon, especially the victims of diseases with external symptoms such as leprosy and syphilis had always been outcasts, nevertheless with the achievements of the science of biology in the nineteenth century, this out-casting became intensified that biology served to deepen the relation between morality and contagion, therefore creating a terror while expanding curative and protective means. Sexually transmitted diseases, gonorrhea and syphilis mainly, were under scrutiny, and these diseases were believed to be generated from brothels, that is, from the “new world” “the foreigners”, and “the filthy body of the prostitute” especially in West European medical discourse. In the course of the end of nineteenth century, it was acknowledged that sexually transmitted diseases were caused by bacteria, however prostitute’s body continued to serve as the source one gets in touch with the venereal diseases. Therefore, not only in early Turkish novels, but also in advice and conduct books addressing familial and sexual issues one quite often comes across

⁸⁶⁰ Letter No.6 From Fehime to Mehabe as excerpted from Fatma Aliye, *Levâiyih*, 25-26.

with the relation built in between prostitution and venereal disease. Quite in accordance with the warnings provided through literary genres, Ottoman administration took certain precautions in the late nineteenth century such as closing down brothels and increasing police surveillance over them, then mandatory and periodical gynecological control and registry of prostitutes that recall the connection between prostitution and venereal disease. Nevertheless, the threat of disease was the most terrorizing one among the perils of prostitution instrumentalized in early Turkish novels to warn the readers. For example Ahmed Midhat informs his readers with the manner of an instructor about this notion through the dialogue of Kalyopi, a seventeen year-old prostitute in one of the brothels around Pera, and Ahmed Bey, a curious visitor “rather came [...] to scrutinize the condition of humanity”⁸⁶¹ in brothels as follows;

We are also surprised with the fact that how come men brought up in cleanliness like you visit here. We are not only surprised, but also resentful to you. How do you frequent these places though you have clean homes and families; if you drink a glass of water, you cannot be sure about to what kind of mouths that glass touched previously. Every morning we bring you “supposedly clean” napkins. We assure you that these napkins were not used at all. But why should we feel obliged to protect you as we claim? Who are you for us? Thus we process those napkins with a lit bit of water and touch of iron everyday, and deceive you that they are just brought from the laundry. As I told you, if you repel from anything starting from women up to the air you breathe here, you are justified in that.⁸⁶²

[...] is not it the foremost danger for you [prostitutes] that you go to bed with the scoundrels visiting you by not knowing whether they are ill or healthy? What if this scoundrel has a disease? [...] Oh! While the most talented doctors fail to diagnose illnesses, how do you know whether a man is ill or not? You may identify the indicators of some diseases. But some bladder diseases do not have obvious symptoms like sores or flux after the preliminary therapy. With respect to this, that guy can still infect you. And

⁸⁶¹ Ahmed Midhat, *Henüz*, 146.

⁸⁶² *Ibid.*, 110.

not only those kinds, but other kinds of diseases which are transmitted by breathe or bodily contact can infect you. [...] To tell you the truth, though you are always in serious jeopardy, the ones frequent you are in no less danger. If these thoughts which are occurring to me at the moment also strike customers, these places [brothels] will be closed down since there would not be any client.⁸⁶³

With respect to the quotes above, it is interesting to see how Ahmed Midhat made use of “disease” as a threat highlighted by a prostitute and an exemplary young male to caution Ottoman reading public about the hazards of prostitution. Both of these two protagonists share the same view point that prostitution via venereal and infectious diseases threatens the health, and purity of families. In another occasion, he gives a detailed and blistered expenditure list for the ones who would like to have a “joy” like visiting brothels and prostitutes.⁸⁶⁴ This long and costly list is a warning for youth and family fathers that there are financial perils of regarding seeking pleasure outside of legitimate margins. However, Ahmed Midhat also talks about the moral and spiritual hazard that prostitution inflicts on individuals and society; “One could feel relief if a soap which would clean the spiritual pollution inflicted by prostitution was devised”⁸⁶⁵ he wrote after depicting the course of life inside brothels. In fact, he believes that prostitution is a “necessary evil” that governments could not do away unless being guided by public opinion and inclination;

[...] actually, no government approves such a situation [prostitution] in its dominion. Governments are the fathers of people; is it possible for a father to favor such wickedness for the members of his household? But if everybody sees such filthy places necessary, and demands them, it [the government] concludes that prostitution is the necessity demonstrated by public demand; as I told you, if [...] public opinion formidably opposes to it, the remaining

⁸⁶³ Ibid.,183-184.

⁸⁶⁴ Ibid., 115-116.

⁸⁶⁵ Ibid. .68.

minority will be regardless. At that occasion, the government can do anything. It can even force this minority to leave this wickedness. At that time, it will even take precautions such as outlawing bachelorhood, taxing the ones persisting to be unmarried and spending the sum collected by this tax for marrying off the girls who left unmarried due to their poverty and faintheartedness, or disciplining the girls, who resorted to this way as a result of their immorality and ignorance, early in their childhood.⁸⁶⁶

Basically, Ahmed Midhat believes that this necessary evil, namely, prostitution, can be handled through variety of means, i.e., “outlawing bachelorhood”, “taxing bachelors”, “utilizing the sum collected through bachelors’ taxation for marrying off the unmarried, poor girls or the spinsters, or disciplining the girls who are prone disgrace” before hand. Indeed, Ottoman administration took precautions such as lowering marriage taxes on hand, or warning local and provincial administrations to propagate the abandonment of costly marriage and ceremonial customs since they gave rise to illegitimacies, that is, prostitution beginning from the 1860s onwards. Together with such official attempts, Ahmed Midhat draws an analogy between precautions for prostitution and health that society needs “a science for protecting honesty and chastity” together with protective health measures.⁸⁶⁷ This resembles British anti-prostitution campaign in 1860s and 1880s that culminated into the “Men’s Temperament Movement”. Ahmed Midhat opts for awareness about moral and individual purity that would prevent prostitution, which is conceptualized as an endemic disease in civilization against which individuals should fight;

[...] in a civilized society, it is unattainable to outlaw this practice absolutely. We do not claim to outlaw it totally. These disgraceful might as well continue their damned undertakings [prostitution]; but these should be concealed from people who are devoted and upright. It should not be practiced so explicitly.

⁸⁶⁶ Ibid., 202.

⁸⁶⁷ Ibid., 239

Instead of hoping to obstruct it, this wickedness will be sustained when it is explicitly practiced.⁸⁶⁸

[...] the attitude of these girls towards prostitution and disgrace is actually a disease. And it is not a disease exclusively contained in the [prostitutes'] soul and flesh. It is an infectious disease in the matter and soul of civilized society within which we live. Therefore, people aware of these places are actually blind unless they do not work to cure this illness.

It is certainly not enough to try to cure the illness. How properly thought the medical doctors! They considered protective health measures more important than therapeutic means. [...] Thus, the same principles should be applied for this "disease of civilization". While devising rules for preventing [prostitution], these rules must be named preventive precautions for chastity instead of preventive precautions for health. [...] If these rules are set, the strain of the disease called prostitution will be so diminished that the remnants of it will be easily handled by physicians and psychologists [*beden ve ruh hekimleri*].⁸⁶⁹

Ahmed Midhat believes that prostitution and brothels belong to Western civilization, and they emerged in the East, that is conceptualized as Ottomandom here, with respect to the expansion of European civilization. The reason he grounds this claim is Islamic Canon's prohibition over prostitution, and prostitution and adultery are equated in this reasoning;

I believe that this loathsome thing [prostitution] is non-existent in Turkish, Islamic and Ottoman world; it is imported from *Frenks*. Oh, those hats! Whichever country those hats entered, this obscenity emerged. [...] In the Holy Koran punishment for adulterous women and men were designated. And what a punishment it is. If adulterers are single, hundred clubbing, if they are married, stoning to death! How do you like it? [...] I wish these laws were applied! [...] the fact that punishment for adultery was predetermined in the holy Koran proves the ever non-existence of such loathsome activity in Islam. If it was present, there would not be any punishment so that it was tolerated. It would be regarded permissible as it happens in *Beyoğlu* at the moment. But what's the point in this? Look at *Anadolu* [Anatolia], look at Asia! Pay a visit to the places which have not been penetrated by those hats and try to find a

⁸⁶⁸ Ibid., 203.

⁸⁶⁹ Ibid., 233-234.

brothel! [...] in which regions across Anatolia and Asia can you find women and men deliberately committing adultery? [...] ⁸⁷⁰

As for the illegitimacies occurring in the countryside that he was surely aware of, Ahmed Midhat sees military service culpable that men lose their moral priorities during this service, however prostitution is still regarded as a European invention;

In one of my voyages, I conversed with a village head somewhere around Kozan. Seemed quite happy about the moral outlook of their province, he added; “the men we sent for military service started to behave unruly and they managed to deceive some witless women. Though we corrected them, the future is worrisome”. That means that those young men accustomed [to adultery via prostitution] here and bring this ill habit into their hometowns. In short, I do not doubt that this habit is non-existent among neither Muslims nor Christians, but it came into our homeland with Europeans. ⁸⁷¹

Actually, Ahmed Midhat’s comment that men gain inclination towards prostitution during military service and prostitution belongs to the Western civilization somewhat parallel to the way Ottoman administration handled the prostitution issue. There are specific documents which address the problem of unruliness and venereal disease among soldiers in arms, and spread of venereal disease in the countryside with respect to prostitution and foreign origin prostitutes. Moreover, Ottoman administration tried to regulate women who were thought to be suspicious by traveling without licence and accompany through regulation at ports, in military districts, and *Serseri Nizamnâmesi*. However, it is obvious again through historical data that prostitution was not a business only pertaining foreigners or non-Muslims; there are cases that Muslim women found guilty of practicing prostitution and sent to exile, or outside the district they lived. It can be said that Muslim prostitutes might

⁸⁷⁰ Ibid., 197-198.

⁸⁷¹ Ibid., 198.

have not been visible like their foreign and non-Muslim counterparts regarding the prohibition over prostitution of Muslim women, nevertheless visibility of foreign and non-Muslim women through street walking, or in brothels does not make prostitution solely specific to these groups. Contemporary books based on memoirs, and studies dealing urban history suggest the opposite that there were Muslim women active in business either in brothels, or as expensive courtesans. It is also interesting that Ahmed Midhat concentrated on *Beyoğlu*, the supreme district of European style of entertainment and region which had specific quarters, and streets for brothels, however, he disregards the hidden “houses of vice” across Muslim neighborhoods. He also draws parallel between slavery and prostitution that he uses this parallel against the contemporary European critique over Ottoman domestic slavery. In any case, Ahmed Midhat’s treatment towards Muslim women’s prostitution is differential, and below quote proves the aforesaid notions altogether;

O you *Frenks* [Europeans]! You talk over outlawing slavery in Turkey in the name of civilisation and liberty! However, not a single slave is sold out to brothels for pleasing the most disgraceful among the people in our country. Here are the real slaves that were sold by their parents to be stained by the grime of prostitution.⁸⁷²

[...]Do you see any Muslim among [...] the ones prostituting themselves in *Beyoğlu*? I claim that the spread of prostitution among Christian foreigners such as French, Polish, Maltese, Rumanian, and Christian inhabitants such as Greek Orthodox, Armenian etc., is by no means comparable with that of Muslim inhabitants.

[...] thank God that this wickedness is really rare among Muslims. Moreover, the prime reason for prostitution among Muslims is women’s look for pleasure in that respect; the ones adopt prostitution as for earning their living are couple of disgraceful exiled from different provinces who commit their sin around cemeteries, here and there.[...] ⁸⁷³

⁸⁷² Ibid., 173.

⁸⁷³ Ibid., 199.

Considering Muslim women's prostitution rare, Ahmed Midhat even goes on to argue that they, - a minority of course-, commit prostitution for sexual pleasure, in a way equating Muslim women's prostitution with illegitimate sex, or adultery. The way he conceptualized Muslim prostitutes as a marginal group helps him to posit them as "demonized few" who have propensity for adultery, carnal inclination and lewdness, which have been previously discussed in this chapter as currently emerged moral problems in Ottoman society. For the non-Muslim Ottoman women, he has different reasons to suggest, in a way demonizing not the women, but circumstances and customs specific to non-Muslim communities under which these women live through; dower and working,

The main reason causing the spread of prostitution among Christians is *drahoma* [dower] which is required for young girls to get married. It is as if a girl must purchase her husband. If a girl does not have money, she will not find a husband. If an affluent Christian has three daughters, he bankrupts. Among people, the poor are always majority. Thus, girls dispossessing *drahoma* are left no choice but seeking pleasure in illegitimate ways. If patriarchs [Orthodox and Gregorian clerics] outlaw the custom of *drahoma*, they will perform a great service for diminishing of this disgrace. In addition to this, the servant girls in Christian households [...] are candidates for brothels. A poor girl goes to serve in a household where there are couple of young men with whom she might engage a secret love affair, and then she is fired following this affair becomes evident. After being reputed as a "bad girl", other families do not employ her. And her parents are poor! Yet, she has seen fancy dresses and adornments; the desire for these has already arisen. Therefore, the next place she will head is the brothel. [...]⁸⁷⁴

It is interesting that working in domestic service, and dower are conceptualized as "defaming" and leading non-Muslim women into prostitution. In through the "supposed" regularity of non-Muslim women employed in domestic service *vis-à-vis* the domestic slavery in Muslim household, which was represented as free of such dangers by providing the opportunity of getting married for the subjects through

⁸⁷⁴ Ibid., 199-200.

giving birth to the offspring of the owner, non-Muslim women's working put under scrutiny for causing prostitution. It is again analyzed as one of the impacts of the West that women's employment as domestic servants increased with the penetration of European civilization into the East. *Drahoma* is also evaluated as a European custom which was previously non-existent among local Ottoman Christians;

[...] while this evil custom has been once non existent even among our Christian inhabitants, it spread out after the springing up of hats. Is the custom of *drahoma* really intrinsic in Christianity? Today's hat wearing Christians used to have the same custom of dowry as we Muslims do; however, parallel to the adoption of hats, our Christian inhabitants espoused other European customs and they accepted *drahoma* as the basis of matrimony. Did we forget that Armenian women were veiled a short while ago? Do not we see that Christian women in Anatolia and Arab lands are as veiled as Muslim [women]? [...] It happened the way I suggested. Eastern people were impaired by Westerners. Under Ottoman administration, *Solyots*, *Manyots* were in fact brave people. Their women and daughters were braver than other nations' men. They were nearly unheard of adultery and prostitution; even their legitimate love was brave. Now, go and see Athens and Piraeus. All the servant girls are the ones called "highlander" that many *Solyot* and *Manyots* are found among.[...] ⁸⁷⁵

Non-Muslim subjects of the empire have also been represented as the foremost and primary group that adopted westernization in a super-westernized fashion in Tanzimat novels; they were believed to have more propensity than their Muslim counterparts to "westernization" in majority of the early Turkish novels. Their consumption patterns together with manners and customs were quite often regarded to be negatively colored by the penetration of European cultural elements. For example, national independence of Greeks and establishment of Greece was attributed to be something inflicted by westernization, and Europeans. The end of Ottoman administration in Greece brought in distortion of the tradition, so sexual morals according to Ahmed Midhat that dower appeared to be sustained through

⁸⁷⁵ Ibid., 200-201.

outside employment of women and giving way to loss of chastity in the previous quote. In other words, “moral decay” in Ottoman society was deemed to be firstly started among non-Muslims thanks to the evil impacts of westernization, and then expanded into Muslim community. In such reasoning, it is not surprise to find prostitution and illegitimate sexual relations as a stigma attributed to non-Muslims. Not only Ahmed Midhat, but other novelists also had this tendency to relate prostitution with non-Muslim groups; Ürani the Greek in Nabizade Nazım’s *Zehra*, Hellula the Jew belly dancer in Fatma Aliye’s *Udi* , Anjel, an ex-prostitute in Hüseyin Rahmi’s *Mürebbiye* are examples for such notion. Evangelinos Misailidis is the second novelist who talks about the impact of *drahoma* leading young girls from Greek-Orthodox community girls into prostitution. He reports in his documentary like novel that Greek-Orthodox families spent most of their assets to the eldest daughters if they had more than one, than the rest had to go either into monasteries to become nuns, or domestic service to earn money for the dower. Misailidis condemned *drahoma* custom for imprisoning young girls into the seclusion of monasteries, then their perversion in such seclusion that they became lesbians.⁸⁷⁶ In the long section devoted to prostitution, he counts sexual assaults of close friends of husbands on wives, “defloration” and love affairs before marriage, financial difficulties that forces one to sell her virginity, age differential, jealousy and domestic violence between couples that lead women to seek for pleasure or refuge with others, low moral quality and craving for fashion as causes behind prostitution of Greek-Orthodox girls.⁸⁷⁷ Misailidis is similar to Ahmed Midhat the way he talks about trafficking of young women as prostitutes that for instance after the decline of

⁸⁷⁶ Misailidis, 193.

⁸⁷⁷ Ibid., 168-193

Ottoman rule in *Eflak*, *Boğdan*, Hungary and Greece, and events of Sakız Island in 1822 increased non-Muslim girls' prostitution.⁸⁷⁸ Misailidis also presents *Beyoğlu* and *Galata* as “centers of vice”, that is, quarters hosting brothels, and accounts about nine brothel-keeper women, who were all ex-prostitute and Greek-Orthodox.⁸⁷⁹ It is meaningful that Misailidis only reports Greek-Orthodox women's prostitution, trafficking and brothels run by Greek-Orthodox “mamas” since he compiled this work definitely for accounting the problems in Greek-Orthodox community, however, Ahmed Midhat's and his contemporaries accounts stigmatized non-Muslims with respect to prostitution by referring Muslim prostitution as non-existent or very scanty. In general, the legal prohibition over prostituting Muslim women until the Second Constitutional Period⁸⁸⁰ might have caused the Tanzimat intellectual to label prostitution accordingly; despite this regulation, contemporary accounts and memoirs reveal that there were Muslim as well as non-Muslim prostitutes, and brothels were not restricted to *Pera*, *Galata* and *Tophâne*; there were brothels scattered around the city, in Anatolian districts, too.⁸⁸¹ However, one should also regard that the difference between brothel-prostitutes, women in entertainment business and courtesans are blurred in Tanzimat novels; for example Hellula in Fatma Aliye's *Udî* is a belly dancer and singer, however, she is also presented as a woman who exchange sexual favors in return for money. In other words, women who do not have “respectable occupations” such as singers, dancers, and women who

⁸⁷⁸ Ibid., 171, 279.

⁸⁷⁹ Ibid., 158-233.

⁸⁸⁰ See Türker, 89.

⁸⁸¹ See Sevengil, 119; Scognamillo, 24-25, 41, 61-62, 78-82.

work as domestic servants, and mistresses in general were represented as the ones who are prone to surpass the thin line demarcating prostitution and chastity.

Then, what are the reasons behind prostitution that cause women to violate the border of chastity and turn into prostitutes according to Tanzimat novels? Tanzimat novelists argued for these causes, which paved the way women to become “fallen” at length, and their comments again entail an outlook of didacticism and advice. The most important reason for women to resort into prostitution is having no proper guardians during their up-bringing in early Turkish novels; it is either their parents who are not capable of supporting them materially and spiritually, or they are orphaned and left to the care of incapable, immoral and impoverished intimates. The moral outlook of “fallen women” is not regarded something ascribed or inherent, but occurred in time with respect to vain parenting and up-bringing. Moreover, through the debate over prostitution, the ideal of proper parenthood and child up-bringing is once more accentuated that through the depiction of resorting into immorality, that is prostitution, parenthood is moralized. Following quotes advocate that ill-parenting, distorted mothering in the absence of fathers and immoral familial surrounding cause prostitution;

It should be regarded that these [prostitutes] in fact were born as innocent and chaste as an angel. [...] If somebody calls them with this word [prostitute], they burst into tears. [...] But how come they do not even happen to think of being ashamed for adopting prostitution for earning their living though being created innocent? What causes their good nature to be devastated in this way? Certainly bad education and discipline!

No mother up-brings her daughter to work in such debased places; thus, when it is stated as “bad education”, the education received in the mother’s lap should be understood. Mothers’ discipline cannot be regarded as insignificant for this respect.⁸⁸²

⁸⁸² Ahmed Midhat, *Henüz*, 138-139.

Ürani was bereft of her mother at the age of five, and she lost her father at twelve. She was left to Fani, her aunt, as an impoverished and dilapidated child. Though Fani was unable to earn her own living, she set her hopes on benefiting from Ürani's beauty in future, and took her in. She [Fani] used to bring her [Ürani] while she was at such an age to the bawdy houses that she attended, and train her to come fit for the customs and formalities there.

Ürani even started to enjoy that world, an appetite [for these] awaked in her. She was feeling a great desire for [these]. If it were up to her, she would immediately go into this world.

[...] Ürani started to earn money even before reaching her fourteen years of age. [...]⁸⁸³

[...] I was born and brought up in a debauched home. Even before I reached my thirteen years of age, those malicious, that so called relatives tried to acquire money by selling my honor. Is it possible for a kid at that age to know what honor is, what mankind is, and how to protect herself from wickedness? ... Once you have fallen, it is like being entrapped in a sea of sand, you sink more into it as long as you try to go out of it. The fate directed, and I have always moved ahead on this way. [...]⁸⁸⁴

Mme! Do you really believe that this flirtatious and coquettish body, habitually jiggling up and down [...], singing and dancing, is not tired out at all? [...] I am compelled to laugh when I am sad and exhausted, I have to sing, dance and lead the carousal whole night when I want to sleep, I have to please a man whom I do not like at all since he paid a lot... Aren't these for providing my widowed mother, my younger but orphaned brothers and sisters?

Mme Bedia! My mother did not bring us up otherwise. I have the obligation of supporting her [my mother] since she has been providing and feeding me up to now. What else can be done? Is it easy to find a husband for a widowed woman who was dilapidated with three children? If a woman has to earn her living, what else will she find to sell other than her dimples, and giggles?

[...] Gold [money] was recklessly spent for my mother's sweet lies, songs, her amorous glances, her feign reluctance. The ones from whom we could not hear anything other than "May god help you", enunciated the following thereupon; "everything I own is yours! Just claim".⁸⁸⁵

Tanzimat novels chose to address contemporary social problems through a strictly moralistic perspective; their reference to structural problems such as economic and social transformation is very limited. Tanzimat novelists resorted into present the exceptional cases of "individual and demonized few", still influential enough to

⁸⁸³ Nabizade Nazım, *Zehra*, 105-106.

⁸⁸⁴ Mehpeyker explains how she ended up to be a courtesan in Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 74.

⁸⁸⁵ Hellula reports her case to become a belly dancer and mistress for livelihood in Fatma Aliye, *Udi*, 58-60.

bring disorder, instead of providing a macro socio-economic analysis. The inflation, war, epidemics and single-headed families thereupon, period of social transformation as creating disharmony and anomie in the social and familial domain were not didactically argued as proper morality is didactically utilized. For example, widows who have material difficulty to support their children are easily demonized, “they do not try traditional low-paid but respectable work for women instead of prostitution”, such as peddling, sewing, laundry work, since these women do not have “patience and moral standard” to live decently as suggested in Fatma Aliye’s *Udi*.⁸⁸⁶ Fatma Aliye and Ahmed Midhat well acknowledged, as their contemporaries do, that limited paid work opportunities for Ottoman women were really limited and insufficient to realize lofty ideals of proper parenthood, since they themselves disprove the futility of such efforts for variety of reasons previously. That must be also the lack, infancy and insufficiency of welfare schemes for orphans and widows, or the distortion of already existing support schemes of such kind that they admitted but chose not to speak for sake of the tale of “moral-proper” instead of positing a threatening socio-political criticism. Therefore, keeping women off prostitution is not a macro political-economic project, but at first it should be considered as an individual and familial strategy; “as an impressive idea in our lofty Ottoman morality [...] it is claimed that even the most repulsive women convert into the loftiest morals when they repent and ritually clean themselves, but this is not the way I suggest. [The proper way of combating prostitution] is not frequenting such places at all!”⁸⁸⁷ In addition to this, the way Tanzimat novelists address social problems is similar to the outset of fairy-tales; there are demons, innocents and strategies to cope and

⁸⁸⁶ Ibid., 59.

⁸⁸⁷ Ahmed Midhat, *Henüz*, 201.

combat with the troubles, and a moral lesson in due. By the utilization of individualized exceptional vices, moral emphasis is strengthened, and the ideal is portrayed properly. For instance, in the medium of prostitution issue, we learn a great deal about how Kalyopi and her family was obliged to accept that she prostituted herself through endless sequences of troubles; her father's business and bankruptcy, her mother's lack of foresight over mothering, Kalyopi's beauty, naivety, and childish desires, her sister's *drahoma* issue and engagement, intermarriage and community disapproval about it, migration into a big city, difficulties of paid work for women, big family size, family emergencies like sickness, etcetera. And all of these factors analyzed through a single discourse, the discursive morality which is designed to dissolve the monstrous vice, prostitution. Moral claims are the most frequent and foremost powerful claims in the Tanzimat novel. In short, whatever the reason, economic, historic- and period-specific, prostitution is a moral problem to be handled with morally rehearsed and rehabilitated parenthood. "If a father lets his daughter to lead into brothel [for whatever the reason], he cannot have the claim of fatherhood over her anymore. If somebody, who is not even a kinsman, rescues her from such a place, he will have every kind of right over her"⁸⁸⁸ wrote Ahmed Midhat illustratively. In a similar "morally claiming" outlook, Bedia in *Udi* has to fight back the empathy she feels towards Hellula, her morally depraved but still powerful rival explains the economic hardships inflicted by her father's decease, by uttering "chastity is still the biggest ornament."⁸⁸⁹

⁸⁸⁸ Ibid., 304.

⁸⁸⁹ Fatma Aliye, *Udi*, 62.

In this moralistic approach that propriety and decent life are achievable through proper parenting and discipline, the prostitutes as protagonists are still demonized everlastingly. Their once and for all going astray causes them to be incompatible and untrustworthy personalities especially if the love is at stake. It has been discussed before that Tanzimat novel does not disregard love, but tame it by reserving it to marriage for the sake of companionship and good parenting. In this frame, regardless of genuine or not, the prostitute's love is not proper since it is aimed to strip men of their wealth and virtues, and it is truly carnal;

Poor Helula! Do you really believe deceiving everyone is like deceiving the gang of wretched that were duped by you? Do you love, don't you? Oh, how strange it is! Do you love humankind? [...] While offering love for many of them at once, and keeping many lovers at the same time, you do not feel sorrow when you are left, and you do not even have pity for them after taking a lot out of them. [...] You are not content with only stripping them [your lovers] of money and property. When they do not have anything to be stripped of, you take them away from the virtues like honor and dignity. You also drag them up into swindling, cheating, and stealing.

Oh, Mme! Your husbands abrade and neglect you because of us!.. Well, yes, their passion for us is stronger. However, their love for you [their wives] is unrivalled.

[...] Your position is achievable neither through money nor repenting. In reality, regret bestows you forgiveness. It also helps you to live chastely. However, repenting cannot do away with certain marks, memoirs, or remembrances. [...] I experienced this bitterness when I was about to get married. I wanted to propose marriage for couple of the ones who recklessly spent money for an amorous glance or a dance of mine. None of these respond favorably to my proposal. Yes! The ones who rushed in to my illegitimate enticement were not interested in this legitimate bid! Money was not esteemed in this respect. I witnessed that the ones rejected me got married with the girls who were uglier, poorer but chaster girls than me.⁸⁹⁰

Similarly, Nabizade argues for Ürani's incapacity to love genuinely as follows;

⁸⁹⁰ Hellula explains her love to Bedia's husband in *ibid.*, 57-58, 99-100.

After changing one or two homes in three or four years, she withdrew to live on her own after renting the flat in the house number 16. She has never fallen in love with any man.

She changed ten to fifteen lovers in two years time and she was unable to stick with any of them. She used to listen every one of her lovers' pledge of love indifferently, and mock them inwardly. After spending some amorous moments together, these two deeply committed lovers [Ürani and one of her lovers] used to break up since they lost their enthusiasm towards each other.⁸⁹¹

Prostitutes' love is disqualified and a dead-end effort for Tanzimat writers although traditional Islamic culture makes room for repenting as Ahmed Midhat argues.⁸⁹² He argues that his protagonist, Ahmed Efendi appreciates Kalyopi's "ineptness for prostitution as a virtue."⁸⁹³ Nevertheless, as an interventionist writer, he compares prostitutes love with that of "descent" women; "I wonder whether the pleasure of being husband and wife is comparable to anything else in the world?"⁸⁹⁴ "The true love", for Ahmed Midhat, can only be found in "a legitimate husband's grateful lap".⁸⁹⁵ In contrast to what he has just suggested, we learn that after rescuing Kalyopi from the brothel she has been working, Ahmed Efendi never thinks of getting married to her. Having acknowledged the sympathy and love in-between themselves, Ahmed Efendi arranges a marriage to her with a lower-order, poor man.⁸⁹⁶

Namık Kemal is the strictest one who demonstrated the "once and for all" ill-mannered nature of "loose women" for a stable and trustworthy relationship, he comments "Mehpeyker was not a woman who would get married and settle down or

⁸⁹¹ Nabizade Nazım, *Zehra*, 106.

⁸⁹² See the excerpt cited from Ahmed Midhat's *Henüz*, in the previous page.

⁸⁹³ Ahmed Midhat, *Henüz*, 146.

⁸⁹⁴ *Ibid.*, 190.

⁸⁹⁵ *Ibid.*, 334.

⁸⁹⁶ *Ibid.*, 334.

the one who would dedicate herself to a single man. The thing that she did not agree with was wearing the ring of wedlock and being exclusively the woman of a man.”⁸⁹⁷

To sum up, prostitution is utilized in early Turkish novels through a discourse of moralistic otherization that proper family, love and sexuality is conceptualized.

The Tanzimat novelists wrote upon upper and upper middle class Ottoman-Muslim households with few exceptions and limited reference to other social strata. For example, other ethnic and religious groups such as Orthodox, Gregorian, Catholic as well as Greeks, Armenians, Jews, and people titled as Levant, were included in the scope of these novels through stereotypes and stigmas. One cannot find a novel which has chosen one of these groups as the central and idealized figures for family and proper upbringing other than ill mannered domestic servants, evil doctors or lewd prostitutes. The onset of nationalism and attempts to create a national literature under the pretext of addressing the nation can be a factor for the limited representation of minority groups in the early Ottoman novel. We should also take into account that the minority groups in the Ottoman society had already established their publishing enterprises as well as newspapers and journals in this period. In sum, there was a particularistic approach in terms of depicting the “people” and different communities were busy with upbringing their own literary élite. Under these circumstances, the rural and provincial populations were not the subjects of the early Ottoman novels; they were yet to be included in the scope of social crisis later, during and after the First World War.

Depending upon the argumentation above one can suggest that the early Ottoman novelist utilized the nearby environment to him or herself. It is also reasonable to read the novels as the scanty accounts of personal experience. For

⁸⁹⁷ Namık Kemal, *İntibah*, 49.

example, we know from the biographical information on Fatma Aliye that she had problems with her husband in terms of her intellectual and literary activities.⁸⁹⁸ And in a way, these problems reflected themselves in her novel called *Muhadarat*, where she talks about an incompatibility between a couple who got married through parents' arrangement. We can also argue that the provincial structure did not have an intellectual stratum *vis-à-vis* the urban centers, and the intellectual and enlightened inhabited the central and commercial, or "regional capitals". In this condition, the novels about countryside and problems of provincial life were normally in due. Moreover, the changes and reforms were generally addressed to the urban population; the immediate surrounding that was in close proximity to the reformists and critical.

It is really a difficult task to distinguish who were the reformist and critical conservative in the Tanzimat period. Though seems misleading and fuzzy at the first sight, the reactionary reformism can be the proper term to understand and delve into the Tanzimat mind. For example, the critical-conservative outstanding is observable through all of the novelists' thoughts about the *alafranga*, the super-westernization and conspicuousness revealed in the second half of the nineteenth and the first decade of the twentieth centuries. However, colored by different ideological agenda, one can encounter with diverse "reformisms". The decadence of the youth through a misunderstood European deeds and conspicuous and extravagant luxury spending, and moral decay of the well-to-do while paving the way for the lower classes for the same end were the primary things to be reacted in this period. The revitalization of the educational and institutional as well as private domain was the point that all

⁸⁹⁸ See Ahmed Midhat Efendi, *Fatma Aliye; Bir Osmanlı Kadın Yazarın Doğuşu*, (İstanbul: Sel Yayıncılık, 1994).

reactionary and reformist ends met. In other words, the Tanzimat period is the time of duality with its all meanings. In addition to this, a duality appeared in the institutional, social and private realms, and it marked the period. Then, both the conflicts and the potentials of this duality were revealed, examined, and tested through the fictive activity.

It is not surprising for the Tanzimat novelist-intellectual to describe and try to rehabilitate the setting, rather than creating an enthusiasm for outward protest against the state of affairs surrounding the Ottoman familial system. They were perfect educationalists that they believed in smooth transformation, or glorious transition in time rather than asserting a need for severe revolution from today to tomorrow. First of all, they aimed to determine the problem related areas, which they perceived as the roots of social decadence and unrest in the age of modernity. Secondly, they were striving for a change, which did not need to be modeled as the one to one employment of external deeds and experiences. Thirdly, the novel as a genre was a medium through which they could circulate their ideas without harming the public conscience and authority. They were trying to create their own means for promoting their own sense of reform and progress, retention and criticism and novel is utilized as didactic medium to demonstrate these notions.

The Ottoman-Muslim upper and upper middle class households were pessimistic landscapes as depicted in the Tanzimat novels. The early novels in Ottoman Turkish were like descriptive panorama that laid the problems of a transitional society. The family is the unit upon which fictive activity was centered; since the intellectual-novelist of the period were both terrorized with the alterations took place in the private domain, and most importantly they substituted their energy for wider political criticism thereupon. They had an organicist view that they

believed if they start from the social category at the base, which was the familial unit for Ottoman society like elsewhere, they would grasp the problems and discords, and discard the outmoded and dysfunctional notions.

CHAPTER V

CONCLUSION

With the proclamation of the Reform Edict of *Tanzimat*, also known as *Gülhâne Hatt-i Hümayunu*, in 1839, Ottoman Empire formally went into an institutionalized process of modernization, which would be finalized by the *Kemalist* Reforms later in the twentieth century. The period between 1839 and 1908 was characterized by “purposive modernizations” by which firstly bureaucratic structure then social institutions in Ottoman society were reformed. The period, therefore, is quite often called the era of reforms and regulations that Ottoman state became increasingly a modern-interventionist-disciplinary state, while Ottoman peoples were disciplined and standardized with regard to modern concept of subject-citizen.

The modernizing reforms initiated by the nineteenth century Ottoman administration were chiefly centered on the critique and transformation of the key institutions firstly in the state apparatus. Parallel to the process of bureaucratic modernization and centralization, the reform of social institutions in which socialization of individuals took place was incorporated into the scope of general reform agenda. In other words, modernizing reforms in Ottoman polity increasingly attained a social locus with the advent of time; the “Ottoman Muslim family” and its reform also became one of the most essential components of this contemporary reform project. Beginning from the *Tanzimat* period onwards (1840s-1900s), a

modern discourse on family was formed with regard to the critical appraisal of marriage, intra-family relations, gender relationships, procreation, morality, hygiene and purity. The centralizing and modernizing state on the one hand, and critical intellectuals on the other the other deliberated the margins of this modern discourse simultaneously.

Ottoman modern discourse which aimed to reform and rehabilitate the way(s) Muslim families functioned had a clear appeal towards creating a new individual. The nineteenth century political, economic and social transformations were decisive for the emergence of such an appeal. First of all, Ottoman Empire was a financially and militarily declining one which had already surpassed its golden age. Previous reform attempts tried to handle this decline by focusing on recuperation of bureaucracy, military and administrative apparatus. However, the decline of the empire proved to be a social one in the wake of constant military defeats against Russian and Austrian onslaughts, internal revolts injuring human potential, and technological, economic and political superiority of the West as an undefeatable competent. The social reforms and ordering of social body in the medium of these reforms became crucial means for withstanding great powers and restoring Ottoman pride. In other words, the previous reform attempts had proved to be amended with set of social reforms in the age of territorial and economic decline.

Following the commencement of Tanzimat period, a new conception of society arose to denote the domain to which bureaucratic state could legitimately intervene on the one hand, and from which the state based its own legitimacy on the other. Accordingly, the welfare, health, outfit and contentment of Ottoman peoples were perceived as prerequisites for the perfection and prolongation of the Ottoman Empire. The issue of promoting contentment and productive capacity of Ottoman

subjects produced set of policy formulations and institutional structuring attempts. These policy orientations and institutional developments can be taken as the indicators of an “early welfare” and “modern- interventionist” state to appear. In other words, social reform in the Ottoman Empire scheduled and intended for restoring contemporary military and economic degeneration.

During the Tanzimat period, Ottoman administration took institutional steps and performed ideological and paradigmatic shifts which put the families at large and Ottoman Muslim family in particular to the embrace of the reform question. Basically, the Tanzimat administration produced an institutional agenda and discourse by which Ottoman social institutions could be reformed and rehabilitated. No matter there was a perfect correspondence between what were planned and desired, and what were achieved in real terms, all constitutive, economic, social elements of the Ottoman Muslim familial ground together with its surrounding ideology became objectified in the medium of reform policies, reformist regulation and reformatory discourse. Tanzimat era was the age of regulation, both in terms of producing regulatory narratives on hundreds of respects, but at the same time bringing in the advent of “centralizing” and “universalizing” regulations that give the modern regulation its distinct character. At this resort, one can recognize the scope, means and impact of familial reform by excavating in to the grand narrative of reformist-regulatory-disciplining discourse at large. Ottoman political, economic, and institutional reforms of mid- nineteenth century produced individual and area-specific regulations that aimed to standardize the everyday lives of Ottoman subjects. The demographic, medical, moral, and educational regulations and the depiction of Ottoman family and its members within these regulations are crucial for couple of respects. Firstly, in the medium of these regulations, Ottoman subjects were

disciplined and standardized to perform certain activities in specific margins. Secondly, the state as an actor regulating social life redefined its power and capacity of using this power by means of regulatory discourses. Thirdly, the interreaction between the regulated and the regulating actors in mid-nineteenth century Ottoman context elicited a new form of power constitution which distinguished the modern period from the preceding one. In short, the simultaneous analysis of these dimensions are vital for determining the dynamics of social reform in particular and the reform question in the late-Ottoman polity in general.

This study is a small contribution to the analysis of the development of social reform and modern discourse on family in the Ottoman Empire during the Tanzimat Period. It brings together the analysis of different discourses, i.e., pronatalism, population progeny, morality and public health which appealed family institution as part of social regeneration in the age of dissolution. It anticipated that parallel analysis of Ottoman regulations, advice genre and novels endemic to the era would posit alternatives to the historical research on Ottoman families in specific and Ottoman modernisation in general through providing insights about the technical and ideological side of the reform history. It is believed that the central inquiries of this study will enhance the historical studies on Ottoman families, both qualitative and quantitative ones by historicizing the dynamics of the emergence of modern discourse on family through the reappraisal of discursive and transformative capacity of reforms instigated for human reproduction, and population health in the Ottoman context. Generally speaking, historical studies on family tend to concentrate on the impact and consequences of the transformations in economy and legal structure in specific historical periods. In these studies, however, the state's and reformist cadres' appeals for reform remain partially analysed. However, the emergence of family as a

domain to be criticised, transformed and regulated is essential for two respects; one is the enlargement of state concern and control over private dynamics. Secondly, for the development of institutional means of intervention towards the realization of this control.

While re-organizing and transforming its own entity, Ottoman state simultaneously reviewed, tried to increase its potential to interfere into many different domains in Ottoman social life during the nineteenth century. Accordingly, certain autonomous and partially controlled domains of life became truly monitored areas in which Ottoman bureaucratic state reworked and redefined its role and activity. Sexual reproduction, morality, public and individual health became public issues about which Tanzimat administration increasingly concerned.

The transformation of Ottoman administration in Tanzimat period was significant due to its accelerated endeavor to promote population progeny and public health through its appeal to families. In other words, Ottoman administration tried to increase its capacity to control “private lives” “private matters” and “private sphere” for ensuring its population policies. For the implementation of these policies, Ottoman Muslim family became a crucial site of control and discipline. Beginning from 1840s onwards, variety of regulations, such as anti abortion, vaccination, and anti-syphilis regulations, were introduced to increase the productive and reproductive potentials of the Ottoman population. These regulations had clear concerns over endorsing public health in the Ottoman society. However the discourse and means embedded in these regulations produced a disciplinary framework for families on the one hand and for other social agents who were indispensable figures for Ottoman social life on the other; the midwife, wetnurse, healer, and inoculator together with other public health practitioners. Concurrent epidemics of smallpox and syphilis, and

frequent abortions among Ottoman peoples troubled the authorities that they felt obliged to introduce preventive means towards these problems in an age population figures were significant more than any other period.

The technical and financial difficulties of Ottoman administration endangered the effective implementation of these regulations. For example the contemporary state of scientific means of inoculation made it hard to propagate smallpox vaccinations among parents up until 1890s. Similarly, financial bankruptcy at provincial and central levels curtailed the full accomplishment of projected syphilis hospitals in Anatolia. Families were tried to be disciplined and moralized over the value of children and impropriety of abortion beginning from the early days of Tanzimat period, yet the state could not launch far-reaching financial support schemes as they were projected. While enforcing the training and licence requirement for midwifery, the state was capable of neither establishing necessary infrastructure for the training of provincial midwives nor appointing trained midwives to the provincial areas. Medical examination requirement prior to marriage in the medium of anti-syphilis regulation was another poorly enforced policy for variety of respects. It aimed to discipline specific group of syphilitics who had to resort official hospitals due to financial reasons. Whereas, as regulations argued, syphilis was not a contagion reserved for lower classes. Higher class syphilitics were overlooked for two reasons; they were predominantly treated at private clinics, and compulsory medical examination prior to marriage enforced only in epidemic regions. Ottoman medical and municipal administrations tried to regulate prostitution, but this also proved to be sporadic since the legitimacy of regulation principle was disputed even within the administration itself. Financial difficulties also prevented the effective medical regulation over prostitution; brothel keepers and

individual prostitutes were deemed responsible to meet the cost of the inspections performed over them. In sum, Ottoman public health and population policies in the Tanzimat period were “good-willed” and “well-projected” proposals, which were poorly or partially-implemented due to financial bankruptcy. However, they provided the necessary meta narratives and legal structure on which consequent modernization and reform projects were built.

Beginning from 1870s onwards, the interference potential of the regulatory state was motivated, amended and legitimized through novels and advice genre that Ottoman people were encircled to obey the disciplinary measures for the second time. Nearly all of the regulations in the era, which concern this study, were included into the scope of the advice genre. As bureaucrats or professional employees of state, polemicists and novelists firstly provided the models on which the state could build its policies. Secondly, they presented far-reaching explanations for their audience about the rationale behind regulations and reforms. Their popular and more comprehensible discourse vis-à-vis the technical and official discourse of regulations provided better instruction and disciplining for the masses. For example, conceptualization of syphilis and abortion in the medium of advice genre were more effective for couple respects. The medical, personal and social hazards of these two public health issues were explained more instructively. As writing through experience, the authors of advice medium offered practical advice and called for active obedience to official regulations.

Early Ottoman novels in Turkish were also crucial means for comprehending the rationale behind regulations and institutional transformation not only for the Ottoman population, but also for the historian. Although novelists have a formidable tendency of abstraction, they predominantly reflect the social and intellectual milieu

in which they live. The Ottoman novelists became novelists in through the writing process itself; majority of them were either state employees or polemicist who had been in the state service for a period of time. They used novel genre as an instrument to instruct and advise masses about current political and social problems. The novels utilized for this study are predominantly didactic novels in which the level of abstraction is limited and inspiration is primarily and repetitively from social disorders characterising Ottoman families. Novel genre was instrumentalized to provide proper behavioral conduct for the Ottoman audience along the stipulations of official regulations and recommendations generated from advice genre. In other words, the state set the regulations, advice genre enhanced the rationale behind regulations and novels popularised this rationale for Ottoman Muslim public.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

I. Primary Sources

a. Archival Sources

Başbakanlık Osmanlı Arşivi (BOA)

Bâb-ı Âli Evrak Odası

Amedi Kalemi

Divan-ı Hümayûn Kalemi

Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Kalemi

Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Kalemi Deavi

Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Mühimme Kalemi

Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Mühimme Kalemi

Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Kalemi- Nezaret ve Devair

Sadaret Evrakı Şura-yı Devlet

Sadaret Evrakı Mektubi Kalemi Umum Vilayat

Cevdet Tasnifi

Cevdet Dahiliye

Cevdet Sıhhiye

Cevdet Zaptiye

Dahiliye Nezareti

Dahiliye Nezareti Tahrirat Kalemi

Dahiliye Nezareti İdare Evrakı

Dahiliye Nezareti Mektubi Kalemi

Dahiliye Nezareti Islah Komisyonu

Dahiliye Nezareti Muhaberat-ı Umumiye Kalemi

İrâdeler

Hususi İrade

İrade Dahiliye

İrade Meclis-i Valâ

Meclis-i Vükela Mazbataları

Yıldız Evrakı

Yıldız Sadaret Resmi Maruzat

Yıldız Esas Evrakı

Yıldız Mütenevvi Maruzat Evrakı

Yıldız Sadaret Maruzatı

Yıldız Evrakı Arzuhal ve Jurnaller

Yıldız Mabeyn Başkitabeti

Yıldız Yaveran ve Maiyet-i Seniyye Erkân- Harbiye Dairesi

Yıldız Sıhhiye Nezareti Maruzatı

Yıldız Şehremaneti Maruzatı

Yıldız Evrakı Tahrirat-ı Ecnebiye ve Mabeyn Mütercimliği

Yıldız Evrakı Umum Vilayetler Tahriratı

Yıldız Zaptiye Nezareti Maruzatı

Zaptiye Nezareti Belgeleri

b. Newspapers and Journals

Basiret

Hadika

Hanım Kızlara Mahsus

İbret

Mecmua-i Fünûn

Mehasin

Servet-i Fünûn

Sıhhiye Mecmuası

Tasvir-i Efkâr

Tânin

Tercüman-ı Hâkikat

c. Printed Primary Sources

Abdülaziz Bey. *Osmanlı Adet, Merasim ve Tabirleri*, 2 vols., İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 2002.

Ahmed Cevdet Paşa, *Tezâkir*, 3 vols., Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1986.

Ahmed Cevdet Paşa. *Maruzat*, İstanbul: Çağrı Yayınları: 1980.

Ahmed Lûtfî. *Târîh-i Lûtfî*, 15 vols., Dersaadet: Mahmut Bey Matbaası: 1884-1885.

Ahmed Midhat. “Esaret”, *Letaif-i Rivayat*, İstanbul: 1871.

_____. “Mihnetkeşan”, *Letaif-i Rivayat*, İstanbul: 1871.

_____. “Bahtiyarlık”, *Letaif-i Rivayat*, İstanbul: 1871.

_____. “Para” in *Letaif-i Rivayat*, İstanbul: 1871.

_____. “Âlem-i Medeniyette Kadınların Mevkii”, *Tercüman-ı Hâkikat*, 11-12, 29 June 1878.

_____. *Avrupa Âdâb-ı Muaşeretini yahut Alafrangra*, İstanbul: 1896-1897.

_____. *Avrupa’da Bir Cevlan*, İstanbul: 1891-1892.

_____. *Çengi*, İstanbul: 1877.

_____. *Felâhî Bey ile Rakım Efendi*, İstanbul: Kırkanbar Matbaası, 1876-1877.

_____. *Felsefe-i Zenân*, İstanbul: 1870-1871.

_____. *Gençlik ve Tevhîl*, İstanbul: Kırkanbar Matbaası, 1889-1890.

_____. *Henüz Onyedî Yaşında*, İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayın, 2004. [c.1882-1883]

_____. *Jön Türk*, İstanbul: Tercüman-ı Hakikat Matbaası, 1910

_____. *Kadınlarda Hıfz-ü Cemal*, İstanbul: Kırkanbar Matbaası, 1888-1889.

- _____. *Paris'te Bir Türk*, İstanbul: 1877-1878.
- _____. *Karnaval*, İstanbul: 1882-1883.
- _____. *Vâh*, İstanbul: 1883-1884.
- _____. *Acaib-i Alem*, İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Klasik Yayınlar, 2004. [c1882]
- _____. "Teehhül" In *Musahabe-i Leyliye*, (İstanbul: Kırkambar Matbaası, 1307/1891-1892.
- _____. "İstidad-ı Etfal" In *Musahabe-yi Leyliye*, İstanbul: Kırkambar Matbaası, 1307/ 1891-1892.
- _____. *Taaffüf*, İstanbul: 1897-1898.
- _____. *Fatma Aliye; Bir Osmanlı Kadın Yazarın Doğuşu*, Prep. by Bedia Ermat, İstanbul: Sel Yayıncılık, 1994.
- E. C. *Hanımlara Yadigar; Tezyinatın Ahlaka Tesiri*, İstanbul: Manastır Matbaası, 1888-1889.
- A.Rıza. *Kızlara Mahsus İdare-i Beytiyye*, İstanbul: Karabet Matbaası, 1898-1899.
- _____. *Kızlara Mahsus Hıfz-u Sıhhat*, İstanbul: Karabet Matbaası, 1905.
- Ahmed Müfid. *Beka-yı Sıhhat*, İstanbul: 1896-1897.
- Ahmed Said. *Hıfz-u Sıhhat-i İzdivac ve Tenasil*, İstanbul: 1892-1893.
- Ali Seydi Bey. *Teşrifat ve Teşkilâtımız*, İstanbul: Tercüman Yayınları, 1970.
- Azmi Ömer, *Hanım Kitabı*, İstanbul: 1328/ 1912-1913.
- Balıkhane Nazırı Ali Rıza Bey. *Eski Zamanlarda İstanbul Hayatı*, İstanbul: Kitabevi Yayınları, 2001.
- Basiretçi Ali Efendi. "Şehir Mektubu no: 23", *Basiret*, 434, 17 Cemaziyülevvel 1288/ 23 July 1871.
- _____. "Şehir Mektubu no.20", *Basiret* , 416, 26 Rebiyülahir 1288/15 July 1871.
- _____. "Şehir Mektubu no. 6", *Basiret*, 791, 28 Ramazan 1289/29 November 1872.
- _____. "Şehir Mektubu no.52", *Basiret*, 1070, 10 Ramazan 1290/ 17 Teşrin-i Evvel 1289/1 November 1873.
- _____. "Şehir Mektubu no.157 [252]", *Basiret*, 2318, 13 Rebiyülevvel 1295 / 26 Şubat 1294/ 17 March 1878.

- _____. “Şehir Mektubu no. 138”, *Basiret*, 1585, 20 Cemaziyyülahir 1292/ 14 April 1875.
- Besim Ömer, *Zayıf ve Vakitsiz Doğan Çocuklara Edilecek Takayyüdat*, İstanbul: 1890-1891.
- _____. *Ebelik: Doğurmak ve Doğurtmak*, İstanbul: Matbaa-i Ahmed İhsan, 1906-1907.
- _____. “Frengi Hakkında Tecarib-i Cedide-yi Fenniye”, In idem., *Nevsal-i Afiyet* 4, İstanbul: Ahmet İhsan ve Şürekası, 1322/1906-1907.
- _____. *Sıhhatnüma-yı Etfal Yahud Valdelere Nasihat; Sıhhat-i Etfal Sa’adet-i İstikbaldir*, İstanbul: Şirket-i Mürettibiye Basımevi, 1887-1888.
- _____. *Sıhhâtünümâ-yı Aile yahud Baba, Ana, Çocuk*, İstanbul: Mahmud Bey Matbaası, 1888-1889.
- _____. *Ukum ve İnânet*, İstanbul: 1890-1891.
- Celaeddin Muhtar. *Frengi Makalatı*, İstanbul: Karabet Matbası, 1901-1902.
- _____. *Frengi ve İzdivac*, İstanbul: Hanımlara Mahsus Gazete Matbaası, 1901-1902.
- Cemal Nadir. *Hanımlara Açık Mektup*, İstanbul: Necm-i İstikbal Basımevi, 1906-1907.
- Cemil Süleyman. *Siyah Gözler*, İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayınları, 2003. [c1911]
- Davis, Fanny. *The Ottoman Lady; A Social History from 1718 to 1918*, Westport Connecticut: Greenwood Press, c1986.
- Dr. Bourge. *Frengi Hıfzıssıhhası*, Trans. By Dr. Avadis Karakoç from French, İstanbul: Mahmud Bey Matbaası, 1908-1909.
- Dr. Munlas Suturi. *Validelere Rehber yahud Hıfz-u Sıhhat-i Etfal*, İstanbul: Kasbar Matbaası, 1894-1895.
- Dr. Salih. *Sari Çocuk Hastalıkları yahud Sirayet-i Marazdan Akdem Etfalin Emr-i Muhafazası*, İstanbul: Ceride-i Askeriyye Basımevi, 1888-1889.
- “Ebe Hanım”, *Hanım Kızlara Mahsus*, 83-285, / 8 Receb 1318/ 1 November 1900.
- Ebu’l Muammer Fuad. *Vezâif-i Aile*, İstanbul: Kateon Bedrosyan Matbaası, 1912-1913.
- Edhem İbrahim Paşa. *Terbiye-i Etfal Risalesi*, İstanbul: Matbaa-yi Amire, 1870-1871.
- Edhem İbrahim Paşa. *Terbiye ve Talim-i Adâb ve Nezayihü’l Etfal*, Ankara: Kültür Bakanlığı Yayınları, c1979.

Evangelinos Misailidis. *Temaşa-i Dünya ve Cefakâr-u Cefakeş*, Prep. By Robert Anhagger & Vedat Günyol, İstanbul: Cem Yayınevi, 1986.

Evliya Çelebi. *Evliya Çelebi Seyahatnamesi*, 7 vols., Prep.by Seyit Ali Kahraman & Yücel Dağlı, İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1996.

Fatma Aliye & Ahmed Mithad. *Hayâl ve Hakikât*, İstanbul: Eylül Yayınları, 2002.

Fatma Aliye. *Levâiyih-i Hayât*, Transcribed and prepared by Tülay Gençtürk Demircioğlu, İstanbul: Boğaziçi Üniversitesi Yayınları, 2002. [c1897-1898]

_____. *Muhadarat*, İstanbul: Kasbar Matbaası, 1892.

_____. *Udî*, İstanbul: Selis Kitaplar, 2002, c1899.

Gürpınar, Hüseyin Rahmi. “Boşanmış Kadın (Mutallaka)” In *Şık*, H.R.Gürpınar, İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 1997. [c1898]

_____. *Metres*, İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 1998. [c1899]

_____. *Mürebbiye*, İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 1995. [c1899]

_____. *Şipsevdi*, İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 2003. [c1911]

Hasan Bedreddin Paşa. *Iskat-ı Cenin. Facia*, İstanbul: 13 No.lu Matbaa, 1874-1875.

Hâtibzâde Nusred Fuad. *İzdivac ve Şerait-i Sıhhiyesi*, İstanbul: 1913-1914.

Hekimbaşı Muhyiddin. *Valideyne İhtar yahud Kuş Palazı*, İstanbul: Alem Basımevi, 1900-1901.

Hüseyin Remzi. *Hıfz-u Sıhhât-ı Müteehhileyn*, İstanbul: Şirket-i Mürettibiye Matbaası 1901-1902.

_____. *Hayât ve Memât ve Aşk-ı İzdivâc*, İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1315.

_____. *Hıfz-u Sıhhât-i Şebâb*, İstanbul: 1891-1892.

_____. *Hocanın Hanım Kızlara Dürûs- ı Ahlâkı*, (İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1899-1890.

_____. *Mirat'ül Beyt; Hanımlara Yadigâr*, İstanbul: 1892-1893.

_____. *Sağdıç; Rehber-i İzdivac*, İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1899-1890.

_____. *Validelere Yadigar*, İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1902-1903.

- _____. *Vesile-i İntibâh*, İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1902-1903.
- _____. *Yadigar-ı Remzi: Aile Hıfzıssıhhası*, İstanbul: Mahmud Bey Matbaası, 1904-1905.
- İbn'ül Hakkı Mehmed Tahir. *İzdivacın Şerait-i Esasiyesi*, İstanbul: Nefaset Matbaası, 1913-1914.
- “Kadın-Tababet”, *Kadınlar Dünyası*, 134, 24 Rebiyyü'l-ahir 1331/2 April 1913.
- “Kastamonu Vilayeti ve Bolu Sancağı Frengi Mücadelesi Teşkilat-ı Sıhhiyesi Nizamnamesi”, *Sıhhiye Mecmuası* 2/3 (1329/1913).
- “Kastamonu’da Teşkil edilen Frengi Mücadelesine Dair Mütalaat”, *Sıhhiye Mecmuası* 3/8 (1331).
- Kenan Tevfik. *Kadınlık ve Analık*, İstanbul: Şems Matbaası, 1913-1914.
- Kırımlızâde Aziz İdris Bey, “İskat-ı Cenin”, *Mecmua-i Fünun* 41 (December 1866).
- La Baronne Durand De Fontmagne. *Kırım Harbi Sonrasında İstanbul*, İstanbul: Tercüman Yayınları, 1977.
- Mazhar Osman, *Sıhhat Almanakı*, İstanbul: Kader Matbaası, 1933.
- Mehmet Celâl. *Küçük Gelin*, İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayınları, 2004. [c1892]
- Mehmed Murad. *Turfanda mı Turfa mı?*, İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayınları, 2004. [c1891]
- Melikzâde Fuad. *Aile Vezaifi ve Terbiye*, İzmir: Ahenk Matbaası, 1893-1894.
- _____. *Vezâif-i Beytiyyeden Hanımlara Mahsus Aile Dersleri*, İstanbul: Şirket-i Mürettibiye Basımevi, 1909-1910.
- Mehmed Said. *Vezaif Al’İnas*, İstanbul: Matbaa-yı Amire, 1878-1879.
- Mehmed Tahir. *İzdivac ve Şerait-i Esasiyesi*, İstanbul: Nefaset Matbaası, 1913-1914.
- Milaslı İsmail Hakkı. *Frengi İlleti Hakkında Herkese Lazım Olan Malumat*, İstanbul: Asır Matbaası, 1901-1902.
- _____. *Frengi İlletin Tedavi-yi Umumiyesi*, İstanbul: Asır Matbaası, 1899-1890.
- “Mini Mini Çocukları Öpmemeli,” *Servet-i Fünûn*, 894, 29 Mayıs 1324/ , 147-148.
- Muallim Naci, *Vezaif-i Ebeveyn Yahud Lahika-yı Ta’lim ve Kıraat ve Mekteb-i Edeb*, İstanbul: Arakil Matbaası, 1304/1888-1889.
- Muhammed Sa’ad, “Kastamonu-Bolu Hastaneleri ve Seyyar Etıbbası Müfettiş-i Umumiliğinden Vürud Eden 1330 Senesi Raporudur”, *Sıhhiye Mecmuası* 2/3 (1331): 202-206.

- Muharrerât-i Nâdire*. 18 vols. İstanbul: İzzet Efendi Matbaası, 1873-1874.
- Mustafa Hüseyin. *Genç Valdelere ve Yeni Doğmuş Çocuklara Hizmet ve Takayyüdat*, İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Matbaası, 1893-1894.
- _____. *Çocukların Hıfz-u Sıhhati*, İstanbul: Kasbar Matbaası, 1893-1894.
- Nabizade Nazım. *Karabibik*, İstanbul: Bordo Siyah Yayınları, 2002. [c1891]
- _____. *Zehra*, Ankara: Ayraç Yayınları, 2000. [c1896]
- Nabizade. *Hanım Kızlara*, 2 vols, İstanbul, 1888-1889.
- Namık Kemal. “Aile”, *İbret*, 56, 18 Ramazan 1289/ 7 Teşrin-i Sâni 1288/7 November 1872.
- _____. “İskat-ı Cenin”, *Hadika*, 15, 28 Teşrin-i Sâni 1288/ 27 Ramazan 1289/ 28 November 1872.
- _____. “Lisan-ı Osmani’nin Edebiyatı Hakkında Bazı Mülâhazatı Şamildir”, *Tasvir-i Efkar*, 416, 28 August 1866.
- _____. “Mukaddime-i Celal” In *Celalettin Harzemşah*, İstanbul: Hareket Yayınları, 1972.
- _____. “Nüfus”, *İbret*, 9, 19 Rebi’ul ahir 1289/ 13 June 1288/ 14 June 1872.
- _____. *İntibah*, İstanbul: Özgür Yayınları, 2000. [c1874]
- Necmeddin Sami. *Sevda Çiçekleri Yahud İzdivacın Ehemmiyeti*, İstanbul: Kasbar Matbaası, 1896-1897.
- Nuri Bin Ömer. *Frengi Risalesi; Istılahat-ı Fenniyeden ‘Âri Frengi Hastalığı Hakkında Herkesin Anlayabileceği Derecede Malûmat-ı Müfideyi Camii’dir*, Dersaadet: 1907-1908.
- Ömer Nuri Bey. *Frengi Risalesi*, 2 vols., İstanbul: Mahmud Bey Matbaası, 1907-1908
- Nusred Fu’ad. *İzdivac ve Şera’it-i Sıhhiyesi*, İstanbul: Şems Matbaası, 1912-1913.
- Recaizade Mahmut Ekrem. *Araba Sevdası*, Ankara: Akçağ Kitabevi, 1999. [c1896]
- Salahaddin Asım. *Türk Kadınlığının Tereddidi Yahud Karışmak*, İstanbul: Arel, 1989. [c1910].
- Sami Paşazade Sezai. *Sergüzeşt*, İstanbul: Altın Kitaplar 2000. [c1889]
- “Şair Süleyman Nesib Bey’in Konferans Metni: Osmanlı Kadınlığı Üzerine”, *Mehasin*, 6 Şubat 1324/ 1909, 382-387.
- Şehsuvaroğlu, Bedi N. “Memleketimizde Frengi Tarihçesi”, *Yeni Asya*, 2 March 1971.

Şekib Akif Nazım. *İslam Hanımlarına Mahsus Fenni ve Ahlaki Mektublar*, İstanbul: Artin Asodoryan Şirket-i Mürettibiye Matbaası, 1900-1901.

Şemseddin Sâmî. *Kadınlar* İstanbul: 1880-1881.

_____. *Taaşuk-ı Talat ve Fitnat*, İstanbul: Oğlak Yayınevi, 2001. [c1872]

Şerefüddin Arif Bey. *Ev Hekimi* , İstanbul: 1899-1890.

“Tuhfe-i Müteehhileyn; Beşinci Bab: Rical ile Nisanın ‘Aza-yi Tenasiliyesi”, *Hadika*, 14, 1 Cemaziyyü’l -evvel 1287 / 17 Temmuz 1286.

“Tuhfe-i Müteehhileyn; Altıncı Bab: Keyfiyet-i Dem-i Hayz”, *Hadika*, 25, 8 Cemaziyyü’l -evvel 1287/ 24 Temmuz 1286.

[untitled article on virginity and sexuality] . *Hadika*, 15 Rebi’ül Ahir 1287 /3 Temmuz 1286.

Uşaklıgil, Halit Ziya . *Aşk-ı Memnu*, İstanbul: İnkılap, 1999. [c1900]

_____. *Kırık Hayatlar*, İstanbul: İnkılap, 1989. [c1902]

_____. *Mai ve Siyah*, İstanbul : Özgür Yayınları, 2003. [c1897]

II. Studies

Abu-Manneh, Butrus. *Studies on Islam and the Ottoman Empire in the 19th Century (1826-1876)*, İstanbul: Isis, c2001.

Ahmad, Feroz. *The Young Turks: The Committee of Union and Progress in Turkish Politics, 1908-1914*, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1969.

Ahmet Akgündüz, *Osmanlı Kanunnâmeleri ve Hukukî Tahlilleri*, 5 vols., İstanbul: Fey Vakfı, 1990.

Akgündüz, Ahmet. *Mukayeseli İslam ve Osmanlı Hukuku Külliyyâtı*, Diyarbakır: Dicle Üniversitesi Hukuk Fakültesi Yayınları, 1986.

Akşin, Sina. ed., *Türkiye Tarihi 3: Osmanlı Devleti, 1600-1908*, İstanbul: Cem Yayınları, 2000.

Akyavaş, Ali Ragıp. *Asitâne; Evvel Zaman İçinde İstanbul*, 2 vols. , İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı Yayınları, 2000.

Arat, Zehra F. “Introduction”, In *Deconstructing Images of “The Turkish Woman”*, ed. Z.F.Arat, New York: St. Martin’s Press, 1998.

Ariès, Philip. *Centuries of Childhood: A Social History of Family Life*, Trans. By Robert Baldick, New York: Vintage Books, 1962.

- Arnot, Margaret L. & Osborne, Cornelia. *Gender and Crime in Modern Europe* (Padstow, Cornwall: UCLA Press, 1999).
- Arrizabalaga, John. Henderson, John. & Roger French. *The Great Pox: The French Disease in Renaissance Europe*, New Haven: Yale University Press, c1997.
- Ata, Adnan. “Milli Kütüphane’de Bulunan Eski (Arap) Harfli Türke Basılı Tıp Kitapları”, In *IV. Tıp Tarihi Kongresi: Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler, İstanbul, 18-20 Eylül 1996*, Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 2003, 269-274.
- Aydın, Mehmet Akif. *İslam ve Osmanlı Hukuku Araştırmaları*, İstanbul: İz, 1996.
- Barkan, Ömer L. “Şer’i Miras Hukuku ve Evlatlık Vakıflar”, In *Türkiye’de Toprak Meselesi*, İstanbul: Gözlem Yayınları, 1980.
- Barkan, Ömer L. “Tarihi Demografi Araştırmaları ve Osmanlı Tarihi”, *Türkiyat Mecmuası*, 10 (1979), pp.1-26.
- Barkan, Ömer L. “Türk Toprak Hukuku Tarihinde Tanzimat ve 1274 (1858) Tarihli Arazi Kanunnamesi”, In *Türkiye’de Toprak Meselesi*, İstanbul: Gözlem Yayınları, 1980.
- Barlas, Uğur. “Safranbolu Frengi Hastanesi ve Cüzamlılar Barınağı Hakkında Bir Araştırma Denemesi,” *Tıp Tarihi Araştırmaları* 5 (1993): 141-151.
- Baron, B. et. Al. *Women in the Middle Eastern History; Shifting Boundaries in Sex and Gender*, New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press, 1991.
- Barrett, Michél & McIntosh, Mary. *The Anti-Social Family*, London: NLB, 1982.
- Basa, S. “Sifiliz’in Tarihesi”, *Haseki Tıp Bülteni* 15 (1977).
- Başkan, Emel B. and Tunalı, Şükran. “The History of Syphilis”, *Türkiye Klinik Tıp Etiği Hukuku Tarihi*, 10 (2002).
- Bayat, Ali Haydar. *Osmanlı Devleti’nde Hekimbaşılık Kurumu ve Hekimbaşılar* Ankara: AYK, Atatürk Kültür Merkezi Başkanlığı, 1999.
- Beck, Lois & Keddie, Nikki. ed., *Women in the Muslim World*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1978.
- Benedict, Peter. “Hukuk Reformu Açısından Başlık Parası ve Mehr”, In *Türk Hukuku ve Toplumunu Üzerine İncelemeler*, ed. A.Güriz, P. Benedict, Ankara: Türkiye Kalkınma Vakfı, 1974.
- Berger, Morroe. *Real and Imagined Worlds: The Novel and Social Science*, Cambridge, Massachusetts: Harvard University Press, 1977.
- Berkes, Niyazi. *The Development of Secularism in Turkey*, New York: Hurst & Co., 1998.

- Bilgegil, M. Kaya. *Harabat Karşısında Namık Kemal*, İstanbul: İrfan Yayınevi, 1972.
- Bloch, Mark. “The Long-Term and the Short –Term: The Economic and Political Significance of the Morality of Kinship In *The Character of Kinship*, ed. J.Goody , London: Cambridge University Press, 1973.
- Bloch, Ruth H. “American Feminine Ideals in Transition: The Rise of the Moral Mother, 1785-1815”, *Feminist Studies* 4/2, (June 1978).
- Börekçi, Mehmet. “Osmanlı Basınından Yakın Devir Tıp Tarihimizi İlgilendiren Bir Yazı,” *Yeni Tıp Tarihi Araştırmaları* 4 (1998).
- Brandt, Allan M. *No Magic Bullet: A Social History of Venereal Disease in the United States Since 1880*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1985.
- Brandt, Allan M. “Sexually Transmitted Diseases”, In *Companion Encyclopedia of the History of Medicine*, eds. W.F. Bynum & Roy Porter , vol.2. London: Routledge, 1993.
- Budak, Ali. *Batılılaşma Sürecinde Çok Yönlü Bir Osmanlı Aydını; Münif Paşa*, İstanbul: Kitabevi, 2004.
- Bursalı Mehmet Tahir, *Osmanlı Müellifleri*, 3 vols. Ankara: Bizim Büro Basımevi, 2000.
- Cihan, Ahmet. *Reform Çağında Osmanlı İlimiye Sınıfı*, İstanbul: Birey, 2004.
- Cin, Halil. *İslam ve Osmanlı Hukukunda Evlenme*, Ankara: Ankara Üniversitesi Yayınları, 1974.
- Clark, Alice. *Working Life of Women in the Seventeenth Century*, New York: Routledge, 1968.
- Crissey, John T. & Parish, Charles L. *The Dermatology and Syphiology of the Nineteenth Century*, New York: Praeger, 1981.
- Çalık, Ramazan & Tepekaya, Muzaffer. “Birinci Dünya Savaşı Esnasında Anadolu’daki Salgın Hastalıklar ve Ermeniler”, *Selçuk Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 16 (2006).
- Çapanoğlu, Münir Süleyman. *Basın Tarihine İlişkin Hatıralar*, İstanbul: Hür Türkiye Dergisi, 1962.
- Çeker, Orhan. “Çocuk Düşürme,” In *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*, vol. 8, 864-865. İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi Genel Müdürlüğü, 1988-.
- Çelik, Nur Betül. *Kemalist Hegemony from Its Constitution to Its Dissolution*, Unpublished PhD. Dissertation, University of Essex, 1996.

- Çoruk, Ali Şükrü. *Eski Zamanlarda İstanbul Hayatı*, Second Edition, İstanbul: Kitabevi, 2001.
- Davidoff, L. & Doolittle, M. & Fink, J. & Holden, K. *The Family Story: Blood, Contract, and Intimacy, 1830-1960*, London, New York: Longman, 1999.
- Davis, Natalie Z. "Ghosts, Kin and Progeny: Some Features of Family Life in Early Modern France", *Daedalus*, 106 (1977).
- Davison, Roderic H. *Essays in Ottoman and Turkish History, 1774-1923; The Impact of the West*, Austin: Texas University Press, 1990.
- Degler, Carl, N. *At Odds: Women and Family in America From the Revolution to the Present*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1980.
- Demirci, Tuba. "Family, State and the Blurring of the Public and Private; Ottoman State and the Emergence of "Marriage Proper" in the Second Half of the Nineteenth Century," *Conference Proceedings of Social Behaviour and Family Strategies in the Balkans XVI-XX. Centuries, Regional Symposium* (Bucharest: New Europe College, forthcoming).
- Demirci, Tuba & Somel, Selçuk Akşin. "Women's Bodies, Demography and Public Health: Abortion Policy and Perspectives in the Ottoman Empire of the Nineteenth Century," *Journal of the History of Sexuality*, (forthcoming).
- Demirci, Tuba. *The Construction of Motherhood and Shifts of the "Woman Question" at the End of Empire: The Turkish Case (1919-1939)*, Unpublished MA Dissertation, University of Essex, 2000.
- Diamond, Jared. *Guns, Germs and Steel*, New York: W.W.Norton, 1997.
- Diday, Paul. *A Treatise on Syphilis in New Born Children and Infants at the Breast*, Trans. By G.Whitey, New York: 1859.
- Doğan, İsmail. "Tanzimat Sonrası Sosyo-Kültürel Değişmeler ve Türk Ailesi", In *Sosyo-Kültürel Değişme Sürecinde Türk Ailesi*, Vol.I, Ankara: T.C. Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu, 1992.176-198.
- Donzelot, Jacques. *The Policing of Families*, Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press, 1979.
- Duben, Alain & Behar, Cem. *İstanbul Haneleri; Evlilik, Aile ve Doğurganlık, 1885-1940*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1996.
- Duben, Alain & Behar, Cem. *Istanbul Households. Marriage, Family and Fertility 1880-1940*, Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press 1991.
- Duben, Alain. *Kent, Aile, Tarih*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002.
- Duben, Alain. "The significance of Family and Kinship in Urban Turkey", In *Sex Roles, Family, and Community in Turkey* ed. Ç.Kağıtçıbaşı, 73-99. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University Turkish Studies, c1982.

- Duben, Alain. "Turkish Families and Households in Historical Perspective", *Journal of Family History* 10 (1985):75-97.
- Edgerton, Robert B. *Death or Glory: The Legacy of the Crimean War*, Boulder, Colorado: Westview Press, 1999.
- Engelstein, Laura. "Morality and the Wooden Spoon: Russian Doctors View Syphilis, Social Class and Sexual Behaviour, 1890-1905", *Representations*, No.14, *The Making of the Modern Body: Sexuality and Society in the Nineteenth Century*, Spring 1986.
- Erdem, Yusuf Hakan. *Slavery in the Ottoman Empire and Its Demise, 1808-1909*, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1996.
- Erder, Leyla & Faroqhi, Suraiya. "Population Rise and Fall in Anatolia, 1550-1620", *Middle East Studies* 15 (1979): 322-345.
- Eren, İsmail. "Yugoslavya'daki Türk Sağlık Kuruluşları", In *I.Türk Tıp Tarihi Kongresi. Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler. İstanbul, 17-19 Şubat 1988*, Ankara: Atatürk Kültür, Dil ve Tarih Yüksek Kurumu Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1992.
- Eren, İsmail. "Bulgaristan ve Romanya'daki Türk Sağlık Kuruluşları" In *I.Türk Tıp Tarihi Kongresi. Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler. İstanbul, 17-19 Şubat 1988*, Ankara: Atatürk Kültür, Dil ve Tarih Yüksek Kurumu Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1992.
- Ergin, Osman Nuri . *Türk Maarif Tarihi*. 2 vols., Second Edition. İstanbul: Eser Kültür, 1977.
- Ergin, Osman Nuri *Mecelle-i Ümûr-ı Belediye* , 9 Vols., İstanbul: İstanbul Büyükşehir Belediyesi Kültür İşleri Daire Başkanlığı, 1995.
- Evin, Ahmet Ö. *Origins and Development of the Turkish Novel*, Minneapolis: Bibliotheca Islamica, 1983.
- Faroqhi, Suraiya "Rural Society in Anatolia and the Balkans During the Sixteenth Century, I.", *Turcica*,: *Revue d'études Turques* 9 (1977):162-195.
- Faroqhi, Suraiya. "Rural Society in Anatolia and the Balkans During the Sixteenth Century, II.", *Turcica*,: *Revue d'études Turques* 11 (1979): 103-153.
- Faroqhi, Suraiya. *Stories of Ottoman Men and Women; Establishing Status, Establishing Control* , İstanbul: Eren, 2002.
- Fildes, Valerie. *Breasts, Bottles and Babies; A History of Infant Feeding*, Edinburg: Edinburg University Press, 1986.
- Fildes, Valerie. *Wet-Nursing: A History from Antiquity to the Present*, Oxford: Basic Blackwell, 1988.

- Findıkoğlu, Ziyaeddin F. “Aile ve Kadın Telakkisinde Tebeddül”, In *Tanzimatta İctimai Hayat* , idem. Z.E.Findıkoğlu, İstanbul: Maarif Matbaası, 1940.
- Findley, Carter N. *Bureaucratic Reform in the Ottoman Empire*, Princeton, New Jersey: Princeton University Press, c1980.
- Findley, Carter V. *Kalemiyyeden Mülkiyeye: Osmanlı Memurlarının Toplumsal Tarihi*, İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı. c1996.
- Finn, Robert E. *The Early Turkish Novel (1872-1900)*, İstanbul: Isis Press, 1984.
- Flandrin, Jean L. *Families in Former Times*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1979.
- Fortes, Meyer. *Kinship and Social Order*, London: Aldine, 1969.
- Foucault, Michel. “Governmentality”, In *The Foucault Effect: Studies in Governmentality* ed. Graham Burchell , Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1991.
- Foucault, Michel. *Discipline and Punish; The Birth of Prison*, New York: Pantheon Books, 1977.
- Foucault, Michel. *Power/Knowledge*, New York: Pantheon Books, 1980.
- Foucault, Michel. *The Birth of the Clinic: An Archeology of Medical Perception*, Trans. from French by A.M. Sheridan, First American Edition, New York: Pantheon Books, 1973.
- Foucault, Michel. *The History of Sexuality*, 2 Vols, New York: Vintage Books, 1980.
- Gerber, Haim. “Social and Economic Position of Women in an Ottoman City, Bursa, 1600-1700”, *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 12 (1980).
- Goody, Jack. *The Development of Family and Marriage in Europe*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- Gürsoy, Akile. “Abortion in Turkey: A Matter of State, Family or Individual Decision,” *Social Science and Medicine* 42 / 4 (1996).
- Hajnal, J. “European Marriage Patterns in Perspective” In *Population in History*, ed. D.V.Glass & D.E.C. Eversley, London: Edward Arnold, 1965.
- Hajnal, J. “Two Kinds of Pre-Industrial Household Formation System”, *Population and Development Review*, 8 (1982):449-494.
- Hammel, E.A. , Laslett, P. “Comparing Household Structure Over Time and Between Cultures: A Suggested Scheme for Representation and Classification with a Provision for Handling by Computer”, *Comparative Studies in Society and History*, 16 (1974):73-103.

- Harshin, Jill. "Syphilis, Wives, and Physicians: Medical Ethics and the Family in Late Nineteenth Century France", *French Historical Studies*, 16/1(Spring 1989).
- Hatem, Mervat F. "19.Yüzyıl Mısır'ında Ebelik Mesleği ve Kadın Bedeninin Denetlenmesi", In *Modernleşmenin Eşiğinde Osmanlı Kadınları*, ed. Madeline C. Zilfi, Trans. By Necmiye Alpay, İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları, 2000.
- Hedenborg, Susanna. "To Breastfeed Another Woman's Child: Wet-Nursing in Stockholm, 1777-1937, *Continuity and Change*, 16/ 3(2001).
- Hot, İnci. "Ülkemizde Frengi Hastalığı İle Mücadele" , *Türkiye Klinik tıp Etiği Hukuku Tarihi* 12 (2006).
- Charles Issawi ed., *The Economic History of Turkey, 1800-1914*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980).
- İhsanoğlu, Ekmeleddin. "Suriye'de Son Dönem Osmanlı Sağlık Müesseseleri İle İlgili Bazı Notlar", In *I.Türk Tıp Tarihi Kongresi. Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler. İstanbul, 17-19 Şubat 1988*, Ankara: Atatürk Kültür, Dil ve Tarih Yüksek Kurumu Türk Tarih Kurumu Yayınları, 1992.
- İnal, İbnü'l Emin Mahmut Kemal. *Son Asır Türk Şairleri*, 11 vols. İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi, 1969-1971.
- İnalcık, Halil. "The Ottoman Economic Mind and Aspects of the Ottoman Economy". In *Studies in the Economic History of the Middle East* , ed. M.A.Cook, London, New York: Oxford University Press, 1970.
- Jennings, R. "Urban Population in Anatolia in the Sixteenth Century: a Study of Kayseri, Karaman, Amasya, Trabzon and Erzurum", *International Journal of Middle East Studies* 7 (1976):21-57.
- Jennings, R. "Women in Early Seventeenth Century Ottoman Judicial Records: the Sharia Court of Anatolian Kayseri", *Journal of Economic and Social History of the Orient* 18 (1975): 53-114.
- Kabacalı, Alpay. *Başlangıcından Günümüze Türkiye'de Matbaa, Basın ve Yayın*, İstanbul: Literatür Yayınları, 2000.
- Kabacalı, Alpay. *İstanbul: From the Past to the Present*, İstanbul: Creative Publishing Ltd. , 2003.
- Kalkan, İbrahim Halil. *Medicine and Politics in the Late Ottoman Empire (1876-1909)*, Unpublished Masters Thesis, Boğaziçi University, İstanbul, 2004
- Karakışla, Yavuz Selim. "Arşivden Bir Belge. Kürtaj Mütahassısı Alman Doktor Madam Mari Zibold", *Toplumsal Tarih* 82 (October 2000): 39-44.

- Karpat, Kemal H. "The Land Regime, Social Structure, and Modernisation in the Ottoman Empire", In *Beginnings of Modernization in the Middle East*, ed. William R. Polk & Richard L. Chambers, Chicago: University of Chicago Press 1968.
- Karpat, Kemal H. *Osmanlı Nüfusu (1839-1914) Demografik ve Sosyal Özellikleri*, Trans. By Bahar Tırnakçı, İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 2003.
- Karpat, Kemal H. *Ottoman Population, 1830-1914: Demographic and Social Characteristics*, Madison, Wisconsin: University of Wisconsin Press, 1985.
- Keane, John ed., *Civil Society and the State: New European Perspectives*, London: Verso, 1988.
- Keddie, Nikki R. & Baron, Beth. *Women in the Middle Eastern History; Shifting Boundaries in Sex and Gender*, New Haven: Yale University Press, c1991.
- Kent, Susan Kingsley. *Sex and Suffrage in Britain, 1860-1914*, Princeton, London: Princeton University Press, 1987.
- Kertzer, David I. "Syphilis, Foundlings, and Wetnurses in Nineteenth Century Italy", *Journal of Social History* 32/ 3 (Spring 1999).
- Khatib-Chahidi, Jane. "Milk Kinship in Shi'ite Islamic Iran," In Vanessa Maher, ed., *The Anthropology of Breastfeeding : Natural Law or Social Construct*, Oxford, Washington D.C.: Berg Publishers, c1995, 109-132.
- Koçak, Muhsin. "Gurre," In *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*, vol. 14, 211-212. İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi Genel Müdürlüğü, 1988-.
- Kömürciyan, Eremya Çelebi. *İstanbul Tarihi: XVIII. Asırda İstanbul*, İstanbul: Eren Yayıncılık, 1988. [c1952].
- Köse, Osman. "XVIII. Yüzyıl Sonları Osmanlı Rus ve Avusturya Savaşları Esnasında Osmanlı Devleti'nde Bir Uygulama: İstanbul'da İçki ve Fuhuş Yasağı", *Turkish Studies*, 2/1 (Winter 2007).
- Kundstadler, P. "Demography, Ecology, Social Structure and Settlement Patterns" In *The Structure of Human Populations*, ed. G. A. Harrison, A. J. Boyce, Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1972.
- Kundstadler, P. "Characteristics of the Western Family Considered Over Time" in Peter Lasslet (ed), *Family and Illicit Love in Earlier Generations*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977.
- Kurnaz, Şefika. *II. Meşrutiyet Döneminde Türk Kadını*, İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı, 1996.
- Kurt, Abdurrahman. *Bursa Sicillerine Göre Osmanlı Ailesi*, Bursa: Kültür Bakanlığı Yayınları, 1998.

- Laslett, Peter ed. *Household and Family in Past Time*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1972.
- Laslett, Peter. *The World We Have Lost*, London, New York, Routledge, 1965.
- Lehning, James R. "Family Life and Wet-Nursing in a French Village", *Journal of Interdisciplinary History*, Vol.12, No.4, Spring 1982.
- Levine, Philippa. *Prostitution, Race and Politics: Policing Venereal Disease in the British Empire*, New York: Routledge, 2003.
- Lewis, Bernard. *The Emergence of Modern Turkey*, Third Edition, New York: Oxford University Press, 2002.
- Lewis, Raphaella. *Everyday Life in Otoman Turkey*, New York: Dorset Press, 1988.
- Livingstone, Frank B. "On the Origin of Syphilis: An Alternative Hypothesis", *Current Anthropology*, 32/5, (December 1991).
- Lobdell, John E. & Owsley, Douglas. "The Origin of Syphilis", *The Journal of Sex Research*, 10/1,(February 1974).
- Mantran, Robert. *17. yüzyılın İkinci Yarısında İstanbul*, 2 vol. , Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1990.
- Mantran, Robert. "The Transformation of Trade in the Ottoman Empire in the Eighteenth Century", In *Studies in Eighteenth Century Islamic History*, ed. T.Naff and R.Owen, Carbondale: Southern Illinois University Press, 1977.
- Mardin, Şerif. *Jön Türklerin Siyasi Fikirleri*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1996.
- Mardin, Şerif. *The Genesis of Young Ottoman Thought: A Study in the Modernization of Turkish Political Ideas*, Syracuse: Syracuse University Press, 2000.
- Mardin, Şerif. "The Mind of the Turkish Reformer", *Western Humanities Review*, 15 (1960): 413-436.
- Marcus, Julie. *A World of Difference. Islam and Gender Hierarchy in Turkey*, London: Zed Boks, 1992. Martal, Abdullah. "İllet-i Efenciyye (İzmir'de Frengiyle Mücadele)", *Tepekule Tarih* 1 (2000): 88-91.
- Mc Allister, Marie E. "Stories of the Origin of Syphilis in the Eighteenth Century England; Science, Myth and Prejudice", *Eighteenth Century Life* 24 (Winter 2000).
- Mc Clintock, A. & Mufti, A. & Shohat, E. ed. *Dangerous Liaisons: Gender, Nation and Postcolonial Perspectives*, Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press, 1997.

- McCarty, Justin. "Age, Family and Migration in Nineteenth Century Black Sea Provinces of The Ottoman Empire", *International Journal of Middle East Studies*, 10 (1979): 309-323.
- Melucci, A. "The Social Movements and the Democratization of Everyday Life", In *Civil Society and the State: New European Perspectives* ed. John Keane, London, New York : Verso, 1988.
- Meriwether, Margaret L. *The Kin Who Count: Family and Society in Ottoman Aleppo 1770-1840*, Austin, Texas: University of Texas Press, 1999.
- Molho, Rena. "Tanzimat Öncesi ve Sonrasında İstanbul Yahudileri." In Pinelopi Stathis ed. *19.Yüzyıl İstanbul'unda Gayrimüslimler*, Translated by Foti and Stefo Benlisoy, İstanbul: Tarih Vakfı Yurt Yayınları, 1999.
- Mossucci, Ornella. *The Science of Woman: Gynecology and Gender in England, 1800-1929*, Cambridge: New York: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
- Musallam, Basim F. *Sex and Society in Islam. Birth Control Before the Nineteenth Century*, Cambridgeshire, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
- Mutaf, Abdülmecit. "Osmanlı'da Zina ve Fuhuş Olaylarına Karşı Toplumsal Bir Tepki: Kapiya Katran Sürmek ve Boynuz Asmak", In *Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyet'e Balıkesir*, İstanbul: 2007.
- Nadeanu, Carolyn A. "Blood Mother / Milk Mother: Breastfeeding, the Family and the State in Antonio De Guevara's Relox De Principes (Dial of Princes)", *Hispanic Review* 69/2 (Spring 2001).
- Nicholson, Linda J. *Gender and History: The Limits of Social Theory in the Age of the Family*, New York: Columbia University Press, 1986.
- Öğütman, R. "Türkiye'de Zührevi Hastalıklarla Savaş", In *Türkiye'de Atatürk Döneminde Bulaşıcı Hastalıklarla Savaş Toplantısı*, İstanbul: İ.Ü. Cerrahpaşa Tıp Fakültesi Yayınları, [without date].
- Omran, Abdel Rahim. *Family Planning in the Legacy of Islam*, London, New York: Routledge, c1994.
- Onur, Bekir. *Türkiye'de Çocukluğun Tarihi*, Ankara: İmge Kitabevi, 2005.
- Oriel, J.D. *The Scars of Venus: A History of Venereology*, London: Springer- Verlag, 1994.
- Ortaylı, İlber. *İmparatorluğun En Uzun Yüzyılı*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2001.
- Ortaylı, İlber. *Osmanlı Toplumunda Aile*, İstanbul: Pan Yayıncılık, 2001.
- Ortaylı, İlber. "Anadolu'da XVI. Yüzyılda Evlilik İlişkileri Üzerine Bazı Gözlemler", *Osmanlı Araştırmaları*, 1 (1980).

- Ortaylı, İlber. "Family in Ottoman Society" . In *Family in Ottoman Society: Sociological and Legal Studies*, ed. Türköz Erder, Ankara: Turkish Social Science Association, 1985.
- Ortaylı, İlber. "Ottoman Family Law and the State in the Nineteenth Century", *A.Ü. OTAM Dergisi* (1990).
- Ortaylı, İlber. *Tanzimattan Cumhuriyete Yerel Yönetim Geleneği*, İstanbul: Hil Yayın, 1985.
- Osmanlı Kanunnâmeleri ve Hukukî Tahlilleri*. 3 vols., İstanbul: Fey Vakfı, 1990.
- Özbek, Nadir. *Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Sosyal Devlet; Siyaset, İktidar ve Mesruiyet 1876-1914*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları 2002.
- Özcan, Tahsin. *Fetvalar Işığında Osmanlı Esnafı*, İstanbul: Kitabevi, 2003.
- Öztürk, Mustafa. "Osmanlı Döneminde İskat-i Ceninin Yeri ve Hükümü," *Fırat Üniversitesi Dergisi (Sosyal Bilimler)* I/1 (1987).
- Öztürk, S. "Tereke Defterlerine Göre XVII. Asırda İstanbul'da Aile Nüfusu, Servet Yapısı ve Dağılımı", *İstanbul Araştırmaları* 3 (1997).
- Panzac, Daniel. *Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda Veba (1700-1850)*, İstanbul: Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 1997.
- Parla, Jale. *Babalar ve Oğullar: Tanzimat Romanının Epistemolojik Temelleri*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2002.
- Parlatır, İsmail. *Tanzimat Edebiyatında Kölelik*, Ankara: TTK, 1987.
- Peirce, Leslie. "She is Trouble and I will Divorce Her: Orality, Honor and Representation in the Ottoman Court of Aintab", In *Women in the Medieval Islamic World: Power, Patronage, and Piety*, ed. G.R.G Hambly, New York: St. Martin's Press, 1999.
- Peirce, Leslie. *The Imperial Harem: Women and Sovereignty in the Ottoman Empire*, New York, Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1993.
- Quataert, Donald. "Age of Reforms," In *An Economic and Social History of the Ottoman Empire, 1300-1914* , H.İnalcık &D.Quataert eds., Cambridge, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1994.
- Quérel, Claude *History of Syphilis*, Trans.by Judith Braddock & Brian Pike, Cambridge:Polity Press, 1990.
- Royle, Trevor. *Crimea: The Great Crimean War, 1854-1856*, London: Abacus, 2000.
- Sağlam, Abdullah. *Kırım ve Kafkas Göçleri, 1856-1876*, Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1997.
- Sağlam, Nuri *Basiretçi Ali Efendi: İstanbul Mektupları*, İstanbul: Kitabevi, 2001.

- Salmon, Marylyn. "The Cultural Significance of Breastfeeding and Infant Care in Early Modern England and America", *Journal of Social History*, 28/2 (Winter 1994).
- Saraçgil, Ayşe. *Bukalemun Erkek; Osmanlı İmparatorluğu'nda ve Türkiye Cumhuriyeti'nde Ataerkil Yapılar ve Modern Edebiyat*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 2005.
- Sarı, Nil. "Osmanlı Sağlık Hayatında Kadının Yeri," *Yeni Tıp Tarihi Araştırmaları. The New History of Medicine Studies* , 3 vols., Ankara : TTK Yayınları, 1996-1997.
- Sarı, Nil. "Osmanlı Sağlık Hayatında Kadının Yerine Kısa Bir Bakış," In *Sağlık Alanında Türk Kadını* , ed. Nuran Yıldırım, İstanbul: Novartis, 1998.
- Saygılıgil, Feryal. "Osmanlı'da Sağlık Alanında Tedavi Gören ve Tedavi Eden Olarak Kadınlar" in *Yerli Bir Feminizme Doğru*, ed. Aynur İlyasoğlu & Necla Akgökçe, İstanbul: Sel Yayıncılık, 2001.
- Saz, Leyla. *Haremin İçyüzü*, İstanbul: Milliyet Yayınları, 1974.
- Scognamillo, Giovanni. *Beyoğlu'nda Fuhuş*, İstanbul: Altın Kitaplar Yayınevi, 1994.
- Scott, Joan W. & Tilly, L.A. "Women's Work and Family in Nineteenth Century Europe", *Comparative Studies in Society and History* 17 (1975).
- Sevengil, Refik Ahmet. , *İstanbul Nasıl Eğleniyordu; 1453'ten 1927'ye*, İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1990.
- Sevük, İsmail Hakkı. *Tanzimat Devri Edebiyatı*, İstanbul: İnkılâp Kitabevi, 1951.
- Sezer, Şennur & Özyalçiner, Adnan. *Bir Zamanlar İstanbul Hayatı; Eski İstanbul Yaşayışı ve Folkloru*, İstanbul: İnkılâp Kitabevi, 2005.
- Shaw, Ezel Kural & Shaw, Stanford J. *History of the Ottoman Empire and Modern Turkey: Volume II Reform, Revolution and Republic-the Rise of Modern Turkey, 1808-1975*, New York :Cambridge University Press, 2002.
- Shaw, Stanford J. "The Origins of Representative Government in the Ottoman Empire: An Introduction to the Provincial Councils, 1839-1876", In idem. *Studies in Ottoman and Turkish History. A Life with the Ottomans* İstanbul: The Isis Press, 2000.
- Siena, Kevin P. "Pollution, Promiscuity and the Pox: English Venereaology and the Early Modern Medical Discourse on Social and Sexual Danger", *Journal of the History of Sexuality* 8/4 (April 1998).
- Silver, Catherine B. ed & trans., *Frederic Le Play on Family, Work and Social Change*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1982.
- Simonton, Deborah. *A History of European Women's Work, 1700 to Present*, London: Routledge, 1998.

- Somel, Selçuk Akşin. "Osmanlı Son Doneminde İskat-i Cenin Meselesi", *Kebikec*, 13, 2002, pp.65-88.
- Sonbol, Amira El-Azhary ed., *Women, The Family and Divorce Laws in Islamic History*, New York: Syracuse University Press, 1996.
- Stock-Morton, Phyllis. "Control and Limitation of Midwives in Modern France: The Example of Marseille", *Journal of Women's History* 8/1 (1996).
- Stone, Lawrence. "Family History in the 1980's", *Journal of Interdisciplinary History* 12 (1981).
- Stone, Lawrence. *Family, Sex and Marriage in England, 1500-1800*, New York: Harper & Row, 1979.
- Süreyya, Mehmed . *Sicill-i Osmanî*, 6 vols, İstanbul: Kültür Bakanlığı ve Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 1996.
- Taner, Tahir. "Tanzimat Devrinde Ceza Hukuku" In *Tanzimat I*, 2nd edition İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Bakanlığı, 1999.
- Tanpınar, Ahmed Hamdi. *Ondokuzuncu Asır Türk Edebiyatı Tarihi*, İstanbul: Çağlayan Kitabevi: 1997.
- Tanpınar, Ahmet Hamdi. *Edebiyat Üzerine Makaleler*, İstanbul: Milli Eğitim Basımevi, 1969.
- Tanrıverdi, H. Alper. & Öney, H. Taylan. "Tıp Alanında Türk Alman İlişkileri", *Artemis* 4/3 (Spring 2003).
- Terzioğlu, Arslan. "Bîmârîstan" In *TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi*, vol.2 , 163-178. İstanbul, Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi Genel Müdürlüğü 1992.
- Terzioğlu, Arslan. "Ein kurzer Blick auf die österreichisch-türkischen medizinischen Beziehungen vom Anbeginn bis Heute," In *Beiträge zur Geschichte der türkisch-islamischen Medizin, Wissenschaft und Technik II*, ed. A. Terzioğlu, İstanbul: Isis, 1996.
- Thorne, Barrie. "Feminist Rethinking of the Family: An Overview". In *Rethinking the Family* ed. B. Thorne and M. Yalom, Boston: Northeastern University Press, 1982.
- Tilly, Louise & Scott, Joan W. *Women, Work and Family*, New York: Holt, Rinehart and Wilson, 1978.
- Timur, Taner. *Osmanlı Kimliği*, İstanbul: Hil, 1987.
- Timur, Taner. *Osmanlı-Türk Romanında Tarih, Toplum ve Kimlik*, İstanbul: Afa Yayınları, 1991.

- Tok, Özen. “Kadı Sicilleri Işığında Osmanlı Şehrindeki Mahalleden İhraç Kararlarında Mahalle Ahalisinin Rolü(XVII. Ve XVII. Yüzyıllarda Kayseri Örneğı”, *Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi* 18/1 (2005).
- Toledano, Ehud. R. *Slavery and Its Abolition in the Ottoman Middle East*, Seattle, London: University of Washington Press, 1998.
- Toledano, Ehud. R. “Attitude to Slavery During the Tanzimat”, In *150. Yılında Tanzimat*, ed. Hakkı Dursun, Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1998.
- Toprak, Zafer. “Fuhuş”, *Dünden Bugüne İstanbul Ansiklopedisi*, vol.3, 342-345. Ankara, İstanbul: Kültür Bakanlığı, Tarih Vakfı, 1994, 342-345.
- Tör, Ahmed Nedim S. *Nevhiz’in Günlüğü*, İstanbul: Yapı Kredi Yayınları, 1998.
- Tucker, Judith E. “Marriage and Family in Nablus, 1720-1856: Towards a History of Arab Marriage”, *Journal of Family History* 13 /2 (1988):165-179.
- Tucker, Judith. E. “Decline of Family Economy in Mid-Nineteenth Century Egypt”, *Arab Studies Quarterly* 1 (1999): 245-271.
- Turan, Şerafettin. “Tanzimat Devrinde Evlenme”, *İş ve Düşünce Dergisi* 182 (1956).
- Turfan, M. Naim. *Rise of the Young Turks: Politics, the Military and Ottoman Collapse*, London: I.B.Tauris, 1999.
- Türker, Orhan. *Galata’dan Karaköy’e Bir Liman Hikayesi*, İstanbul: Sel, c2000.
- Tuş, Muhiddin & Gürbüz, Adnan & Demirel, Ömer. “Osmanlı Ailesi ile İlgili Şer’iyye Sicillerinden Seçilen Örnek Belgeler” In *Sosyo Kültürel Değişme Sürecinde Türk Ailesi*, Vol. 3, Ankara:T.C.Başbakanlık Aile Araştırma Kurumu Yayınları, 1992.
- Unat, Ekrem Kadri. “Müderres Dr. Celaleddin Muhtar Özden,” In *III.Tıp Tarihi Kongresi: Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler, İstanbul, 20-23 Eylül 1993*, Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1999, 9-24.
- _____. “Muallim Miralay Dr. Hüseyin Remzi Bey ve Türkçe Tıp Dilimiz,” In *IV. Tıp Tarihi Kongresi : Kongreye Sunulan Bildiriler, İstanbul, 18-20 Eylül 1996*, Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 2003, 239-252.
- Ünver, Süheyl A. “Osmanlı Tababeti ve Tanzimat Hakkında Yeni Notlar” In *Tanzimat I*, İstanbul: MEB Yayınları ,1999.
- Uzunpostalıcı, Mustafa. “Cenin”, In *Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi*, vol.7, 369-70. İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi Genel Müdürlüğü, 1988-.
- Walkowitz, Judith R. *Prostitution and Victorian Society: Women, Class and the State*, New York: Cambridge University Press, 1980.

- Wallerstein, Immanuel. *The Modern World System: Capitalist Agriculture and the Origins of the European World Economy in the Sixteenth Century*, New York: Academic Press, 1974.
- Watts, Sheldon. *Epidemics and History: Disease, Power and Imperialism*, New Haven, Connecticut: Yale University Press, 1998.
- Yanıkdağ, Yücel. "Educating the Peasants: The Ottoman Army and Enlisted Men in Uniform", *Middle Eastern Studies* 40/6 (November 2004):92-120.
- Yarman, Arsen. *Osmanlı Sağlık Hizmetinde Ermeniler ve Surp Pırgıç Ermeni Hastanesi Tarihi*, İstanbul: Surp Pırgıç Ermeni Hastanesi Vakfı, 2001.
- Yazıcı, Nesimi. "Tanzimat Dönemi Basını Konusunda Bir Değerlendirme", In *Tanzimat'ın 150. Yıldönümü Uluslararası Sempozyumu*, Ankara: TTK Yayınları, 1994, 55-84.
- Yıldırım, Nuran & Bozkurt, Suzan. "Başlangıcından Günümüze İstanbul Tıp Fakültesi'nin Kadın Öğretim Üyeleri," In *Sağlık Alanında Türk Kadını*, ed. Nuran Yıldırım, İstanbul: Novartis, 1998.
- Yıldırım, Nuran. "Beyoğlu Nisa Hastanesi", In *Dünden Bugüne İstanbul Ansiklopedisi*, vol.2. Ankara, İstanbul: Kültür Bakanlığı, Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 1993-1995.
- Yıldırım, Nuran. "Nizamnâme-i Eczacıyan der Memalik-i Osmaniye. Osmanlı Devleti'nde Eczacılar Nizamnâmesi-1852," In *IV.Türk Eczacılık Tarihi Toplantısı Bildirileri (4-5 Haziran 1998, İstanbul)*, ed. Emre Dölen, İstanbul: Marmara Üniversitesi Eczacılık Fakültesi Yayını, 2000.
- Yıldırım, Nuran. "19. Yüzyıl Sonu ve 20. Yüzyıl Başında İstanbul'da Fuhuşla İlgili Bazı Belgeler", *Tarih ve Toplum*, 35/ 208 (Nisan 2001).
- Yıldırım, Nuran. "Salgınlar", In *Dünden Bugüne İstanbul Ansiklopedisi*, vol.3. Ankara, İstanbul: Kültür Bakanlığı, Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 1993-1995, 423-425.
- Yıldırım, Nuran. "Tanzimat'dan Cumhuriyet'e Koruyucu Sağlık Uygulamaları" In *Tanzimat'dan Cumhuriyet'e Türkiye Ansiklopedisi*, vol.5. İstanbul, İletişim Yayınları, 1985, 1320-1338.
- Zaretsky, Eli. *Capitalism, the Family and Personal Life*, London: Pluto Press, 1976.
- Zilfi, Madeline C. "Osmanlı'da Kölelik ve Erken Modern Zamanda Kadın Köleler", *Osmanlı Ansiklopedisi*, vol.5. Ankara: Yeni Türkiye Yayınları, 1999.
- Zilfi, Madeline C. ed, *Women in the Ottoman Empire; Middle Eastern Women in the Early Modern Era*, Leiden, New York: Brill, 1997.
- Zürcher, Eric Jan. *Turkey: A Modern History*, London, New York: I.B. Tauris, 2005.

Zürcher, Eric Jan. "Between Death and Desertion. The experience of the Ottoman Soldier in World War I", *Turcica* 28 (1996): 235-258.

III. Encyclopedias and Dictionaries

Companion Encyclopedia of the History of Medicine, ed. W.F. Bynum & Roy Porter, 2 vols. London: Routledge, 1993.

Dünden Bugüne İstanbul Ansiklopedisi, 8 vols. Ankara, İstanbul: Kültür Bakanlığı, Türkiye Ekonomik ve Toplumsal Tarih Vakfı, 1993-1995.

Tanzimat'dan Cumhuriyet'e Türkiye Ansiklopedisi, 6 vols. İstanbul: İletişim Yayınları, 1985.

TDV İslâm Ansiklopedisi, 10 vols. İstanbul: Türkiye Diyanet Vakfı İslam Ansiklopedisi Genel Müdürlüğü, 1988-.

Şemseddin Sami. *Kamus-ı Türkî*. 2 vols. Dersaadet: 1899-1900.

Sir J.W.Redhouse. *Turkish and English Lexicon. New Edition* Constantinople: 1890.